

The Augustinian Theme of Harmony:
A Contribution of a Spiritual Tradition to a Better Understanding
of the Self and Others.

by

Robert F. Dueweke, O. S. A.

Doctoral thesis submitted to the Faculty of Theology, Saint Paul University, in fulfillment of the requirements for the Doctoral Program in Theology, Spirituality concentration.

Ottawa, Canada
November 30, 2004

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	1
I. Background and pastoral experiences	2
II. Questions emerging from these experiences	3
III. Harmony linked to understanding the self, God, and others	6
IV. Corpus of Augustine’s texts and those of Augustinian spirituality	7
V. Chapter divisions of the thesis	10
CHAPTER 1: SPIRITUALITY AND CHRISTIAN SPIRITUALITY	16
I. Spirituality: a popular word without a specific meaning	18
II. Spiritual dimension of the human being: soul, expression and desire ...	21
III. Spirituality and “meaning of life”	23
IV. Christian spirituality and its many expressions	27
A. Brief history of the term “spirituality”	27
B. Spirituality as the “art of living the Gospel”	30
C. Christian spirituality and its varied expressions	32
D. Augustinian Spirituality: <i>caritas</i> as “cet admirable secret”	36
E. The contribution of Augustinian Spirituality	63
CHAPTER 2: HARMONY: RESONANCES OF A THEME IN AUGUSTINE’S WRITINGS	65
I. Presence of the term <i>harmonia</i>	75
A. Term “harmony” in Augustine’s writings	75
B. Term “harmony” in the writings of the Order of Saint Augustine .	82
II. Presence of the theme of “harmony”	91
A. Harmony as expression of human dynamics in Augustine’s <i>Rule</i> .	91
_____ 1. Element of Oneness (<i>unus</i>) – Goal and Purpose for living together	91
_____ 2. Element of Community of Love (<i>anima una et cor unum</i>) .	93
_____ 3. Element of “Interiorly united toward God” -- <i>in Deum</i>	95
B. Theme of Harmony in the Order’s Documents	97
_____ 1. “Longing for spiritual beauty:” the ultimate aim of the Rule	97
_____ 2. Bonds of common life: the other as “temple” in Ange Le Proust	100
_____ 3. Beyond “community:” the Fourfold Communion in Jordan of Saxony	104
III. Crisis of minds and hearts: the <i>anima una</i> on a “window shelf”	109
A. Lacking “awareness and interiorizing” the core message	110
B. Living the core message in new ways in a new situation	112

CHAPTER 3: CREATION: THE DESIGN OF HARMONY AND IMPACT OF LOVE ON PERSONAL AND COMMUNAL LIFE	117
I. Cosmic harmony as a coherent living design in Augustine	120
A. Beauty of Creation: an expression of harmony	121
B. Harmony with the Creator	128
C. Harmony with others: <i>pax et concordia</i>	137
II. Creation and harmony in the Order’s Tradition	143
A. Harmony with Creation: pastoral challenge and appropriation of design	144
B. Harmony with God: “un centro de amor”	154
C. Harmony with others: peace, concord and sharing of goods	162
 CHAPTER 4: PRAYER FROM THE HEART AND COMMUNION OF SYMPHONY	 176
I. Augustine: Prayer from the heart and Communion of symphony	179
A. Prayer from the heart: “ <i>Words spoken by your lips should also be alive in your hearts</i> ”	179
B. Communion with one another, on the way	196
II. The Order’s Tradition: Prayer of the undivided heart and Communion of <i>concordia</i>	206
A. Prayer of the undivided heart: “every thought, affection, desire of soul”	207
B. Communion of <i>concordia</i> : future life and the “kiss of peace”	218
 CHAPTER 5: THE “WHOLE CHRIST:” A FORGOTTEN EXPRESSION OF HARMONY	 233
Part I: The “whole Christ” and Augustine	236
A. Christ present in the faithful: “though many, so it is with Christ”. ..	237
B. Christ present with the poor: “if one suffers, all suffer”	244
C. Christ present in discord: “we are not to break the bonds”	246
Part II: The “whole Christ” and the Order’s Tradition	250
A. Augustine Favaroni: “Christo integro”	251
B. Girolamo Seripando: Saying the “Pater Noster” makes us brothers and sisters	258
C. “Whole Christ” as the ultimate horizon of Oneness	262

CONCLUSION	270
Appendix 1: <i>The Rule of Saint Augustine</i>	279
Appendix 2: “Harmony” in the Plan of Augustinian Formation (<i>Ratio</i> 29-30)	287
BIBLIOGRAPHY and ABBREVIATIONS	288

INTRODUCTION

Since time immemorial the human person, as a social being, has evolved within a web of inter-relationships with both the natural environment and other human beings. Although living with others involves a tenuous bond of giving and receiving, always on the edge of fragmentation when excessive self-interest and exploitation are present, a community that supports the “values of peace, mercy and forgiveness” and still has some sense of unity depends upon the strength and respect needed among the members.¹

With echoes of the biblical story of Noah’s Ark, Bill Reid’s sculpture “The Spirit of Haida Gwaii” in the Museum of Civilization in Gatineau, Quebec, illustrates the inherent challenge of interaction and connectedness with one another moving together toward a common destiny. And yet, a disturbance ripples across the calm waters. Intrigue and frenzy ensue where wild animals and birds jockey for better position. There is shoving and biting in the small confines of the seaworthy vessel. In spite of the mayhem of minimal collaboration and much competition in the tiny canoe, at least one member of the group, the chieftain, transcends the immediate confusion with interior calm and guides his small

¹J. MONTALDO (ed.), “Contemplation and the Cosmos: Chapter VIII of Thomas Merton’s Lecture Notes on Theology and Mysticism” in B. DIEKER and J. MONTALDO (eds.), *Merton & Hesychasm: The Prayer of the Heart - The Eastern Church*. Louisville, Ky.: Fons Vitae, 2003, pp. 431-445. “A special problem of modern times, with its technology: technology, with its impersonal, pragmatic, quantitative exploitation and manipulation of things, is deliberately indifferent to their *logoi*. Consideration of the symbolic *logos* of a thing would be an obstacle to science and technology, so many seem to think. Hence the *logos* must be excluded. No interest in ‘what’ a thing really is . . . Centrality of destruction in this process. Technology leads to demonic pseudo-contemplation, mystique of technics and production” (emphasis is Merton’s) (p. 440). The *logos* is defined as that something within the human person that is hidden, “spiritual, simple, profound, unitive, loving, selfless, self-forgetting, oriented to love and to unity with God and other men in Christ” (p. 437). For further exploration on the theme of dialogue with nature, see S. McCASLIN, “Merton and ‘Hagia Sophia’ (Holy Wisdom)” in *Merton & Hesychasm*, pp. 235-254, especially 251.

community to safe haven on the distant horizon.

The “Haida Gwaii” is an apt commentary in art form on human relationships today. Behind every problem, be it domestic or international, there is a problem with relatedness. A human face with emotion appears within each episode. Some may try to penetrate the deep causes underlying the conflict or be in solidarity with those who suffer. The compelling need is to rise above the situation of discord with a spirit of new possibilities on how to live together.

I. Background and pastoral experiences

As a member of the Augustinian Order I have encountered many pastoral situations in which the network of human relationships and life together have been shattered. My foreign mission work in Northern Peru exposed me to the devastating consequences of poverty, civil war and terrorism, violations of basic human rights, and death. Institutions of law and order lost their credibility. Human life was disposable in the twisted logic that sought the advancement of raw power in the name of “justice” for the oppressed. Fear and suspicion dominated everyone’s lives.

One does not have to travel far to look into the eye of either institutionalized or group power that severs the bonds of human relatedness and social concord. The inner city of Chicago’s South Side exposed me to a civil and domestic discord of *déjà vu*. In an economically depressed area, groups of youths violently assault each other and the local population for control over sections of the city; graffiti identify who dominates and governs which area. Ethnic rival gangs possess arsenals of weapons. Children playing near their homes are often murdered by drive-by shootings. Half of the funerals in our parish

community are liturgies of teenagers whose lives ended prematurely. Street violence injects fear into the community, tearing at the social fabric and relationships within families and neighbors, causing the inhabitants to flee to safer havens in other parts of the city.

Other Augustinians have experienced similar challenges resulting in the ultimate consequences. Srs. Esther Paniagua and Caridad Alvarez, religious sisters of the Augustinian Missionaries from Spain, lived a quiet missionary presence in Algeria. On October 23, 1994, the sisters, while approaching a chapel for Eucharist, were assassinated in the street by terrorists. While in Madrid, I attended the funeral for these two sisters. Together, with the community, we sought within our own faith tradition as Augustinians for a direction that would help us deal with violent reality and renew our pastoral commitment in spite of the dangers.²

II. Questions emerging from these experiences

The reality of violence makes me ponder how Christian spirituality, specifically how the spirituality of the Augustinian Order, with its emphasis on a “form of living” that is both communal and apostolic, may help me face such difficult situations encountered in pastoral ministry. More precisely, is it possible to identify some components or features of this spirituality which will help one to live more fully one’s own life, despite a surrounding violent environment?

In the search for answers to this question, I have found with a great enthusiasm how significant harmony was for Augustine (354-430). The bishop of Hippo Regius speaks

²References are made to the Augustinian sisters in B. OLIVERA, *How far to follow? The Martyrs of Atlas*. Petersham, Mass.: St. Bede’s Publications, 1997, pp. 20, 107, 116.

about harmony as “*coaptatio*,” translatable as “rhythm of relationships.”³ This is a marvelous rendering of the term that opens avenues for its pursuit as a theme of study. Indeed, the term *rhythm of relationships* may be combined with other terms as *concord*, *communion*, *friendship*, and so on, in such a way that it appears to be a meaningful *theme* in view of a better understanding of the self and others. Meanwhile, I realized that religious communities claiming to follow Augustine had failed to pay closer attention to this theme to the point that *harmony* did not represent a major component of their spirituality.⁴ As soon as I raised this question I perceived the matter for my doctoral study.

The question led to the following hypothesis: *the element of harmony in Augustine’s own spiritual experience has the potential to provide a better understanding of the self and of others.* An abundant material which has been collected and analyzed allows us to ask the following question: *to what extent does the spiritual tradition of the Augustinian order have recovered the component of harmony found in the thought of the bishop of Hippo?* Answers to this question will contribute to seeing more clearly how the Augustinians have received the teaching of their “spiritual Father.” The goal of this thesis is to answer this important question.

³The Greek term *harmonia* is defined by Augustine in two places, *Trin.* IV, 2.4 and *civ. Dei* 22, 24 (see abbreviations at the beginning of the bibliography). The Doubleday 1958 edition of *The City of God*, p. 528, translates “*coaptatio*” as “rhythm of relationships” whereas other editions will simply use the word “concord.” V. BOURKE (ed.), *Saint Augustine: The City of God*, translation by G. Walsh, D. Zema, G. Monahan and D. Honan, New York: Doubleday, 1958. A fuller description of terms will be offered in Chapter Two.

⁴I want to express my debt of gratitude to Prof. Kevin Coyle who introduced to me the idea of *harmony* as a topic of study.

The particular tradition we refer to is the “Augustinian tradition,” of which spirituality is an integral component. Generally, the term “tradition” implies a “handing down” of customs, thought, and practices belonging to a family, nation, culture or institution over a significant period of time. In Christianity, tradition is closely linked with how the community of faith “believes, teaches, and confesses on the basis of the word of God.”⁵ When we speak of the “Augustinian tradition” we refer to a particular manner of believing (spirituality), teaching, and confessing Jesus Christ through a set of beliefs, ideas, practices, and customs in the religious congregation, bearing the name of its spiritual master, whose written texts serve as a source of inspiration, “model and rule of our every action.”⁶

⁵The word “tradition,” not in conflict with history and critical methods of research, refers to the “process of communication and to its content.” It is more than the uncritical passing of the crystal ball of ideas and practices from one generation to the next. Rather, tradition involves the ongoing re-interpretation, modification, and enrichment of core beliefs in light of new discoveries and new needs. For an elaboration of the term “tradition,” see J. PELIKAN, *The Christian Tradition: A History of the Development of Doctrine: The Emergence of the Catholic Tradition (100-600)*. Vol. 1, Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 1971, pp. 1-10. T. MARTIN, *Our Restless Heart. The Augustinian Tradition*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 2003, pp. 91-92.

⁶MARTIN, *Our Restless Heart*, p. 74: “Augustine’s spiritual tradition, with its inherent biblical, theological and philosophical underpinnings, was channelled through fresh biblical, theological and philosophical developments within Western Christianity that provided a new milieu within which Augustine was read, studied and handed on.” See also *Living in Freedom under Grace: Augustinian Spirit and Spirituality in the Writings of the Popes and Priors General (1953-1978)*, Rome: Curia Generalizia Agostiniana, 1979, pp. 54, 133-134, 198. Echoes of the notion of tradition are found in Jesus’s advice to the faithful disciple as a “householder who brings out from his storeroom things both new and old” (*Mt.* 13:52).

The Order’s *Constitutions* 21: “The fundamental document of this spirituality is the *Rule*. This is complemented by the special characteristics that pertain to an apostolic fraternity, considered in the light of the entire teaching and distinguished example of our holy father Augustine, ‘who is to be the model and rule of our every action.’” *Rule and Constitutions of the Order of Saint Augustine*, issued by Authority of Miguel Angel Orcasitas, Prior General. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1991. Hereafter *Const.* (Note: a revised issue was published by Authority of Robert F. Prevost, O.S.A., Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Historical Institute, 2002. See pages 173-176 for additions and deletions between the 1990 and 2002 publications. Sections in the *Const.* on the spirituality of the Order are revised at the 2004 Intermediate General Chapter.) Appendix 1 contains the complete text of the *Rule* translated by R. Russell.)

This short description of the Augustinian tradition implies that the theme of harmony is present, but because of the use of other terms instead of the word “harmony,” the theme as such does not appear clearly. If this is the case, in what manner do these terms express the idea of harmony in Augustine’s thought? In other words, to sum up the goal of this study, a fundamental question is raised: *how does the Augustinian tradition regarding its spirituality receive, or not, the different components of the theme of harmony found in Augustine’s writings?* The answers to these questions will pave the way to see better how harmony, understood as “a rhythm of relationships,” sheds light on the link between the self, God and others and, consequently, obtains a clearer understanding of the self, God and others.

III. Harmony linked to understanding the self, God, and others

Various authors⁷ have written about different aspects of the theme of harmony and made valuable contributions toward understanding relationships with the self, God, and others. Some stress the natural orientation and primary relationship of the human person in dialogue with God, by “entering” into the self through interiority, and therefore opening oneself to the nature of harmony. God speaks and the human person responds.

We also see the theme of harmony as a treatment of polarities in reciprocal relations

⁷W. JOHNSTON, “*Arise, My Love . . .*” *Mysticism for a new era*. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 2000. J. VANIER, *From Brokenness to Community*. New York and Mahwah, N. J.: Paulist Press, 1992. See also “Asian Christian Perspectives on Harmony,” document number 75 of the Federation of Asian Bishop’s Conference, [cited 15 January 2000]; available from World Wide Web @ <http://ucanews.com/html/fabc-papers/fabc-75.htm> All citations from the Internet will comply with the guidelines established from J. D. LESTER and J.D. LESTER, Jr., *The Essential Guide to Writing Research Papers*, New York: Longman, Inc, 1999, pp. 46, 100-101. Since the abundance of information available through the Internet raises credibility issues, most of that information will be from sites or educational institutions (“.edu”) or professional organizations (“.org”).

seeking a balanced tension, for example, internal life and external activities, contemplation and action, and the self loving God and neighbor.⁸ However some of these writers do not make a clear link between the self and the notion of harmony, a path which leads me to see already a link with the reality of conflict.⁹

Indeed, different authors acknowledge that various forms of cruelty may have causes rooted in the inner self and some people are calling for a spirituality that responds to a violent situation.¹⁰ Consequently, a connection between the self and discord may be seen, and already suggests how the theme of harmony studied in the context of a spirituality may be relevant.

IV. Corpus of Augustine's texts and those of Augustinian spirituality

When we speak of "Augustinian spirituality" as a component of its tradition we mean the manner in which that religious congregation -- the Order of Saint Augustine -- lives the Gospel of Jesus Christ and reproduces the first Christian community where its members live "with one mind and one heart toward God," share all material and spiritual things in common, and distribution of things is made according to need (see *Acts* 4: 32, 35).

⁸R. LOMBARDI, *Vatican II and Now: A Retreat to the Fathers of the Council (November 8-11, 1965)*. Washington, D. C.: Movement for a Better World, 1967, pp. 133-144. P. HENNESSY (ed.), *A Concert of Charisms: Ordained Ministry in Religious Life*. New York: Paulist Press, 1997, pp. 7-8, 193-195. DIEKER and MONTALDO (eds.), *Merton & Hesychasm*, pp. 20-23, 104-106. A. TRAPÈ, "Causes of Anxiety" in *Living in Freedom under Grace*, pp. 113-120, especially p. 117.

⁹See L. CORBETT, "The Dark Side of the Self, September 11, and a Depth Psychology of Terrorism" (02/06/03) [cited 15 June 2003]; available from World Wide Web @ <http://www.cgjungpage.org/articles/Sept11Corbett.html>

¹⁰L. CUNNINGHAM, "On Contemporary Martyrs: Some recent literature." *Theological Studies* 63 (2002): pp. 374-381. P. CLAVERIE, "A martyr speaks of martyrs." *Cistercian Studies* 37/2 (2002): pp. 177-180. J. WARDHAUGH, "A Spirituality of Trauma." *Human Development* 21/3 (2000): pp. 44-48. E. RANLEY, "A Christian spirituality of non-violence." *America* September (1989), pp. 110-123. D. WUERL, "How faith communities respond to gun violence." *Origins* 30/3 (2000): pp. 34-36.

Interiority and apostolic action are two pillars of this spirituality upon which a community strives to live in unity, concord, friendship, and love, not only within the local community, but for the wider Church community as well.¹¹

For the purposes of this study the principal texts, or “code of life,”¹² for Augustinian spirituality will be two texts taken as a unit: the *Rule of St. Augustine* and the *Constitutions* of the Order of St. Augustine. The *Rule* is identified for its unique capacity to be the “carrier” of spirituality and the *Constitutions* represent the application of that spirituality in a contemporary context. Other texts will be writings and sermons from the Order’s theologians and saints. The specifics of this corpus will be treated in each chapter at the appropriate moment.

Since this thesis belongs to the study of Augustinian spirituality, its methodology has to deal with a thematic approach to Augustine’s texts in connection with some various aspects of doctrine and praxis, like creation, God, others, prayer, “whole Christ.” These categories deploy different components of harmony and therefore provide some keys for a deeper understanding of the different texts.

Some texts of interest, aside from the major writings, the *Confessiones*, *De Trinitate* and *De civitate Dei*, are the pastoral texts where Augustine, as monk¹³ and bishop, refers

¹¹Chapter 1 will define in greater detail the meaning of Augustinian spirituality.

¹²The “code of life” is used in the address of Pope Paul VI to members of the General Chapter on September 20, 1971. See *Living in freedom under grace*, pp. 43-45.

¹³The use of the term “monk” for Augustine and/or his followers can be problematic and misleading, especially if we are thinking of a modern day version of the Benedictine or cloistered Cistercian monk. Because of the theme of harmony treated in this thesis, when I make reference to Augustine as a monk, I have in mind Adolar Zumkeller’s clarification of the term: one who lives with others as “one heart and one soul.” The term “monk” (*monachus*) for Augustine “is not an individual person, living for himself alone, or one who is striving for his own personal perfection and sanctification; .

to the theme of harmony in his sermons to religious communities and congregations and letters to individuals requesting advice.¹⁴ Some homilies will also be examined, for example, the “*Newly Discovered Sermons*” publicized by Johannes Divjak in 1989.¹⁵ Some letters, like the famous *Epistula* 130 on prayer to the Roman refugee Lady Proba, and Augustine’s last correspondence, *Epistula* 228, where he gives pastoral advice to a bishop whose diocese is under siege by barbarian invaders, offer unique insights into the harmony of relationships within the Paschal Mystery and toward one another in a time of civil strife that are appropriate even for today.

. . . he is no solitary whom the community is serving in some subordinate means.’ Rather, those men would be considered monks who through their harmonious living together have become, as it were, a *monos*, that is, a single being, and possess only one heart and one soul toward God.” Thus, I use the term monk because of its similarity of meaning with the components of harmony and of “one heart and one soul.” See A. ZUMKELLER, *Augustine’s Ideal of the Religious Life*. E. Colledge (trans.) from the 2nd revised edition of *Das Mönchtum des heiligen Augustinus*. New York: Fordham University Press, 1986, p. 132. See Augustine’s sermons 355 and 356 for a description of life in community.

¹⁴C. Mohrmann is quoted by M. PELLEGRINO, “General Introduction,” in *WSA*, vol. III/1 of the Sermons. New York: New City Press, 1990, p. 56: “Almost every subject which Augustine deals with in his works comes up in his preaching as well. Even the most difficult and abstract theological questions, such as his trinitarian theology, are discussed in his sermons. . . Augustine’s preaching is clearly theological and speculative. In his sermons he gives a preliminary exposition of his theological positions and their spiritual expression.” Pellegrino also says on page 114: “The sermons are indeed not the *Confessions*, but the spirit and outlook of Augustine remain the same in both.”

References to letter writing in antiquity: G. KENNEDY, *Greek rhetoric under Christian Emperors*. Princeton, N. J. : Princeton University Press, 1983. C. CONYBEARE, *Paulinus Noster: self and symbols in the letters of Paulinus of Nola*. Oxford (England): Oxford University Press, 2000. D. DOYLE, *The Bishop as Disciplinarian in the Letters of St. Augustine*. Patristic Studies, 4. New York: Peter Lang, 2002, especially pp. 1-7. M. E. KEENAN, *The Life and Times of St. Augustine as revealed in his letters*. Patristic Studies, vol. 45. A dissertation. Washington, D. C.: The Catholic University of America, 1935, especially pp. 63-67 on “letter writing.”

¹⁵See J. ROTELLE (ed.), “Newly Discovered Sermons” in *WSA*, III/11. Hyde Park: New City Press, 1997, p. 17. Volume III/1, pp. 13-137, of the same series has a lengthy introduction to the study of the sermons by M. PELLEGRINO. The best presentation of the homiletic genre is by A. OLIVAR, *La predicación antigua*, Barcelona: Editorial Herder, 1991. Overall, the Mainz collection of the sermons is closer to the social and political reality of 4th and 5th century Africa. Obviously, when attempting to identify these sermons’ integrity and authenticity, one must be aware of the possibility of truncation by medieval copyists.

Some of the bishop's *Ennarationes in psalmos* speak of the relationship of harmony at the level of understanding the personal self. Furthermore, Book 6 of his early work, *De musica*, will be considered for what it says about the theme of harmony in general. Books 11 to 13 of the *Confessiones* and Book 11 of the *De civitate Dei* are important for understanding how Augustine situates himself regarding cosmic harmony and the built-in design of existence which requires the human person to be oriented toward God in self-giving love, and not in excessive self-love which gives rise to greed and ambition.

V. Chapter divisions of the thesis

To write a thesis in the field of spirituality requires, first of all, establishing clearly what we understand by “spirituality” and by “Christian spirituality.” This is the aim of the opening chapter. Today the word “spirituality” is commonplace with many shades of interpretation. However, we think it is possible to propose a means or common ground to describe the term spirituality. Then, after a presentation of the nature of Christian spirituality as “the art of living the Gospel,” Augustinian spirituality will be explored more precisely as a particular expression of this art.

The study of the nature of the theme of harmony in Augustine's writings implies describing and expanding on some important aspects of its reality and its components. Chapter Two, then, will tackle directly the theme of harmony. However, the first thing to do is to look at how the Greek term “harmony” – which Augustine translates in *De civitate Dei* and *De Trinitate* as *coaptatio* (“concord” or “rhythm of relationships”)¹⁶ – appears in

¹⁶“Hanc enim coaptationem, sicut mihi nunc occurrit, dicere volui, quam graeci ἀρμονίαν vocant” (*Trin.* IV, 2.4; *CCL* 50, 164). “Numeros tamen de quibus loquor, quibus coaptatio, quae ἀρμονία Graece dicitur” (*Civ. Dei* 22, 24; *CCL* 48, 850).

some of his writings. This approach to the term already gives a direction to deepen the nature of harmony as a *rhythm of relationships*.

The study will take into consideration the three-fold aspects of bonds within the self, in God and with others. For the self, we find interiority as an aspect of harmony. Relationship with God implies the bonds of friendship and profound prayer is a condition for harmony. The quality of social relatedness and bonding sees unity as the goal and peace as the manifestation of harmony. More important, harmony is not the final result of human effort, but a collaboration with divine grace. Harmony is a “gift of God”¹⁷ and the “fruit of love which is poured forth in our hearts by the Holy Spirit.”¹⁸ This three-fold aspects of bonds within the self, in God and with others call to be studied from theological categories if we want to grasp the profound meaning of the nature of harmony. In fact, theme and theological categories determine the methodology of this study. We will present the methodology in section two of Chapter Two.

The Benedictine Jean Leclercq and Walter Principe elaborate in detail the historical

¹⁷*Const.* 42, citing Augustine’s *En ps.* 132, 10: PL 37,1735: “They should also understand this: ‘It is a grace of God that the friars live together; it is not the result of their own doing or their own merits; rather it is his gift.’ This is what the *Rule* means where it says that we should observe all our obligations in a spirit of charity ‘as lovers of spiritual beauty . . . not as slaves living under the law but as men living in freedom under grace’” (*Rule* 8, 2).

¹⁸*Rom.* 5:5 and *Const.* 11. See J. DJODI, *Le Saint-Esprit, Don de Dieu: Une clé de compréhension de la pneumatologie de Saint Augustin*. Doctoral dissertation St. Paul University, Ottawa, Canada, defended December 17, 2002, especially the “Partie Annexe.”

use of themes in doing theology.¹⁹ Chapter Three, in like manner, takes a thematic theological approach to the theme of harmony in creation. We choose the subject of creation because we find a design or pattern in the structure of the universe²⁰ that defines what a harmonious relationship looks like. Harmony exists when “all creatures are referred to the Creator.” Disharmony is born when the Creator is no longer identified as the center of existence. Self-centered love, pride and arrogance are manifestations of disharmony. The category of creation, then, helps us to identify the primary design for harmony, namely, the love relationship between the human creature and God the Creator.

Chapter Three gives, firstly, some details about the application of the methodology that it has already presented. The presentation of this content will be divided into two parts. The first part will comprise different aspects of the theme of harmony in some of Augustine’s texts, such as the beauty of creation and the design of cosmic harmony, from which we can identify what it means to be in harmony with the Creator and with others. The second part will turn to the Augustinian tradition to see how these aspects have been received and interpreted through the centuries in the Order’s literature like the *Rule*, *Constitutions* or writings from spiritual authors. Parallels and divergences will be

¹⁹J. LECLERCQ, *The Love of Learning and the Desire for God*. New York: Fordham University Press, 1961 (reprint 2001), pp. 54-56, 99; translated by C. Misrahi from the French *L’amour des lettres et le désir de Dieu: Initiation aux auteurs monastiques du moyen âge*. Paris: Les Éditions du Cerf, 1957. David Tracy indicates that this same text by Leclercq “should be recovered” when doing theological research. See T. BREYFOGLE and T. LEVERGOOD, “Conversations with David Tracy.” *Cross Currents*, 44 (1994): p. 296. For further elaboration on what makes a thesis “theological,” see W. PRINCIPE, “Toward defining spirituality.” *Studies in Religion*. 12/2 (Spring 1983): pp. 127-141, and methodology on pp. 139-141.

²⁰*Isa.* 45:18: “The creator of the heavens, who is God, the designer and maker of the earth who established it, not creating it to be a waste, but designing it to be lived in.” (Unless indicated otherwise, all scripture citations are from *The New American Bible*. Nashville, TN.: Thomas Nelson Publ., 1987.)

identified between the two parts. The purpose of this arrangement is to help us identify more easily that aspect of the theme of harmony treated in Augustine's texts and the Order's tradition. This procedure of comparison will be used also with Chapters Four and Five.

Therefore, in order to explore the theme of harmony as a characteristic of Augustinian spirituality, it is important to consider how this spirituality proposes to balance the tension between interiority and common life. These two aspects, held as fundamental by Augustine for a healthy community, will be approached from the two aspects of doctrine of prayer and communion because together they best describe the "purpose" of the Order as the *anima una* (or "being one mind and one heart on the way to God").²¹ Prayer, in its individual and communal dimensions, embraces the unique inheritance of the Order's eremetical roots as well as the process of what it means to be "on the way toward God."²² Prayer is a condition for harmony. Communion reflects the goal of Christian life to be one in unity with diversity; it is an expression of harmony. This is what will be discussed in Chapter Four.

To express the harmony between the members of the christian community, Paul uses the image of the body and Augustine speaks in terms of the "whole Christ." In Chapter Five, we will look at the "whole Christ" as an echo to the Apostle of the Nations when he

²¹See *Const.* 16: "The purpose of our Order consists both in our seeking and worshiping God together with one heart in brotherhood and spiritual friendship and in our working to serve the people of God. As the Rule admonishes us, the main reason for our having come together is to live harmoniously, intent upon God in oneness of mind and heart."

²²Because of its importance to the theme of harmony, the expression "on the way toward God" – Augustine's addition to "one mind and one heart" in *Acts* 4:32 – will be elaborated on in Chapter Two.

identifies the Church as the Body of Christ.

Here is an important component of Augustine's teaching that seems not to be emphasized in the Augustinian tradition. According to one prominent theologian, this notion of the "corporate identity," of the "I" and the "we," is a forgotten aspect in Augustinian spirituality and needs to be "rediscovered."²³ Such a recovery will help us recognize that the principle (based on *Col. 1:24*) in which the *anima una* (see *Acts 4:32* and p. 56, n. 138) comes into existence is through the union with Christ in his body the Church, an expression of harmony and antidote to situations of discord.²⁴ Therefore the necessity to devote an entire chapter to the topic of the "whole Christ" is commanded by the importance of the subject as much as by the seriousness of this oversight.

In the conclusion we will collect the fruits of our study and will point to how the appropriation of the theme of harmony may enrich and enhance Augustinian spirituality. In this light it belongs to Augustine's followers to discover the concrete means and the details for the appropriation of the spirituality in a specific manner. Does the theme of "harmony" generate a sort of pedagogical means which may help people to a better understanding of the self and others? Therefore, in answering this question we will be in position to say how this theme of "harmony," as articulated in Augustinian spirituality,

²³T. VAN BAVEL, "The 'Christus Totus' Idea: A forgotten aspect of Augustine's spirituality" in *Augustinian Spirituality and the Charism of the Augustinians*. J. Rotelle (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1995, pp. 59-70.

²⁴*Const. 16*: "since the principle by which hearts are made one is none other than an intimate union with Christ in his body which is the Church." *Col. 1:24* (NIV): "Now I rejoice in what was suffered for you, and I fill up in my flesh what is still lacking in regard to Christ's afflictions, for the sake of his body, which is the church." *Acts 4:32* (NRSV): "Now the whole group of those who believed were of one heart and soul, and no one claimed private ownership of any possessions, but everything they owned was held in common."

represents a valuable contribution to Christian spirituality for today.

CHAPTER 1: SPIRITUALITY AND CHRISTIAN SPIRITUALITY

Overusing a word or expression, or turning it into a cliché, can diminish or even rob it of its original meaning. This is true for the word “spirituality” which has become popularized by men and women seekers from all walks of life, especially from Europe and North America.¹ The word serves as an umbrella in many bookstores for the variety of religious and non-religious phenomena as New Age, paranormal studies, psychological development, etc. In the electronic format the Internet hosts thousands of sites on the same subject. Some sites define their particular use of the word “spirituality,” while most do not.

The *background or context* for this chapter lies in the description of the word “spirituality.” Spirituality is no longer the exclusive domain of a Christian framework of understanding and living, nor is it reserved for a special class of people, like monks and nuns in a religious tradition. For some, the word “spirituality” is no longer linked to a tradition nor to a living faith-community. As a result, a variety of meanings of spirituality have emerged, ending in a certain confusion and ambiguity.² Boundaries of meaning are hazy and they tend to overlap each another. One word, many definitions. Since the reference to spirituality is now broader than the Christian reference, it is imperative to

¹For an analysis on the popularity of “spirituality,” see PRINCIPE, “Toward defining spirituality,” pp. 127-141 and J. ALEXANDER, “What do recent writers mean by spirituality?” *Spirituality Today* 32 (1980): pp. 247-256.

²For a survey of the term see S. ROSE, “Is the term ‘spirituality’ a word that everyone uses, but nobody knows what anyone means by it?” *Journal of Contemporary Religion*, 16/2 (2001): pp. 193-207. J. Alexander says the term “spirituality” is used by most writers in a “generic and experiential sense.” This general sense is perceived as something “concrete” rather than as an “abstract,” making the term “reified” and it “loses its meaning.” Under this prevailing perception, it becomes a challenge to shape a theologically adequate definition for the term. See ALEXANDER, “What do recent writers mean by spirituality?” pp. 253-254. Principe also addresses the issue of confusion with the term “spirituality” as having “a certain fluidity . . . vagueness” about it. The same is true for the term “mysticism.” See PRINCIPE, “Toward defining spirituality,” p. 129.

clarify the word and its meaning, on the one hand, and to discuss the nature of Christian spirituality on the other hand.

The *specific question* we want to ask is: What is spirituality and, specifically, Christian spirituality? In what manner can we move toward a consensus on the meaning of this term? At this moment spirituality means many things to many people. Perhaps there is a perspective from which a common agreement, as well as clarity, can be reached when we speak of spirituality.

The *method* we use is first to examine how some writers and theologians explain the underlying causes for the popularity and ambiguity of the term “spirituality.” Next, since the notion of the “spiritual” dimension of the human person is much broader than spirituality, we briefly view how some thinkers understand this dimension of soul, dualism and integration of the person. The expression “meaning of life” linked with spirituality provides a way for dispersing the ambiguity around the word “spirituality.” Finally, we want to examine from the writings of various theologians, like Nicholas, von Balthasar and Lafont, what constitutes a “Christian” spirituality, a brief historical development of the term *spiritualitas*, and its varied expressions as “specific” spiritualities, such as “Augustinian” spirituality. The characteristics comprising an Augustinian spirituality are treated from two perspectives: Augustine of Hippo’s *Rule*, with reference to commentaries by Ange Le Proust and Adolar Zumkeller, and the origin of the Order of St. Augustine, as seen from the Order’s *Constitutions* and the collected wisdom of other Augustinian writers.

Then the objective of this chapter is to sketch a background for a better understanding of what we mean when we speak of “a specific spirituality” from a Christian

perspective. From then, it becomes possible to illustrate the different components of Augustinian spirituality. In order to achieve this, we have to clarify, first of all, the notion of spirituality in itself, before we tackle the nature of spirituality in general and Christian spirituality in particular. We now turn to the popular attraction of the term “spirituality.”

I. Spirituality: a popular word without a specific meaning

The phenomenon of the popularity of spirituality may be explained by the fact that the word covers a multitude of interests. For some it may mean the way faith is lived, a type of interior quest, a search for God, a holistic and integrated approach to human reality and ultimate concerns, a new technique in meditation or relaxation, the inner capacity for self-healing. The market economy has even recognized the opportunity for profits in selling things related to spirituality.³

We may ask, why is there so much interest in spirituality? Without engaging in a lengthy reflection, some writers claim that interest in this topic is indicative of social confusion.⁴ Disorder in the socio-cultural fabric of life will generate questions about spirituality. The political rhetoric since the terrorist attacks on the World Trade Center in New York, September 11, 2001, is intertwined with a “spirituality”- type vocabulary, like

³J-C. BRETON, “Le supermarché du spirituel.” *Prêtre et Pasteur* 98/2 (1995): pp. 66-71. See W. SPOHN, “Spiritual Practices: The True Test of Spirituality.” *Dialog: A Journal of Theology* 40/4 (2001): pp. 277-283, especially p. 279 who identifies much popular spirituality as “theologically suspect” for its “individualism, social dislocation from community, consumerism, the primacy of experience over reflection, and a therapeutic mentality obsessed with personal fulfillment.”

⁴B. HANSON, “Christian Spirituality and Spiritual Theology.” *Dialog* 21 (1982): pp. 207-212. See also P. TRIGO, “Crisis civilizatoria y espiritualidad cristiana.” *ITR* 2 (1999), pp. 55-120. B. A. ROBINSON, “New Age Spirituality. Beliefs, practices, etc.,” Jan. 25, 2000 [cited 13 May 2001]; available from World Wide Web @ [http:// www.religioustolerance.org/newage.htm](http://www.religioustolerance.org/newage.htm) “New Age teachings became popular during the 1970's as a reaction against what some perceived as the failure of Christianity and the failure of Secular Humanism to provide spiritual and ethical guidance for the future” (p. 2).

the global struggle between “good and evil.” People are alarmed about the future and their inner lives betray an experience of extreme stress and fragmentation. Many pursue a spirituality with the hope for some sort of comfort in knowing that wholeness and equilibrium in one’s self and in the world are possible.

Other writers say that the popularity is due to the sense of generality the term evokes. The present cultural climate emphasizes similarity of ethical and religious ideas and impulses which have replaced an earlier era of the Modern Period that focuses on differences, often to much debate, on dogmatic teachings and disciplines.⁵ The problem here is determining an authentic spirituality from one that is not and when the term “spirituality” is emptied of its meaning.⁶

People in different situations claim “to have a spirituality,” but when asked to give precision to what they mean, no clear agreed-upon definition is heard because everyone has his or her own opinion about it. Some people will say “I am not religious, but I have my own spirituality.” By “religious” they often mean “organized religion” in a pejorative sense. This same idea is coined in the expression “Deed, not creed.” For others spirituality is synonymous with having a religious identity and practice. Spirituality can also mean “self-realization”⁷ and an exploration of one’s inner resources to boost self-confidence, lower risks for heart attacks, and overcoming substance abuse and smoking. Wisdom and

⁵ALEXANDER, “What do recent writers mean by spirituality?” p. 254.

⁶ALEXANDER, “What do recent writers mean by spirituality?” p. 253. See SPOHN, “Spiritual Practices,” p. 279, where the author identifies spiritual practices as “regular worship, solidarity with the poor” as key to authenticity. ROSE, “Is the term ‘spirituality,’” p. 204, points to three conditions: experience with ultimate concern, regular practices, and a life of love/altruistic activities.

⁷R. FRAGOMENI, “New Age Spirituality.” *Liturgical Ministry* 10 (2001), p. 218.

practices from the Eastern traditions, such as Buddhism and Hinduism, have identified specific paths to transcendence, like the path of the seven chakras. Some interpretations may or may not include elements of a relationship with a Divine Other and transcendent states of being.⁸ The variations of meaning of the term “spirituality” are endless.

One of the reasons for its generality and vagueness is that people have ignored the origin and foundation of the word “spirituality.” The vagueness of the use of the term “spirituality,” and consequently, some criteria for authenticity, may be indicative that people do not claim to belong to a particular religious tradition.⁹ In doing so they dissociate themselves from foundations on which the basis for a spirituality is formed. What they use is a “pick and choose” approach as the best way to form a “personalized” spirituality tailored to their needs.

When reference is made to a spirituality without a foundation or context, the meaning of the term still tends to confuse. Another reason to explain the wide confusion is the fact that the word “spiritual” appears as a synonym of “spirituality.” This needs to be addressed in a view that makes clear the distinction between the two words despite the link between them.

⁸ROSE, “Is the term ‘spirituality,’” p. 205.

⁹ALEXANDER, “What do recent writers mean by spirituality?” pp. 252-253: “Each religious tradition possesses dogmatic tests of spirituality which have developed from revelation, reason, and experience. The consensus of the Christian tradition is that the *sine qua non* of spirituality is charity and love, yet these qualifiers are only occasionally found in recent Christian definitions of spirituality. If spirituality is to be understood in a generic sense, what then will be its generic test of authenticity? From what revelation, from which experience, from whose reason will the test be derived?” See SPOHN, “Spiritual Practices,” p. 279.

II. Spiritual dimension of the human being: soul, expression and desire

The spiritual dimension of a human being is broader than the notion of spirituality. When we speak about the spiritual dimension we are referring to what we call the “soul.” Soul involves the realm of the intellect, the capacity to reason, and the correct use of freedom. It is the person’s “inherent capacity for selfhood, self-awareness, and subjectivity.”¹⁰

To speak of soul does not imply a dualistic way of thinking. Philosophers and theologians have struggled to understand, in particular, the relationship between the spiritual and the physical and at the same time not to fall into the trap of dualism.¹¹ By dualism we refer to two fundamental principles that are coequal and coeternal, in opposition and in tension with each other, and underlie all reality.¹² This system of thought is characterized by opposing poles: “good” and “evil,” “spiritual” and “material.”

Throughout the history of religion, dualism has been absorbed in a variety of degrees as a framework for interpreting the problem of evil, God, cosmos, and the human person. Its extreme forms, Zoroastrianism and Manichaeism viewed reality as two forces

¹⁰S. NOFFKE, “Soul” in *NDCS*, p. 908. See also W. PANNENBERG, *Anthropology in Theological Perspective*. Philadelphia, Pa.: Westminster, 1985.

¹¹In the Christian context, we may sum up the debate about this matter by saying that, especially after Vatican II, the spirit and body are recognized with an emphasis on the human *person* as one, and not as a divided entity. The human being is one, “though made of body and soul” (*Gaudium et spes*, 14).

¹²See D. HUNTER, “Dualism” in *NDCS*, pp. 298-299. P. BROWN, *The Body and Society: Men, Women, and Sexual Renunciation in Early Christianity*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1988. J. NELSON, *Embodiment: An Approach to Sexuality and Christian Theology*. Minneapolis, Mn.: Augsburg, 1978.

or warring factions – the Kingdom of Light and the Kingdom of Darkness.¹³ Christians who were Gnostics or extreme Platonists saw the spiritual principle as primary and the material principle, or embodiment, as the result of a fall or crisis in the human soul or the higher spiritual order. This view still lingers on today. Modern efforts and concerns attempt to correct the imbalance by drawing attention to “holistic and creation-centered” procedures to understanding reality and the human person.¹⁴

Moreover, the spiritual dimension is known only through the material, that is, by what is observable, what one does and speaks. The human operations of knowing, feeling and loving are expressed through concrete behavior. Since as Karl Rahner points out, the human person is not divided into unrelated and distinct parts, the spiritual dimension influences the integration of the person as a whole.¹⁵ The physical body and psyche are affected as a whole by one’s options, for example the deliberate, conscious choice to make money at all costs, or to work with the poor will have a positive or negative impact on one’s physical health and social relationships. From this perspective we observe how choices and

¹³A helpful source on Manichaeism and its influences in Augustine’s thinking, is J. K. COYLE, “Saint Augustine’s Manichaean Legacy.” 2002 St. Augustine Lecture. *Augustinian Studies* 34/1 (2003): pp. 1-22.

¹⁴HUNTER, “Dualism” in *NDCS*, p. 299. The Bible interprets the human person as at once bodily and spiritual. Since there is no biblical basis for dualism, especially between body and soul, contemporary effort at holistic thought and a renewed appreciation for creation “is nearer to biblical thought than the intervening nineteen centuries of Christian tradition.” See S. NOFFKE, “Soul” in *NDCS*, p. 910.

¹⁵“The declaration of the Council of Vienne claims that the *anima* is the *forma corporis* that must be taken seriously. [The human person] is really ‘substantially’ one, and not the final addition of two beings, which could be thought of, at least, as originally existing in themselves. All [the human person’s] characteristics, despite their real differences, must always be considered as determining the one [person], and none of them can be adequately grasped except as applying to the whole.” K. RAHNER, “Person” in *Encyclopedia of Theology: A Concise Sacramentum Mundi*. K. Rahner, ed. London: Burns and Oates, 1975, p. 1223.

decisions are grounded in the notion of human desire.

Desire, a heart-hunger, is a component of the spiritual dimension. It is defined as the “fire within,” “an existential ache,” “a restless force” driving the person toward beauty and a fuller life. Desire needs to be channeled and directed into beliefs, affects and behaviors associated with transformation.¹⁶ Nevertheless, one has to use caution when speaking about the spiritual dimension and not to confuse it with spirituality. For example, when theologian Ronald Rolheiser says “what we effectively do with desire is our spirituality,” he opens a door wide for ambiguity to enter in because he takes an aspect of the spiritual dimension -- desire -- and identifies it as “spirituality.”¹⁷

III. Spirituality and “meaning of life”

“Spirituality” needs a definition that can draw wide consensus. The cloud of confusion hanging over the term evaporates if we link it with the expression “meaning of life.” How do we understand this expression and its connection with spirituality? Is the popular interest in spirituality symptomatic of some relationship in contemporary society?

“One of the symptoms of alienation in the modern age is the widespread sense of meaninglessness.”¹⁸ Jungian analyst Edward Edinger says that many patients seek psychotherapy not to eliminate a cause behind a disorder but because they feel their lives

¹⁶See L. SPERRY, “Approaches to Transformation.” *Human Development* 22/1 (2001), p. 19.

¹⁷R. ROLHEISER, *The Holy Longing. The Search for a Christian Spirituality*. Toronto: Doubleday, 1999, p. 5.

¹⁸E. EDINGER, *Ego and Archetype*. New York: G. P. Putnam’s Sons, 1972, p. 107. Viktor Frankl links psychic health with meaning in human existence in his founding principles of logotherapy. See V. FRANKL, *Man’s Search for Meaning*. First published in 1946 as *Ein Psycholog erlebt das Konzentrationslager*. New York and Toronto: Washington Square Press, 1959 (reprint 1985).

no longer have any meaning. The word “meaning” can be used in two ways. The first is more abstract and conveys objective information, like the nature of a sign. The red traffic light “means” stop. The second way, for Edinger, is not abstract but “a psychological state, which can affirm life” and where “things come together,” as seen in a symbol. This is not an abstract concept but something “living” which “relates us organically to life as a whole.” The nature of symbol is operative at this level and manifests itself in “dreams, myths, and works of art.”¹⁹ So a more adequate phrasing of the question ‘what is the meaning of life?’ may be “what is the meaning of *my* life?”

The expression “meaning of *my* life” implies how we view life “hanging together” and our place within it. We may view our existence abstractly, sarcastically or with a sense of purpose. For some, like Camus, life is absurd and has no meaning whatsoever. For others life is worthwhile, has meaning mediated through symbols, ritual, and a purpose of relatedness within a larger scheme, be it of a cosmic or divine relationship.²⁰ In this sense the expression “meaning of life” is a key component in understanding the notion of spirituality as the “art of living.” A coherent relationship between one’s beliefs and behavior, between inner convictions, priorities, and valued symbols, is what sustains “meaning” in a spirituality. Let us explore this term further.

¹⁹The word *symbol* comes from the Greek *symbolon* which combines *sym-*, meaning together or with, and *bolon-*, meaning that which has been thrown. The basic meaning is thus “that which has been thrown together.” See EDINGER, *Ego and Archetype*, p. 130. *Webster’s Third New International Dictionary*, Springfield, Mass.: Merriam-Webster Inc., Pub., 1993, p. 2316, indicates the original use of “symbol” means “to throw at the devil.” *Diabolos*, from which we have the word “diabolical” means “throwing apart” (*diabol* at p. 621 and *dis* at p. 642 meaning “apart, to pieces.”)

²⁰See S. WOLF, “Life, Meaning of,” in *Routledge Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, New York: Routledge, 1998, pp. 630-633.

Little has been written about the term “meaning of life” in the 1990's as compared to the 1960's and 1970's.²¹ Resources indicate that the expression “meaning of life” has two dimensions: 1) an understanding of how we live our lives in view of our ultimate destiny and 2) what constitutes a commitment to that particular goal. Meaning of life necessarily involves a certain rationale why one chooses to live in a certain way as opposed to another. This rationale is determined by how one understands the “ultimate destiny,” which most of the religions propose as an answer. Without a clear focus on what is the “ultimate,” we become subject to the whim of other forces within or from outside the self. Work addiction, alcohol and drug abuse are some of the forces at work and that indicate the modern person’s inability to orientate one’s life.²² There is no direction or true north against which decisions and choices can be made, and so one is constantly searching for the key that will provide new avenues to life’s ultimate meaning and purpose. As long as one remains on a type of “quest,” the choice to make a commitment that involves every aspect of human existence will be postponed.

²¹ Thomas Merton deals with this subject in “The war within us” in *The New Man*, New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 1961 (reprint 1999): pp. 3-20. Merton says, “For a man to be alive. . . he must think intelligently . . . direct his actions by free decisions, made in the light of his own thinking. These decisions must tend to his own intellectual and moral and spiritual growth . . . more aware of his capacities for knowledge and for free action . . . expand and extend his power to love others, and to dedicate himself to their good; for it is in this that he finds his own fulfilment” (p. 7). T. METZ, “The Concept of a Meaningful Life.” *American Philosophical Quarterly*, 38/2 (2001), p. 151, note 2. See T. MULDOON, “Why Young Adults need Ignatian spirituality.” *America* 184/6 (2001), pp. 8-14. On the meaning of life in the context of religious life, see E. BIANCHI, “La vida religiosa: Signo profético creíble?” *Confer* 40/153 (2001), p. 44. See also R. W. HEPBURN, “Questions about the Meaning of Life.” *Religious Studies* 1(1965): pp. 125-40; M. P. LEVINE, “What does death have to do with the meaning of life?” *Religious Studies* 23 (1987): pp. 457-465.

²²E. WHITMONT, *The Symbolic Quest*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1969 (reprint 1991), p. 17. See R. ROLHEISER, *The Shattered Lantern.: rediscovering a felt presence of God*. New York: Crossroad Pub., 2001, Chapter 2, regarding societal and cultural factors, like “narcissism, pragmatism, unbridled restlessness, and the non-contemplative personality,” which all militate against the formation of an interior life.

Secondly, what constitutes a commitment, then, is how values, beliefs, inner convictions are shaped by one's ultimate aims in life. A coherent relationship exists between beliefs and actions. For example, some commit themselves to a rigid vegetarian diet because of their particular belief in the sacredness of life and relationship between animals and human beings.²³

We find this coherency implicated in spirituality. The Indian Sebastian Kappen defines spirituality as:

not in opposition to materiality or carnality but to mean the manner in which humans transcend themselves and reach out to the ultimate possibilities of their existence. As such, spirituality entails both an understanding of the deepest meaning of human existence and a commitment to realizing the same.²⁴

Kappen draws a relationship between spirituality and beliefs regarding the “meaning of life.” In general, spirituality involves “the individual and unique experience,”²⁵ a desire to reach out beyond oneself, to something “ultimate” and “transcendent. Thus, an essential element is given in order to reach the needed consensus how to define spirituality in a broader sense. From this viewpoint, we may see how Christian spirituality embraces

²³ An example from a Christian context is Ignatius of Loyola's (1491-1556) “First Principle and Foundation” in the *Spiritual Exercises* describes a life with meaning and an invitation to live in a certain manner: “Human beings are created to praise, reverence and serve God our Lord, and by means of this to save their souls” [23]. Cf. G. GANSS (ed.), *Ignatius of Loyola: The Spiritual Exercises and selected works*. New York: Paulist Press, 1991, p. 130. See also MULDOON, “Why Young Adults need Ignatian spirituality,” pp. 9-10.

²⁴S. KAPPEN, “Spirituality in the New Age of Recolonization.” *Concilium* 4, (1994), p. 33. See also E. BIANCHI, *Words for the Inner Life*. Ottawa: Novalis, 2002, p. 28: Bianchi, Italian founder of the ecumenical community in Bose, says: “There is a constant that has accompanied me in this journey in Christian spirituality, and it is the conviction that *our life has a meaning* and that it is not our task to invent it or determine it, but simply to discover it present and active in us and around us. Once we have recognized it, we are given the freedom to welcome it.”

²⁵ROSE, “Is the term ‘spirituality,’” p. 205.

particular beliefs in the meaning of life and a manner of living in accordance with the beliefs disclosed by Jesus and his Living Message.²⁶

IV. Christian spirituality and its many expressions²⁷

Unlike popular spirituality, Christian spirituality has a foundation and clear boundaries of meaning on how “life hangs together.” We unfold its characteristics by looking at the history of the term “spirituality,” Christian spirituality as the art of living the Gospel of Jesus and its varied expressions. Sufficient space is given to elucidate the core elements that constitute Augustinian spirituality.

A. Brief history of the term “spirituality”²⁸

Since so much has been written about the history of spirituality, we can only make general comments on its development. The Latin term *spiritualitas* is derived from the noun *spiritus* and the adjective *spiritalis* or *spiritualis*.²⁹ These words are used as translations of Paul’s use of the Greek words *pneuma* (*spiritus*) and *pneumatikos* (*spiritualis*) and are set

²⁶See J. W. FOWLER, *Stages of Faith: The Psychology of Human Development and the Quest for Meaning*. San Francisco, Calif.: Harper & Row, 1981. F. FERDER and J. HEAGLE, *Tender Fires: The Spiritual Promise of Sexuality*. New York: Crossroad, 2002.

²⁷For a history of Christian spirituality see P. SHELDRAKE, *Spirituality & History: Questions of Interpretation and Method*, Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 1991 (reprint 1995). The author introduces new perspectives on how spiritualities embody social and cultural values of that historical period. Some spiritualities were sources of oppression against other “minor voices” as well. For Internet resources on Christian Spirituality, see A. MCGRATH, *Christian Spirituality: An introduction*, Malden, Mass: Blackwell, 1999, pp. 175-177. For an analysis of the term “spirituality” connected with the qualifier *pneumatikos* in the New Testament, see M. MCINTOSH, *Mystical Theology: The Integrity of Spirituality and Theology*. Oxford: Blackwell Pub., 1998, p. 6. A description of different types of literature on spirituality can be found in M. DOWNEY, “Spiritual Writing, Contemporary” in *NDCS*, pp. 916-922, especially pp. 917-919.

²⁸Much of this survey is taken from PRINCIPE, “Toward defining spirituality,” pp. 127-141, J. LECLERCQ, “Spiritualitas,” *Studi medievali*, serie terza, (1962), pp. 279-296, and A. SOLIGNAC, “Spiritualité” in *DS* vol. 14, col. 1142-1160.

²⁹PRINCIPE, “Toward defining spirituality,” p. 130.

over against *sarx* or *caro* (flesh) and not in opposition to *soma* or *corpus* (matter, substance).³⁰ For Paul the opposition or contrast is not between the immaterial and the material, but between two ways of life: one that is guided by the Spirit of God and one that opposes the guidance of the Spirit of God.

The earliest use of the word *spiritualitas* so far is found in an anonymous letter attributed to Pseudo-Jerome from the first part of the fifth century. The letter urges the person to live a life in accordance to the Spirit of God: “So act as to advance in spirituality.”³¹ The use of the word is in consonance with the original Pauline sense³² and with other writers like Gregory of Nyssa and into the thirteenth-century. In the Middle Ages, however, the word *spiritualitas* took a turn in nuance to designate ecclesiastical property or a person in contrast to the property of a royal figure, designated as *temporalitas*.³³

In seventeenth-century France the word *spiritualité* indicated a more religious sense of the devout life or a life of prayer. The active life became distinct from contemplation and emotions of enthusiasm, hence the term fell from commonplace vocabulary by the First Vatican Council (1869-1870).³⁴

³⁰PRINCIPE, “Toward defining spirituality,” p. 130. See *Gal.* 3:3, 5:13, 16-25; *1Cor.* 3:1-3; *Rom.* 7-8.

³¹ “Age ut in spiritualitate proficias.” PSEUDO-JEROME, *Epist.* 7 (PL 30, 114D-115A), quoted by LECLERCQ, ““Spiritualitas,”” n. 2, p. 280.

³²LECLERCQ, ““Spiritualitas,”” n. 2, pp. 280-281.

³³PRINCIPE, “Toward defining spirituality,” p. 131.

³⁴R. WOODS, “Spirituality, Christian (Catholic), History of” in *NDCS*, p. 945. The suppression of the Orders and monasteries during the French Revolution might also have been a factor.

By the early 1900's the term *spiritualité* resurfaces in various works and later in translations.³⁵ By mid-century *spiritualité* is still connected to the soul (*la vie de l'âme*) in opposition to the material body, but is also identified with the following of a life style of a certain person: "a variety of principles that rule the spiritual life of a person, group . . . the spirituality of Saint Francis."³⁶ This last meaning reflects the growth of the historical studies of *spirituality* or *spiritualities*.³⁷ To date, however, no dictionary identifies the recent use of the word "spirituality" to designate a branch of study.³⁸ Nevertheless, there are courses and degrees offered on spirituality and the history of spiritualities.³⁹

³⁵We find these works by Auguste Saudreau's *Manuel de spiritualité* (1916) and Pierre Pourrat's four-volume *La spiritualité catholique* (1918-1928). The *Dictionnaire de spiritualité ascétique et mystique* begins its publication in 1937. More significant of the development of the term is found in Paul Robert's *Dictionnaire alphabétique et analogique de la langue française* (1964).

A. SAUDREAU's text *Vie d'union* (1900) was translated from the third edition by E. J. Strickland only in 1927 under the title *The Life of Union with God, and the Means of Attaining It, According to the Great Masters of Spirituality*, London: Burns, Oates and Washbourne. See PRINCIPE, "Toward defining spirituality," p. 134, n. 42.

In the English language, Rolheiser says, the word "spirituality" has only become part of our common vocabulary within the last thirty years. ROLHEISER, *The Holy Longing*, p. 5. ROSE, "Is the term 'spirituality'?", p. 205 and 207, makes a similar observation in terms of the "paucity of words" in English available for identifying different types of spirituality, in contrast to the German root *Geist* (spirit) which has a number of meaningful derivations.

It is worth noting that fifteenth century French spirituality has not yet been studied adequately. See D. GUTIERREZ, *The Augustinians in the Middle Ages 1357-1517*. Vol. I, part II. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Historical Institute, 1983, p. 57, note 12, citing F. RAPP, "France - 'Le 15e siècle'" in *DS* 5, col. 891: "Le 15e siècle spirituel français n'a pas encore fait l'objet d'une solide étude d'ensemble."

³⁶P. ROBERT, *Dictionnaire alphabétique et analogique de la langue française*, vol. 6, Paris: Société du Nouveau Littré, 1964, p. 531: "ensemble des principes qui règlent la vie spirituelle d'une personne, d'un groupe . . . la spiritualité de saint François."

³⁷PRINCIPE, "Toward defining spirituality," p. 133.

³⁸PRINCIPE, "Toward defining spirituality," p. 135. As early as 1953 Thomas Merton and Jean Leclercq have exchanged correspondence over the concern on how theology and spirituality can be reconciled with each other as disciplines. See P. HART (ed.), *Survival or Prophecy? The letters of Thomas Merton and Jean Leclercq*. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2002, p. 38.

³⁹The entire issue of *Theoforum* 33/1 (2002) is a thematic issue from the August 2001 Symposium "Spirituality at the University."

In the academic field, studies began to appear on the spirituality of specific, holy persons, like

B. Spirituality as the “art of living the Gospel”

Christian spirituality is defined by the Dominican theologian J. H. Nicholas as the “art of conforming one self to Jesus Christ under the action of the Holy Spirit, the art of living the Gospel.”⁴⁰ The “art” is the manner in which one shapes one’s life in light of “ultimate possibilities of existence.” By turning to the Gospels, the Christian adopts a style and direction for living. For example, a life rooted in love is vital because the human person was created out of love and is called into a personal relationship with God who is Love and through whom one’s identity as *imago Dei* is discovered and realized. Through deep human intimacy and passion we embrace the divine in the mystery of love and communion, of encounter and absence, as portrayed in the *Song of Songs*.⁴¹ All life is ultimately gift from

the spirituality of St. Francis. “Biblical spirituality” looked to certain aspects found in the scriptures. The spirituality of different historical periods and groups, like desert spirituality and orthodox spirituality, came under study. The word became extended to include non-Christian groups like the spirituality of Islam and Hinduism. Eventually articles began to appear on the spirituality of the Mass, baptism, family and laity. Some studies involve the spirituality of the human voice and of matter. L. DE VIENNE, *La spiritualité de la voix*. Paris: Cerf, 1960, and R. LINNSEN, *Spiritualité de la matière*. Paris: Éditions Planète, 1966.

⁴⁰J. H. NICHOLAS, “Que faut-il entendre par ‘spiritualité’?” *La Vie Spirituelle*, 139 (1985), p. 529: “L’art de se conformer à Jésus Christ sous l’action du Saint-Esprit, l’art de vivre selon l’Évangile.” See B. MCGINN, “The Letter and the Spirit: Spirituality as an Academic Discipline.” *Christian Spirituality Bulletin*, (Fall 1993): p. 3: “*Spiritualis*, the Latin translation of *pneumatikos*, appears 22 times in the Vulgate of St. Jerome, but it was not until the fifth century that we find the noun *spiritualitas*, appearing in a letter anciently ascribed to St. Jerome: ‘Age ut in spiritualitate proficias,’ that is, ‘Act in order to grow in spirituality’ (PL 30:115A).” The development of the term *spirituality* is treated in the next section.

⁴¹FERDER and HEAGLE, *Tender Fires*, pp. 64 and 68: “The sensuous poetry of the Song of Songs strikes remarkable parallels and contrasts with the story of Adam and Eve. The setting is once again in a garden and the Eden-like surroundings return us to an atmosphere of harmony, beauty, and delight . . . Perhaps the most important lesson from the Song of Songs is that of love’s mystery and goodness in the midst of struggle. Diversity and unity, differentiation *and* mutuality, are integral to God’s dream for the universe. The call to partnership between woman and man is God’s creative intention, and even though that companionship is bruised and wounded by human exploitation, God promises healing for relationships and redemption for our fractured intimacy. No matter how risky human intimacy may appear to be, it still leads to deeper life and fulfillment. No amount of human selfishness or oppression can obliterate the image of God at the center of every sunrise and smiling face. What God created in the

the Creator and the creature acknowledges this gift of love with gratitude.

The path to this communion of love and thanksgiving is the “art of conforming oneself” to the life and teachings of Jesus of Nazareth who says “I am the way, the truth, and the life.”⁴² As an itinerant preacher, teacher, and healer, he seeks every opportunity to bring men and women into a communion as “brothers and sisters.” He felt deep compassion for the sick and suffering poor in his day. He taught with examples from every day life how those marginalized by society and religious institutions are to be received into the communion because they too are “bearers of the Good News.” Jesus remains in constant contact and vigilance with God through prayer, either alone or with his companions. Through this communion with God he is able to love even his enemies to the point of death. Even in the darkest hours of anguish and apparent abandonment, Jesus trusts in the communion of love as having the last word in any situation that divides and dehumanizes.

When St. Paul says “make your own the mind of Christ”⁴³ he invites each man and woman to collaborate with the Spirit of Love in their task of reshaping their lives as they look to the Jesus of compassion, humility, and trust in the face of everything that contradicts the communion of love.⁴⁴ His obedience is a result of deep prayer and communion with the Father from which his ministry and hope for the future communities

divine image and saw as very good continues to be a source of grace and communion. ‘Love,’ the Song of Songs reminds us, ‘is strong as death; . . . many waters cannot quench love, neither can floods drown it’ (Sg. 8:6-7).”

⁴²*Jn.* 14:6.

⁴³*Phil.* 2:5.

⁴⁴For some practical questions related to naming a spirituality, see M. LAGUË, “Nommer et s’appropriier sa spiritualité: Art de vivre et pédagogie.” *Église et Théologie* 29 (1998): pp. 7-30.

flows: “that they may be one as we are one.”⁴⁵ Christian spirituality, as the “art of living the Gospels,” looks to love as the center point around which everything revolves, participates, and derives its meaning.⁴⁶ But Christian spirituality is not something “ethereal;” it has “embodiment” in particular time and place throughout history. How has the word “spirituality” evolved?

C. Christian spirituality and its varied expressions

Christian spirituality, embraced by either a person or group (community), refers to the “art of living” and following the person of Jesus of Nazareth, and incorporating his teaching, motivation and mission into our lives. But Christian spirituality exists only through particular expressions we call “specific spiritualities.” Indeed, the Gospel is the *norm or foundation* for all expressions of spirituality and the test for authentic spirituality.⁴⁷ To better understand the link between Christian spirituality and specific spiritualities we may compare it with the relationship between different local churches. The universal Church exists only through the reality of local churches. The same is true for Christian spirituality with its many particular expressions. In fact, the Gospel provides the themes which shape one’s actions and behavior based on Jesus’ manner of living, his gestures and

⁴⁵Jn. 17:11.

⁴⁶For a study on the reform of words, see G. VANN, “The Writer as Creator.” *New Blackfriars* 35 (1954): pp. 358-363. The manner in which meaning is expressed will vary from time and place. Words like “charity” (*caritas*) may have “lost all the grandeur and immensity of *caritas* . . . and has ceased to mean an attitude of will and become a matter of feeling.” “The need is obvious: a reform, a cleansing, but at the same time a constant renewal, a craftsmanship in the making and using of words which will really be vehicles of meaning as well as sound and beautiful in themselves” (p. 359).

⁴⁷H. URS VON BALTHASAR, “The Gospel as Norm and Test of all Spirituality in the Church.” *Concilium* 9/1 (1965), pp. 5-13. T. DUNNE, “Experience” in *NDCS*, p. 365: to be a Christian “means embracing an agenda” which is the Gospel. Cf. SPOHN, “Spiritual Practices,” pp. 277-283.

the way he looked at or embraced someone, as well as his attitudes of openness, kindness and compassion. In consequence, some people make commitments: option for the poor, care for the handicapped, work in education or prisons, to name a few.

Since no one can live all the values in the gospels with the same intensity, Christian spirituality means embracing a particular value and expression which develops as a *specific* spirituality. Integral to living a specific spirituality requires a definite turn to Jesus' message, attitudes and gestures as expressed in the gospels, such as compassion or trust as privileged expressions. A specific expression of Christian spirituality requires commitment because it is a response to a call and an understanding of human life, as previously cited by Kappen. According to the personal psychology, character, temperament, times, culture and needs, the person makes a preferential selection of themes and values that makes sense for that individual's life and for the life of the world.

Caution is required, nevertheless, to make sure that a specific spirituality does not develop into a sort of gnostic exercise as a flight from the world or into an individualism that even groups, and not just persons, can succumb. A specific spirituality, in order to avoid a certain aberration equating it with an utopian endeavor, must take into account that a lived faith in the person Jesus of Nazareth gives us meaning and, consequently, one makes a personal commitment to live this faith with seriousness in the present historical moment and cultural milieu. For this reason, the Word of God will remain a priority and a kind of contemplative listening and faith-stance in the world (*Rom. 10:17*).⁴⁸ Prayer,

⁴⁸*Rom. 10:17* (NIV): "Faith comes from hearing the message, and the message is heard through the word of Christ." See also M. LAGUË, "La non-pertinence des catégories masculine, féminine, féministe en spiritualité chrétienne." *Cahiers de Spiritualité Ignatienne* 106 (2003), p. 22: "L'écoute dit la

likewise, will become an important source for nourishment and meaning on how we live in a given environment where such a practice may not have much value. A realistic view of spirituality incorporates “something *lived* in a most personal, serious way -- the integral life that faith in Jesus Christ gives us as we live in *this* century, among *these* [people], in *this* world.”⁴⁹

In view of the aforementioned, can we give a concise definition of specific spirituality for this present study? The Benedictine theologian Dom Ghislain Lafont defines a specific spirituality as: “*a certain way of understanding the Gospel, a sort of selection and ordering of values and themes that contain or result in a certain style of life.*”⁵⁰ This kind of synthesis gives birth to different spiritualities like the spirituality of compassion and spirituality of the Eucharist.⁵¹ Individuals or groups will select and rank one theme more important than the others because of personalities and spiritual climates, characterized by a certain equilibrium among the various elements that are to be found in every Christian spirituality,⁵² such as asceticism, mental or mystical prayer, liturgical prayer and the practice of virtues.

disponibilité du coeur et de l'esprit qui consentent à se laisser instruire.”

⁴⁹A.-M. BESNARD, “Lignes de force des tendances spirituelles contemporaines.” *Concilium* 9 (1965), p. 28: “spiritualité propose un projet terriblement ambitieux et exigeant, où il s’agit de *vivre*, de la façon la plus personnalisée et la plus grave, la vie intégrale que la foi en Jésus-Christ nous donne à vivre en ce siècle-ci, parmi ces hommes-ci, au milieu de ce monde-ci.” Emphasis is mine.

⁵⁰G. LAFONT, *Imaginer l’Église catholique*. Paris: Les Éditions du Cerf, 1995, p. 140: “Une spiritualité est une certaine manière de comprendre l’Évangile, une sorte de sélection et de mise en ordre des valeurs qu’il contient d’où résulte un certain style de vie.”

⁵¹ For a treatment of the feminine/masculine aspects of Christian spirituality, see LAGUË, “La non-pertinence des catégories,” pp. 9-28.

⁵²F. VANDENBROUCKE, “Spirituality and Spiritualities.” *Concilium* 1/9 (1965): p. 27.

A specific spirituality takes form when different people and groups are either inspired themselves or choose to follow the inspiration and guidance of certain holy persons who are identified with a certain theme found with biblical roots. They organize themselves around these men and women; their inspiration, writings, and often a *Rule of Life* are left for future members to follow. A ripple-effect goes outward where others begin to organize themselves around this specific viewpoint. The monasticism of Benedict of Nursia (d. 550) had its emphasis on meekness, obedience and humility. Francis of Assisi (d. 1226) focused on evangelical poverty as a true source of freedom from anything that is not from God. The diverse spiritualities complement each other. As Paul points out, they are like “windows on the gospel” and through their eyes we gaze on the evangelical landscape from a variety of perspectives.⁵³

In summary, the “art of living the Gospel” is integral to Christian spirituality. Since all the values of the Gospel cannot be embraced with the same intensity, different persons or groups will select certain themes to live by because they receive the Gospel in their life as a personal response to a divine call which shapes it, like a masterpiece, as in Augustinian spirituality. Just as there are a variety of artistic expressions, so too, are there many ways of living the Gospel, all giving shape to human lives which can be truly pleasing and beautiful.

⁵³1 *Cor.* 12:4-6: “There are different gifts but the same Spirit; there are different forms of service but the same Lord; there are different workings but the same God who produces all of them in everyone.” People of inspiration in modern times are Thomas Merton (d. 1968), Dorothy Day (d. 1980), Mother Teresa (d. 1997), called the “apostle of joy,” and Gustavo Gutiérrez.

This brief survey serves as background for understanding spirituality in a general Christian framework. It is the art of living, rooted in the Gospel, an experience of faith and how that experience can be studied. We now turn to look at the characteristics of another specific spirituality already mentioned: the “Augustinian.”

D. Augustinian Spirituality: *caritas* as “cet admirable secret”⁵⁴

Augustinian spirituality is a unique way of living the Gospel, following Christ under the inspiration of Augustine of Hippo.⁵⁵ The way, or the specific spirit of the Order,⁵⁶ finds its clearest expression in *caritas*: the great commandment to love God and one’s neighbor. Where other orders focus on a particular aspect, Augustinian spirituality views *caritas* as a whole spectrum with its colorful diversity of expression.

⁵⁴According to R. Russell, “there is no satisfactory work in English on Augustine’s spiritual teaching.” Even though this comment was made in 1976, Robert Dodaro of the *Patristicum* in Rome claims that this statement is still true as of 2002. In Russell’s opinion, the best works so far on this subject are F. CAYRÉ, *La Contemplation Augustinienne: Principes de spiritualité et de théologie*. Bruges, Belgium: Desclée de Brouwer, 1954 and F.J. THONNARD, *Traité de la vie spirituelle à l’école de saint Augustin*. Paris: Bonne Presse, 1959. A reliable summary of Augustine’s spiritual teaching is C. BOYER’s article in *DS*, vol. 1, col. 1101-1130. These sources are referred to in R. RUSSELL’s article “Nature and Foundations of Augustinian Spirituality” in *Second Annual Course on Augustinian Spirituality, Rome - July 1-17, 1976*. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1976, p. 15.

⁵⁵Questions relevant for understanding founders of communities or movements, see SHELDRAKE, *Spirituality & History*, p. 84: Who were they? What are the motivating values? How did they understand their world? How did this world influence their interaction with existing theological and spiritual theory?

⁵⁶The privileged texts will be the *Rule of St. Augustine* and the *Constitutions* (1-239) of the Order of St. Augustine. See B. RANO, “The Charism of the Order of St. Augustine” in *Augustinian Origins, Charism, and Spirituality*. J. Rotelle (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1994, pp. 59-60. See M. CLARK, “Augustinian Spirituality,” in *NDCS*, pp. 66-73 and P. de L. VIZCAINO, *San Agustín: Orden de S. Agustín*. Zamora, Spain: Ediciones Monte Casino, 2000, pp. 159-169. And ZUMKELLER, *Augustine’s Ideal of the Religious Life*. A fine bibliographical resource on Augustine and the Augustinian Order can be found on the Internet [cited 5 December 2003]; available from World Wide Web @ <http://www.augustiniana.org>

Ange Le Proust (1624-1697)⁵⁷ composed on an unknown date the *Traité de la Règle de Saint Augustin* for the *Congrégation des Sœurs de Saint Thomas de Villeneuve*⁵⁸ which was founded in 1661 for “service and assistance to the poor.” This publication, called “a treasure of spirituality” (*un tesoro de espiritualidad*),⁵⁹ was carefully preserved by the sisters in manuscript form.⁶⁰ The core of this spirituality is the “secret:” “this admirable secret consists in inspiring everyone with this important counsel of the apostle: *help carry one another’s burdens; and that way you will fulfill the law of Christ (Gal.*

⁵⁷ Le Proust was born in Poitiers in 1624 and died in Paris in 1697. He was a contemporary of Pascal and Bossuet. He joined the Augustinian community of Bourges. He was a professor of philosophy and theology, prior, and prior provincial.

Most of the studies on the thinking of Le Proust can be found in these sources: three articles by L. CILLERUELO, “Introducción del P. Angel Le Proust a la Regla de S. Agustín.” *Revista Agustiniiana de Espiritualidad* 6 (1965): Part 1, pp. 23-38 and Part 2, pp. 372-385; and “El amor de Dios, dechado del amor del prójimo.” *Revista Agustiniiana de Espiritualidad* 7 (1966): pp. 56-72. L. VERHEIJEN, “Le Père Ange Le Proust et la nature propre de la vie monastique augustiniienne.” *Augustinus* 12 (1967): pp. 485-487. S. KOSTKA, “Le Proust” in *DS* 9, col. 683-685.

⁵⁸VERHEIJEN, *Nouvelle Approche*, p. 15: “pour le service et assistance des pauvres . . . Chose très intéressante: sans être des cloîtrées, ces Sœurs étaient des religieuses au sens strict du terme, ce qui, à cette époque, était une innovation.”

The Congregation was formed to work with hospitals and the poor. In 1670 they began to take vows, wear a habit and follow the Augustinian Constitutions. They grew rapidly throughout France, and because of their dedication, “not even the revolutionary terror stamped them out, even though they had several martyrs and lost a number of houses. Napoleon himself, who had no love for religious, approved of their continuance in 1801, and so the congregation renewed its vitality.” By 1975, their membership numbered 437, with 32 houses in Europe, Senegal and the United States (Norwalk, Connecticut). See J. GAVIGAN, *The Augustinians from the French Revolution to Modern Times*. History of the Order of St. Augustine, vol. IV. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Historical Institute, 1989, p. 300.

⁵⁹L. CILLERUELO, “Introducción del P. Angel Le Proust a la Regla de S. Agustín.” *Revista Agustiniiana de la Espiritualidad* 6 (1965): pp. 23-38; 372-385, especially, p. 23. The *Traicté de la Règle de Saint Augustin* was written during the time when France was celebrating the canonization of St. Thomas of Villanova (1658) and the congregation founded, as mentioned, in 1661 (p. 23).

⁶⁰Only in 1962 was the original manuscript discovered in the convent’s archives. The original French text was published in 1980 and the English translation in 1996. The late publication explains Le Proust’s obscurity, at least in the English-speaking world.

6:2).”⁶¹ The law of Christ is this: “Help carry one another’s burdens; in that way you will fulfill the law of Christ.”⁶² In the opinion of Luc Verheijen and John Rotelle, “ces très belles lignes de notre commun confrère du XVII siècle” are “a propos today and will be of service to posterity in the future.” Augustinian spirituality emphasizes *mutual* charity under the inspiration of the Holy Spirit.⁶³

The *Traité* will be a reference throughout this thesis because the author provides some psychological insights into the self in the context of his interpretation of the *Rule of St. Augustine* of which charity is a central characteristic of Augustinian spirituality.

Even though charity is a virtue common to all religious orders and congregations, it has a special place in Augustinian spirituality. Due to the importance of this point, we will cite what Le Proust says:

Saint Augustine directs all virtues toward the charitable intention of making the way to evangelical perfection easy for one’s neighbor. This is achieved by a union of hearts in the bonds of mutual charity, and in a community whose only aim is to unite and bind individuals together under the same yoke, to bear each other’s

⁶¹A portion of the text is cited in L. VERHEIJEN, *Nouvelle Approche de la Règle de Saint Augustin*. Abbaye de Bellefontaine: Bégrolles en Mauges, 1980, p. 17: “Et cet admirable secret consiste à inspirer à tous cet important conseil de l’Apôtre de supporter la charge l’un de l’autre en accomplissant la loi de Jésus-Christ.” For the English translation: J. ROTELLE (ed.), *Treatise on the Rule of Saint Augustine. Ange Le Proust, O.S.A. 1624-1697*. John A. Otto (trans.), p. 11. Hereafter, *Treatise*. Taken from the old French, *Traicté de la Règle de Saint Augustin*. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1996; text cited by Verheijen is on pp. 9-11. This text was translated into modern French in 1980 but only 200 copies were printed. I am grateful to the *Congrégation des Sœurs de Saint Thomas de Villeneuve* in Paris for having donated a copy of Le Proust’s work to the library at St. Paul University, Ottawa. A. LE PROUST, *Traité de la Règle de Saint Augustin*. [hors commerce] Paris: Jean Munier, 1980. Hereafter, *Traité*. An in-depth study of the *Traité* would make an interesting thesis.

⁶²The citation from *Galatians* is an addition on page 11 of the English translation of Le Proust.

⁶³In reference to *Rom. 5:5*: “The love of God has been poured out in our hearts by the Holy Spirit,” Augustine identifies this mutual love in community with the Holy Spirit. ZUMKELLER, *Augustine’s Ideal of the Religious Life*, p. 129: “From this (*Rom. 5:5*) he infers that his love cannot be in us without the Holy Spirit and that in this love the Holy Spirit Himself is present in us; without expressly saying so, Augustine identifies this love of ours with the Holy Spirit.”

burdens, making this yoke sweet for one another, and its burden light . . . to bind themselves to it by the bonds of Adam, by the bonds of charity, encouraging each other's perseverance, helping each other to support one another. The rich are helped by the poor, the latter by the rich⁶⁴

Words like bond, union, yoke all reflect a type of rhythm of relationships. We are all called by the great commandment to do charity. The Augustinian spirit implies a shared charity where we carry the yoke and burden of the Gospel *together*. This mutuality which makes the command to love possible and life's burden light is the "admirable secret."

1. Toward God through Christ: "ad te"

The secret is rooted in Christ. For this reason, Augustine the bishop tells his congregation: "You simply must believe, and your faith must not waver from Christ, not waver from the gospel, not waver from his promises."⁶⁵ In another sermon he says, "Turn to the gospels for inspiration. Don't waste time on empty entertainment."⁶⁶ Thus, in

⁶⁴ROTELLE, *Treatise*, p. 10. LE PROUST, *Traité*, p. 22: "Saint Augustin oriente toutes les vertus vers la charité, dans l'intention de rendre le chemin de la perfection évangélique facile au prochain, par l'enchaînement des cœurs dans les liens d'une charité réciproque et d'une communauté qui ne vise qu'à unir sous un même joug les individus. Portant les fardeaux les uns des autres (cf. Gal. 6,2), ils se rendent ce joug suave et sa charge légère (Mt. 11,30) . . . Ainsi liés par des liens tendres, des liens de charité, ils se facilitent leur persévérance et leur salut. Ils se soutiennent les uns par les autres; les riches par les pauvres, ceux-ci par les riches"

⁶⁵"Opus est ut credas, et fides tua non deserat Christum, non deserat euangelium, non deserat promissa eius" (S. 159B, 16; F. DOLBEAU, "Nouveaux sermons de saint Augustin pour la conversion des païens et des donatistes (II)." *Revue des Études Augustiniennes* 37 [1991], p. 285). This sermon was preached in February 404 at a place called Tignica (now Ain Tounga) on the southern route from Carthage to Hippo Regius. This town had both a Catholic and a Donatist bishop, who were both present at the conference in Carthage in 411. See *Sermons*, WSA III/11, p. 163, note 1.

⁶⁶"Detur aliqua securitas: uidebimus quanti morbi procedent in medium, quanta luxuria redundabit, maior quam nunc. Securitas equi quies, propter theatra et organa et tibias et pantomimos! Male uis uti eo quod optas, propterea non accipis. Audi, audi, apostolicam uocem, multo liberio rem quam mea est – noui enim quam multos offendam" (S. 114B, 14; F. DOLBEAU, "Nouveaux sermons de saint Augustin pour la conversion des païens et des donatistes (V)." *Revue des Études Augustiniennes* 39 [1993]: p. 84.) This sermon, preached in Carthage in December, 403, may be a composite of two or more other sermons. See *Sermons*, WSA III/11, p. 115, note 1.

speaking about Augustinian spirituality in this thesis, we have our sights on that style of life based on mutual charity centered in Christ, adopted by men and women who turn to and embrace certain themes and values found in Augustine’s writings because they provide meaning and source of inspiration for Christian living and a reaching out to others.⁶⁷

The main characteristics of spirituality as a “reaching out to one’s highest potential” are made visible in Augustinian spirituality through the lens of mutuality and love. The first page of the *Confessiones* describes in a most concise way the human being’s essential relationship and natural orientation towards God, the Creator,⁶⁸ and the essence of Augustinian spirituality – “You have made us and drawn us to yourself, and our heart is unquiet until it rests in you.”⁶⁹ The words *ad te* indicate human nature’s “capacity for the Greatest Nature.”⁷⁰ But we must also note the words *nos* and *nostrum*. Again, Augustinian spirituality is not a private enterprise, but a “reaching out” *together* toward our ultimate possibilities, “our” salvation.

2. Another look at some unpopular ideas

We are aware that Augustine of Hippo inspires this spirituality of the congregation.

⁶⁷Some sources for Augustinian spirituality are the *Second annual course on Augustinian spirituality*, July 1-17, 1976. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1976, and *Searching for God: the contemplative dimension of the Augustinian experience*. International Course on Augustinian Spirituality, July 1-19, 1979. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1981. L. MARÍN DE SAN MARTÍN, “La espiritualidad agustiniana.” *Revista Agustiniana* 35/108 (1994): pp. 925-959.

⁶⁸RUSSELL, “Nature and Foundations of Augustinian Spirituality,” p. 16.

⁶⁹“*Quia fecisti nos ad te, et inquietum est cor nostrum donec requiescat in te*” (*Conf.* 1, 1, 1; *CCL* 27, 1.)

⁷⁰“*Quoniam enim magna natura sit, tamen vitari potuit, quia summa non est: et quoniam vitari potuerit, quia summa non est, tamen quia summae naturae capax est, et esse particeps potest, magna natura est*” (*Trin.* 14, 4, 6; *CCL* 50A, 429).

Today many find various aspects of this bishop's thought problematic and even odd that he is considered as an inspiration for harmony. We may understand why there is this kind of reluctance, nevertheless, we may also acknowledge a tremendous impact on the Church and society in the West, for better and for worse, regarding some of his teachings on sexuality, dualism, and the use of military force, of which some are to be questioned, for they no longer fit to the experiences of modern times.⁷¹ At the same time, these conflicting issues present an ideal opportunity for applying the principles of hermeneutics and for avoiding the dangers of presentism. He is a man of his era. We must understand him in that evolving context and acknowledge the fact that much of his teaching has suffered the consequences of misinterpretation. One must be cautious of making hasty judgements.

The bishop of Hippo often changes his mind on many fronts and, consequently, it is necessary to ask when and in what historical circumstances did he write his ideas. He is one of the few thinkers of antiquity who reviews his written works and edits them with new understandings and insights later in his life. His *Retractationes* is a testimony to this task of evaluation.

Nevertheless, Augustine continues to supply us with viewpoints that are still valid

⁷¹Scholarship has shown that Augustine's life and writings (the two cities, sin, *concupiscentia*, and predestination) are linked to Manichaeism. For this study see COYLE, "Saint Augustine's Manichaean Legacy," pp. 1-22. R. DODARO and G. LAWLESS, *Augustine and his Critics*. London: Routledge, 2000, is "a balanced selection of articles discussing with critics and responding, not in a confrontational manner, but as part of a dialogue in the search for truth" – quoted in A. FITZGERALD, "El Estudio de Agustín Hoy." *Revista Agustiniiana* 42/129 (2001), pp. 1187-1188. See M. SCANLON, "The Augustinian Tradition: A Retrieval." *Augustinian Studies* 20 (1989), pp. 61-92, and G. DALY, "Saint Augustine and Modern Theology," in *Augustinian Spirituality and the Charism of the Augustinians*. J. Rotelle (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1995, pp. 19-31. M. NOLAN, "Have Augustinians anything to say that the world needs to hear?" in *Second Annual Course*, pp. 239-242. Nolan says the first step is to look at the world, and then at Augustine's thought.

for living the Gospel in the contemporary context, such as mutual charity. New terrain for exploration is the role of desire and what it means to be a person in the bishop's thinking.⁷² Having said this, in order to understand this spirituality in its broader contours we begin from two perspectives, namely, Augustine's *Rule*, for it is the carrier of the spirituality and "the central document on which Augustinians, as Augustinians, model their lives"⁷³ and the Order's *Constitutions*, important for understanding their identity and mission.

3. First Perspective: Augustine's Rule for "lovers of spiritual beauty"⁷⁴

The first perspective looks at Augustine as the source of inspiration and guide of a spiritual tradition.⁷⁵ This tradition finds its "carrier" in Augustine's *Rule*, a set of guidelines for relationships and the already mentioned "secret" of mutual charity in a community. Where there is a union of hearts, minds, and purpose, a certain beauty of humanity comes to light as an attractive force. For this reason, the *Rule* is designed for

⁷²Gadamer refers to the process of recollecting what is significant as "effective tradition." See H-G, GADAMER, *Truth and Method*. New York: Crossroad, 1982, pp. 305-341. See SCANLON, "The Augustinian Tradition," pp. 61-92, regarding a retrieval of the notions on God, anthropology, history, will, person, grace, and love.

⁷³T. X. MARTIN, "The Augustinian Order" in *Second annual course on Augustinian spirituality*, July 1-17, 1976. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1976, p. 87.

⁷⁴Sources for the *Rule* are: *S.* 355-356; *Ep.* 83, 210, 211, 213, 216, 243; POSSIDIUS, *Vita*, n. 11, 22-31. See C. BOYER, "Augustin (saint)." *DS* vol. 1, col. 1126-1130. G. LAWLESS, "Regula," in *Augustine through the Ages. An Encyclopedia*. A. Fitzgerald (ed.). Grand Rapids, Mi.: William B. Eerdmans, 1999, pp. 707-709. Hereafter *AA*. K. MADIGAN, "Regula, Use After Augustine" in *AA*, pp. 709-710.

⁷⁵*Const.* 21: The fundamental document of this spirituality is the *Rule*. This is complemented by the special characteristics that pertain to an apostolic fraternity, considered in the light of the entire teaching and distinguished example of our holy father Augustine, "who is to be the model and rule of our every action."

“lovers of spiritual beauty.”⁷⁶ What were the events that led up to the composition of this document as a “carrier” of spirituality?

a) Background development of the Rule

Augustine is often described as the theologian, philosopher or bishop, and rarely as the monk.⁷⁷ The spark that ignited his interest about the monastic life occurred before his conversion while he was “studying intensely the scriptures”⁷⁸ especially the letters of Paul, and the chance conversation about the Christian life style of the Egyptian monk Antony (c. 250-356).⁷⁹

Augustine admired and imitated the ascetic denial (*renoncement ascétique*) of Anthony.⁸⁰ After his conversion (386) Augustine decided to live in community with close friends, bound by an informal agreement or “concordat,”⁸¹ and devoted himself to a

⁷⁶*Rule VIII, 1*: “The Lord grant that you may observe all these precepts in a spirit of charity as lovers of spiritual beauty, giving forth the good odor of Christ in the holiness of your lives” (See Appendix 1).

⁷⁷See page 8, footnote 11, on how the term “monk” is used in this thesis. See ZUMKELLER, *Augustine’s Ideal of the Religious Life*, p. 132 and MARTIN, “The Augustinian Order,” p. 87.

⁷⁸See *Ep. 21*, written to Valerius, the bishop of Hippo, before Easter of 391 and shortly after Valerius ordained Augustine to the priesthood. Augustine requests time off to study the scriptures more intensely so that he can know best how to minister to others.

⁷⁹*Conf. 8, 6, 14-15*.

⁸⁰BOYER, “Augustin (saint),” col. 1126.

⁸¹Ange Le Proust calls this agreement for living the “Concordat for Monks,” or Augustine’s First *Rule*. Later, with the organization of a community, Augustine saw that this body had to be inspired and “animated” by the spirit of God. For this reason, he puts in first place the commandment of love: “Before all things let God be loved.” This became the Second *Rule* (*Ad servos Dei*). His Third *Rule* (*ep. 109*) had the aim of removing obstacles in the formation of community. In the second chapter, he places emphasis on communal and individual prayer: “Attend eagerly to prayer.” See ROTELLE, *Treatise*, pp. 22, 30-31; LE PROUST, *Traité*, pp. 41-42, 53-54.

contemplative life style⁸² in Cassiciacum, Italy, and then at his family's estate in Thagaste, North Africa.

Having been inspired initially by the reading of the scriptures and the discourse on monastic living in Egypt and Milan, Augustine never abandoned the idea of living in a contemplative community together with others as “servants of God” and being “poor in spirit,” even when he assumed the burden and duties of a bishop. Eventually, he wrote a rule of life and established a monastery of clerics (*monasterium clericorum*) in his own episcopal residence and other communities throughout the diocese of Hippo Regius. His monasteries were founded on the “principles of charity of the Gospel.”⁸³ Some writers indicate that the *Rule*, written at a time of cultural upheaval and when the barbarian invasions were underway, was composed for a community of men, probably the lay community in Hippo.⁸⁴

b) Values and priorities expressed in the Rule

Even though the bishop of Hippo never wrote a systematic work on his spiritual

⁸²M. CLARK, “Augustinian spirituality.” *Augustinian Studies* 15 (1984), pp. 83-92: “Although Augustine might not have referred to his life with God as spirituality, the need to use this word of one’s intimate religious life is somewhat rooted in the Augustinian experience as well as in the historical development of European Christianity into Christendom” (p. 84).

⁸³ BOYER, “Augustin (saint),” col. 1126-1127.

⁸⁴Augustine comments on the invasions, namely the attack on Rome in *civ Dei* and in *s.105*, 296 and 397. Verheijen cleared up much of the ambiguity surrounding the origin and development of the *Rule* in his valuable resource: *La règle de saint Augustin*. Paris, Études augustiniennes, 1967. See A. ZUMKELLER, *Augustine’s Rule: A Commentary*. Matthew J. O’Connell (trans.) and John E. Rotelle (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1987, p. 13. E. A. MATTER, “Women” in *AA*, p. 890 says: “The last part of *epistula* 211 is the basic substance of Augustine’s monastic *Rule (Regula)*.” See also T. VIÑAS ROMÁN, “Regula ad servos Dei y teología de la liberación.” *Augustinus* 38 (1993), pp. 527-547. B. RAMSEY (ed.), *Saint Augustine: The Monastic Rules*. A. Mary and G. Bonner (trans.) and G. Bonner (commentary). Hyde Park, N.Y.: New City Press, 2004.

doctrine,⁸⁵ in what manner is his *Rule*, barely ten pages in length (3000 words) and the oldest monastic rule in Western Christianity, a reflection of his mind set, values and priorities regarding Christian living?⁸⁶ In order to have a glimpse of Augustine's religious insights one needs to look at the scripture texts he privileged.

In these references to the Scriptures Augustine's own vision and spirituality come to light, for the biblical ideas which he emphasizes are the cherished sources from which he himself lives. It is precisely this biblical and evangelic foundation which forms the permanent structure of the *Rule*: it guarantees the *Rule*'s value throughout changing times and cultures.⁸⁷

The opening line of the *Rule* (1,2) says “*Before all else, live together in harmony (Ps. 68:7), being of one mind and one heart (Acts 4:32) on the way to God*” and “*For this is what you read in the Acts of the Apostles: Everything they owned was held in common, and each one received whatever he had need of (Acts 4:32, 35).*”⁸⁸ Augustine had a burning

⁸⁵Of the important sources on this subject identified in BOYER, “Augustin (saint),” col. 1104-1105, primary work is the *Confessions* (397-400) which was the most popular until the *Imitation of Christ. The Trinity* (400-416) provides the theoretical foundations for piety. The *City of God* (413-426/7), especially, Books 5, 8-12, 19-22, the *Sermons on the Psalms* (396-420), part preached and part written, the *Sermons, Tracts on John*, and *Letter to Parthos* (413-418), and the pastoral *Letters* 26, 118, 130, 188, 210, 211, are significant writings. Two spiritual treatises were written around 400-401: *On the work of monks* and *On holy virginity*. Two texts from the young Augustine are *Two Soliloquies* (386-387) and *On the Blessed Life* (386). On preaching in antiquity, see G. KENNEDY, *Greek rhetoric under Christian emperors*. Princeton, N. J. : Princeton University Press, 1983, pp. 180-186.

⁸⁶SHELDRAKE, *Spirituality & History*, pp. 120-121. The *Rule* of Augustine emphasizes community, charity and external relationships. Little is said about communal structures. Calling the *Rule* the “oldest monastic *Rule* in the West” in the English edition still promotes a certain confusion around its identity since its editors are friars and not monks. Many religious communities have adopted the *Rule* “except monastic!”

⁸⁷T. VAN BAVEL, *The Rule of Saint Augustine: with Introduction & Commentary*, R. Canning (trans.). London: Darton, Longman & Todd, 1984, p. 7. See also, C. HARRISON, *Beauty and Revelation in the thought of St. Augustine*, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1992, p. 204-206, note 61: the author cites Origen: “one must tune their mind and hearts to the chords of scripture.”

⁸⁸*Rule* 1, 3. In this study, texts from the *Rule* are from the translation by R. Canning which is based on the critical text of Luc Verheijen, *La règle de Saint Augustin*. Paris: Études Augustiniennes, 1967. A translation by R. Russell [cited 9 Sept. 2003]; available from World Wide Web @ <http://www.augustinian.villanova.edu/writings/english.htm>

desire to revive the model of the *anima una* of the first Christian community in Jerusalem. Five times he cited *Acts* 4: 32, 35 in this document. The community who adopts this *Rule* has as its goal to be “one in heart and mind.” It is a life style based on mutual love and friendship, and Augustine adds *ad te*, on the way to God.⁸⁹

Some scripture texts found in the *Rule* (1, 2) highlight attitudes inherent in common living and “being one mind and one heart.” “Love is not self-seeking”⁹⁰ and it is sublime and permanent.⁹¹ Selfless love is the criterion for determining the growth, or demise, of a community. God, who is love,⁹² dwells within each person.⁹³ The expressions of this life style are common living, common prayer,⁹⁴ and Eucharist as the “mystery of peace and unity,”⁹⁵ table fellowship, relaxation and manual labor.

⁸⁹Augustine learned the collective sense behind *Acts* 4, 32 through his correspondence with Paulinus of Nola (*Ep.* 31, 4). See L. VERHEIJEN, *Saint Augustine's Monasticism in light of Acts 4:32-35*. Villanova, Pa.: Villanova University Press, 1979, p. 10.

⁹⁰*Rule* 5, 2: “For it is written of love that *it is not self-seeking* (1 *Cor.* 13:5); that is to say, love puts the interests of the community before personal advantage, and not the other way around. Therefore the degree to which you are concerned for the interests of the community rather than for your own is the criterion by which you can judge how much progress you have made.”

⁹¹*Rule* 5, 2: “Thus in all the fleeting necessities of human life *something sublime and permanent* reveals itself, *namely love*” (see 1 *Cor.* 12:31- 13:13).

⁹²1 *Jn.* 4:8: “Whoever is without love does not know God, for God is love.”

⁹³*Rule* 4, 6: “Therefore, in church or wherever you may be in the company of women, you are to consider yourselves responsible for one another’s chastity. Then God *who dwells in you* (2 *Cor.* 6:16) will watch over you through your responsibility for one another.”

⁹⁴*Rule* 2, 1: “*Persevere faithfully in prayer* (*Col.* 4:2) at the hours and times appointed;” 3, 2: “From the beginning of the meal to the end listen to the customary reading without noise or protest against the scriptures, for you have not only to satisfy your physical hunger, *but also to hunger for the word of God* (*Amos* 8:11).”

⁹⁵ “Ita et Dominus Christus nos significavi, nos ad se pertinere voluit, mysterium pacis et unitatis nostrae in sua mensa consecravit. Qui accipit mysterium unitatis, et non tenet vinculum pacis, non mysterium accipit pro se, sed testimonium contra se” (*S.* 272; *PL* 38, 1248).

c) *Rule and the art of living the Gospel message: attractions and conflicts*

The final chapter is the climax of the *Rule*, for it urges its members to make their lives a work of art in light of the Gospel by being “lovers of spiritual beauty,⁹⁶ giving forth the good odor of Christ in the holiness of your lives.”⁹⁷ By this “spiritual beauty” Augustine intends to speak of the “beauty of God” and the “beauty of divine wisdom.”⁹⁸ This spiritual beauty is also linked with that of contemplative enjoyment.⁹⁹ Like a magnet, the soul is moved by an attraction, pleasure and delight toward God. We will treat this expression of spiritual beauty as an element of harmony in the next chapter.

Striving together to be one mind on the way toward God (*in Deum*) is a long journey toward the goal of God’s beauty and wisdom. “Late have I loved you, Beauty so ancient and so new, late have I loved you! . . . I tasted you, and I hunger and thirst; you touched me, and I burned for your peace.¹⁰⁰ Verheijen makes this link between the contemplative notion “lovers of spiritual beauty” and the reason why members are called to live together “as

⁹⁶*Rule* 8, 1: “May the Lord grant that, filled with *longing for spiritual beauty*, you will lovingly observe all that has been written here.”

⁹⁷*Rule* 8, 1: “Live in such a way that you spread abroad *the life-giving aroma of Christ* (2 Cor. 2:15).”

⁹⁸ZUMKELLER, *Augustine’s Rule*, p. 122. See also Augustine’s *On Eighty-three Different Questions*, 30 where he links spiritual beauty with the divine beauty.

⁹⁹T.VAN BAVEL, *The Rule of St. Augustine: With Introduction and commentary*. R. Canning (trans.) from *Regula*. London: Darton, Longman & Todd, 1984, p. 115.

¹⁰⁰“Sero te amavi, pulchritudo tam antiqua et tam nova! Sero te amavi! Et ecce intus eras, et ego foris, et ibi te quaerebam; et in ista formosa quae fecisti, deformis irruebam. Mecum eras, et tecum non eram. Ea me tenebant longe a te, auae si in te non essent, non essent. Vocasti, et clamasti, et rupisti surditatem meam. Coruscasti, splenduisti, et fugasti caecitatem meam. Fragradi, et duxi spiritum, et anhelo tibi. Gustavi, et esurio, et sitio. Tetigisti me, et exarsi in pacem tuam” (*Conf.* 10, 27, 38; *PL* 32, 795).

fragrance” with one mind and heart on the way to God.¹⁰¹ There is an echo here of Augustine’s initial inspiration for communal living linked with the stories of the monk Antony: “the proliferation of monasteries, the sweet fragrance rising up to you from the lives of monks, and the fecund wastelands of the desert.”¹⁰²

Living in a human community will engender its own types of conflicts and “odors” not so sweet. Since Augustine’s communities were composed of people from different social and economic classes, some were wealthy landowners and others were slaves and peasant farmers, a communion of “hearts and souls” was a challenge. If the members were to live the deep meaning of their lives, there had to be mutual love, friendship in God, reconciliation and every person had to be seen as “God’s temple.”¹⁰³

This ongoing search had to be expressed through commitment to a life of evangelical poverty and an attitude of detachment toward life, in things material, spiritual, and psychological. All things were held in common and distribution was on the basis of need.¹⁰⁴ The sharing of goods overcomes differences and enhances the sharing of hearts in

¹⁰¹VERHEIJEN, *Nouvelle Approche*, p. 241. See also J. GARCIA, “La Beauté spirituelle dans la Règle de saint Augustin.” *Connaissance des Pères de l’Église*, 55 (1994), p. 16.

¹⁰²“Inde sermo ejus devolutus est ad monasteriorum greges, et mores suaveolentiae tuae, et ubera deserta eremi quorum nos nihil sciebamus.” (*Conf.* 8, 6, 15; *CCL* 27, 122).

¹⁰³ *Rule* 1, 8: “You are all to live together, therefore, *one in mind and one in heart* (*Acts* 4:32), and honor God in one another because *each of you has become his temple* (*2 Cor.* 6:16).” Cf. *1 Cor.* 3:16: “Do you not know that you are the temple of God, and that the Spirit of God dwells in you?”

¹⁰⁴Sources which described the style of community life Augustine envisioned are: *The work of monks* (*De opere monachorum*) written around 400 and the source for the future monastic saying “Work and pray” (*Ora et labora*). *Holy Virginity* (*De sancta virginitate*), written in 401, describes the theology of consecrated virginity and continence. *Letter* 243 (401) and *Sermons* 355 and 356 explain monastic life.

friendship. At the same time, no one ought to be denied what he needs.¹⁰⁵ This attitude of “unity with diversity” is eschatological insofar as the sharing of goods anticipates the hope of eternal life, the Sabbath rest, where there will be a common joy and “God may be all in all.”¹⁰⁶

The *Rule* embodies an attitude of realism and anticipates conflict and tension. Possession of goods and honors tends to generate discord. When one member, because of pride and self-centeredness, says this is “mine” and that is “yours,” envy and discord erupt and destroy the *anima una* of the “one mind and heart.” The community requires the “turn inward” at the level of the self. Time must be made for reconciliation from the heart,¹⁰⁷ to remove the splinter from one’s eye,¹⁰⁸ to forgive each other’s trespasses,¹⁰⁹ and to avoid committing murder in the name of hatred.¹¹⁰

¹⁰⁵*Rule* 1, 3: “Your superior should see to it that each person is provided with food and clothing. He does not have to give exactly the same to everyone, for you are not all equally strong, but each person should be given what he personally needs. For this is what you read in the *Acts of the Apostles: Everything they owned was held in common, and each one received whatever he had need of* (Acts 4: 32, 35).”

¹⁰⁶“Quanta erit illa felicitas, ubi nullum erit malum, nullum latebit bonum, vacbitur Dei laudibus, qui erit omnia in omnibus!” (*Civ Dei* 22, 30; *CCL* 48, 862).

¹⁰⁷*Rule* 6, 2: “It is better to have to deal with a person who, though quick to anger, immediately seeks a reconciliation once he realizes he has been unjust to another, than with someone who is less easily roused, but also less inclined to seek forgiveness. But a person who never wants to ask forgiveness, or who fails to do so from the heart (*Mt.* 18:35), does not belong in a religious community, even though he may not be sent away.”

¹⁰⁸*Rule* 6, 1: “Do not quarrel. But if you do have a quarrel, put an end to it as quickly as possible. Otherwise an isolated moment of anger grows into hatred, *the splinter becomes a beam* (*Mt.* 7:3-5), and you make your heart a murderer’s den.”

¹⁰⁹*Rule* 6, 2: “Brothers who have insulted each other should *forgive each other’s trespasses* (*Mt.* 6:12); if you fail to do this, your praying the Our Father becomes a lie. Indeed, the more you pray, the more honest your prayer ought to become.”

¹¹⁰*Rule* 6, 1: “For we read in the scriptures: *Whoever hates his brother is a murderer* (1 *Jn.* 3:15).”

The response to anger and pride is humility, an aspect of the virtuous life or the “art of living” (*artem vivendi*) or “regulating life” (*ars agendae vitae*),¹¹¹ found in the act of divine self-emptying in the Incarnation where Christ is the model for Christian living. Gottschalk Hollen (d. 1481) viewed the *Rule* as a structure for reform and art of living *communio* grounded in *caritas*.¹¹² Hollen preached that the whole human being must sacrifice himself or herself to God in the fire of love.

In his commentary on the *Rule* Adolar Zumkeller, like Le Proust, clearly states that what one finds in this document is the primacy of love (*caritas*) and that no other rule emphasizes love as much as Augustine’s.¹¹³ Its overriding concern is that whatever goes on in the monastery there should “prevail love, which remains forever.”¹¹⁴ The bishop realized that since “God is love,”¹¹⁵ then love must be the goal and aim of Christian life in

¹¹¹ “Ac per hoc prima illa naturae propter se ipsa existimat expetenda, ipsamque virtutem quam doctrina inserit velut artem vivendi, quae in animae bonis est excellentissimum bonum. Quapropter eadem virtus, id est ars agenda vitae, cum acceperit prima naturae, quae sine illa erant, sed tamen erant etiam quando eis doctrina adhuc deerat, omnia propter se ipsam appetit, simulque etiam se ipsam” (*Civ Dei* 19, 3; *CCL* 48, 662). The same idea of the “art of living” is again in *civ Dei* 19, 1: “. . . quatuor esse quaedam, quae homines sine magistro, sine ullo doctrinae adminiculo, sine industria vel arte vivendi, quae virtus dicitur, et procul dubio discitur, velut naturaliter appetunt. . .” (*civ Dei* 19, 1; *CCL* 48, 657). See T. E. PAGE (ed.), *Saint Augustine: The City of God against the pagans*. G. E. McCracken and others (trans.). Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1957-1972, vol. 6, pp. 98-99, n. 1: “A favorite subject for discussion among ancient philosophers was the question whether virtue can be taught.”

¹¹²W. ECKERMANN, “Reform as Conversion from Self to Community: Reception of the Augustinian *Rule* in Gottschalk Hollen, O.E.S.A. (d. 1481).” *Augustinian Heritage* 36 (1990): pp. 59-81, especially p. 60. Hollen was one of the most influential teachers of the spiritual life among the Low German Augustinians of that time. Next to Johannes of Werden, Hollen was Westphalia’s most distinguished preacher in the late middle ages. His sermons are filled with ascetic material.

¹¹³ZUMKELLER, *Augustine’s Rule*, p. 17. See ROTELLE, *Treatise*, pp. 10-11.

¹¹⁴*Rule* 5, 2: “Everything you do is to be for the service of the community, and you are to work with more zeal and more enthusiasm than if each person were merely working for himself and his own interests.”

¹¹⁵1 *Jn.* 4:8.

general, and religious life in particular. The notion of love he has in mind is nothing other than the one great commandment to love God and neighbor.¹¹⁶ What gives meaning and purpose to Christian living is that through this task of loving one another, bearing one another's burdens, others will come to know and experience something about God and the truth of the Gospel.¹¹⁷ This task is accomplished in imitation of the first apostolic community where the members lived with one mind and heart intent on God. Love (*caritas*), then, is the center point around which the Christian life revolves and has its meaning and mission.

4. *Second Perspective: Origin of the Order of St. Augustine*

The second perspective on origins builds on the foundation of Augustine's *Rule* of life and looks at the "Church" as the official founder. On December 16, 1243, Pope Innocent IV issued the bull *Incumbit nobis* bringing together several hermit communities¹¹⁸ from the region of Tuscany, and later, on April 9, 1256, at a moment called the "Great Union,"¹¹⁹

¹¹⁶Mt. 12:31; *Rule* I,1-from *Ordo monasterii: the Regulations for a Monastery*, and not of Augustine's authorship. The *Ordo* opens the *Rule* with this paragraph: "Before all else, dear brothers, love God and then your neighbor, because these are the chief commandments given to us" (R. Russell's translation in *Rule and Constitutions*, p. 23). G. LAWLESS, "Regula" in *AA*, p. 708.

¹¹⁷Jn. 13:34-35. Fulfillment of this task is the mission of the monasteries in the Church. See Augustine's *On Eighty-three varied Questions*, FC 70, question 71, 1.

¹¹⁸For a development of the hermit movement, also called the "apostolic life movement" or the "poverty movement" as a religious phenomenon in 13th century Europe, see A. ENNIS, "The Hermit Tradition: Its Origins and Influence in Augustinian History." *Augustinian Heritage* 39/2 (1993): pp. 131-161. For a study on women preachers during this period, see H. GRUNDMANN, *Religious movements in the Middle Ages. The Historical Links between Heresy, the Mendicant Orders, and the Women's Religious Movement in the Twelfth and Thirteenth Century, with the Historical Foundations of German Mysticism*. S. Rowan (trans.) from *Religiöse Bewegungen im Mittelalter*. Notre Dame, Ind.: Notre Dame University Press, 1995.

¹¹⁹M. B. HACKETT, "The Seventh Centenary of the Great Union of Augustinians." *Irish Ecclesiastical Record* 87 (1957): pp. 13-24. The acts from this chapter have not survived (p. 18). "The union itself was a masterpiece of compromise" (p. 19). Lanfranc Settala of Milan was appointed prior

Alexander IV's *Licet ecclesiae catholicae*¹²⁰ gave them juridical structure and an ecclesial mission under the title "Order of the Hermit Friars of St. Augustine", or what is called today the "Order of Brothers of Saint Augustine" or in shorter form the "Order of Saint Augustine" (O.S.A.).¹²¹ As a mendicant Order, the Augustinians stand along side with the Dominicans, Franciscans and Carmelites.¹²²

What was the difference between the monk and the mendicant friar? The "friars" distinguished themselves from the "monks" by a new spirit of evangelization, a commitment to preaching, and insertion into the lives of people.¹²³ A new critical awakening was taking place regarding the need for reform to meet the pastoral challenges of the rapidly expanding cities. The term "hermit" was a flexible term for religious men who lived alone in the

general by Cardinal Annibaldi. The critical testing period of the union between 1256-1264 was largely due to the personality and wisdom of Lanfranc (pp. 21-22).

The Great Union involved the following hermit communities: Hermits of John the Good, the Hermits of St. William, the Hermits of Brettino, the Hermits of Monte Favale, and other smaller congregations of hermits. This event took place at the Tuscan hermits' foundation of Santa Maria del Popolo in Rome. The new Order comprised 180 religious houses. See W. MONAHAN, "The Augustinian Order at the Grand Union." *The Tagastan* 14/2 (1951): pp. 22-36.

¹²⁰See "Bullae ab Alexandro Papa IV datae mense aprili an. 1256 Ordini eremitarum S. Augustini." *Anal. Aug.* 4 (1911-1912): pp. 441-443. For the history of the Order see B. RANO, *The Order of Saint Augustine*. A. Ennis (trans.) from *Dizionario degli Istituti de Perfezione*. Rome: Edizioni Paoline, 1974. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Historical Institute, 1975. R. KUITERS, "*Licet Ecclesiae Catholicae*: Commentary." *Augustiniana* 6 (1956): pp. 14-36. A. de MEIER, "*Licet Ecclesiae Catholicae*: Text." *Augustiniana* 6 (1956): pp. 9-13.

¹²¹See *Const.* 5. The term "Hermits" was dropped from its original title in the revision of the *Constitutions* after Vatican II. In this text we will use the shorter form, the "Order of Saint Augustine."

¹²²Even though the Augustinians and Carmelites received papal approval, they were nearly suppressed because of "competition" with the Franciscans and Dominicans. For a study on this conflict, see R. EMERY, "The Second Council of Lyons and the Mendicant Orders." *The Catholic Historical Review* 39/3 (1953): pp. 257-271.

¹²³Cf. MARTIN, *Our Restless Heart*, p. 96. For a contemporary discussion on the need to redefine the term "monk," see W. TEASDALE, *A Monk in the World*. Novato, Ca.: New World Library, 2002, pp. xxiv - xxv.

wilderness, but were quickly joined by others. Desiring a life more Gospel-oriented, radical and less institutionalized, these solitaries of the wilderness distinguished themselves from and often made a deliberate rejection of the powerful and wealthy monasteries that followed the *Rule of St. Benedict* which was seen as the religious “establishment” of the time.¹²⁴ Often the name of hermits was synonymous with the community of Augustinians.¹²⁵ Certain legends, including the pseudo-Augustinian *Sermones ad fratres in eremo*, of the fourteenth and fifteenth-centuries made their contribution to the formation of a corporate identity and link to St. Augustine.¹²⁶

Under the inspiration found in the *Rule of St. Augustine*¹²⁷ the new community was

¹²⁴MARTIN, *Our Restless Heart*, p. 97.

¹²⁵For the development of the “apostolic life” or “hermit” movement, see A. J. ENNIS, “The Spirit of the present Constitutions: An attempt to recapture the elements of our original charism” in *Second Annual Course*, pp. 147-149. IDEM, “The Hermit Tradition,” pp. 131-161. A description of the life style of the typical medieval hermit involves: poverty, prayer, penance, people, preaching, and pilgrimage (p. 134). F. A. MATHES, “The Poverty Movement and the Augustinian Hermits.” *Anal. Aug.* 31 (1968): pp. 5-154.

¹²⁶Local legends and apocryphal sources claimed that after his baptism and before his departure to Africa, Augustine retired to the hermit communities in the Tuscan hillside. He found the followers of Paul the First Hermit and Antony and organized them into communities and gave them the monastic rule, the *Regula sancti Augustini*, written in one of the hills north of Pisa. Some fables claimed that Augustine even founded the hermitages of Spelonca, Lecceto and Centumcellae. See R. ARBESMANN, “Andrea Biglia, Augustinian friar and humanist (d. 1435),” *Anal. Aug.* 28 (1965): pp. 167-168, note 116 on p. 186. These legends are not supported by sources. See R. ARBESMANN, “Henry of Friemar’s Treatise on the Origin and Development of the Hermit Friars and its True and Real Title,” *Augustiniana* 6 (1956), p. 62. Many of the legends were created to avoid the Order’s suppression. See EMERY, “The Second Council of Lyons,” pp. 257-271.

¹²⁷Three texts identified with Augustine “constitute the basic dossier for the monastic Rule which bears his name,” says G. Lawless: (1) *Ordo monasterii*: the *Regulations for a monastery*; (2) *Praeceptum*: the Rule; (3a) *Objurgatio*: the *Reprimand for Quarreling Nuns* (letter 211.1-4); (3b) *Regularis informatio*: the *Rule for Nuns* (letter 211.5-16). LAWLESS, “Regula” in *AA*, pp. 707-708. The Rule was not widely used until after the eleventh century. The Rule, because of its “flexibility and generality,” became a “guide for the organized religious life” for many communities. K. MADIGAN, “Regula, Use After Augustine” in *AA*, pp. 709-710.

to live together as an apostolic fraternity,¹²⁸ with the principles of sharing of life, evangelical poverty, equality, and ministerial service to the needs of the Church.¹²⁹ The foundation of the Great Union of 1256 is nothing more than its most characteristic expression: *anima una et cor unum in Deo* – “one mind and one heart in God” – an aspect that is threaded throughout the course of this study.¹³⁰ An adaptation was made to the *Rule (Praeceptum)* at the time of the creation of the new Order. As mentioned previously, the first line from the ancient *Ordo monasterii* (Monastic Regulation), a text not from Augustine, was added as a preface to the *Rule (Praeceptum)*: “Before all else, beloved, love God and then your neighbor, for these are the chief commandments given to us.”¹³¹ We now look at the salient features of this spirituality as described in the *Constitutions* and the spiritual writings of men and women in the Order.

¹²⁸*Const. 4*, note 10: “The expressions ‘orders of evangelical poverty’ and ‘Orders of apostolic fraternity’ are used in place of ‘mendicant orders’ because they better indicate the nature and purpose of these Orders” (see numbers 7-16). *Const. 21*: “The fundamental document of this spirituality is the *Rule*. This is complemented by the special characteristics that pertain to an apostolic community.”

¹²⁹The mendicant communities, or the “new” orders were organized by the popes because of a distrust of the phenomenon of itinerant preachers on the part of ecclesiastical and civil authorities. There were two major problems: who had the authority to preach, and what they could preach. Innocent III (1198-1216) first raised the issue of how to respond to the people’s need for popular preaching. See ENNIS, “The Hermit Tradition,” pp. 138-140.

¹³⁰HACKETT, “The Seventh Centenary of the Great Union,” p. 24. When we refer to the *anima una* in this study, we return to this inspiration from the Great Union and source from *Acts 4:32*.

¹³¹See ZUMKELLER, *Augustine’s Rule*, pp. 11-12. For extended research on the origin of the *Rule*, see G. LAWLESS, *Augustine of Hippo and his Monastic Rule*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1987. RAMSEY, *Saint Augustine: The Monastic Rules*.

a) *Constitutions and the application of the Order's spirituality*

The Order's *Constitutions*, considered to be a "spiritual text,"¹³² contributes to the self-understanding as a congregation and defines the spirituality of the Order. This document combines the salient features of the *Rule* as well as the "accumulated wisdom" and teaching of its forebears and the characteristics of an apostolic fraternity, such as common life, equality, and life with the people of God.¹³³ In general, this spirituality is both "evangelical and ecclesial." It is evangelical insofar as the first part of the *Rule* urges its members to keep the gospel and to follow the command to love God and neighbor¹³⁴ in likeness to the apostolic community in Jerusalem.¹³⁵ It is ecclesial when the community is part of the larger community called the Church, or the body of Christ, "joined together in Christian solidarity" or a sort of "'exchange' of charity." Through the example of its life and ministry, the community becomes a "leaven" and "sign of its unity."¹³⁶ Zumkeller identifies the traits of Augustinian spirituality as: *Communio fratrum, vita perfecta communis, communio orationis,*

¹³²The *Constitutions* are identified as a spiritual document in the *Plan of Augustinian Formation: Ratio Institutionis Ordinis Sancti Augustini*, Rome, Pubblicazioni Agostiniane, 1993, vol. 6, 123c. Hereafter *Ratio*. Regarding the Order's identity see T. VAN BAVEL, *The Basic Inspiration of Religious Life*. J. Rotelle (ed) and H. Jackson (trans.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1996, p. 112. For an historical development of the *Constitutions*, see J. BARRY and J. MACDOUGALL, "A History of our Constitutions - Part I." *The Tagastan* 20/2 (1958): pp. 2-15; Part II in 20/3 (1958-1959): pp. 27-44.

¹³³Cf. *Const.* 4, 7-16, 20.

¹³⁴*Mt.* 22:40: "The whole law and the prophets depend on these two commandments"; *Rom.* 13:8: "Owe nothing to anyone, except to love one another; for the one who loves another has fulfilled the law."

¹³⁵*Const.* 24 indicates the centrality of the scriptures in the life of the Order: "The intensity of evangelical and ecclesial life will be ever more renewed in us and flourish in the Order, if each of us 'will avidly read, devoutly listen to, and earnestly learn' (*Ep.* 132) the Sacred Scriptures, especially the New Testament."

¹³⁶*Const.* 23: "there must necessarily be a "kind of 'exchange' of charity" (*c. Faust.* 5, 9, 11). *Const.* 25: "we ought to be the leaven of the Church and the sign of its unity, for this is what our *Rule* demands where it says: 'The main reason for you having come together is to live harmoniously. . . .'"

*fraternitas apostolica, caritas serviens.*¹³⁷

More specifically, Chapter Two of the *Constitutions* – called “The Spirituality of the Order” – elaborates on the evangelical and ecclesial aspects of this spirituality: sharing of life, personality and freedom, search for God, giving of self, and the apostolate. We will give a brief summary of each aspect.

“Sharing of life”¹³⁸ refers not only to living in the same physical place, but more importantly, it is the sharing of minds and hearts, a unity of purpose, understanding, and concern for each other. In a sermon on St. Augustine, Hermann of Schildesche (d. 1357) comments on the *Rule*, specifically the meaning of the *anima una*:

Not only with reference to unity of peace and harmony, but certainly also with regard to unity of purpose, understanding, and heartfelt affection, so that in all these religious only one may be visible.¹³⁹

The spirit of oneness encompasses the totality of the human person. “Personality and freedom”¹⁴⁰ implies that personality is not obliterated in the Augustinian community, but is enhanced in a context of mutual friendship of giving and receiving. Friendship in Christ also

¹³⁷ In RANO, *Augustinian Origins*, p. 105. Cf. A. ENNIS, “The Spirit of the present Constitutions,” p. 155: the basic characteristics of the hermit movement and the mendicant orders that harmonize with Augustine’s idea of religious life are – “live in community, prayer and study, evangelical simplicity and / or poverty, preaching the Gospel (or ministry) and response to the needs of the people (or the times).”

¹³⁸*Const.* 26-29 describes “Sharing of Life.”

¹³⁹Schildesche taught theology in Paris and for the last seventeen years of his life he acted as vicar general to the bishop of Würzburg. He left many works concerned with moral theology, exegesis, canon law, and ascetic mysticism. His *Tractatus de conceptione beatae Mariae virginis*, written in 1350, is the oldest work on the Immaculate Conception written in Germany. Cf. *Const.* 27. “Unitate totalis intentionis, et integritate mentalis collectionis, et totalitate cordialis affectionis” – taken from the sermon in B. RANO, “S. Agustín y su Orden en algunos sermones de agustinos.” *Anal. Aug.* 53 (1990), p. 43.

¹⁴⁰*Const.* 30-31 describes “Personality and Freedom.”

enhances freedom in the community where there is dialogue and necessary autonomy, for everything truly worthwhile is held in esteem.

“Search for God”¹⁴¹ expresses our natural longing and desire to reach out to our fullest potential as “restless hearts” because we have been made in God’s image and likeness. Even though sin has tarnished this image we are capable of a return to God by returning within ourselves, by going “in depth.” This return to the self is called “interiorism” or “interiority” which is the “pivot of Augustinian prayer, as it is of Augustinian spirituality as a whole.”¹⁴² Prayer, both individual and common, augments and stimulates unity among its members. The notion “Giving of Self”¹⁴³ is not possible without humility and taking up our cross which is basically having to put up with one another. Here the ascetical dimension, those practices necessary to help one move from an egocentric self to the recognition of Christ in the self of the other, is important.

Finally, the “apostolate”¹⁴⁴ reminds the Augustinian community that it does not live for itself but for the entire ecclesial community and for all people who together constitute the body of Christ, and that its first goal is to proclaim the kingdom of God. Contemplation and action are essential components of the Augustinian, not in dualistic but complementary fashion, where the exterior activity is a result, springing from prayer and a deep interior

¹⁴¹*Const.* 32-35 describes “The Search for God.”

¹⁴²B. HACKETT, “Augustine and Prayer: Theory and Practice” in *Second annual course on Augustinian spirituality*, July 1-17, 1976. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1976, p. 177.

¹⁴³*Const.* 36-38 describes “Giving of Self.”

¹⁴⁴*Const.* 39-42 describes the “Apostolate.”

life.¹⁴⁵

As we see, the Order's spirituality has two dimensions: evangelical and ecclesial. This spirituality is not insulated from others and world. Rather, it is open-ended. Sharing of life and purpose, friendship in community, search for God and selfless love through ministry are its essential aspects. Many men and women of the Order, who were moved by love, freedom and spiritual beauty, have contributed to the development of this spirituality of interdependence and mutuality over the centuries.

b) Accumulative wisdom of Augustinians

Even though the Order was not founded on the inspiration of a single charismatic leader, like a Francis or Dominic, within a very short period of time the community produced outstanding men and women¹⁴⁶ who embraced with intensity and seriousness the Augustinian way of appropriating the Gospel, especially the feature of common life found in *Acts* 4: 32, 35. Prominent saints of the Order are Nicholas of Tolentine (d. 1305), Clare of Montefalco (d. 1308), the peacemakers Rita of Cascia (around 1456), Bl. Christiana of

¹⁴⁵For an elaboration on these two dimensions from the viewpoint of Jordan of Saxony, see ENNIS, "The Hermit Tradition," p. 159: Speaking about the reasons why a friar might legitimately go out of the "monastery," he (Jordan) said that one should go out only for the sake of *opera contemplativae vitae*, never for the sake of *opera activae vitae*. "Active works," he explained, are all those which serve merely material or personal need, whether for oneself or for one's neighbor. "Contemplative works," on the other hand, are those which serve the good of souls, namely preaching and hearing confessions.

¹⁴⁶K. GERSBACH, "Foreword" to JORDAN OF SAXONY, *The Life of the Brethren*. Translation from *Jordani de Saxoniam Liber Vitasfratrum* (New York: Cosmopolitan Science & art services, 1943), Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1993, p. 17, note 2: "Father David Gutiérrez, O.S.A., points out that besides the two saints, Nicholas of Tolentine and Clare of Montefalco, fifteen officially recognized blessed died before 1356 (*History of the Order of St. Augustine*, volume 1, part 1 (Villanova, 1984) 118-119.) Not all of these are mentioned in *The Life of the Brethren*. See C. COUNIHAN, "Lay and clerical elements in early Augustinian History." *Anal. Aug.* 43 (1980): pp. 305-333.

Santa Croce sull'Anno (d. 1310)¹⁴⁷ and John of Sahagún (d. 1478). There is the famed theologian and student of Thomas Aquinas Giles of Rome (Aegidius Romanus) (d. 1316),¹⁴⁸ and writers of spirituality such as Augustine of Ancona (d. 1328), Albert of Padua (d. 1323 or 1328), and Michael of Massa (d. 1337). We also have the Englishmen John Waldeby (d. after 1372) and William of Flete (d. around 1395), the spiritual director to Catherine of Siena, who lived as a quasi-solitary in the community in Lecceto (Tuscany), the famous center for Augustinian spirituality and reform of religious life.¹⁴⁹

Other ascetical and mystical writers are Pedro Malón de Chaide (d. 1589) known for his *La conversión de la Magdalena* which continues to be reprinted and recognized for its Spanish prose, and two other masterpieces composed in prison between 1573 and 1583. Thomas of Jesus de Andrade wrote *Trabalhos de Jesus* in Africa. *De los nombres de Cristo* was composed in the inquisitorial prison at Valladolid by biblical exegete and humanist theologian Luis de León (d. 1591). St. Alonso de Orozco's (d. 1591) abundant texts, like his *Confesiones*, written in 1580, are an example of devotional literature in the Spanish Golden Age. We conclude by recalling five "forgotten" Augustinians who were "masters of spirituality" as well as priors general and theologians: Clement of Osimo (d. 1291), Augustine of Tarano (d. 1309), Augustine Favaroni (d. 1433), Alexander of Oliva (d. 1463),

¹⁴⁷See C. ALONSO, "Women in the Augustinian Calendar: reflections on their spirituality" in *Searching for God: the contemplative dimension of the Augustinian experience*. International course on Augustinian Spirituality, Rome, July 1-19, 1979. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1981, pp. 209-217.

¹⁴⁸See D. TRAPP, "Augustinian theology of the 14th century." *Augustiniana* 6 (1956), pp. 146-274.

¹⁴⁹B. HACKETT, "Lecceto: Centre for Augustinian Spirituality" in *International Course on Augustinian Spirituality: Searching for God*. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1981, pp. 190-208.

and Girolamo Seripando (d. 1563).¹⁵⁰ Favaroni and Seripando will be treated in the following chapters.

c) Augustinian School, spiritual writers and martyrs

Shortly after the Order's foundation, an "Augustinian School" of thought, with Giles of Rome (d. 1316) as its most important representative, developed to promote the writings and ideas of Augustine in the medieval universities.¹⁵¹ As a School, its characteristics are a threefold primacy: of Christ, of love, and of grace.¹⁵² Its theology was more "affective" than speculative or practical.¹⁵³ During the time of much theological debate not a single

¹⁵⁰D. GUTIERREZ, *The Augustinians in the Middle Ages 1256-1356*, Vol 1, Part 1. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Historical Institute, 1984, p. 120: "The neglect of these men . . . has left a void in the liturgical calendar of the Order. These five men were masters of spirituality who reached holiness through their government of the Order and their service to the Church."

¹⁵¹A "school" is generally referred to a "school of thought," as a body of students or people adhering to a certain set of principles, doctrines, methods, or authorities. See I. IRIBARREN, "The Search for an early Thomistic School." *Vivarum* 39/2 (2001): 263-265. D. GUTIERREZ, "Ermites de Saint-Augustin" in *DS* 4, col. 998-1003. R. RUSSELL, "Augustinianism, theological school of" in *New Catholic Encyclopedia*. Wm. J. McDonald (ed.). New York: McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1967, vol. 1, pp. 1069-1071.

¹⁵²RANO, *The Order of Saint Augustine*, p. 84.

¹⁵³In "Lecture 1" of the *Commentary on the Song of Songs*, Giles of Rome distinguishes between the goals of the "contemplation of the philosophers"—which is "wisdom"—and "contemplation of theologians." J. ROTELLE (ed.), *Commentary on the Song of Songs and Other Writings: Giles of Rome, O.S.A.* Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1998, p. 62: "But the contemplation, as the theologians speak of it, is based more on taste than theory, and more on love and sweetness than on contemplation. And if the pursuit of learning is sometimes found applicable to the contemplative life, according to the theologians this is insofar as such employment leads us to the love of God. If, then, anyone studies for the sake of knowledge and not of edification and advancement in the love of God, he must understand that he is living the contemplative life according to the philosophers, and not according to the theologians. (In terms of application of the senses to learning, Giles assigns the senses of hearing and sight to the philosophers, and taste, smell, and touch – to the theologians" (p. 63).

An error in translation is found in RANO, *The Order of Saint Augustine*, p. 84, stating that theology was "effective" when it ought to be "affective." This corresponds to A. ZUMKELLER, *Theology and History of the Augustinian School in the Middle Ages*. J. Rotelle (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1996, p. 20: The Augustinian standpoint becomes clearer in terms of the aim and goal of theology: "'*finis principalis*' is '*dilectio*' and '*caritas*' and therefore assigns to it neither a speculative nor practical but **affective character**." Emphasis is mine.

Giles of Rome, the intellectual founder of the School, defended the "primacy of the will over the

Augustinian among the many writers opposed the two principal schools of spirituality in the sixteenth century – the Jesuit school and the Carmelite school of St. Theresa of Avila and St. John of the Cross. Augustinian bishops and theologians defended these trends. St. Thomas of Villanova (d. 1555) wrote many treatises on contemplation; Luis de Montoya (d. 1569) and Augustín de Coruña both praised the *Exercises* of St. Ignatius of Loyola. Luís de León supported a strong defense for St. Theresa of Avila’s ideas and he was responsible for the *editio princeps* of her books.¹⁵⁴

Three important German Augustinian spiritual writers – Henry of Friemar (d. 1340), Hermann of Schildesche and Jordan of Saxony (d. around 1375), the Order’s first historian and author of the *Liber Vitasfratrum*,¹⁵⁵ written during the years of the Black Death (1348-1351), rank with their Dominican contemporaries -- Eckhart, Tauler and Suso. Although they did not acquire the fame of the Dominicans, they had a considerable influence on the religious life of their time. According to David Gutierrez, “their sound teaching, earned a place in the history of German spirituality in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries.”¹⁵⁶

intellect, with Augustine’s designated love as the proper goal of theology; . . . the goal is ‘ *affectio*,’ adhering in love to the supreme truth, and it should lead the human being to ‘ *caritas*’.” Most Augustinian theologians of the late middle ages adopted this view (p. 23).

¹⁵⁴D. GUTTIERREZ, *The Augustinians from the Protestant Reformation to the Peace of Westphalia 1518-1648*. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Historical Institute, 1979, vol. II, p. 163.

¹⁵⁵Known as *The Life of the Brethren*. The spiritual works of Augustinians around the year 1357 are described by Jordan as: “Chanting the divine office in choir, serving at the altar, dedicating themselves to prayer, psalmody, and the reading of the sacred books, teaching, preaching the Word of God, hearing confessions of the faithful and procuring the salvation of souls with exhortations and good example” (“Et quidem secundum statum modernum certum est Ordinem principaliter super opera spiritualia, quae ad vitam contemplativam pertinent, fore fundatum; quae sunt haec: officia divina decantare, altari deservire, orare, psallere, lectioni seu studio Scripturae insistere, docere et verbum Dei praedicare, fidelium confessiones audire, animarum salutem verbo et exemplo procurare” (*LB* 255; (II, 26); *LV* 260).

¹⁵⁶GUTIERREZ, *The Augustinians in the Middle Ages*, p. 157.

Augustinian writers noted for their writings in biblical spirituality are Girolamo Seripando, archbishop of Salerno, Luis de León and St. Thomas of Villanova.

We have seen a certain thread present from Augustine's hearing the "amazing" stories of the Egyptian monks, to his formation of monasteries, to the founding of the Order of hermit communities in the thirteenth-century, and the spirituality carried in the *Rule of Augustine* and the Order's *Constitutions*. That thread is the notion of *caritas*, identified with the Holy Spirit (*summa caritas*),¹⁵⁷ expressed through common life, searching for God together, and together serving the Church. Even though community is an important component in many religious groups, the *anima una* for the Augustinian takes primary place in one's life and religious identity. The Augustinian *communio* goes further: it is the radical desire to live "unity of charity"¹⁵⁸ and "a holy communion of life."¹⁵⁹ Van Bavel claims that the sharing of life in all its dimensions, after the model of the first apostolic community, is what characterizes Augustinian spirituality.¹⁶⁰ In making his point, he contrasts this spirituality of common life with the Benedictine tradition where the monastery church was

¹⁵⁷ZUMKELLER, *Augustine's Ideal of the Religious Life*, p. 129.

¹⁵⁸"Vivunt nobiscum in societate communi: nemo eos distinguit ab illis qui aliquid attulerunt. Charitatis unitas praeponenda est terrenae commodo haereditatis" (*S.* 356,8; *PL* 39, 1577). This sermon, with the title "Saint Augustine's second sermon on the way of life of the clergy who were living with him," was preached in January, after the Epiphany, in 426. The best account of this situation is found in F. VAN DER MEER, *Augustine the Bishop. The Life and Work of a Father of the Church*, Brian Battershaw and G. R. Lamb (trans.), New York: Sheed & Ward, 1961, chapter 8, "The clergy and the ascetics," section 1, "The *Episcopium* as monastic community." See *Sermons*, *WSA* III/10, p. 182, note 1.

¹⁵⁹"... et Jerosolymis habitabant in sancta communione vitae, non dicentes aliquid proprium, quibus erant omnia communia, et anima et cor unum in Deum" (*Act.* II, 44, et IV, 32) (*De op mona.* 16,17; *PL* 40, 562). MARÍN DE SAN MARTIN, "La espiritualidad agustiniana," p. 929.

¹⁶⁰*Acts* 4:32, 35. See T. VAN BAVEL, "Reflections on Spirituality and Charism," in *Augustinian Spirituality and the Charism of the Augustinians*. John Rotelle (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1995, pp. 73-82.

the center of life. In the Augustinian friary, on the other hand, the center of life is found in the common room.¹⁶¹

E. The contribution of Augustinian Spirituality

What relevance does this feature of the *anima una* -- “one heart and one soul toward God” -- have for us today?¹⁶² This is a pertinent question. In contemporary society we experience so much loneliness, alienation, and lives without meaning, not only among the elderly but the youth as well. A spirituality of communion in God with one another can be appealing and offer a path for fragmented lives searching for some sort of healing.¹⁶³ The spirit of the Augustinian *Rule* is, in itself, a call to the “evangelical equality of all people.” It is socially critical and challenges inequality, consumerism, pride and abusive power.¹⁶⁴ Adolar Vermeulen applies the core of Augustinian spirituality for the present time with these words:

In searching for God you will meet him in men and women everywhere. Be close to them in their longing for wholeness and meaning in their lives – to be close to them, or rather: to be together with them in everything that concerns life profoundly.¹⁶⁵

¹⁶¹The role of the local prior, for instance, may be considered “as the principle of unity for the local community.” See R. PREVOST, *The Office and Authority of the Local Prior in the Order of Saint Augustine*. Dissertation in the faculty of Canon Law. *Pontificia Studiorum Universitas A S. Thoma Aq. In urbe*. Rome, 1987. See also R. GAVOTTO, *The Prior General: The Principle of Unity in the Order of Saint Augustine*. Rome: Pont. Universitas Gregoriana, 1973.

¹⁶²B. HACKETT, “The relevancy of St. Augustine’s spirituality,” in *Second annual course on Augustinian spirituality*, July 1-17, 1976. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1976, pp. 157-173.

¹⁶³CLARK, “Augustinian spirituality,” p. 84: “Augustine developed his spirituality in an age of crisis and rapid change; this makes his spirituality all the more viable today.”

¹⁶⁴VAN BAVEL, *The Rule of Saint Augustine*, p. 8.

¹⁶⁵Ad. F. VERMEULEN, “Augustinian Spirituality, A Source of Fruitful Apostolate,” in *Augustinian Spirituality and the Charism of the Augustinians*. John Rotelle (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1995, p. 209.

In other words, “carry each other’s burden.” Other expressions are: share life, hopes and fears, purpose; personal freedom in community; search for God through interiority; selfless love; ministry in Church and world. These expressions characterize Augustinian spirituality.

In this opening chapter we looked at the popular perception and interest in spirituality. Christian spirituality, on the other hand, is the “art of living” the Gospel as the central teaching and guide. Augustinian spirituality has the characteristic of love (*caritas*), living the Gospel *together*, after the style of the *anima una* of the first disciples in Jerusalem. This particular spirituality offers a sense of meaning¹⁶⁶ for those who walk this path. Etienne Gilson sums it up: “the more a doctrine tends to be built around charity, the more Augustinian it is.”¹⁶⁷ Charity involves an understanding of the self and a rhythm of relationships with others. In the following chapter we will look closer at these relationships through the theme of harmony as a component of Augustinian spirituality.

¹⁶⁶The expression “meaning of life” is privileged in the Augustinian document *IGC 1998*, I,1, (*Augustinians in the Church for the World of Today. Documents of the Intermediate General Chapter 1998*) as one of the “signs of the times” to which an Augustinian response can be given. The text reads:

“Some signs of the times that define our age allow us to speak with a certain Augustinian tone. In contrast, perhaps, to the unbroken succession of national and international conflicts, we hear in all corners of the world the call for peace. Dissatisfaction with conventional, remote human relationships and the immense gap between rich and the poor resulting from a system of injustice are leading us to reassess the value of friendship and community; the problem of the meaning of life is acquiring a central place in contemporary thought. The call for participation and democracy, the harmonious cooperation and collaboration of numerous partners are leading to the conviction that the world is increasingly one and demands greater responsibility from all.”

¹⁶⁷E. GILSON, *The Christian Philosophy of Saint Augustine*. L. E. M. Lynch (trans.) from the *Introduction à l’étude de saint Augustin*. London: V. Gollancz, 1961, p. 238.

CHAPTER 2: HARMONY: RESONANCES OF A THEME IN AUGUSTINE’S WRITINGS

Harmony, as a term and a theme in Augustine’s writings, is a theme both rich and obscure in the documents of the Order of Saint Augustine that describe its spirit and mission in the Church and world today. Since specific spiritualities are based on a certain number of themes rooted in biblical values or expressions, the theme of harmony – evolving from the *anima una* experience of the first Christian community in Jerusalem – can be seen as a component of Augustinian spirituality.¹ The purpose of this chapter is to present, on one part, the notion of harmony as a **theme** in some of Augustine’s writings and those of the Order of Saint Augustine that describes its spirituality. And, on the other part, we see how this theme can provide new perspectives to understanding the self and others.

The *specific questions* we ask are, how does Augustine define the term harmony? Does Augustine use other words synonymous of harmony? If so, what are they and in what way do they contribute to consider “harmony” as a theme? Then we turn to the Augustinian tradition to ask: do the term harmony and its related concepts appear in the Order’s documents describing its spirituality?

We approach the theme of harmony by using various aspects of doctrine and praxis which serve as keys to the interpretation of the spiritual tradition. The method used to

¹T. VAN BAVEL, “Reflections on Spirituality and Charism,” in *Augustinian Spirituality and the Charism of the Augustinians*. John Rotelle (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1995, p. 75. Van Bavel identifies not more than four or five norms.

interpret the texts is thematic and historico-theological. By *thematic* we mean that the approach to the theme of harmony takes into consideration the term harmony and its related concepts. These terms serve to describe different aspects of the reality of harmony and then contribute to name its components. For example, prayer is a condition for harmony. The *historical* dimension is directly connected with Augustine's writings as the reference point for our question: how has the Augustinian tradition received these aspects of the theme of harmony. This question implies a study of some of the Order's documents released over the centuries. The historical dimension belongs to every reflection about a specific spirituality in view of retracing the tradition. Continuities and ruptures have to be identified and this is related to our hypothesis formulated in terms of reception of Augustine's theme of harmony. The *theological* dimension refers to authentic spirituality rooted in the mysteries of the faith (*données de la foi*). Those mysteries have been interpreted and are, indeed, the core of theological discourse.

Our approach is possible because of the understanding of Christian spirituality as theology.² Theological categories, like creation and communion, reflect the foundation of

²M. LAGUË, "Spiritualité et théologie: d'une même souche: Note sur l'actualité d'un débat." *Église et Théologie* 20 (1989): pp. 333-351. See also IDEM, "La spiritualité chrétienne: sa raison d'être dans une faculté de théologie: Sept thèses." *Theoforum* 33 (2002): pp. 61-75. H.-U. VON BALTHASAR, *La vérité est symphonique*. Original title: *Die Wahrheit ist symphonisch*, Freiburg: Johannes Verlag Einsiedeln, 1972. Translation: Saint-Maur: Editions Parole et Silence, 2000, especially pp. 142-151. LECLERCQ, *The Love of Learning and the Desire for God*, pp. 192-193.

Some scholars have another viewpoint on the relationship between spirituality and theology. Recognizing the mutual relation (or: as "equal partners") between spirituality and theology in the university, the American Sandra Schneiders outlines her perspective. For her, spirituality is a discipline in its own right, and not a subdivision of theology (systematics, moral and historical theology). It stands on its own because the focus of spirituality is on the nature of *experience* in its many dimensions; "spirituality" is defined as the "experience of conscious involvement in the project of life-integration through self-transcendence toward the ultimate value one perceives." Since spirituality is multi-disciplinary (studied from psychological, cultural, artistic, literary, as well as from theological positions), theology itself cannot encompass the totality of spirituality. Even in the Christian context, spirituality is no longer limited to the criteria of a doctrinal framework, but goes beyond it. This understanding invites

experience of the history of God's covenant with the people of Israel and of the Church. These categories, the biblical foundations of faith, are the objects of theological discourse.³ The manner in which these are expressed and lived out concretely in the lives of the faithful is the object of spirituality.⁴ Theology and spirituality are linked together at the same source (*la même souche*) – the Christian experience⁵ – and possess the same project (*un même projet*) – giving an account of the mystery of God in Jesus Christ, the lived mystery as *history of grace*.⁶

A thematic approach, interpreted from various aspects of doctrine and praxis, follows this general direction.⁷ Within each theological category, we look at the theme of

scholars into a new territory regarding inter-faith and inter-religious dialogue. New ideas and challenges from non-Christian sources present an opportunity to evaluate Christian assumptions and to explore new lines of questioning. See S. SCHNEIDERS, "Theology and Spirituality: Strangers, Rivals or Partners?" *Horizons* 13 (1986), pp. 253-274; "Spirituality in the Academy." *Theological Studies* 50 (1989), pp. 676-697; "Spirituality as an Academic Discipline: Reflections from Experience." *Christian Spirituality Bulletin* 1 / 2 (Fall 1993), pp. 10-15; "A Hermeneutical Approach to the Study of Christian Spirituality." *Christian Spirituality Bulletin* 2/1 (Spring 1994), pp. 9-14.

European scholars have also made a contribution to the study of spirituality. Kees Waaijman has produced a significant work on the topic. Part 2, Chapter 5 deals with "A Design for the discipline of Spirituality" and Part 3 treats its methodology. K. WAAIJMAN. *Spirituality: Forms, Foundations, Methods*. J. Vriend (trans.). Studies in Spirituality, Supplement 8. Leuven, Paris, Dudley, Ma.: Peeters, 2002. Writers who support the position of spirituality as a separate discipline are J. A. Coleman, A. Jones, M. B. McGuire, P. Sheldrake and P. Van Ness. Those who refer to spirituality as a "distinct," rather than a "discrete," discipline are P. Endean, M. McIntosh, J. M. Ashley, and A. M. Clifford.

³Vatican II reiterates that "Scripture is the soul of theology" (*DV* 24).

⁴See LAGUË, "La spiritualité chrétienne," pp. 63-64.

⁵We do not refer to the word "experience" as something private, strictly affective, or a "direct encounter" with a thing, but to the experience underlying the biblical stories told about the relationship between God and the people of Israel and of the Christian community. See LAGUË, "La spiritualité chrétienne," p. 65. T. DUNNE, "Experience" in *NDCS*, pp. 365-377.

⁶LAGUË, "Spiritualité et théologie," p. 351.

⁷PRINCIPE, "Toward defining spirituality," pp. 139-141. For a historical development of the use of biblical themes in the writings of the monastic Middle Ages, see LECLERCQ, *The Love of Learning and the Desire for God*.

harmony within the text from a variety of perspectives, such as its components, conditions, and aspects. Questions for analysis and for organizing the material are used for identifying authentic and unauthentic expressions of that spirituality.⁸ Because of their “evocative powers,”⁹ the selection and rearrangement of ideas (comparison/contrast) and expressions important for spirituality offer a freshness and new shades of meaning and appropriation.¹⁰

Since the writings of saints and theologians expound on their experience of the Christian mysteries, one must take into careful consideration the historical and cultural context. Facts are colored by assumptions and values. Some ideas are fortified while others are suppressed. In other words, we must be aware that these written texts are what Philip Sheldrake calls “historically conditioned;” they are products of circumstances in a given place and time as well as the psychological state and social values of the writer’s living faith and commitment.¹¹

There is a need for a critical dialogue with the texts because the “meaning” of a text is more than the historical context.¹² We must consider the author, audience, and influences. Interpreting the text is not a static endeavor, but a dynamic “conversation” between the reader and the text, as a meeting of two horizons, both carrying their own

⁸The use of themes and the spontaneous play of associations of ideas was commonplace in the monastic Middle Ages. See LECLERCQ, *The Love of Learning and the Desire for God*, p. 77. E. KINERK, “Toward a Method for the Study of Spirituality.” *Review for Religious* 40/1 (1981): pp. 3-19.

⁹LECLERCQ, *The Love of Learning and the Desire for God*, pp. 54 and 241.

¹⁰LECLERCQ, *The Love of Learning and the Desire for God*, p. 34: “But if the great ideas of the past are to remain young and vital, each generation must, in turn, think them through and rediscover them in their pristine newness.”

¹¹SHELDRAKE, *Spirituality & History*, pp. 92, 108. On suppressions, see pp. 106-107.

¹²SHELDRAKE, *Spirituality & History*, pp. 173-175.

world views. If there is honesty and openness, and the “spell” of our presuppositions which served as a starting point with the text is broken,¹³ the “contact” between the reader and text can provoke new understandings and disclose something that “remains compelling, and they continue to challenge readers and bring them into transforming contact with what is enduring and vital in the Christian tradition.”¹⁴ We come to a fuller appreciation of the text when we apply it to the present moment.¹⁵

The conversation is not one of ideas, but a way of being in the world, here and now. Since this is a study in Christian spirituality, the way of being in the world concerns the experience - how the believer appropriates the Gospel message and applies it in real life. For example, rather than being a book of laws, the *Rule of St. Benedict* passes on the “experience” of its founder.¹⁶ Therefore, in reading the *Rule* one must be informed about the culture, theology and needs of the time period in which it was written.

After investigating the history, sociology, and other related areas, we examine and judge results in light of chosen theological categories¹⁷ – an ecclesial experience of faith

¹³To “break the spell” is H-G. Gadamer’s expression from *Truth and Method* as cited in SHELDRAKE, *Spirituality & History*, p. 180.

¹⁴P. SHELDRAKE, “Interpretation” in *New Dictionary of Catholic Spirituality*. Collegeville, Mn.: The Liturgical Press, 1993, pp. 547-550, esp. 548b. Hereafter *NDCS*. For a description of a classic text, see also TRACY, *The Analogical Imagination*, pp. 99-135. On recognizing a spiritual classic: SHELDRAKE, *Spirituality & History*, p. 172. See M. A. McINTOSH, *Mystical Theology. The Integrity of Spirituality and Theology*. Oxford: Blackwell Pub., 1998, p. 143: “Once one has learned not to take the patterns of the text as a description, then the text can function as a new theological *gestalt*, a hermeneutical field within which everything is seen in a new light and is charged with a new resonance.”

¹⁵SHELDRAKE, *Spirituality & History*, p. 181.

¹⁶See SHELDRAKE, *Spirituality & History*, pp. 181-182.

¹⁷LAGUË, “La spiritualité chrétienne,” p. 72: “les données de la foi demeurent toujours les clés pour interpréter l’expérience chrétienne.” BALTHASAR, *La vérité est symphonique*, p. 150.

responding to revelation considered as normative, and yet, its expressions are subject to scrutiny and further development. We then identify patterns of God's actions and of human response, and weigh different spiritualities in light of revelation and the way of life projected by a believing community and its theology. As mentioned, variations of expressions and new ways of understanding occur because of their "wealth of content."¹⁸

Finally, while using the findings of psychology, philosophy, and other disciplines, we would use theological judgments as a basis for selecting what is important for spirituality (living the Gospel in concrete situations) and for determining its historical impact or lack of it.¹⁹ At this point, a study of secular ideologies might be studied for their influence to distort authentic spirituality. It is important to remember that the manner of interpretation and judgment is made within a faith-oriented discipline where theology and spirituality interact in a unified way.²⁰

A question remains: how does the theme of harmony in Augustine shed light on the notion and better understanding of the self and others? In Chapters Three, Four and Five questions concerning the self are examined in light of the various aspects of doctrine and praxis (creation, prayer, communion, and *totus Christus*). New emphasis on understanding the self will surface as we look at these categories from the perspective of the theme of harmony. For example, the capacity to recognize the presence of God in the life of the other

¹⁸LECLERCQ, *The Love of Learning and the Desire for God*, pp. 99, 200.

¹⁹The Christian mysteries are brought close together, in order to grasp their coherence, and acquire a new synthetic view. See LECLERCQ, *The Love of Learning and the Desire for God*, pp. 200, 202, 215.

²⁰BALTHASAR, *La vérité est symphonique*, pp. 142-151. "J'insiste sur l'indivisibilité entre théologie et spiritualité" (p. 150).

as a condition for harmony is a new element for understanding the self in the context of Communion. We recognize the presence of the sacred in the other only when we see that presence in ourselves first. Communion and harmony become a possibility especially in moments of conflict and tension.

To approach the nature of “harmony,” this chapter follows a comparative structure in two parts. The first part deals with harmony as a **term**. We look at how the term is defined and appears in some of Augustine’s writings. For instance, Augustine defines clearly the term harmony in *De civitate Dei*, which is important for determining the theme’s development. Then we turn to see how this term resonates, or not, in some of the documents of the Order of Saint Augustine, such as the *Rule* and *Constitutions*.

The second part follows the same structure as the first, but with the treatment of harmony as a **theme**. In this part we also look at how harmony as a theme can “open the door” to new understanding of the self and others. What do we mean by “self”? Does a person “have” a self, or “is” s/he a self? Can you lose a self? The term itself can be very ambiguous and there are many theories about the meaning of self. The sense in which we use the term is one that respects, first, both the conscious and unconscious dimensions of awareness and second, the “unfolding” of the self in light of biblical values and its relationship with the self, God, and others. Psychoanalyst Frances M. Moran identifies these two dimensions as the “Augustinian Path” and as an “intellectual inheritance” passed on to us through the Church.²¹ For example, unconscious awareness represents the “vast

²¹The other viewpoint of looking at the self is from the “Aquinas Path,” whose emphasis is on conscious awareness. No doubt the road less traveled is the path of Augustine. Thomist psychology makes sense to us. Augustine’s road to understanding the self is more complex, goes beyond conscious awareness and what we know, and plumbs the unknown “depths” beyond conscious understanding. See F.

cloisters” of memory found in Book 10 of the *Confessiones*. The point here is to emphasize that there is more to the self than just the conscious self.

Now a word about the texts themselves. Previously, we described how and why we are using Augustine’s classical and pastoral texts. One text in particular is Augustine’s *Rule* for monastic life, which aims at giving “verbal expression to the reality of being a Christian.”²² This is obvious from a quick reading of a very short text which contains not less than thirty-one biblical references, of which twenty-seven are from the New Testament.

Regarding the Order’s tradition, the texts selected are those that describe in some way the art of living the Christian life as an aspect of Augustinian spirituality. These texts are the *Rule of St. Augustine*, the Order’s *Constitutions*,²³ a spiritual composition which deals with the application of the spirit of the *Rule*, and the Order’s formation manual, the *Ratio Institutionis Ordinis Sancti Augustini*. Recent chapter documents and pastoral letters of the Order are treated because they portray the “contemporary rhythm of life.”²⁴ Given that the Order’s spirituality involves “the wisdom accumulated by our forebears,” we look at reflections and writings from our theologians – like Jordan of Saxony (d. 1370 or 1380)

M. MORAN, *Listening. A Pastoral Style*. Melbourne, Australia: David Lovell Publ., 2001, pp. 132-138. A special thanks to Prof. Augustine Meier who introduced me to this important book. For a discussion on how Augustine views the self’s search for meaning through *relations*, see also J. SMITH, “Confessions of an Existentialist: Reading Augustine after Heidegger.” *New Blackfriars* 82/964 (2001): pp. 273-282.

²²T. VAN BAVEL, “The Evangelical Inspiration of the Rule of St. Augustine.” *The Downside Review* 93 (1975): p. 83.

²³Both texts will be taken from *Rule and Constitutions of the Order of Saint Augustine*. Issued by Authority of Miguel Angel Orcasitas, O.S.A., Prior General. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1991.

²⁴“Renewed Augustinians for the Third Millennium: Documents of the Ordinary General Chapter 1995.” Rome: Pubblicazioni Agostiniane, 1995, p. 41. The Prior General, Miguel A. Orcasitas, says in a homily “It is said that the history of religious families is, in great part, the history of their Chapters. Each Chapter faces certain challenges. Each reflects the contemporary rhythm of life and can determine the future decisively.”

and Ange Le Proust (d. 1697).

The *interest or need for this chapter* lies first of all in the general clarification of the difference between a term and a theme; second, we want to have some idea what we mean by harmony when we use the word as a theme. The term harmony provides us with the root idea from which various aspects are generated. The following chapters deal with these aspects in greater detail. This clarification is important if we are going to understand how the theme of harmony is a component of Augustinian spirituality and how it gives us direction for understanding the self and others. So, just as Chapter One served as a backdrop for spirituality, Chapter Two provides a general framework for grasping the concept of the theme of harmony.

As *background or context* for this chapter, it has been said in the introduction that this study will deal with the theme of harmony which is larger than the term. This means we take into consideration other words which are related to this reality. Where a “term”⁶ has definite boundaries of meaning, a “theme” is a type of umbrella encompassing two or more synonymous or contrasting terms. A “theme” is defined as “a placing, arrangement”⁷

⁶S. BERG FLEXNER (ed.), *The Random House dictionary of the English language*. New York: Random House, 1987, p.1958. The word “term” comes from the Latin *terminus* meaning boundary, limit, end; it can also mean to name, call or designate some particular subject, as a science or art. In Aquinas (13th c.) the word *terminus* is synonymous with *dictio, locutio, nomen*. J. A. H. MURRAY (ed.), *A New English Dictionary on Historical Principles*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1919, vol. IX, part II, p. 202: A term is a “technical expression” . . . In wider application, “term” can be any word or group of words expressing a “notion or conception, or denoting an object of thought.” It can also mean an expression (*for* something). Boundaries and limits are placed in order to grasp what the word means and in what sense it will be used in the text.

⁷MURRAY, *A New English Dictionary*, p. 269: In the field of music, for example, the theme is the principal melody or *canto fermo* in a contrapuntal piece, or it is a simple tune on which variations are constructed. A Bach *fugue* is an example of thematic development within a musical score. Available on the World Wide Web @ <http://www.jan.ucc.nau.edu/~tas3/fugueanatomy.html>

or “unifying or dominant idea, a motif, as in a work of art.”⁸ It involves a linking of similar ideas under the same category of thought, principle, or leitmotiv.

However, a theme may also encompass antonyms which give clearer insight into the original notion at hand. For example, discord portrays a lack of concord or darkness is the absence of light. So a theme includes not only an arrangement of similar terms but also its opposite in a way that enhances the definition of the principal idea.⁹

Since theme involves an “arrangement” of ideas, new expressions can unfold that may not have been considered before. This is the creative dimension of the theme which allows us to explore new terrain of expressions and make new links with ideas. This is possible because there is an “excess of meaning,” to use David Tracy’s expression.¹⁰ Despite the fact that it generates more possibilities, a theme relies basically on the meaning of a term, in this occurrence the term harmony. Our specific term provides some orientations assumed by a theme. We now turn to see how the term harmony is defined and appears in writings of Augustine and of the Order.

I. Presence of the term *harmonia*

⁸ BERG FLEXNER (ed.), *The Random House dictionary*, p. 1966.

⁹In music, Ludwig van Beethoven was a master at working with the Greek notion of *catharsis*, the tension of bringing order out of chaos. For a wonderful study on music and society, see A. GUZELIMIAN, *Parallels and Paradoxes, Explorations in Music and Society*. Daniel Barenboim and Edward W. Said. New York: Pantheon Books, 2002.

¹⁰D. TRACY, *The Analogical Imagination: Christian theology and the culture of pluralism*. New York: Crossroad, 1981, pp. 99-135. Hugh of St. Victor developed a variety of themes from Augustine’s ideas. See I. ILLICH, *In the Vineyard of the Text. A commentary to Hugh’s ‘Didascalicon.’* Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1993, p. 123.

A. Term “harmony” in Augustine’s writings

According to a computer search of Augustine’s writings the term “harmonia” and its cognates are used 123 times.¹¹ In his *De civitate Dei*, for example, the term is used to describe the relationship of the parts to a whole, as in the portrayal of the human body. What can be said of the background to this important book and underlying emotional currents that may have been present at the time of his writing?

Begun in 413 the *De civitate Dei* is Augustine’s longest and most comprehensive work. The work itself is a response to the accusation that Christianity was responsible for the sack of Rome by Alaric and the Goths in August 410. Augustine responded in kind to the accusation, by using the writings of the pagan authors like Cicero, saying that the breakdown of Roman society was due not to the Christian faith but to Rome’s failure to live up to its ideals.¹² This work was finally completed in 426 when Augustine was 72 years of age. On September 26 of that same year he assembled his clergy and large congregation in the *Basilica Pacis* to hear a decision. He nominated the priest Eraclius to be his successor. He told them, “In this life we are all bound to die; and for everyone, his last day is always uncertain . . . I came to this town in my prime: I was a young man then, now I have grown old.”¹³ In this psychological climate of everything that contributes to the maturity of age and preparation for a holy death, Augustine writes in *De civitate Dei*

¹¹P. TOMBEUR, *Library of Latin Texts*. Software designed by Cetedoc. Turnhout, Belgium: Brepols, 2002.

¹²See E. FORTIN, “Civitate Dei, De” in *AA*, pp. 197-198.

¹³*Ep.* 213, 1 as recorded in P. BROWN, *Augustine of Hippo. A Biography*. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1967, (new edition 2000), p. 411.

his reflections involving the term harmony.

1. Harmony as “rhythm of relationships”

Where does Augustine give us his definition of the term harmony and what were some of the other concerns he might have had to confront when he composed this text? In the last Book (22, 24) of the *De civitate Dei*, Augustine uses the term *harmonía*.¹⁴

What I have in mind is the *rhythm of relationships* (*coaptatio*), the **harmonía**, as the Greeks would say, whereby the whole body, inside and out, can be looked upon as a kind of organ with a music all its own. The beauty of this music no one has yet discovered, because no one has dared look for it. Nevertheless, if this *total organic design* could only be discerned . . . there would be revealed to the soul so ravishing a beauty that no visible shapeliness of form that delights the eye – the mere minister of our mind – could be compared with it.¹⁵

The notion of harmony in Augustine has two dimensions: a “rhythm of relationships” and a “joint or fitting together.” But what was the state of mind of Augustine, the old man and retiring bishop, when he wrote these words in the final pages of the *De civitate Dei* and to which we will return in a moment?

To know the actual mental state of anyone is difficult, if impossible. This is true

¹⁴R.W. DYSON (ed.), *Augustine: The City of God against the Pagans*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1998. Hereafter *Civ Dei*.

¹⁵(Emphasis is mine.) “Numeros tamen de quibus loquor, quibus **coaptatio**, quae ἀρμονία Graece dicitur, tamquam cuiusdam organi, extrinsecus atque intrinsecus totius corporis constat, quid dicam. Nemo valuit invenire, quos nemo ausus est quaerere? Qui si noti esse potuissent, in interioribus quoque visceribus, quae nullum ostentant decus, ita delectaret pulchritudo rationis ut omni formae apparenti quae oculis placet ipsius mentis quae oculis utitur praeferretur arbitrio” (*civ Dei* 22, 24; *CCL* 850). V. BOURKE, (ed.), *Saint Augustine: The City of God*. Translation by G. Walsh, D. Zema, G. Monahan and D. Honan, New York: Doubleday, 1958, p. 528: The term “harmony” is translated as “rhythm of relationships.” *Civ. Dei*, p. 1163 uses the word “togetherness” (*coaptatio*) and “concord” is found in W. OATES (ed.), *Basic Writings of Saint Augustine*, New York: Random House, 1948, vol. 2, p. 650 and in *NPNF*, vol. 2, pp. 503-504. These last two editions both indicate that *coaptatio* is a word coined by Augustine and found again in *Trin* 4, 2; *CCL* 50, 164: “Hanc enim coaptationem, sicut mihi nunc occurrit, dicere volui, qum graeci ἀρμονίαν vocant.” The word “harmony” is also found in *civ. Dei* 2, 21; 17, 14; 22, 30.

especially for personalities separated by many centuries. However we do know that some issues were upper most in the bishop's mind that could have influenced his thinking, feeling and reflections. One issue dealt with the stories of miracles, especially those of physical healing, occurring in different villages and towns. This is of interest to Augustine, too, for he is more aware of the failing body and prays for good health.¹⁶

Augustine, indeed, had been led into an acute awareness of the extent of the purely physical suffering of the human race. These miracles had sprouted from the desperation of men [and women] afflicted 'by more diseases than any book of medicine could hold' . . . it is this urgent need for faith in an unbelievable, distant transformation, that determines Augustine's final attitude to the miracles around him.¹⁷

All is aimed towards the future, to eternal life, a life of immortality with God where there is no longer any physical suffering.

And people, especially the martyrs, have walked before with the firmness of faith. "All the hopes of the people of God were now pinned on the future – on the resurrection of the body. The martyrs had died for this impossible belief; their dead bodies, also could be allowed to witness to it."¹⁸ This is the attitude which Augustine had reached when, in the twenty-second book of the *De civitate Dei*, he attempted, by an unwieldy and picturesque catalogue of strange occurrences in Hippo, Carthage, Calama"¹⁹ It seems that since there was so much disharmony in Roman North Africa, Augustine had thoughts about a

¹⁶BROWN, *Augustine of Hippo*, p. 420.

¹⁷BROWN, *Augustine of Hippo*, p. 421.

¹⁸"Quia et ipsi martyres hujus fidei martyres, id est, hujus fidei testes fuerunt, huic fidei testimonium perhibentes mundum inimicissimum et crudelissimum pertulerunt; cumque, non repugnando, sed moriendo vicerunt" (*Civ Dei* 22, 9; CCL 48, 827).

¹⁹BROWN, *Augustine of Hippo*, pp. 421-422.

different life not on this side of death, but a life of complete harmony of which miracles were like streaks of light in a dark area: “These reliefs were some slight hint, like thin rays of sunshine entering a darkened room, of the final transformation, the glorious resurrection, of the bodies of the elect.”²⁰

Returning to the notion of “rhythm of relationships” cited in *De civitate Dei* 22, 24, this expression rises out of the text as a reflection on the mysterious, hidden and beautiful arrangements of the physical organs in the human body. Aside from their practical purposes, healthy organs have “rhythm, poise, symmetry, and beauty.” The physical parts on both the outside and inside of the body demonstrate a certain network of rhythmic relations between the parts. Disease and disorder are related somehow to a breakdown of coherent relationships between the organs; the body falls into sickness; the rhythm is broken. The word chosen by the pastor to describe the healthy relationship of parts to the whole, is *harmonia*.

As a rhetorician, Augustine is exact with his words and the ideas he is trying to convey. For example, in his *De diversis questionibus octoginta tribus*, question 30, the bishop begins his thinking by defining *honorable (honestum)* and *useful (utile)* and how he intends to use these terms.²¹ Sometimes he would make up a word like the term

²⁰S. 317, 1 as quoted in BROWN, *Augustine of Hippo*, p. 421.

²¹“Ut inter honestum et utile interest, ita et inter fruendum et utendum. Quanquam enim omne honestum utile, et omne utile honestum esse, subtiliter defendi queat: tamen quia magis proprie atque usitatus honestum dicitur quod propter se ipsum expetendum est, utile autem quod ad aliud aliquid referendum est: secundum hanc differentiam nunc loquimur, illud sane custodientes, ut honestum et utile nullo modo sibimet adversentur” (*De diversis questionibus LXXXI*, 30; *CCL 44A*; *FC*, vol. 70, pp. 55-56).

“coaptatio,”²² defined in *De civitatis Dei* 22, 24 as “rhythm of relationships” to mean “adjustment” or “adaptation.” Moreover, this same word (*coaptatio*) – implying “match, agreement, concord, consonance, construction or interlock”-- is also used in his discourse on redemption and mediation in *De Trinitate* 4, 2, 4: “What I mean by this interlock, it has just occurred to me, is what the Greeks call ‘harmonia’”-- (*Hanc enim coaptationem, sicut mihi nunc occurrit, dicere volui, quam graeci ἀρμονίαν vocant*).²³ Augustine conveyed the closest meaning to his words by turning to the Greek language²⁴ and to non-Christian authors.²⁵

Then, to get a better idea of Augustine’s understanding of *harmonia*, as a ‘rhythm of relationships,’ it is necessary to see how the aging African pastor makes a link with how the Greeks think when they use the term harmony in their mythology.

²²For references to *coaptatio*, see A. UÑA JUÁREZ, “San Agustín: la interioridad bella.” *Pensamiento* 53/205 (1997), p. 142, n. 67. In J. M. FONTANIER, “Le *De Pulchro et Apto* d’Augustin,” *Revue des sciences philosophiques et théologiques* 73 (1989), pp. 418-419: “Tout au long de son œuvre, Augustin continuera à définir la beauté comme une **coaptatio**, une adaptation des parties d’un tout, adaptées (*apta*) entre elles et au tout. **Coaptatio** ou tout autre terme équivalent: *congruentia partium, concordia partium. Omnis enim corporis pulchritudo est partium congruentia cum quadam coloris suavitate (civ Dei 19, 2). Définition stoïcienne? A en croire Plotin, elle faisait l’objet d’un quasi-consensus (Enn. I, 6, 1, 21).*” Emphasis is mine.

²³*Trin.* 4, 2, 4; *CCL* 50, 164; J. ROTELLE (ed.), *The Trinity*. Brooklyn, New York: New City Press, 1991. Hereafter *Trin.*

²⁴Awareness of the Greek and Roman classics was integrated into the education system in Augustine’s time. See S. MACCORMACK, “Classical Influences on Augustine” in *AA*, p. 206: After reading St Paul and Scripture, he (Augustine) used a much more selective scrutiny with classical texts. The classics lost their influence till the sack of Rome (410). See also J. O’DONNELL, “Augustine’s Classical Readings.” *Recherches Augustiniennes* 15 (1980): pp. 144-175. O’Donnell makes the observation: “We assume that Augustine’s readings of Greek works in the original were few and comparatively insignificant. On this point, H.-I. MARROU, *Saint Augustin et la fin de la culture antique*, (Paris, 1958), 27-37, 631-637, requires only minor modification” (p. 144, note 2).

²⁵Augustine is clear in *de Doctr. christ.* II, 18, 28, that one can use secular authors and texts in their pursuit for “understanding scripture” and “truth.” “Imo vero quisquis bonus verusque christianus est, Domini sui esse intelligat, ubicumque invenerit veritatem, quam confitens et agnoscens, etiam in Litteris sacris superstitiosa figmenta repudiet” (*CCL* 32, 53).

2) Greek notion of *ἀρμονία*: “joints” on a chariot wheel

We learn that Harmonia was the goddess of concord and she lived with her husband Kadmos in the Elysian Fields. Ironically, much discord surrounded her life. Harmonia was born of the secret love affair between the war-god Ares and the goddess of love, Aphrodite and with profound shame the infant was given to Pleiad Elektra. Elektra received the child as her own with her newborn son, Emathion. Harmonia grew up under the care of her foster-mother. Years later, as a reward for assisting Zeus in the battle against the monster Typhoeus, Kadmos was given Harmonia to be his wife. In her grief Harmonia, seduced by the disguised Aphrodite, married the “vagrant, homeless sailor.” So the young girl picked up and kissed the soil of her birth, left home, and together Harmonia and Kadmos founded the city of Thebes in Greece.²⁶

In this story harmony has a political interpretation. Thus the English word “harmost,” derived from the Greek “harmos” (joint, fastening), indicates a governor appointed by the Spartans over subject towns and peoples. The notion of “joint” or “fastener” is carried over into the social structure of citizenry and human relations. So “the primary meaning of the Greek word is not musical, as with the English ‘harmony’; its primary meaning is a ‘joint, fastener, or clamp –a carpenter’s or shipwright’s word’.”²⁷ Harmony has something to do with “bringing together, joining, fitting together pieces or

²⁶*Dionysiaca* 3.373-4.292. For additional descriptions from other classical sources of this mythical story: available from World Wide Web @ www.theoi.com/Kronos/Harmonia.html

²⁷Cited on p. 177 in the notes of *trin*. On the etymology of the word “harmony,” see also J. SHIPLEY (ed.), *Dictionary of Word Origins*, Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, reprint 1969, p. 175: “originally a term from carpentry, not music. A basic principle in Greek and Oriental philosophy - ‘to fit together.’”

parts of a whole,” like the joints and parts of a chariot wheel. This meaning has its source in the hymns sung by the nine Muses at the wedding feast of Harmonia and Kadmos and the result of this music was the founding of Thebes, a new social order where citizens lived in concord.²⁸

After tracing some features of Greek mythology about the term harmony, we may see Augustine’s use of the term as “joining or fitting together” in a way that a carpenter constructs a wheel for a chariot or the way in which the organs of the body “fit together.”²⁹ Does Augustine go deeper with his understanding of harmony than just relating to parts that “fit together”? We find an answer to this question when we look at his doctrine on creation, fall as discord, and a description of the Trinitarian God. His reflection on the doctrine of creation is based on *Wisdom* 11:21: “You have disposed all things by measure and number and weight.” This citation demonstrates that the universe is designed according to the triadic principles of “measure, number, and weight.” These three principles can shed light on our understanding of harmony as “joint, fit together.” One can see the implications regarding the self in relation to creation, God, and others. We will return to this triad in the next chapter.

Augustine gives us a sense of harmony in an uncommon, poetic description of God as Trinity. In *De doctrina Christiana* 1, 5, 5, we find the interesting Trinitarian formula:

²⁸Democritus said that the essence and the happiness of humanity consists in ‘harmony.’ He was the first philosopher to give importance to the field of music as a separate academic discipline from astronomy, arithmetic and geometry. He is the founder of the quadrivium. See L. SPITZER, “Classical and Christian Ideas of World Harmony.” *Traditio* 2 (1944), pp. 409-464, especially pp. 416-417; 3 (1945), pp. 307-364.

²⁹Cf. *Civ. Dei* 22, 24.

“In the Father unity, in the Son equality, in the Holy Spirit the harmony (*concordia*) of unity and equality, and these three are all one because of the Father, are all equal because of the Son, are all linked together because of the Holy Spirit.”³⁰ The term harmony is also applied by Augustine to the Incarnation-event with God’s entrance into human history by “joining, adjusting” with the human condition by sending his Son.³¹ It suffices for now to make reference to this important topic since it will be developed later on. Meanwhile, it is relevant to wonder if the term *harmony* as “rhythm of relationships” and “joint and fastener” is carried over into the Augustinian spiritual tradition.

B. Term “harmony” in the writings of the Order of Saint Augustine

Before we consider how the term “harmony” appears in the Order’s documentation, we need to take a step back and look at the characteristics of three texts: the *Rule*, *Constitutions*, and *Ratio*.

³⁰“In patre unitas, in filio aequalitas, in spiritu sancto unitatis aequalitatisque concordia, et tria haec unum omnia propter patrem, aequalia omnia propter filium, conexa omnia propter spiritum sanctum” (*De doct. Christ.* I, 5, 5; *CCL* 32, 9.15). J. ROTELLE (ed.), *Saint Augustine, Teaching Christianity – De Doctrina Christiana*. WSA I/11. Hyde Park, NY: New City Press, 1996. E. HILL, translator of this text, makes this comment: “An interesting formula . . . There is nothing quite like it in his *The Trinity*, attributing specifically distinct but still shared attributes to each of the three persons. It is, we could say, a poetically pleasing formula, but lacking in theological rigor” (p. 126, note 6). See K. COYLE, “Concordia: The Holy Spirit as Bond of the Two Testaments in Augustine.” *Augustinianum* 22 (1982): pp. 427-456, especially p. 429. J. GARCIA LAVAREZ, “El misterio de la Trinidad y la comunidad en san Agustín.” *Revista Agustiniiana* 33 (1992): pp. 613-637.

³¹Cf. *Trin.* 4, 2.

The primary writings of the Order's spirituality are Augustine's *Rule*³² and the *Constitutions*, "a spiritual book."³³ These two texts, the *Rule* and the *Constitutions*, together receive the bulk of our attention here due to their importance in describing the nature and components of Augustinian spirituality. It is important to remember that the *Rule* indicates the basic norm or spirit of the Augustinian lifestyle; this norm never changes. In his *Rule* Augustine does not deal with the details of everyday living in the way that the Benedict's *Rule* [or: the Benedictine *Rule*] is designed to do. Augustine's *Rule* deals with the essentials he found in sacred scripture.³⁴ C. Boyer says that Augustine's monasteries are "founded on the charity of the Gospel, governed with gentleness, austere without being rigid, observant without narrowness, given to prayer, study, and for clerics, to the apostolate."³⁵

Where the *Rule* establishes the basic norm of the Augustinian spirit, the *Constitutions* explain and offer directives on living this norm or spirit. These directives can

³²See C. BOYER, "Augustin (Saint)" in *DS* 1, col. 1126 - 1129 on the *Rule*. Sources for understanding the *Rule* are s.355-356, ep. 83, 210, 211, 213, 216, and 243, and Possidius' *Vita Sancta Augustini*, n. 11, nos. 22-31. For a brief history of the *Rule* see P. DE LUIS VIZCAINO, *San Agustín/Orden de San Agustín*. Zamora (Spain): Ediciones Monte Casino, 2000, pp. 147-151.

³³*Rule and Constitutions of the Order of Saint Augustine*, Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1991. Hereafter *Const.* (Numbers refer to paragraphs and not page numbers.) For the *Rule* identified as the "fundamental document" of the Order's spirituality, see *Const.* 21. The *Constitutions* is not just a manual of laws, but "a spiritual book" (*Ratio* 123c), or a guide on how to live in the Spirit, with which the members "strive frequently to meditate on and apply to ourselves the principles, admonitions and norms" (*Const.* 522; *Rule* 8; *Perfectae Caritatis* 4). "Thus, while we together seek God with one mind and heart, the interior movements of the Spirit will achieve their effect in each of us" (*Const.* 522).

³⁴See VAN BAVEL, "The Evangelical Inspiration of the Rule," pp. 83-99.

³⁵See C. BOYER, "Augustin (Saint)," col. 1128-1129: ". . . qu'il trouva la formule de ces monastères fondés sur la charité de l'Évangile, gouvernés avec douceur, austères sans rigidité, observants sans étroitesse, adonnés à la prière, à l'étude, et, s'il s'agit de clercs, à l'apostolat."

change according to circumstances.³⁶ At first sight, the word “Constitutions” seem to indicate a body of laws and prescriptions. But the *Constitutions* are more than just regulations; they are an “expression of a truly Augustinian way of life” and the “touchstone of our unity.”³⁷ The *Rule* and *Constitutions* go together as the “code of life.”³⁸ Any attempt to understand this spirituality must begin with these two foundational texts.³⁹

The document *Plan of Augustinian Formation (Ratio Institutionis Ordinis Sancti Augustini)*, commonly called *Ratio*, will be used not only for its identification and integration of the basic elements of the *Rule* and *Constitutions* for formation, but also how

³⁶VIZCAINO, *San Agustín/Orden de San Agustín*, p. 166.

³⁷J. BARRY and J. MACDOUGALL, “A History of our Constitutions - Part I.” *The Tagastan* 20/2 (1958): pp. 2-15, especially p. 43; Part II in 20/3 (1958-1959): pp. 27-44. Jerome Seripando remarked that it is the Constitutions which distinguish us from all others who follow the Rule of St. Augustine (p. 43).

³⁸*Living in freedom under grace: Augustinian spirit and spirituality in the writings of the Popes and priors general (1953-1978)*. Rome: Curia generalizia agostiniana, 1979, pp. 43-45.

³⁹See C. BOYER, “Augustin (Saint),” col. 1104-1105, for sources of Augustine’s spiritual doctrine in his writings. Augustine never systematized his spiritual teachings, but his ideas are found throughout his works. The more important works are the *Confessions* (397-398), the great treatise on spiritual doctrine; *De Trinitate* (400-416) which expounds the theological foundations of piety; *De Civitate Dei* (413-426/7), especially books 5, 8-12, 19 - 22; the *Enarrationes in Psalmos* (396-420); Homilies that form the *Tractatus in Johannem* and *In epistolam ad Parthos* (413-418) and other numerous *Sermones*; *ep.* 130 on prayer (412), 26, 118, 188, 210, 211; two works on monastic life, *De opere monachorum* (400) and *De sancta virginitate* (400-401), both spiritual treatises; *Soliliquiorum libri duo* (386-387) and *De vita Beata* (386).

Other texts to be examined are the documents from the Ordinary and Intermediate General Chapters over the past ten years. These texts are:

Renewed Augustinians for the Third Millennium. Documents of the Ordinary General Chapter 1995. Rome: Pubblicazioni Agostiniane, 1995. Hereafter *OGC1995*.

Augustinians in the Church for the World of Today. Documents of the Intermediate General Chapter 1998. Rome: Pubblicazioni Agostiniane, 1998. Hereafter *IGC1998*.

Ordinary General Chapter 2001. Documents and Decisions. Rome: Pubblicazioni Agostiniane, 2001. Hereafter *OGC2001*. These documents are important for the nature of their implementation of the ideals and spirit articulated in the *Rule* and *Constitutions*, especially in light of the preparation for the new millennium.

the term “Harmony” appears explicitly as a subsection in the text.⁴⁰

1. *Harmony as “unanimitas” in the Rule and Constitutions of the Order*

From the very beginning of its foundation, the Order of Saint Augustine embraced the inspiration of its spiritual Father by adopting his *Rule* of life and vision for living the Gospel message. This spirit, as mentioned, is articulated through the Order’s *Constitutions*. Does the term *harmonia*, as it is found in the *Rule* and the *Constitutions*, contribute to defining the spirit of the Order?

The Order’s interpretation of the *Rule* of Augustine depends much on the commentaries written on the *Rule* itself.⁴¹ If one were to read through the *Rule* in its Latin version, scholars believe, written by Augustine himself, the term *harmonia* does not appear at all, but it offers equivalent expressions (inspired by *Acts* 4:32).⁴² In 1, 2, the section which indicates the purpose and goal of community life, we read: “Before all else, *live*

⁴⁰*Plan of Augustinian Formation (Ratio Institutionis Ordinis Sancti Augustini)*. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1993. Hereafter *Ratio*.

⁴¹The first official commentary on the *Rule* entitled *Expositio in Regulam Sancti Augustini* (PL 176, 881-924) was traditionally associated with either Hugh of St. Victor (d. 1141) or Letbert of Saint Ruf (d. 1110), both Canons Regular of Saint Augustine, but scholars today no longer make this claim of authorship. Even though authorship is unknown, what is certain is that the Order officially adopted the document in its earliest existence. Modern commentary and English translation of the *Expositio* can be found in B. RANO, “The Charism of the Order of St. Augustine” in *Augustinian Origins, Charism, and Spirituality*. John Rotelle, O.S.A. (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1994, pp. 441-496.

Jordan of Saxony’s *The Life of the Brethren* (published in 1357) is structured as a text on Augustine’s four-fold communion found in the opening statement of the *Rule*. The commentary of St. Alonso de Orozco (d. 1591) replaced the original *Expositio* as the Order’s official commentary in 1686. In the seventeenth century, Ange Le Proust (d. 1697) was known for his reflections on the *Rule* with the emphasis on the great commandment. In contemporary times, commentaries have been written by Adolar Zumkeller and Tarcisius van Bavel.

⁴²For the Latin version of the *Rule: Regula et constitutiones. Ordinis Fratrum Sancti Augustini*. Issued by Theodore Tack. Rome: Curia generalis augustiniana, 1978. Regarding authenticity of the text, see A. ZUMKELLER, *Augustine’s Rule. A Commentary*. M. J. O’Connell (trans.) and J. E. Rotelle (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1987, p. 12. Concerning the date of the *Rule (Praeceptum)* – situated shortly after Augustine’s consecration as a bishop (395 or 396), see L. VERHEIJEN, *Saint Augustine’s monasticism in the light of Acts 4:32-35*. Villanova, Pa.: Villanova University Press, 1979, pp. 45-46.

together in harmony (*unanimis*) (Ps. 68:7) being of one mind and one heart (Acts 4:32) on the way to God.”⁴³

The second place where the expression of harmony is found is at the end of the first chapter of the *Rule*: “You are all to live together, therefore, *one in mind and one in heart* (*unanimiter; as one soul*) (see Acts 4:32), and honor God in one another because *each of you has become his temple* (2 Cor. 6:16).”⁴⁴ Adolar Zumkeller translates *unanimiter* as “oneness” as an expression of “harmony.”⁴⁵ Other English translations of the *Rule* will use similar expressions: “Live, then, all of you, in harmony and concord” (*unanimiter et concorditer*).⁴⁶

However, the word “harmony” appears four times in the English translation of the Order’s *Constitutions*. The *Constitutions* quotes the opening line in Augustine’s *Rule* – “to live harmoniously, intent upon God in oneness of mind and heart.”⁴⁷ The word appears again, as we mentioned previously, in a citation from the German theologian and spiritual

⁴³“Primum, propter quod in unum estis congregati, ut unanimes habitetis in domo et sit uobis anima una et cor unum in deum.” Augustine grew toward this ideal, first in speaking about the unity within an individual, as “simplicity of heart” of the ancient monastic tradition, and then later “unity of heart” receives another explanation as a unity among many people. See T. VAN BAVEL, *The Rule of Saint Augustine: With Introduction & Commentary*. R. Canning (trans.). London: Darton, Longman & Todd, 1984, p. 43.

⁴⁴ *Rule* 1, 8: “Omnes ergo unanimiter et concorditer uiuite, et honorate in uobis inuicem deum cuius templa facti estis.”

⁴⁵ ZUMKELLER, *Augustine’s Rule*, p. 50.

⁴⁶G. LAWLESS, *Augustine of Hippo and his Monastic Rule*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1987, p. 83.

⁴⁷ *Const.* 16: “The purpose of our Order consists both in our seeking and worshipping God together with one heart in brotherhood and spiritual friendship and in our working to serve the people of God. As the Rule admonishes us, the main reason for our having come together is to live harmoniously, intent upon God in oneness of mind and heart.”

writer Hermann von Schildesche's commentary on the meaning of "unity of heart" in the *Rule*, which is meant to be understood "Not only with reference to unity of peace and harmony, but certainly also with regard to unity of purpose, understanding, and heartfelt affection."⁴⁸

The *Constitutions* speak about the "spirit of unity and harmony of will" with reference to religious obedience. The expectation or ideal relationship between the member of the community and the superior is one of humble service and mutual responsibility by both parties. A "harmony of will" is realized in the context of prayer and consultation with the desire to discover and conform oneself to God's will.⁴⁹

2. Harmony in the "Plan of Augustinian Formation:" a signal for new directions

The *Plan of Augustinian Formation*, commonly called the *Ratio*, was published in 1993. The *Ratio* serves as a "tool" to help specify and integrate the essential elements of spirituality found in the *Rule* and *Constitutions* and judged to be vital for Augustinian

⁴⁸*Const.* 27: "For it is of no value to live together in the same house if disparate wills keep us apart. God looks more to unity of heart than to unity of place." "Many bodies, but not many spirits; many bodies, but not many hearts" must we be, so that our spirits "are not many spirits, but only one spirit, the one spirit of Christ." As Hermann von Schildesche says, commenting on the *Rule*, this is to be understood "Not only with reference to unity of peace and harmony (*ad unitatem pacis et concordiae*), but certainly also with regard to unity of purpose (*ad unitatem mentalis intentionis*), understanding (*intellectualis collectionis*), and heartfelt affection (*cordialis affectionis*), so that in all these religious only one may be visible," that is, "the one Christ loving himself."

⁴⁹*Cf. Const.* 76: "By prayer and by consultation with the friars, superiors should strive to discover and carry out what God, in whose name they command, wills in regard to the friars."

In the General Chapter of 2001 the term harmony again is referred to only once, but in a liturgical setting. The former Prior General Miguel Orcasitas says in a homily: "That same Spirit can give us the gift of unity and fraternal harmony, in order to grow in charity, as Saint Augustine teaches us: 'Charity brings about harmony; harmony gives birth to unity; unity maintains charity and charity leads to glory.'" Like charity and unity, harmony is a gift from God; it is not something we create from our own efforts. All three of these gifts are interrelated. *OGC 2001*, p. 47; *En ps.* 30, II, s. 2, 1.

formation “in any historical or social context.”⁵⁰ This document is a contemporary interpretation of what is contained in the *Constitutions*⁵¹ of self-understanding and identity as an Order, of which the inspiration of Augustine and his *Rule* takes priority.⁵² The *Ratio* links the past to the present with a future projection.

The word harmony appears more frequently in the *Ratio*.⁵³ What is significant for this study is the section entitled “Sharing Life in Community,” with subheadings to “Harmony,” “Life of Love,” “Humility,” “Friendship,” and “Communication.”⁵⁴ The two sections on “Harmony” deal with community relations.⁵⁵

(29) Augustine tells us that he never met better people than those who made progress in the monastery but, on the other hand, that he never met worse than those who had lost their ideal

(30) Wherever people try to build up a community . . . they will be confronted with tension and conflict. For it is a fact that we all have different personalities, feelings, perceptions, expectations, ideas, choices, needs, and values In the past, formation in religious life taught people how to pray, how to live the vows, and how to be a good apostle, but *not necessarily how to live in community*.⁵⁶

⁵⁰ *Ratio*, intro, pp. 3-5: “Our fidelity to our charism obliges us to read the signs of the times and to find in our own spirituality meaningful directions for the present moment. In this way, interiority, community and mission, which are essential components of our Augustinian identity, are continually valid because they take on a modern expression whenever we return to St. Augustine”

⁵¹ Especially sections 206-221.

⁵² *Ratio*, Introduction, pp. 5 and 9.

⁵³ See the following sections: “disagreement adds spice to harmony” (27); the sharing of material goods enhances harmony in the community (36); the correct understanding of obedience and authority are important to assure unity (39); we need to integrate our experiences, especially difficulties, in a harmonious way (46); the words of our prayer are to be in harmony with our actions: “When you sing Alleluia, you must give bread to the hungry” (48; 50).

⁵⁴ *Ratio* 19-30.

⁵⁵ Full text (29-30) can be found in the Appendix 2.

⁵⁶ Emphasis is mine.

This is perhaps the first time the term harmony comes into view as a caption in the Order's documents. Whatever the case may be, some general aspects for understanding the term are given here and provide a "new direction" for community living. For example, section 29 makes it clear that community life is not some form of utopia or romantic dream, but a "school of realism." It is a life of ups and downs, of promises kept and broken. Community is a human experience where the best people and the worst live under one roof. As Augustine himself said, "I am a human being and I live among human beings."⁵⁷

Section 30 is a commentary on what happens when people "try to build up a community" anywhere, be it a family or a nation. One thing to be certain of is the inevitability of "tension and conflict," already identified in Chapter 1. When individuals or groups from different backgrounds, personalities, interests and hopes come together, a tension between the ego-self, private interests and the needs of the group can express itself in ways that are destructive. Nevertheless, such tensions should never be considered as "abnormal," but as something integral to human interaction. The outcome of such tension ought to be something productive in building mutual trust and fruitful in learning about the self, personal growth, and an enjoyment found in group process. Such tensions should be "rewarding" and not experiences in total frustration and psycho-social disintegration.

Under this heading of "Harmony," the portrayal seems to be one of disharmony caused by tensions and conflict. This only points to the fact that harmony must be situated in reality when human beings come together. This section concludes with an important observation for this study. It says that in the past the Order emphasized in its formation how

⁵⁷"Homo sum, et inter homines vivo" (*Ep.* 78, 8-9; *PL* 33, 271).

to pray, to live the vows, and to do ministry, **“but not necessarily how to live in community.”**⁵⁸ Here it becomes vague. Is harmony related to how people live in community? This section does not explain in a clear manner what it means when it uses the term harmony. The problem is that the word appears only in the caption. But if the word harmony implies a sort of relationship, then the explicit use of this term in recent documentation of the Order is indicative of a thematic shift in awareness of self-identity that is grounded in the nature of interaction between imperfect human beings living in imperfect communities.⁵⁹

Thus, we can say that the term *harmony* in the *Rule* is a translation of one word among many from Augustine’s use of the Latin *unus*. The Latin *harmonia* is not explicit in the Order’s documents even though the term appears as a caption in the *Ratio* describing the challenging nature of human relationships and community life. A change in the Order’s consciousness about itself and the notion of community as relationships may explain why a caption on “Harmony” has been included. We will return to this point in the *Ratio*.

We may be surprised that the term *harmonia* does not appear clearly in these texts. Words that have a resonance with harmony, like oneness, community, and love, do not always evoke the same richness. The vitality of words changes with time.⁶⁰ Nevertheless, we need to continue to “drink” at the Augustinian sources which suggests “the freshness

⁵⁸Emphasis is mine.

⁵⁹Karl Rahner makes a similar claim that language and new awareness of things affect each other. See A. CALLAHAN, “The Relationship between Spirituality and Theology.” *Horizons* 16/2 (1989): p. 273.

⁶⁰On how a theme generates new ideas, see page 69.

and newness of the water that flows each day from these sources and invites us to open ourselves to what is unprecedented.”⁶¹

II. Presence of the theme of “harmony”

A. Harmony as expression of human dynamics in Augustine’s Rule

If Augustine does not use the term *harmonia* with much frequency, he, nevertheless, touches the theme of harmony in many occurrences. Echoes of the prominent scripture text which fashion the Augustinian spirituality are found in the opening lines of the *Rule*: “Before all else, *live together in harmony (unanimis) (Ps. 68:7), being of one mind and one heart (Acts 4:32) on the way to God.*”⁶² Three elements emerge from the *Rule*: Oneness, Community of love, and Interiorly united toward God.

_____ 1. *Element of Oneness (unus) – Goal and Purpose for living together*

A community that lives as “one” is an expression of the theme of harmony. Luc Verheijen points out that Augustine’s biographer, Possidius, claims that “*being of one mind and one heart*” and “*they had all things in common, and each was given what he needed*”

⁶¹*IGC 1998*, 16. The passage continues: “Remember not the events of the past, the things of long ago consider not. See, I am doing something new!” (*Isa. 43: 18-19*). This passage from Genesis is even clearer: ‘Go forth from the land of your kinsfolk and from your father’s house to a land that I will show you’ (*Gen. 12:1*); furthermore it is a passage that is echoed in the Gospel recommendation that we are not to put new wine into old wine skins (see *Mt. 3:17*).”

⁶²*Rule 1, 2. VAN BAVEL, The Rule of Saint Augustine*, pp. 11-24. Van Bavel describes the deeper meaning of this passage as a “network of dynamic relationships between people” with two points for the practice of community life: “1. The necessity of a certain agreement or consensus. Community life of whatever kind requires a certain level of concord, harmony, sharing the same ideals and striving towards the same ends . . . 2) Sharing in one another’s life of faith . . . Interpersonal communication also demands a sharing in one another’s inner life, one another’s ideas, expectations, longings, activities, hope and faith” (p. 47). Communities following the *Rule* of Augustine are not based on simple good will. That is why Augustine adds “*in Deum*” to the phrase from *Acts 4: 32* – a community that is “on the way to God” or “intent upon God.” T. MARTIN, *Our Restless Heart. The Augustinian Tradition*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 2003, p. 163, note 7: “*In Deum* . . . conveys dynamism and movement. It could be rendered ‘towards God.’” See ZUMKELLER, *Augustine’s Rule*, p. 24.

in *Acts* 4:32, 35 is Augustine's source of inspiration and leitmotiv for the spirituality of the original monastery at Hippo: "according to the rule and instruction of the apostles."⁶³ Zumkeller draws attention to the fact that Augustine uses the Latin word *unus* no less than four times in this short sentence.⁶⁴ Here "*unus*," a subtext of harmony, is identified as the goal, foundation and purpose of the religious community.

Before we elaborate on a feature of harmony generated by *Acts* 4:32, a word about Augustine's use of *Psalms* 67:7 is in order. The modern translation of this verse is: "God . . . who gives a home to the forsaken."⁶⁵ This is different from Augustine's Latin text which translates "God who brings those of one mind together in one house." There is a difference in perspective between the "forsaken" and "those of one mind." Augustine's intention was to place emphasis on harmony in community right from the very beginning.⁶⁶

What insights can we glean regarding the self? First of all, turning to scripture for inspiration, Augustine encourages his members and communities to use the *Rule* as a "mirror" (*in speculo*). "As in a mirror, you will be able to see in it whether there is anything you are neglecting or forgetting."⁶⁷ If one's manner of living is coherent with the *Rule* and

⁶³*Vita* 5, 1. L. VERHEIJEN, "La Règle de S. Augustin." *Augustinianum* 4 (1964): pp. 109-122. Reference in D. GUTIERREZ, *The Augustinians in the Middle Ages 1256 - 1356*, vol. 1, part 1. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Historical Institute, 1984, p. 10. No other monastic community appeals directly to *Acts* apart from the Taizé community. See T. VAN BAVEL, "The Evangelical Inspiration of the Rule," p. 87.

⁶⁴ZUMKELLER, *Augustine's Rule*, p. 23.

⁶⁵*Ps.* 68:7.

⁶⁶See VAN BAVEL, *The Rule of Saint Augustine*, p. 42.

⁶⁷*Rule* 8, 2: "As in a mirror . . . If you find that your actions match what is written here, thank the Lord . . . If, however, a person sees that he has failed in some way, then let him be sorry for what has occurred in the past and be on his guard for what the future will bring."

Gospel, give thanks. If not, try to change, and move on with hope asking God for strength and assistance. We see the importance of this personal and communal reflection on a regular basis when we realize that Augustine's communities were composed of people from all class levels of society: rich, nobles and poor.⁶⁸ Honest critique on the part of individual self and the community as a whole facilitates "oneness" as an expression of harmony. The *Rule*, then, becomes a tool for self-examination in light of living the Gospel values.

2. *Element of Community of Love (anima una et cor unum)*

Similar to the notion of "oneness," a community of love is an expression of the theme of harmony. Let us consider the second part of this sentence: "*being of one mind and one heart (anima una et cor unum) on the way toward God (in deum)*". For is it not precisely for this reason that you have come to live together?"⁶⁹ Being *one mind and one heart* is the predominant thematic expression of harmony; *anima una* and *cor unum* do not mean uniformity, but a dynamic of human relationship based on love and friendship.⁷⁰ These relationships require a certain agreement or consensus regarding why the members want to "fit together." Van Bavel says this kind of community life requires a level of "concord, harmony, sharing the same ideals and striving towards the same ends. It is a sharing of a

⁶⁸VAN BAVEL, *The Rule of Saint Augustine*, pp. 53-55. L. VERHEIJEN, *Saint Augustine: monk, priest, bishop*. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Historical Institute, 1978, pp. 70-73. F. VAN DER MEER, *Augustine the Bishop. The Life and Work of a Father of the Church*, Brian Battershaw and G. R. Lamb (trans.), New York: Sheed & Ward, 1961, pp. 206-217, 235-241. For an introductory study on social classes, see J. KELLY, *The World of the Early Christians*. Message of the Fathers of the Church series, vol. 1. Collegeville, MN.: The Liturgical Press, 1997, especially Chapter Six.

⁶⁹*Rule* 1, 2; *Acts* 4: 32.

⁷⁰T. VAN BAVEL, "La espiritualidad de la Regla de san Agustín." *Augustinus* 12 (1967), p. 446. See *Ep.* 130, 2, 4 for a description of friendship in Augustine's letter to Proba, a refugee from Rome.

common inspiration linked to fundamental principles.”⁷¹ Verheijen comments “that the *anima una* of *Acts* 4:32 is, in the eyes of Augustine, the *anima unica Christi* or, which comes to the same thing, the “one soul of the Church,” her *koinônia*.”⁷² We will return to this topic of the *anima una* as a “boundary-breaker” when we treat another aspect of harmony in the notion of the “whole Christ” in the last chapter.

Furthermore, the *anima una* goes beyond the utilitarian factor of living under one roof and eating at the same table, and involves sharing faith, experiences, ideas, desires, failures and successes. Here we capture a sense of the self. At times, we may need to share our fears and frustrations that have their origin deep in our unconscious selves. In other words, a level of interpersonal communication and sharing of the fruits of one’s interiority are required.⁷³ But there can be no sharing of the deeper self unless there is some form of *openness* and *trust* between the members. Openness is the result of love and seeing Christ dwelling in the other. “You are all to live together, therefore, *one in mind and one in heart* (*Acts* 4:32), and honor God in one another because *each of you has become his temple* (2

⁷¹VAN BAVEL, *The Rule of Saint Augustine*, p. 47.

⁷²VERHEIJEN, *Saint Augustine: Monk, Priest, Bishop*, p. 7. See also a comparison of Vatican II ecclesiology and Augustinian ecclesiology in *OGC2001*, no. 10, at C-8 and Pietro BELLINI’S address to the Chapter on p. 43, 4b.

⁷³VAN BAVEL, *The Rule of Saint Augustine*, p. 47. For the remaining parts of the *Rule* each chapter defines the particulars and gives concrete expression of interpersonal communication to common life in *Rule* 1, 2 and 8: common prayer (*chapter* 2), a lengthy chapter on safeguarding interior purity and communal responsibility expressed in fraternal and sisterly correction (*chapter* 4), conduct regarding the weaker members and the sick (*chapters* 3-5), service to the sick, care of the community’s goods, and loaning of books (*chapter* 5), a mutual agreement to avoid all that will wound another person (*chapter* 6), the relationship of the brothers with those in positions of authority in the community (*chapter* 7), and a final exhortation and observance of the *Rule* (*chapter* 8).

Cor. 6:16).”⁷⁴

The criterion for progress in the community determines the extent to which “love is not self-seeking.”⁷⁵ Self-centered love destroys any possibility for openness. Trust serves as a glue which holds people together. The lack of trust and ego satisfaction are often the root causes for discord within the community. Consequently, social love, the ultimate criterion for personal development and progress, becomes the flip side of love of God .⁷⁶

_____3. *Element of “Interiorly united toward God” -- in Deum*

The harmony among people enables and enhances bonding with God. The final component of the line in *Rule* 1, 2 is that this style of common life is done “into God” (*in deum*) or “on the way to God.” This is Augustine’s distinguishing characteristic. Christians ought not come together out of good will or for a sense of security. They come together as a community “intent upon God” in its everyday activities which are directed toward the divine Other and one’s neighbor.

Augustine’s aim is to form a community of love in God where its members are interiorly united into a living whole, a living organism. But genuine communion can only

⁷⁴*Rule* 1, 9: “Omnes ergo unanimiter et concorditer vivite, et honorate in vobis invicem Deum cuius templa facti estis.”

⁷⁵*Rule* 5, 2: “For it is written of love that *it is not self-seeking* (1 *Cor.* 13:5); that is to say, love puts the interests of the community before personal advantage, and not the other way around. Therefore the degree to which you are concerned for the interests of the community rather than for your own is the criterion by which you can judge how much progress you have made. Thus in all the fleeting necessities of human life *something sublime and permanent* reveals itself, *namely love* (see 1 *Cor.* 12:31; 13:13).” (Cf. *Const.* 29 and 54).

⁷⁶Personal progress in a social setting is evident from 1 *Cor.* 13:5, 12, 31; *Gal.* 5:13 and 1 *Thess.* 5:14. The harsh text from 1 *Jn* 3:15: “anyone who hates his brother is a murderer,” belongs to this same context of love. See VAN BAVEL, “The Evangelical Inspiration of the Rule,” p. 84.

take place when individuals personally find this common ground.⁷⁷ This is characteristic of Augustine's view of the dynamism in the Christian life. We are on the way to God and individuals and communities advance toward this goal. The rationale for coming together is to seek God, and to do it *together*.⁷⁸ God is the horizon and point of reference to which the different strands of life, desires, are pulled together. "Intent upon God" and "seeking God together" are the marks of Christian life and religious life in particular.

The *Rule* paints broad sketches and desired goals, such as oneness, community of love, God - centeredness, that orientate Christian living. Coming together in friendship and enhancing *mutual relationships* with God as its object and goal, permeate as the quality of love in this short document. Social love, as an expression of the love of God, demonstrates a self-in-relation, as well as the criterion for personal progress. The celebrated phrase from the *Confessiones* -- "Our hearts are restless until they rest in You" -- exemplifies the two aspects of this life style: the desire to seek God and to do it together, for it is "our" hearts that are seeking.⁷⁹ These elements of harmony -- oneness, community of love, and interior unity toward God -- reflect the Emmaus experience -- being on the road together walking toward and with God. To say it in another manner, "Intent upon God with one mind and one heart" is called, in the words of Zumkeller, the "golden rule" and "brief formula" for the

⁷⁷See ZUMKELLER, *Augustine's Rule*, p. 24.

⁷⁸T. VAN BAVEL, *The Basic Inspiration of Religious Life*, J. Rotelle (ed) and H. Jackson (trans.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1996, p. 220: "That is why we say that a religious community is a group of persons who *together* listen to the gospels."

⁷⁹See P. de L. VIZCAINO, *San Agustín/Orden de San Agustín*, p. 159: "La célebre frase del comienzo de las *Confesiones*: "Nos hiciste, Señor, para Ti y nuestro corazón está inquieto hasta que descansa en Ti" recoge los dos aspectos señalados: el anhelo de alcanzar a Dios y el modo comunitario de consecución. El primero salta a la vista, el segundo está sugerido en el *nos* y en el *nuestro*."

monastic ideal, a “declaration of war on all self-centeredness.”⁸⁰ The *anima una*, based on sculpting a new self around the Gospel values of love and self-giving, became the primary goal for the Order of Saint Augustine.

B. Theme of Harmony in the Order’s Documents

While the term harmony appears in the Order’s documents, the theme of harmony manifests itself in many ways. Yet, the members who follow the path of Augustinian spirituality may not recognize the presence of the theme of harmony as an integral component of their spirituality. Here we examine the elements of “longing for spiritual beauty,” the bonds of common life in Le Proust, and the fourfold communion of Jordan of Saxony.

_____ 1. “*Longing for spiritual beauty:*” *the ultimate aim of the Rule*

When asked what the purpose of the *Rule* of Augustine is, people are quick to say “community life” and quote the opening lines of the *Rule*: “Before all else, *live together in harmony, being of one mind and one heart* on the way to God.” But recent scholarship points to this statement as a “secondary” objective, a comment that may sadden some because here we find the English “harmony” for the term *unanimes*. Verheijen and others have said that the real focus or the “keystone” (*la clef de voûte*) to understanding the *Rule* lies in its final chapter with the expression “longing for spiritual beauty.”⁸¹ This statement is a real discovery. Augustine, always concerned with the essentials of Christian living,

⁸⁰ZUMKELLER, *Augustine’s Rule*, p. 94.

⁸¹ VERHEIJEN, *Nouvelle approche*, pp. 201-242, especially pp. 202, 240-242. The same article is in *Augustiniana* 22 (1972): pp. 469-510. J. GARCIA speaks about the phrase “lovers of spiritual beauty” as the key to penetrating the meaning of the *Rule* in “La beauté spirituelle dans la Règle de saint Augustin.” *Connaissance des Pères de l’Église* 55 (1994): pp. 16-20, especially p. 16 regarding “la clef.”

concludes his *Rule* and final message in the context of prayer:

May the Lord grant that, filled with *longing for spiritual beauty* (*Sir.* 44:6), you will lovingly observe all that has been written here. Live in such a way that you spread abroad *the life-giving aroma of Christ* (1 *Cor.* 2:15). *Do not be weighed down like slaves straining under the law, but live as free men under grace* (*Rom.* 6:14-22).⁸²

“Longing,” hunger or thirst for the more represent deep characteristics of the self. There is a feeling of passion, incompleteness and a movement to “reach out.”

“Longing for spiritual beauty,” as an expression of the theme of harmony, is a major characteristic in the *Rule* and serves as a complementary part to: “one heart and one mind toward God.” To be “on the way to God” (*tendus vers Dieu*) means to be “lovers of spiritual beauty,” or “harmony.” “Beauty,” for Augustine, refers to order and harmony.⁸³ Transcendental harmony facilitates bodily harmony, cosmic order, balance created by a virtuous life, wisdom, and the unity of the Church called to more unity.⁸⁴ Although the expression “spiritual beauty” is present in the *Rule*, unfortunately, it has not been received in the hearts and minds of its membership in the same way as “community” and “ministry.”

Furthermore, when a community strives in a contemplative manner to be “one mind and one heart toward God,” there is a certain beauty that appears that becomes attractive and contagious to others; the community emits a fragrance or “living aroma of Christ”

⁸²*Rule* 8, 48: “Donet Dominus, ut observetis haec omnia cum dilectione, tamquam spiritalis pulchritudinis amatores et bono Christi odore de bona conversatione flagrantes, non sicut servi sub lege, sed sicut liberi sub gratia constituti.”

⁸³VERHEIJEN, *Nouvelle approche*, p. 241: “Je crois que la solution du problème se trouve dans la notion de la beauté chez Augustin. Elle était à ses yeux en relation étroite avec l’ordre et l’harmonie. ‘Les choses belles plaisent par leurs proportions, dans lesquelles . . . on recherche l’harmonie,’ dit Augustin dans son *De musica*.” “Haec . . . pulchra numero placent, in quo iam ostendimus aequalitatem appeti” (*De mus.* 6, 13.38; *PL* 32, 1184).

⁸⁴VERHEIJEN, *Nouvelle approche*, p. 241. Instead of “spiritual beauty,” Augustine could have used expressions like “lovers of supreme Good,” “divine Truth,” or “absolute Being” (p. 240).

(*bonus odor Christi*) whereby others come to know God as Love.⁸⁵ In other words, communitarian life is the means, moved by desire, pleasure and sweetness, to contemplate divine Beauty, a sense of the sublime reflected in the harmonious relations of “hearts and minds.” An evangelizing echo from John’s Gospel takes place because others are “charmed” by a unity that moves their hearts.⁸⁶ The community, then, is at the same time the “means and expression” of contemplation.⁸⁷ As we see, the *Rule* is more contemplative in nature than it seems at first glance. The point here is that without a doubt the Order’s documents focus on the first statement, or “preface,” “one mind and one heart toward God” as the dominant characteristic to the neglect of the second part, the “postface,” the call to be “filled with longing for spiritual beauty,” which is a real discovery in itself.

Does the notion “spiritual beauty” appear in the Order’s documents? Only in the Ordinary General Chapter of 1995 document does the expression from the *Rule* “lovers of spiritual beauty”⁸⁸ appear and then only once. But this document, which defines community as a “theological space,” says:

⁸⁵ *Cor.* 2:15; *Rule* 8, 1. A. ZUMKELLER, “Ecclesiological Aspects of Monastic Life according to Saint Augustine,” in *Second Annual Course on Augustinian Spirituality, Rome, July 1-17, 1976*. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1976, pp. 70. Zumkeller also says: “In this sense, in Augustine’s opinion, we religious ought to spread in the Church the ‘fragrance of Christ’ by the good reputation which is the result of our conduct (*Rule* VIII, 1; *ep.* 48,4). He emphasizes, on the other hand, that by scandal which religious cause among the Christian people, ‘the fragrance of Christ’ will be expelled, which precisely these members of the Body of Christ should diffuse” (*de opere mona.* 28, 36).”

⁸⁶ *Jn.* 13:35 JB: “It is by your love for one another that everyone will recognize you as my disciples.” This same idea of *Jn.* 13:35 is found in Thomas of Villanova’s sermon for the *Twelfth Sunday after Pentecost*, *WSTV*, part 5, p. 220.

⁸⁷ GARCIA, “La beauté spirituelle,” p. 16.

⁸⁸ The translation from Robert Russell says: “in a spirit of charity as lovers of spiritual beauty, giving forth the good odor of Christ in the holiness of your lives” (VIII, 1). Canning’s translation of the same text: “longing for spiritual beauty” (8, 1).

In our history and our spirituality we find that God takes first place . . . Christ, *the most beautiful among the children of God*, is more important than any human work . . . interiority, the realm of the heart, takes precedence over appearances, and over all that fragments or divides. In our history and our spirituality we discover the value of community as the theological space where people can truly fulfill their destiny: the divine persons in the communion of the Trinity, and human persons in those communities that are rooted in the Trinity (3).

From this faithfulness to our history and our spirituality is reborn the hope of discovering the enthusiasm, (“*as lovers of spiritual beauty*”) and that communion of life (“*one heart and one soul*”) which build up the Church and can attract the poor of our times, filled with joy because they realize that they are members of God’s family (4).

These two citations point to a direction that does not stand out in the rest of the Order’s documents and the theme of harmony. Desire, joy and enthusiasm from contemplating God, the source of Beauty, describe the self as a “lover of spiritual beauty.” Zumkeller says that the “spiritual beauty” referred to is divine wisdom and the contemplation of this divine beauty and “we, too, should make time for quiet meditation and contemplation of the spiritual beauty.”⁸⁹ Here another dimension of the self emerges: the value of solitude and silence-with-others as a preparation for contemplating beauty in a world filled with artificial stimuli.

_____ 2. *Bonds of common life: the other as “temple” in Ange Le Proust*

Earlier we spoke of community as a “theological space,” that is, a context for interpreting the Gospel. The Order’s *Constitutions*, half of which concerns the nature of spirituality and the manner of living that spirituality with the Gospel message,⁹⁰ points to

⁸⁹ZUMKELLER, *Augustine’s Rule*, pp. 122-123. In Augustine’s *Soliloquies* I, 10, 17: “The more my hope of seeing that beauty grows, the more my love and longing concentrates on it” (“Et hoc mihi bonum in dies crescit: nam quanto augetur spes videndae illius qua vehementer aestuo pulchritudinis” (*PL* 32, 879)).

⁹⁰For the nature of spirituality, see *Const.* 1-52; For manner of living, see *Const.* 53-239.

our second expression of the theme of harmony: common life. What is common life and what are some of its characteristics?

Common life, rooted in the Jerusalem community of “being one mind and one heart,” is the communal principle of Augustinian spirituality⁹¹ articulated in Augustine’s *Rule* and retrieved in *Constitutions* 8:

The foundation of Augustinian life is that common life (*vita communis*) by which friars who are rooted and united in the charity of Christ serve one another, strive to develop the natural talents of the human person by the grace of God, and work with all their energy for the benefit of the community (*Communitate*) . . . In this life, the friars possess nothing as their own but live for the common good (*bono communi*).

As an element of harmony, common life consists of a quality of relating in charity to one another, collaborating with grace in our own personal development, and working not for ourselves but for the community of individuals who strive to be united toward God. In this context the self works and lives for the other, but its identity is not obliterated in the community setting. The self is not “fused” into the group, for that would be a “confusion,”⁹² but through grace one develops oneself in freedom to become what one is meant to become.

The interaction of the self with others becomes clearer in the context of reconciliation, a characteristic of common life.⁹³ Augustine is quoted in *Constitution* 501: “we are human and might have had the same fault; let mercy go before reprimand.” An awareness of someone in difficulty requires a sensitivity of “great kindness, charity and

⁹¹*IGC 1998*, 21.

⁹²J. VANIER, *From Brokenness to Community*. New York and Mahway, N.J.: Paulist Press, 1992, p. 17.

⁹³Chapter 21 of the *Const.* (500-521), entitled “The Safeguarding of the Life of the Community,” deals with the process for fraternal correction.

patience,”⁹⁴ as a wound in need of healing is treated by a physician.⁹⁵

Le Proust picks up this characteristic with additional force. In his commentary on *Rule 1, 8*, and *2 Cor. 6:16*, he elaborates on the role of the self and esteeming the other as the “space” of God’s dwelling: “honor God in one another because *each of you has become his temple.*” This is difficult to do because we are prone to the shortcomings as regards esteem of our neighbor and fail to see the “plank” in our own eye.

The eye does not see itself. Something similar obtains in the spiritual order. Our extremely carnal eyes do not reflect back to us our own defects, but how clear-sighted they are as regards those of our neighbor!⁹⁶

This self-deception can be overcome through charity and humility. That is to say, we can break down the barrier before our eyes by “seeing” God in the other human being. Le Proust continues:

Saint Augustine builds our union on a more solid motive: he asks us to look on our neighbor in the light of the honor God pays him of dwelling in him. He asks us to consider how much our neighbor is loved by God, since he makes him “his temple,” a living temple capable of receiving, of feeling the honor paid him because of God, who also attaches himself to us through the same bond of union so as to be in us the center of our loves. . . it is the bond which Saint Augustine intended to use to produce the union of the Order.⁹⁷

⁹⁴*Const.* 502; 1 *Thes* 5:14.

⁹⁵*Const.* 507.

⁹⁶ ROTELLE (ed.), *Treatise*, pp. 98-99. A. LE PROUST, *Traité de la Règle de Saint Augustin*. [hors commerce] Paris: Jean Munier, 1980, p. 118: “L’œil ne se voit pas lui-même. Il en est de même dans l’ordre spirituel, nos yeux trop charnels ne réfléchissent pas sur nous nos propre défauts mais combien ils sont clairvoyants sur ceux du prochain!” Hereafter, *Traité*.

⁹⁷ ROTELLE (ed.), *Treatise*, p. 99. LE PROUST, *Traité*, pp. 118-119: “Saint Augustin fonde notre union sur un plus solide motif: il nous ordonne de regarder notre prochain à partir de l’honneur que Dieu lui fait d’habiter en lui, en considérant combien il en est aimé puisque Dieu en fait ‘son temple’ mais un temple vivant, capable de recevoir, de sentir l’honneur qu’on lui porte à cause de Dieu que s’attache aussi à nous, par le même lien de union, pour être en nous, le centre de nos amours . . . c’est le lien dont saint Augustin prétend se servir pour faire l’union de l’ordre.”

When we recognize God in the other a certain “bond” is created. Through this “bond” and connections created with our neighbor, especially with those whom we do not esteem, the Order is constructed. This is a remarkable insight and Le Proust fills nearly every page of his *Traité* with images of bonds, links and connections between the self, God, and others. One truly has the feeling that the spirit of Augustinian spirituality is built on this harmony of “rhythms of relationships.” Lope Cilleruelo claims that not since Jordan of Saxony has there been as full and serious a study on the interpretation of the spirit of the Order of Saint Augustine as that by Père Le Proust.⁹⁸ It is regrettable that this seventeenth-century Augustinian philosopher and theologian -- “a spiritual author who would merit attracting attention”⁹⁹ -- from the community of Bourges is not well-known.

Harmony of common life, of “being one mind and heart,” and seeing God in the other in moments of discord tell us much about the art of “carrying each other’s burdens,” which is the fulfillment of the law of Christ, and the sense of common responsibility for each other.¹⁰⁰ What this says about the self is the need to recognize one’s capacity for error and wrongdoing. Through our wounds, we can then perceive with “patience” the wounds

⁹⁸L. CILLERUELO, “Introducción del P. Angel Le Proust a la Regla de S. Agustín.” *Revista Agustiniana de la Espiritualidad* 6 (1965): p. 23: “Desde los días de Jordán de Sajonia no se ha hecho un ensayo tan amplio y tan serio de interpretación del espíritu de la Orden de S. Agustín.” [All translations from Spanish are mine.] The text referred to is JORDAN OF SAXONY, *The Life of the Brethren*.

⁹⁹S. KOSTKA, “Le Proust (Ange),” in *DS* 9, col. 685: “un auteur spirituel qui mériterait d’attirer l’attention.” For a biography see G. BERNOVILLE, *Les religieuses de Saint-Thomas de Villeneuve, 1661-1953*. Vol. 44. Paris: Grasset, 1953. A study into the life and thought of Le Proust would make an interesting thesis.

¹⁰⁰*Gal.6:2*. Augustine highlights the spirit of harmony when he says “Put greater effort into creating concord among you than in correcting one another” (*Ep.* 210, 2). See VAN BAVEL, *The Rule of Saint Augustine*, pp. 54-55: “Differences between people ought never in themselves to become an insuperable barrier to the development of a healthy society. If we have learnt to share in each other’s talents and have mastered the art of bearing one another’s burdens, then it is possible in normal circumstances to set up a community in which many differences exist between the members.”

in the other. We have a common responsibility because we are all human. We are also God's *temples*. This is the glue and bond of our common life and reconciliation with each other. The essence of Augustinian spirituality occurs in this "synapses" or space of interaction between people, an expression of the theme of harmony.

_____ 3. *Beyond "community:" the Fourfold Communion in Jordan of Saxony*

So far we have seen "community" and "common life" as elements of the theme of harmony. We find in the Order's tradition other expressions of this theme that are more precise and forgotten. One such possible expression is that of "communion."

Prior to Le Proust and closer to the Order's roots as a foundation, we find the fourteenth-century Augustinian historian and spiritual writer Jordan of Quedlinburg, also called Jordan of Saxony, who composed the ascetical treatise, *The Life of the Brethren (Liber Vitasfratrum)*.¹⁰¹ This treatise, which contains a wealth of material from many sources, both secular and Christian, records the first history of the Order, from its origins through the first hundred years. *The Life of the Brethren* is described as moral-ascetical in nature with its frequent use of scripture, often paraphrased.¹⁰² Jordan is a "master of the spiritual life, both as to theological foundation and practical experience,"¹⁰³ and his work links the present discussion to the theme of harmony--more specifically the element of *communion*. First, let us mention a word about Jordan's background.

¹⁰¹W. HÜMPFNER, "Introduction to the Latin edition" in JORDAN OF SAXONY, *The Life of the Brethren*. J. Rotelle, (ed.) and G. Deighan (trans.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1993, p. 48. This text is a translation of JORDANI DE SAXONIA, *Liber Vitasfratrum*, edited by R. ARBESMANN and W. HÜMPFNER. New York: Cosmopolitan Science & Art Service Co., Inc., 1943.

¹⁰² HÜMPFNER, "Introduction," pp. 46-47.

¹⁰³ HÜMPFNER, "Introduction," p. 42.

Jordan's monumental work *The Life of the Brethren* was written during a period of great disharmony - the time of the Black Death (1348-1351). This work on the "communion of common life" was composed in a climate where people fled the cities and monasteries were left empty of monks and friars. For this reason, when Jordan was the superior of his province (1346-1351), where 244 members of the province died in the plague within six years and many of the friars were "hurrying off to Rome," he wrote a series of spiritual exercises for the membership to follow during these crucial and difficult times.¹⁰⁴ An element of the theme of harmony manifests itself in terms of *communion*, especially in the most dire of times when disease ravaged the continent. In this work, then, Jordan treats the aspect of *communion* through an analysis of discord, both internally to the self as well as externally in society.

Jordan still leaves his mark, in ink at any rate, in modern times. In the *Constitutions*, the expression "being one mind and heart" appears under the title "Sharing of Life."¹⁰⁵ The opening paragraph of this section quotes an important text from Jordan's *The Life of the Brethren*:

"Augustine, holy Father and Founder of our revered Order," says Jordan of Saxony, "intending to renew the apostolic life, based himself entirely on these aforesaid words. As a result . . . if we carefully examine Saint Augustine's ideal . . . we find that he based his entire religious foundation on community (*communitate*), or better on communion (*communione*), that is, a sharing 'of life together in the same place . . . , of spiritual oneness . . . , of temporal possession . . . , of proportional distribution," and, therefore, "all the statutes of the Order, both in the *Rule* and in

¹⁰⁴VIZCAINO, *San Agustín/Orden de San Agustín*, p. 182: Around the year 1350, in three years more than 5000 Augustinians died from the Black Death. W. HÜMPFNER, "Introduction to the Latin edition" in *LB*, p. 40. For an accounting of the Plague and Jordan's failure to carry out the spiritual exercises for himself when he gave them to the communities, see pp. 227-228.

¹⁰⁵*Const.* 26-29.

the *Constitutions*, are based on these elements.”¹⁰⁶

“Community, or better on communion.” This citation is important for a couple of reasons. It points to a shift in understanding the character of the Order’s spirit since the citation is kept in the present-day *Constitutions*. Does it indicate a desire to move from community as a group of people occupying the same physical space to a deeper identity? This quotation opens an opportunity into a rich tradition and understanding of Augustine’s ideals for common life.¹⁰⁷ Community is transformed into a four-dimensional communion which can shed light on our earlier discussion on *Ratio* 29-30.¹⁰⁸

Upon closer examination and based on Augustine’s notion of *Acts* 4:32, 25 – being “one mind and one heart toward God,” *The Life of the Brethren* comprises a division into four parts which Jordan calls “The Fourfold Communion” (*communio quadriformis*): living in the same place (*localis cohabitationis*), spiritual oneness (*spiritualis unionis*), possession of goods (*temporalis possessionis*) and proportional distribution (*proportionalis distributionis*).¹⁰⁹ Each communion represents a certain expression of harmony in relationship with various entities.

The “**first communion**” implies the sharing of life in the same place in a *cenobium*,

¹⁰⁶“Porro diligenter inspiciendo intentionem beati Augustini tam in Regula quam in illis sermonibus, quos fecit de communi vita clericorum, quam etiam in aliis dictis suis commonitoriis, invenimus, quod ipse totam Religionem suam super communitate vel melius communione fundavit. Haec autem sacrae Religionis communio quadriformis est” (*LB*, (I,1) 63-64; *LV*, 7).

¹⁰⁷C. BAZARRA, “Comunidad - comunión?” *Iter* 26 (2001): pp. 159-172.

¹⁰⁸We may recall on page 89 that *Ratio* 30 tells us that members were not taught how to live in community. The notion of “communion” can help open this topic for further discussion.

¹⁰⁹“Prima est communio localis cohabitationis . . . Secunda est communio spiritualis unionis . . . Tertia est communio temporalis possessionis . . . Quarta est communio proportionalis distributionis . . . Et quia super hac quadruplici communione beatus Augustinus fundavit Regulam suam . . .” (*LB* (I, 1) 63-64; *LV* 7-8).

or monastery.¹¹⁰ A “communion of many living together as one” indicates the “quality of life lived in it,”¹¹¹ such as, a description of cenobite hermits, the silence of the anchorites, the manner in which one can leave the monastery and remained attached, the type of habit, title and seal of the Order. The communion described here is also for the faithful.¹¹²

The “**second communion**” is “communion of common life” (*communio coenobitica*) described as “spiritual oneness” and defined as “one heart and one soul.”¹¹³ The cenobites are called “to imitate the condition of the world to come where all things will be in common, for God will be all in all. There we will have complete peace and freedom from trouble.”¹¹⁴ Some characteristics of this communion are the virtue of obedience, mutual love, humility, correction, personal and communal prayer, manual work, chastity and avoiding idleness. Incorporated in this second communion is a chapter on the reality of disharmony (*discordia*) among the brothers.¹¹⁵ In “Disharmony—A Great Danger among the Brothers” (*De Discordia, Quam pernicioso est inter Fratres*), Jordan sums up

¹¹⁰*LB* and *LV* (I, 1-21).

¹¹¹“Coenobium vero etiam professionis ipsius qualitatem disciplinamque designat” (*LB* (I, 2) 67; *LV* 12).

¹¹²“‘Communio,’ inquit, ‘est caritas, qua omnia putantur communia.’ Quae revera communio, etsi suo modo esse debeat inter omnes fideles, specialiter tamen requiritur, ut sit inter Religiosos unius professionis” (*LB* (I, 2) 65; *LV* 9).

¹¹³“Ex quo apparet, quod communio coenobitica, de qua nos principaliter agimus, non tam consistit in corporali cohabitatione quam in spirituali unione, quae est secunda communio supra commemorata in principio, quae notatur in eo, quod dicitur in auctoritate ibi praelibata: *erat cor unum et anima una*” (*LB* (II, 1) 117; *LV* 75).

¹¹⁴“Quae vita tanto felicitior est, quanto statum saeculi futuri imitatur, ubi omnia communia, quia Deus est omnia in omnibus. Et quia ibi summa est pax et securitas, civitas, in qua typus huius vita praecessit, Jerusalem, id est ‘visio pacis, dicta est’” (*LB* (II, 1) 117; *LV* 75).

¹¹⁵*LB* (II, 6) 140-144; *LV* 106-111.

the chapter in the first line: “Just as in a community of religious there is nothing more beneficial than love, which makes the hearts of the brothers to be one by a union of wills, so there is nothing more destructive than disharmony, which separates their hearts by a diversity of wills” (II,6). Self-centeredness and “spiritual pride” (II,9) destroy the harmony of communion and pull away from God as the point of reference. Avarice, pride and egoism within the self are the roots to discord and conflict in a communion.

The tone of Part III of the *Life of the Brethren* on the “**third communion**” -- temporal possession -- is a plea to recover Augustine’s ideal of living in community after the model of the apostles and disciples living together in Jerusalem.¹¹⁶ Living in community, in the harmony of communion, is established in the laws of nature, according to Jordan (III,1). (We will look at communion as a law of creation in the next chapter.) Augustine revived the “apostolic communion” by means of a *Rule*, and this means the brothers are not to own estates, properties or receive salaries, but have everything in common.

The “**fourth communion**” deals with proportional distribution where all things are received according to need and not equally, as described in *Acts* 4:35. This concept is often misunderstood. Some of the brothers are surprised when they discover that common life is not necessarily “equal,” and they say with derision:

“No private goods – this vice begone! Let all things common be,”
We say, yet what is common is not given equally.

Jordan says “when these verses are properly understood they are in fact more in line with

¹¹⁶*LB* (III, 3) 308-309; *LV* 330-332.

the intention of the *Rule* than contrary to it.”¹¹⁷

Each communion evokes some relational dimension of the self. Relationship with a physical space (first communion), with others (second communion), with possessions (third communion), and proportional distribution (fourth communion) are in one way or another expressions of the theme of harmony and built on the notion of the *anima una* in the *Rule*.

In general, the Order’s spiritual tradition has received the components of harmony – “spiritual beauty” and Jordan’s “communion” – through its texts like the present-day *Constitutions*. The psychological and spiritual notions around the “bonds of common life” in Le Proust still need to be discovered. However, is something else missing?

III. Crisis of minds and hearts: the *anima una* on a “window shelf”

Does the *Rule* still function as a “mirror?”¹¹⁸ Jordan cites a famous saying from John Cassian:

The prophets wrote the books; our fathers came along later and put them into practice; likewise their successors commended them to memory. The present generation however came along and wrote them down on paper, depositing them on

¹¹⁷“Et quoniam hoc non vident in aliquo monasterio observari, calumniantur facta eorum, asserentes professores huius Regulae non recte eam servare, hos versiculos quasi subsannative contra eos garrientes: “Nil proprium: procul hoc vitium; communia quaeque; Sic loquimur, sed non utimur communibus aequae.” Sed si sane intelligantur hi versus, magis sunt secundum intentionem Regulae quam contra eam” (*LB* (IV, 1) 359-360; *LV* 392-393). ZUMKELLER, *Augustine’s Rule*, p. 72: “Peace and harmony in community life require, however, that the privileges which the Rule allows to some be correctly understood and approved by the others. Augustine warns us against envy. It should not be ‘a source of annoyance or appear unjust’ if something extra or better is given to a few. Nor should we ask for ourselves what we see others receiving out of consideration for their needs. Above all, we must avoid facile or unloving judgments on those with greater needs. We are all inclined to judge others by our standards.”

¹¹⁸Cf. *Rule* 8, 2: “This little book is to be read to you once a week. As in a mirror, you will be able to see in it whether there is anything you are neglecting or forgetting (*Jas.1:23-25*).”

window shelves and in boxes, there to lie forgotten.¹¹⁹

Has the notion of *communion*, more than *community*, been received in the corporate consciousness of the Order? Some do not think so.

A. Lacking “awareness and interiorizing” the core message

The last two Priors General of the Order quoted this text from Jordan concerning community and communion to set a direction for the Order at large.¹²⁰ In his inaugural address to the 1998 Intermediate General Chapter, Miguel Orcasitas makes a courageous statement when he says that the core message of Augustinian spirituality is *not* reaching its membership. He says the Order has explained this spirituality in a clear fashion, for “it is enough to read the *Constitutions* and the documents of the Order.” He believes that the problem is not due to the lack of documentation, “as much as from a *lack of awareness and interiorizing*” on the part of the membership.¹²¹ Here we reach something deep in the self.

The former Prior General said:

The choices made by the Order during the thirty-year Post-Conciliar period, regarding the fundamental characteristics of our spirituality have centered mostly upon *common life*, from which there rises the search for God, particularly by way of an interior life and a disposition toward service to the Church.¹²²

¹¹⁹“ ‘Prophetae conscripserunt libros; patres autem nostri venerunt post eos et operati sunt eos; et iterum successores eorum commendaverunt eos memoriae. Venit autem generatio, quae nunc est, et scripsit eos in cartis atque membranis et posuit eos in fenestris vel cistis otiosos.’ Haec ibi.” (*LB* (II, 14) 186-187; *LV* 173). This same quotation is found in contemporary sources, such as E. BIANCHI, *Words for the Inner Life*, Ottawa: Novalis, 2002, p. 26 and A.-M. BESNARD, “Lignes de force des tendances spirituelles contemporaines.” *Concilium* 9 (1965), p. 40.

¹²⁰M. ORCASITAS, *La comunidad agustiniana entre el ideal y la realidad. Carta a todos los hermanos de la Orden como preparación del Capítulo General Intermedio de 1992*. Roma 28 de agosto de 1991: Acta OSA 40 (1992), p. 9. For the current Prior General Robert Prevost, see *OGC2001*, p. 50.

¹²¹Emphasis is mine.

¹²²*JGC 1998*, p. 45.

What is the cause for the “lack of awareness and interiorizing?” This is a serious question, for the confusion still exists in many sectors of the Order and it “influences the understanding of our service to the Church.” Three factors may influence this void of understanding.

One cause might be a combination of social and cultural forces like exaggerated individualism, an absolute insistence on one’s well-being, attitudes toward work preference, prestige, security, and excessive determination of an individual path. These attitudes subsist in a society that values extreme consumption and personal identity defined in terms of material acquisition.¹²³ Consequently, the other person is not needed.

Another factor may be the cultural and physical environment in which silence and solitude are not valued, yet are required for interiorization.¹²⁴ Nevertheless, each member has the burden to personally discover that common ground and cultivate the interior disposition that unites them by “living in freedom under grace.”¹²⁵ A rediscovery of “holy leisure” in the midst of a fast-paced world will aid communities to appropriate the spirit of the Order. Silence and solitude are conditions for harmony.

Third, the important documents of the Order emphasize “community,” but do not

¹²³See R. ROLHEISER, *The Shattered Lantern: Rediscovering a Felt Presence of God*. New York: Crossroad, 2001. W. G. JEANROND, *Theological Hermeneutics: Development and significance*. New York: Crossroad, 1991, p. 166: states that it is the task of theologians, in times of confusion, to “clarify issues, develop a method for criteria development, for critical and constructive examination of our common Christian heritage.”

¹²⁴H. NOUWEN, *Out of Solitude*. Notre Dame, Ind.: Ave Maria Press, 1974, p. 21: “A life without a lonely place, that is, a life without a quiet center, easily becomes destructive. When we cling to the results of our actions as our only way of self-identification, then we become possessive and defensive and tend to look at our fellow human beings more as **enemies** (emphasis mine) to be kept at a distance than as friends with whom we share the gift of life.”

¹²⁵*Rule VIII*, 48: “sed sicut liberi sub gratia constituti.”

highlight the notion of communion. The *Ratio*, a formation manual responsible for articulating the elements of the Augustinian spirit for today, makes no reference to Jordan's statement on "communion." When we compare "Sharing of Life" in the *Constitutions* 26-29 to "Sharing Life in Community" in the *Ratio* 16-44, the term "communion" does appear once: "No community can grow or accomplish its mission of witness unless its members are communicating and are in communion with one another" (28). The term "community life" and the spirit of communion – mutual trust, relationships, love and openness—are present throughout the *Ratio*, but the word "communion" is not explicit in the sense Jordan had meant it. This notion of communion ought to be recovered and presented in a new way.

B. Living the core message in new ways in a new situation

Once the *core* message of Augustinian spirituality has been received by its members, that message can be lived more authentically. This does not mean being chained to every word of the founders without taking into account the historical context and the challenges of today. An interpretation of the original ideas and new expressions is accomplished in freedom and in attentiveness to the spirit of God speaking through contemporary events. F. Vandenbroucke says

It is the task of their successors to do today what the founders would do if they were here and not repeat the initial formula like slaves or robots. Such a repetition is disastrous; it is a negation of evolution. The Church can never be out of touch with the concrete, existential situation of [human beings] to which it offers itself and in which it lives.¹²⁶

Augustinians today must grasp the essence of its spirit. That core message has to be

¹²⁶F. VANDENBROUCKE, "Spirituality and Spiritualities." *Concilium* 1/9 (1965): p. 28. See also L. CUNNINGHAM, "What is a School of Spirituality?" *Spirituality* 6/32 (2000): p. 292: "What one notices in the history of Christian spirituality is that a new way tends to make use of, and give refinement to, older ways. In other words, 'new ways' are not detached from the living tradition."

interiorized and reinterpreted in a dialectic or a kind of “paradosis”¹²⁷ with the issues and concerns facing people on a daily basis. Therefore, when we question if the theme of harmony has been received by the Order’s tradition, we can answer affirmatively: in bits and pieces of documentation. Nevertheless, we keep in mind the words of the Prior General who points to a corporate identity crisis and questions whether the central message of the Order’s spirituality has been received in the “hearts and minds” of its members. This is a signal of red alert.

In review, our specific questions were: how did Augustine define the term harmony and what were some aspects generated from this term? The bishop of Hippo looks to the term harmony as a “rhythm of relationships.” Turning to the *Rule* we find the elements of “oneness,” “community of love,” and “interiorly united in God.” Since the *Rule* bridges Augustine with the Order of Saint Augustine in time and thought, both the term and theme of harmony have been received in the Order’s tradition in different degrees. The term harmony makes a significant appearance in the formation manual, the *Ratio*. Some aspects, like “longing for spiritual beauty” and “communion” have nearly fallen into obscurity. Le Proust had something to say about the theme of harmony when he wrote about reconciling relationships -- by recognizing God in one’s neighbor whom we may not esteem.

Moreover, the elements of harmony received into the spiritual tradition give us a glimpse into understanding the self, God, and others as an “Augustinian path.” We can summarize these understandings, with their biblical values, by keeping in mind that

¹²⁷JEANROND, *Theological Hermeneutics*, p. 166: “Christian faith must be appropriated and not just repeated, by every new generation . . . handing on the gospel is a process called “paradosis” in the New Testament (cf. 1 *Pt.* 1:18) and it is never a smooth process but one always filled with tension.”

communities are usually composed of the “rich, nobles and the poor.”

- 1) The self has the capacity to turn inward and examine critically one’s conscious and unconscious attitudes and behavior in light of the Gospel. The *Rule* serves as a tool, or a “mirror” (*Jas.* 1:23-25), for this reflection. If there is coherency, let the self be grateful; if not, change and move on with God’s grace and be “one mind and one heart” (*Acts* 4:32) with others.
- 2) In a community of love, the self is open to deep sharing of faith, experiences, ideas, desires, failures and successes. The self is transparent with that which is most precious, and sometimes, most vulnerable. The self risks, with the possibility of deep trust and interpersonal communication with others. Risk takes on another dimension through interiority: to trust the self (and God) on the inward journey. Pride and avarice are “solvents” – a term from Le Proust – in the community. Bonds are destroyed. The criterion for healthy communities is: “Love is not self-seeking” (*1 Cor.* 13:5).
- 3) The self “unfolds,” says Jordan of Saxony, in four “communions”: with place, purpose, material and spiritual possessions, and unequal needs of the other. Through communion, the self has an exterior dimension of relatedness.
- 4) Community promotes a self-in-relation because of a self’s interior dimension: centeredness in God. The community seeks God *together* and carries the yoke of the Gospel *together*. The weight of individual responsibility is lessened.
- 5) The person, with the community, *longs for spiritual beauty* (*Sir.* 44:6). The self is characterized by deep passion, enthusiasm and joy of the restless heart. The

attraction of the Beautiful stirs the inner self and attracts others toward the same end of becoming the *aroma of Christ* (1 Cor. 2:15). Through pleasure and enjoyment, others will come to know God as love.

- 6) *Longing for spiritual beauty* speaks of a contemplative dimension of the self. This dimension is nurtured through silence, solitude and meditation. The self shares a silence-with-others and the “vast cloisters” of the unconscious open up to our awareness.
- 7) As a self-in-relation with others, the community becomes a “theological space” where new bonds of the self can be created with others and with God. The self comes to know itself, and through reflection on biblical values, it recognizes the hidden unknowns that are part of who one is. The discovery of self-awareness is a path of freedom and coordination with God’s Spirit.
- 8) In moments of disharmony and crisis, the self attempts to see God in the other, one’s neighbor, because *each of you have become his temple* (2 Cor.6:16). Awareness that God loves the other immensely challenges our pride and exaggerated sense of self-importance. Our neighbor, whom we may not esteem, is a “theological space” of God’s love. The self realizes its own tendency toward self-deception and need to *remove the plank* from one’s own eye (Mt. 7:3-5; Lk.6:41-46). Self-deception is overcome by charity and humility and the realization that we are all human.
- 9) Recognizing God in one’s neighbor helps us to form bonds of union and relationship. Discord is remedied through reconciliation, of seeing God in the other,

and the art of *carrying each other's burdens* (Gal. 6:2). A common responsibility exists for the other.

Jordan of Saxony claims that Augustine retrieved the spirit of the Christian church in Jerusalem as part of the design of creation, that is, a communion of *one mind and one heart*, by composing his *Rule* for his monastic communities. What does Augustine say about this design, and how does it shed light on our discussion of the theme of harmony?

CHAPTER 3: CREATION: THE DESIGN OF HARMONY AND IMPACT OF LOVE ON PERSONAL AND COMMUNAL LIFE

Christian faith challenges us to face the question: Who is God? In his letter, St. John helps us to look in a particular direction: “God is love” (1Jn. 4:8). Love is meant to be shared, and creation is an expression of the God who is love. The universe, with all the matter and energy it contains, was loved into existence. Through the cosmic forces of explosion and collapse, convergence and expansion, formation and re-formation, a natural design of being emerged and the hidden sweeps of evolution continue to unfold.

The person of faith, standing in wondrous awe and “unity of feelings”¹ at the beauty and gift of creation, discovers in the deepest self a “fire” that ignites the questions of human existence. Human beings, together, mirror the order of the universe when they in freedom choose, move beyond self, from diminishment and nothingness toward a shared love-relationship with the Creator, the source of one’s becoming and the fulness of being.

Therefore, creation is chosen as a theological category since it presents the relationship between the human person and the Creator and “rightly ordered love” (*ordo amoris*) as foundational to understanding the theme of harmony and integral to the goal and the “art of living” the Christian life, an expression privileged by Augustine.² This

¹ SPITZER, “Classical and Christian Ideas of World Harmony,” pp. 411-412: “What is missing in the main European languages is a term that would express the unity of feelings experienced by man face to face with his environment (a landscape, Nature, one’s fellow-man), and would comprehend and weld together the objective (factual) and the subjective (psychological) into one harmonious unity.” In German, the word is “stimmung” (cf. p. 409).

²For *Civ Dei* 19,1 and 3, see page 50, note 116.

approach does not deal with the different elements of the cosmos, in the way science would study this subject, but as a whole which includes the confession of God as Creator.

Moreover, the study of disharmony provides, from a different perspective, another insight into the notion of harmony. For example, disharmony manifests the effects of disordered love, a wrongly self-centered existence, rather than one de-centered from the self and re-centered in God. Augustine's preoccupation with discord in people's lives and in the Church, and the Order's diverse experiences with war, schisms, and infidelity to the spirit of the *Rule* in its communities, all have an "echo" beyond the structures of religious life in the world today.³ For our study the human-divine relationship as a primary dimension (or "primary speech")⁴ of the theme of harmony serves as a criterion for recognizing discord.

This chapter explores the primary relationship between the human person and God as a foundational dimension or design in the theme of harmony in some of Augustine's writings on creation. In the second part of this chapter, this relationship is examined further in light of Augustinian history and writings since the Order's juridical foundation in 1244. Augustinians like Giles of Rome and Thomas of Villanova,⁵ for example, help us see if this

³A. FITZGERALD, "El Estudio de Agustín Hoy." J. A. Cabrera (trans.) *Revista Agustiniiana* 42/129 (2001), p. 1185: Augustine speaks of things that are familiar to us – our sense of justice, our awareness of evil, our fear of death, and our desire for truth and salvation. (Agustín habla de cosas que son familiares para nosotros: nuestro sentido de justicia, nuestra conciencia del mal, nuestro temor a la muerte y nuestro deseo de verdad y de salvación.) J. GAVIGAN, *The Augustinians from the French Revolution to Modern Times*. History of the Order of St. Augustine, vol. IV. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Historical Institute, 1989, p. 13, hopes that those who read this text: "will better understand the conditions and spirit of the order today, when they become acquainted with its triumphs and its trials of the last 185 years."

⁴An expression used by A. and B. ULANOV, *Primary Speech. A Psychology of Prayer*. Louisville and London: Westminster John Knox Press, 1982.

⁵A. TURRADO, "Thomas de Villeneuve," *DS* 15, col. 876: Pedro Saínz Rodríguez calls Thomas of Villanova, Augustinian friar and archbishop of Valencia, and "Padre Granada" the "two greatest preachers of Spain's Golden Age" ("los dos más grandes predicadores de la España del siglo de oro").

foundational dimension was appropriated as a value by the Order's tradition. We ask what new insights come to the foreground in the three-fold understanding of the relation of the self to self, God, and others.

The classical and pastoral texts privileged are those that refer to *harmonia*, and other expressions like *concordia*. By classical texts we mean Augustine's *Confessiones*, *De civitate Dei*, and *De Trinitate*. The pastoral writings consist of the *Sermones*, *Epistulae*, and scripture commentaries.⁶ The pastoral texts are important for knowing how Augustine as pastor responded to the needs of his congregation.⁷ His preaching resonates in spirit the same ideas articulated in the bishop's classical works like the *Confessiones*.⁸ The letters

Thomas knew how to blend scholastic thought with his spiritual writings: "Thomás sait harmoniser la spéculation scholastique avec l'affectivité mystique . . . ce qui le distingue profondément des autres théologiens et mystiques de l'époque" (col. 878). IDEM, *Espiritualidad Agustiniiana y Vida de Perfección: El Ideal Monástico Agustiniiano en Santo Tomás de Villanueva*. Madrid: Cosa Ediciones, 1966, p. 5: Thomas' works are called "sermones," and not specific treatises in theology (*sus obras son "sermones" y no tratados específicos de teología*).

⁶For a study on the sermons, see M. PELLEGRINO, "Introduction" in *Sermons*, WSA III/1, J. Rotelle (ed.). Brooklyn, New York: New City Press, 1990, pp. 13-137. The introduction is translated by Matthew J. O'Connell from the original Italian, "Introduzione Generale" in *Opere di Sant' Agostino – Discorsi XXIX*, Rome, Italy: Città Nuova Editrice, 1979.

⁷Cf. T. C. MADRID, "El ministerio pastoral según San Agustín." *Revista Agustiniiana* 40/122 (1999): pp. 653-713.

⁸PELLEGRINO, "Introduction," p. 114. "Almost every subject which Augustine deals with in his works comes up in his preaching as well. Even the most difficult and abstract theological questions, such as his trinitarian theology, are discussed in his sermons . . . Augustine's preaching is clearly theological and speculative. In his sermons he gives a preliminary exposition of his theological positions and their spiritual expression" (p. 56). A. FITZGERALD, "El estudio de Agustín hoy." J. A. Cabrera, trans. from English. *Revista Agustiniiana* 42/129 (2001): p. 1187: One needs to read the sermons of Augustine to understand his major works. For a bibliography on the sermons of Augustine see H. RONDET, "La théologie de saint Augustin predicateur." *Bulletin de littérature ecclésiastique* 72 (1971): pp. 71-105; and Pellegrino's "Introduction," p. 57, note 10. Another resource, considered as one of the best, is A. OLIVAR, *La Predicación cristiana antigua*. Barcelona: Editorial Herder, 1991. In terms of the newly discovered sermons a concordance of names is given in WSA III/11, pp. 21-22. Sermons Dolbeau 2-7 and 21-27 reflect an explosive pastoral situation in the African Church and the Mainz collection is closer to the reality of the fourth and fifth-centuries (p. 15). One must also be aware that cuts have been made in the sermons by medieval clerics (p. 16).

offer an abundance of material of “utmost importance” of the bishop’s life, personality and character, doctrinal themes and the feelings of the heart.⁹ Furthermore, Allan Fitzgerald claims that the pastoral works like the sermons and letters ought to be studied with the classical texts, and used as a type of “prism,” for a “more balanced understanding” of Augustine the theologian. For example, *Sermo 52* offers a general vision of trinitarian theology already found in the large work *De Trinitate*. Fitzgerald also says the pastoral works have been “abandoned” by contemporary research due to the paucity of good translations in English.¹⁰ Here the pastoral and classical texts are worked together.

I. Cosmic harmony as a coherent living design in Augustine

The theme of harmony is viewed from three perspectives: 1) the beauty of creation is an expression of a built-in, coherent design of relationships, 2) the turn of the self toward God as the Creator is a condition for harmony, and 3) living in unity, peace and concord are expressions of harmony. The order and structure found within creation provide an

⁹J. M. FLOOD, “St. Augustine in his Letters.” *The Furrow* 3/5 (1952): pp. 196-202. Augustine’s correspondence has received slight attention even from biographers. The letters show us Augustine “without distortion.” The advantage of letter-writing was a means of “obtaining publicity, of supplying news, of discharging the functions of exhortation and encouragement, of maintaining a bond between churches and individuals and, not seldom, doing duty as an open pamphlet or a treatise” (p. 196). The letters are more topical than the sermons (Pellegrino, “Introduction,” p. 115). For a general review of the art of writing and influence of Augustine’s writings in the Middle Ages, see J. LECLERCQ, *The Love of Learning and the Desire for God: A Study of Monastic Culture*. C. Misrahi (trans.) from *L’Amour des lettres et le désir de Dieu: Initiation aux auteurs monastiques du moyen âge*. Paris: Les Éditions du Cerf, 1957. New York: Fordham University Press, 1961 (reprint 2001): pp. 97-98: His most frequently copied works were not his works of controversy, but his pastoral treatises, sermons, letters, and biblical commentaries. For a study on letters as a literary genre in antiquity, see CONYBEARE, *Paulinus Noster* and DOYLE, *The Bishop as Disciplinarian*. G. KENNEDY, *Greek rhetoric under Christian emperors*. Princeton, N. J. : Princeton University Press, 1983.

¹⁰FITZGERALD, “El Estudio de Agustín Hoy,” p. 1183. Also, “it is not sufficient to read the *Confessions* and the *City of God*, but Augustine the preacher, as well, in order to maintain a balance.” (*No es suficiente leer las Confesiones y la Ciudad de Dios, sino al Agustín predicador, al que es necesario mantener en el centro*), p. 1190.

understanding of the self in its relationship to God and with others.¹¹

A. Beauty of Creation: an expression of harmony

We recall that *harmonia* is used and defined by Augustine in *De civitate Dei* 22, 24 with the metaphors of the human body and the different aspects of the beauty of creation as composites of mutual and interlocking relationships. The diversity in creation, from the multitude of stars in the heavens, the variety of species of birds and animals to the tiniest of insects, give rise to a sense of wonder and awe.

Consider the manifold and varied beauty of sky and earth and sea; the plenteousness of light and its wondrous quality, in the sun, moon and stars and in the shadows of forests; the colour and fragrance of flowers, the diversity and multitude of the birds with their songs and bright colours; the multiform species of living creatures of all kinds, even the smallest of which we behold with the greatest wonder -- for we are more astonished at the feats of tiny ants and bees than we are at the immense bodies of the whales.

Consider also the grand spectacle of the sea, robing herself in different colours, like garments: sometimes green, and that in so many different shades; sometimes purple; sometimes blue. And what a delightful thing it is to behold the sea when stormy: a sight made all the more delightful to the onlooker by the pleasant thought that he is not a sailor being tossed and heaved about on it!¹²

¹¹Resources used: C. HARRISON, "Measure, Number and Weight in Saint Augustine's Aesthetics." *Augustinianum* 28 (1988): pp. 591-602; R. WILLIAMS, "'Good for nothing?' Augustine on Creation." *Augustinian Studies* 25 (1994): pp. 9-24; E. GILSON, *The Christian philosophy of Saint Augustine*. L.E.M. Lynch (trans.). London: V. Gollancz, 1961, especially Part 3, Chapter 1: "Creation and Time;" T. CLARKE, "St. Augustine and Cosmic Redemption." *Theological Studies* 19 (1958): pp. 133-164; T. VAN BAVEL, "The Creator and the Integrity of Creation in the Fathers of the Church, especially in Saint Augustine." *Augustinian Studies* 21 (1990): pp. 1-33; O. du ROY, *L'intelligence de la foi en la Trinité selon saint Augustin*. Paris: Études Augustiniennes, 1966.

¹²"In caeli et terrae et maris multimoda et uaria pulchritudine, in ipsius lucis tanta copia tamque mirabili specie, in sole ac luna et sideribus, in opacitatibus nemorum, in coloribus et odoribus florum, in diuersitate ac multitudine uolucrum garrularum atque pictarum, in multiformi specie tot tantarumque animantium, quarum illae plus habent admirationis, quae molis minimum (plus enim formicularum et apicularum opera stupemus quam inmensa corpora ballaenarum), in ipsius quoque maris tam grandi spectaculo, cum sese diuersis coloribus uelut uestibus induit et aliquando uiride atque hoc multis modis, aliquando purpureum, aliquando caeruleum est. quam porro delectabiliter spectatur etiam quandocumque turbatur, et fit inde maior suauitas, quia sic demulcet intuentem, ut non iactet et quatiat nauigantem!" (*Civ Dei* 22,24; *CCL* 48, 851). VAN BAVEL, "The Creator and integrity of creation," pp. 10-11: The Fathers

Creation is a great book from which we observe the beauty manifested through diverse relationships of shapes, colors and species. A certain sense of hierarchy of values and order follow in the universe that is poetic in form.

The things of the earth are subordinated to the things in the heavens, and by the harmonious succession of their times they join the fellowship of the universal poem (*carmini universitatis associant*).¹³

Nothing created is to be repudiated, not even the human body. All is good and for our benefit if we know how to read this book and observe the interplay and order of relationships between diversity and unity. The ordered harmony of the parts in creation manifests a wondrous beauty, not just for itself, but as a coherent design for living.

1. Harmony of design: mensura, numerus, pondus

As is his style in determining the behavior of a Christian, Augustine turns to Scripture for insight¹⁴ and reads the book of *Wisdom* 11:21 – “You have disposed all things by measure and number and weight.”¹⁵ The bishop’s version of the text is: “Omnia in mensura, et numero et pondere dispouisti.”¹⁶ In his *De Genesi ad litteram*, completed in 415, he writes

of the Church emphasized the **original harmony** among all creatures: trees, grass, plants, fruits, and animals were without any defect (see *c. Iulianum opus imperfectum* 6,16). Emphasis is mine. Harmony of the seasons: “the beauty of the seasons, which, in its own place, is a harmonious part of this world” (*civ Dei* 12,4; *CCL* 48,358-359).

¹³ “Ita caelestibus terrena subjecta, orbis temporum suorum numerosa successione quasi carmini universitatis associant” (*De musica* 6, 11, 29; *PL* 32, 1179).

¹⁴PELLEGRINO, “Introduction,” p. 25.

¹⁵Cf. *Civ Dei* 11, 30-31; 15, 20; 17, 4; 20, 5; 7.

¹⁶A.-M. LA BONNARDIÈRE, *Biblia Augustiniana. Le Livre de la Sagesse* (Paris: Études Augustiniennes, 1970, pp. 295-296. According to La Bonnadière, he used this text thirty-one times in direct quotation, of which twenty-one were before the year 411.

When we read that God finished all the works of His creation in six days, and when we reflect on the number six and find that it is a perfect number, and when we realize that the works of creation occur according to a pattern, in steps, as it were, that match the aliquot (*sic*) parts of six, we should call to mind what Scripture says elsewhere: [You have] ordered all things in measure, number and weight. And let the soul that is able reflect on this, calling on God for help, the source of its strength and inspiration, and let it consider whether these three – measure, number, and weight – in which, according to Scripture, God ordered all things, existed somewhere before the creation of every creature, or whether they too were created; and if they existed before creation, let us ask where.¹⁷

The triad, the basic design found within created reality, describes distinct but interrelated functions of each component. Measure (*mensura*) defines the terms of “limits and boundaries,” for created things have a fixed set of possibilities in the process of becoming. For instance, an acorn can only develop into an oak tree, and not a chicken or geranium. Number (*numerus*)¹⁸ indicates form, harmony, or proportion. Because of number creation possesses the capability for balance and equilibrium through the constant flux of time. The drive toward harmony and adjustment are characteristics of this function. Weight (*pondus*) deals with the “gravity” innate in each created object to seek its natural level of “rest.” Smoke rises, rocks fall, and fish float. For human beings, weight is what pulls us toward our goals, toward what we are ultimately made for: relationship of the self turned toward God as Creator.

¹⁷“Quapropter cum eum legimus sex diebus omnia perfecisse, et senarium numerum considerantes, invenimus esse perfectum, atque ita creaturarum ordinem currere, ut etiam ipsarum partium, quibus iste numerus perficitur, appareat quasi gradata distinctio; veniat etiam illud in mentem, quod alio loco Scripturarum ei dicitur, *Omnia in mensura, et numero, et pondere disposuisti* (*Sap. xi, 21*); atque ita cogitet anima, quae potest, invocato in auxilium Deo, et impertiente atque inspirante vires, utrum haec tria, mensura, numerus, pondus, in quibus Deum disposuisse omnia scriptum est, erant alicubi antequam crearetur universa creatura, an etiam ipsa creata sunt; et si erant antea, ubi erant”. (*De Gen. ad litt. 4, 3, 7; PL 34, 299; ACW, vol. 41, pp. 107-108*).

¹⁸For a treatment of the numbers 6 and 7 in creation, see *civ Dei* 11, 30-31.

Human nature tends to reach beyond itself. As we will see later, this is an important concept in Augustinian spirituality, described as “vital ontology” in St. Thomas of Villanova and portrayed as “natural longing” in the Order’s *Constitutions*.¹⁹ Just as a stone falls and fire rises the human spirit-in-love seeks its natural level and space inhabited by God who is the cause of our deepest unrest. One seeks to be centered in the divine. “My weight is my love,” (*pondus meum amor meus; eo feror quocumque feror*),²⁰ says Augustine, a phrase repeated over again by writers and saints of the Augustinian tradition. Spurred by desire and delight, the human person falls in love with the Creator who is the center of his/her being. This relationship between creature and Creator is the most primordial and foundational of relationships. Harmony is a self-in-relation,²¹ a mystery of self-giving love, first and foremost, with its original design *in Deum*.

This fundamental bond between the self and God recognizes the right order in creation and the human person does not confuse the “creature” for the Creator as the source of happiness and being. The triad of measure, number, and weight, then, reflects a law of nature built into the design of the universe. More concretely, how does the triad guide human persons to follow a coherent pattern of life?

¹⁹A. TURRADO, “Thomas de Villeneuve” in *DS* 15, col. 874 - 890, esp. 889 on “vital ontology.” *Const.* 32: “. . . by reason of that natural longing that God himself, as a skilled artisan, has placed in our hearts, until the time when we will be able to find fulfillment, peace, and happiness in contemplating him in the light of glory.” See *Const.* 32.

²⁰*Conf.* 13, 9, 10; *CCL* 27, 246-247. This idea is also found in *Ep.* 55, 10; *S.* 65a.

²¹For a discussion on the meaning of the self-in-relation, see J. SMITH, “Confessions of an Existentialist: Reading Augustine after Heidegger.” *New Blackfriars* 82/964 (2001): pp. 273-282, esp. 278f.

2. *Harmony with the self: a life of virtue*

Harmony unfolds in the human being who observes the laws of nature and lives a life of virtue.²² Measure implies how action limits itself, it is not just a continuous stream of uncontrolled energy.²³ Number involves the “form”²⁴ of virtue which directs the person and wisdom for the appropriate response to circumstances that will bring about a certain balance and equilibrium.²⁵ Weight encompasses our choices or rejections of certain courses of action in a way they fit the goals of our love and how we come to know and accept our place in creation.²⁶ The human subject, who attempts to live a moral and spiritual life, finds meaning and coherence when these functions are “in balance” or “in harmony” with each other insofar as one’s love, cooperating with grace, is turned (weight) toward God. In the *Confessiones* Augustine tells us:

²²*De Gen. ad litt.* 4, 4, 9: “The [one] who knows the words “measure, number, and weight” only in their material sense is like a captive in his limited knowledge. Let him, then, rise up above all that he knows in this way. For [one] will find himself more strongly attracted to these things of the spirit the less the attractions of the flesh draw him to things below.” (“Sed nomina mensurae et numeri et ponderis, quisquis non nisi visibiliter novit, serviliter novit. Transcendat itaque omne quod ita novit, aut si nondum potest, nec ipsis nominibus haereat, de quibus cogitare nisi sordide non potest. Tanto enim magis cuique ista in superioribus chara sunt, quanto ipse minus est in inferioribus caro” (CSEL 28)).

This concept of the virtuous soul patterned after creation has some debt to Stoic influences. See Augustine’s *b. vita* 33-34. In terms of conforming to this pattern, see CORSINI, “L’harmonie du monde et l’homme microcosme,” p. 459.

²³Cf. *B. vita* 33-34.

²⁴C. HARRISON, “Augustine and Religious Experience,” *Louvain Studies* 27 (2002): p. 110: “It is also in the language of form that Augustine describes how man experiences his dependence upon grace for his reformation, for his will and ability to do any good act. This is primarily because form – that which gives existence – consists of, and manifests itself, in order, harmony and unity – or to use the biblical terms Augustine adopts from Wisdom 11:21 in this context, in measure, number and weight. These are likewise ontological terms – they constitute and describe being – but they are also philosophical, ethical and aesthetic. They constitute and describe truth, goodness and beauty.”

²⁵Cf. *Gn. Litt.* 4, 4, 8 and *De Trin.* 3, 9, 16ff. Number or form is that by which God is made visible through the Word and in the incarnation (*vera rel.* 11, 21; *Jo. ev.tr.* 1, 13).

²⁶Cf. *Civ Dei* 19, 13; *de mus.* 6, 11, 29-31; *Ep.* 138, 5.

Give me yourself, O my God, give yourself back to me. Lo, I love you, but if my love is too mean, let me love more passionately. I cannot gauge my love, nor know how far it fails, how much more I love I need for my life to set its course straight into your arms, never swerving until hidden in the cover of your face. This alone I know, that without you all to me is misery, woe outside myself and woe within, and all wealth but penury, if it is not my God.²⁷

The searching self seeks the divine self through love. But the path is not clear, and one does not know if its love is straight or crooked. What is known for certain are the effects of disorder within and beyond the self. The faithful person recognizes the depths of human emptiness and calls out to a divine embrace. The human heart finds a harmonious relationship with God when it is at “rest” in the same way that a stone naturally falls and fire rises upward.

In your Gift we find rest, and there we enjoy you. Our true place is where we find rest. We are borne toward it by love, and it is your good Spirit who lifts up our sunken nature from the gates of death. In goodness of will is our peace.²⁸

We can say that the human person is most at “rest” and “peace” when the self has God as the center of its existence. At the same time, this experience of restfulness and peace, which is complete and fulfilled only in the future life, is disturbed when the self turns away from God and anchors itself in excessive self-assuredness. Love becomes misplaced and disordered.

²⁷“Da mihi te, Deus meus, redde te mihi: te enim amo; et si parum est, amem validius. Non possum metiri ut sciam quantum desit mihi amoris ad id quod sat est, ut currat vita mea in amplexus tuos, nec avertatur donec abscondatur in abscondito vultus tui. Hoc tantum scio, quia male mihi est praeter te, non solum extra me, sed et in meipso; et omnis mihi copia quae Deus meus non est, egestas est” (*Conf.* 13, 8, 9; *CCL* 27, 246).

²⁸“Quasi locus ibi esset, qui non est locus, de quo solo dictum est quod sit donum tuum. In dono tuo requiescimus; ibi te fruimur. Requies nostra, locus noster. Amor illuc attollit nos, et Spiritus tuus bonus exaltat humilitatem nostram de portis mortis. In bona uoluntate pax nobis est” (*Conf.* 13, 9, 10; *CCL* 27, 246).

They are not at rest as long as they are disordered, but once brought to order they find their rest. Now, my weight is my love, and wherever I am carried, it is this weight that carries me: (*pondus meum amor meus; eo feror quocumque feror*). Your Gift sets us afire and we are borne upward: we catch his flame and up we go. In our hearts we climb those upward paths, singing the songs of ascent. By your fire, your beneficent fire, are we enflamed, because we are making our way up to *the peace of Jerusalem*. For *I rejoiced when I was told*, “We are going to the Lord’s house.” There shall a good will find us a place, that we may have no other desire but to abide there forever.²⁹

If love is a kind of weight, it finds its rest toward God, the *peace of Jerusalem*. A love that is not toward God, which we will describe more in detail later, is a disordered love and a weight of disturbance. These three principles of the triadic structure – measure, number, and weight – which exist to enhance our understanding,³⁰ find proper expression in the human being who is a moral subject and knows the “art of living” (*artem vivendi*).³¹ This triad is significant because it describes how God structured the universe and its diversity into a

²⁹“Minus ordinata, inquieta sunt; ordinantur et quiescunt. Pondus meum amor meus; eo feror quocumque feror. Dono tuo accendimur, et sursum ferimur. Inardescimus et imus. Ascendimus ascensiones in corde, et cantamus canticum graduum. Igne tuo, igne tuo bono inardescimus et imus; quoniam sursum imus ad pacem Jerusalem, quoniam *jucundatus sum in his qui dixerunt mihi: In donum Domini ibimus*. Ibi nos collocavit voluntas bona, ut nihil velimus aliud quam permanere illic in aeternum.” (*Conf.* 13, 9, 10; *CCL* 27, 246-247). This idea is also found in *ep.* 55, 10; *s.* 65a.

³⁰This trinitarian structure is expressed in creation, -- “its existence was in harmony with the goodness for the sake of which it was made” -- but in an obscure and “veiled” manner, of which the purpose is to enhance our understanding. *Civ Dei* 11, 24. HARRISON, “Measure, Number and Weight,” p. 592: The arrangement of these three principles – measure, number, and weight – can be analogous to God and together constitute the unity of existence. Du Roy refers to this triad as “that which will crystallise the trinitarian structure of reality in Augustine’s thought” (p. 593).

³¹See Latin on page 50, note 116. *Civ Dei* 19, 3: “virtue also is to be desired: virtue, which, as the art of living, is the most excellent of all the goods of the soul, and which is implanted by teaching. Therefore, when this virtue – the art of conducting one’s life. . . Life is not the same thing as virtue, since not every kind of life is virtue, but only a wisely conducted life.” In *civ Dei* 19, 1: “art of living which we call ‘virtue’.” See in this connection of the art of living as a learned discipline: Plato’s *Meno*, 86ff; Aristotle’s *Nic. Eth.* 2, 1. Plato emphasizes in *Gorgias* that human conduct involves the interrelationship of virtues (507 AC) and “the best way of life is to practise justice and every virtue in life and death” (527 E). A virtuous life is more desirable than a life that is haphazard and arbitrary. Human action must follow a pattern if it is to be truly virtuous and to attain the good which is the goal of every form of human activity. See J. OWENS, *A History of Ancient Western Philosophy*. New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1959, p. 205.

coherent design or network of interactions, and human beings have the capacity to live the virtuous life by “asking, seeking, knocking” and turning toward God Creator, as “the source of strength and inspiration,” the true reference point for living in harmony with all creation.

B. Harmony with the Creator

How does one turn toward God? Does creation assist the human person in that turn? Augustine quotes Plato who gives the reason for the creation of the world: that “good works might be made by a good God.”³² Everything that is in the world is good. The material reality is not the ultimate arena of two opposing forces of light and darkness, but a reality created from nothing with order, form and process. The things in time imitate God by their form, order, and harmonious procession.³³ Augustine’s doctrine of *creatio ex nihilo* is an existential language that mirrors his own experience and struggle to turn towards God. Let us first review the background of his doctrine.

1. Doctrine of creation and personal responsibility for actions

The Christian communities of the early Church promoted the belief that God created the universe out of nothing (*ex nihilo*).³⁴ Augustine’s doctrine of creation is a response to

³²“Hanc etiam Plato causam condendi mundi iustissimam dicit, ut a bono Deo bona opera fierent” (*Civ Dei* 11, 21; *CCL* 48, 340). Cf. *c. Faust.* 32, 20. Augustine opposes Porphyry’s opinion that “escape from any kind of body is an essential condition for happiness” (*Civ Dei* 13, 19; *CCL* 48, 402).

³³M. VERSFELD, *A Guide to the ‘City of God.’* London and New York: Sheed and Ward, 1958, p. 17.

³⁴Anthanasius’ *De Incarnatione* is the best example of the doctrine of creation from nothing as the basis for theological thinking. As a response to the Platonists he says “God would be merely a craftsman and not the creator of existence, if he fashions underlying matter but is not himself the cause of the matter” (2). Anthanasius is referenced in Carol HARRISON’s article, “Augustine and Religious Experience.” *Louvain Studies* 27 (2002): pp. 99-118, especially p. 102, note 1. In this paper she puts forth the argument that the doctrine *creatio ex nihilo* of the young Augustine, ten years following his conversion (386-397), and the concepts of the Fall, original sin, and grace of the Augustine of the *Confessiones*, is one continuous thought, with the difference of choice of concepts and terms, rather than the “dramatic shift” or “revolution” that scholars indicate with a letter written to the priest Simplicianus in

Manichaeism and Platonic viewpoints on how matter came into existence.³⁵ We read in Books 5 and 7 of the *Confessiones* how the bishop struggled and found in the “Religion of Light”³⁶ an answer to the problem of evil. The Manichaean doctrine on creation espoused the dualistic existence of two spiritual forces or realities at work in the universe, one darkness and the other light. The world consisted of fragments of divine light scattered throughout the cosmos. The divine particles were “trapped” in matter. In consequence, the individual person was “free” from taking responsibility for decisions and actions, for the cause of evil was due to some operation in a divine realm.

Later in *Confessiones* 7, 5, 7, Augustine asks: why should God ignore certain forces and parts of the universe? The notion of “pre-existent formless matter” did not make sense. His doctrine on creation and the evolutionary principles of *rationes seminales*³⁷ put forth the argument that God made the universe as an ordered harmony and beauty out of nothing because creation is good in itself.³⁸ Creation is constantly evolving. One may think of the

396 (pp. 100-101). For a survey of Christian attitudes in both the East and West toward the cosmos, see D. STRAMARA, “Surveying the Heavens: Early Christian Writers on Astronomy.” *St. Vladimir’s Theological Quarterly* 46/2 (2002): pp. 147-162, and for Augustine’s views see pp. 158-161. G. MAY, *Schöpfung aus dem Nichts: die Entstehung der Lehre von der “creatio ex nihilo.”* Berlin: W. de Gruyter, 1978.

³⁵COYLE, “Saint Augustine’s Manichaean Legacy,” pp. 1-22. GILSON, *The Christian philosophy*, p. 189; See VAN BAVEL, “The Creator and the Integrity of Creation, pp. 1-10.

³⁶COYLE, “Saint Augustine’s Manichaean Legacy,” p. 2.

³⁷These are best described as latent energies or forces of development waiting to be activated and called into existence (being or form). *Rationes causales/seminales* do not simply cause things to grow, but they give the specifications on how to grow within defined limits and a fixed range of possibilities established by God’s will (cf. *Gen litt* 6, 15, 26).

³⁸“Look, this is God, and these are the things God has created. God is good, and though he is far more wonderful than they in every respect, still he who is good has created them good; see too how he surrounds and pervades them. Where, then, is evil; where does it come from and how did it creep in?” (“Ecce Deus, et ecce quae creavit Deus, et bonus est Deus, atque his validissime longissimeque praestantior; sed tamen bonus bona creavit, et ecce quomodo ambit atque implet ea. Ubi ergo malum, et

gospel on the gradual growth of the wheat and the mustard which develops into a tree for birds to enjoy.³⁹

The goal of these processes is a convergence unto harmony, beauty and order when “creation is referred to its Creator.”⁴⁰ And if creation is from nothing, and not part of divine nature, then everything it does and suffers cannot be attributed to the divine nature either.⁴¹ The individual person can no longer “escape” from taking responsibility for his or her decisions and actions.⁴² One can choose to live with and form a bond with the Creator. Or the self can sever that bond and seek some other experience.

2. Disharmony with the Creator: experience of brokenness

Augustine is attracted to the antithesis found in the creation doctrine: mutability and divine immutability, time and eternity, nature of dependency and contingency in contrast to divine self-sufficiency; nothingness and the totality of Being.⁴³ These paradoxes found

unde, et qua huc irrepsit?” (*Conf.* 7, 5, 7; *CCL* 27, 96.)

³⁹*Mk.* 4:26-34. This dynamic quality of evolution is also found in Gregory of Nyssa’s *In Hexaemeron* PG 44, 64 A-B. See CORSINI, “L’harmonie du monde et l’homme microcosme,” p. 462. With “la joie, l’enthousiasme, l’optimisme”, Gregory introduces the theme of the wheat and mustard seed to describe his vision of the cosmos: “c’est une introduction bien adaptée à un traité qui va décrire l’harmonie du monde non comme le résultat d’un mélange, mais comme l’effet d’un dynamisme puissant et créateur.”

⁴⁰“Illi clariore, hic obscuriore cognitione, velut artis atque operum: quae tamen opera cum ad ipsius Creatoris laudem venerationemque referuntur, tanquam mane lucescit in mentibus contemplantium” (*Civ Dei* 11, 29; *CCL* 48, 349).

⁴¹Cf. *De Genesi contra Manicheos* 2, 29, 43.

⁴²The force of habit that fought against me had grown fiercer by my own doing, because I had come willingly to this point where I now wished not to be. And who has any right to object, when just punishment catches up with a sinner? (“Sed tamen consuetudo adversus me pugnacior ex me facta erat, quoniam volens, quo nollem, perveneram. Et quis jure contradiceret, cum peccantem justa poena sequeretur?” (*Conf.* 8, 5, 11; *CCL* 27, 120).

⁴³Cf. *De beata vita* 8; *Soliliquia* 1. 1, 4.

in the *creatio ex nihilo* doctrine parallel his own experience of the world, of himself, and of the divine. Augustine uses an existential language to describe the human experience of his own sin, brokenness and frailty, inability for completeness, unrest in seeing the truth and the movement towards nothingness and non-being.

The movement toward Being (toward God) comes with the realization that he can not attain the truth and wholeness by his own efforts, as the philosophers have claimed, but through a dependence on the humble Christ (*ad humilitatem Christi*),⁴⁴ the inner Teacher, the Word made flesh and divine grace, as he describes in *Confessiones* 8 in reference to Paul in *Romans* 7, and applied to the doctrine on creation-from-nothing.⁴⁵

I thus came to understand from my own experience what I had read, how the flesh lusts against the spirit and the spirit strives against the flesh. I was aligned with both, but more with the desires I approved in myself than with those I frowned upon, for in these latter I was not really the agent, since for the most part I was enduring them against my will rather than acting freely.⁴⁶

To find my delight in your law as far as my inmost self was concerned was of no profit to me when a different law in my bodily members was warring against the law of my mind, imprisoning me under the law of sin which held sway in my lower self. For the law of sin is that brute force of habit whereby the mind is dragged along and held fast against its will, and deservedly so because it slipped into the habit willingly. In my wretched state, who was there to free me from this death-doomed body, save your grace through Jesus Christ our Lord?⁴⁷

⁴⁴Cf. *Conf.* 8, 2, 3.

⁴⁵HARRISON, "Augustine and Religious Experience," p. 103.

⁴⁶"Sic intelligebam, me ipso experimento, id quod legeram, quomodo caro concupisceret adversus spiritum, et spiritus adversus carnem (*Galat.* v, 17). Ego quidem in utroque; sed magis ego in eo quod in me approbavam, quam in eo quod in me improbavam. Ibi enim magis jam non ego; qui ex magna parte id patibar invitus, quam faciebam volens. Sed tamen consuetudo adversus me pugnacior ex me facta erat, quoniam volens, quo nollem, perveneram" (*Conf.* 8, 5, 11; *CCL* 27, 120).

⁴⁷"Frustra condelectabar legi tuae secundum interiorem hominem, cum lex alia in membris meis repugnaret legi mentis meae, et captivum me duceret in legem peccati, quae in membris meis erat. Lex enim peccati est violentia consuetudinis, qua trahitur et tenetur etiam invitus animus, eo merito quo in eam volens illabitur. Miserum ergo me quis liberaret de corpore mortis hujus, nisi gratia tua per Jesum

When I was making up my mind to serve the Lord my God at last, as I had long since purposed, I was the one who wanted to follow that course, and I was the one who wanted not to. I was the only one involved. I neither wanted it wholeheartedly nor turned from it wholeheartedly. I was at odds with myself, and fragmenting myself. This disintegration was occurring without my consent, but what it indicated was not the presence in me of a mind belonging to some alien nature but the punishment undergone by my own.⁴⁸

We see in these three citations that in Augustine's experience, "in order to exist" and to move away from nothingness, his life must be a continuous turning and unfolding towards the origin of his existence, the endless willing of God, through the search for the truth, obedience of the good and delight in the beautiful.⁴⁹ When one makes the self the "center" of existence, rather than God, the primary relationship of harmony is broken, and one drifts toward the "un-creation" of alienation and fragmentation. We examine further this wrong order of love and how it can be transformed.

3. De-centering the Self to re-centering in the Spirit

Imbalance in the created order takes place through the repercussions of disordered self-love. The human person confuses the "creature" for the Creator. One's interior sense is intensely focused on excessive self-interest, greed and ambition. Due to pride and

Christum Dominum nostrum? (Rom. vii, 22-25)" (*Conf.* 8, 5, 12; *CCL* 27, 120-121).

⁴⁸"Ego cum deliberabam ut jam servirem Domino Deo meo, sicut diu disposueram, ego eram qui volebam, ego qui nolebam; ego, ego eram. Nec plene volebam, nec plene nolebam ideo mecum contendebar, et dissipabar a meipso. Et ipsa dissipatio me invito quidem fiebat, nec tamen ostendebat naturam mentis alienae, sed poenam meae" (*Conf.* 8, 10, 22; *CCL* 27, 127).

⁴⁹HARRISON, "Augustine and Religious Experience," p. 104. Harrison highlights the fact that the term "experience" is an elusive word, especially when we deal with a person like Augustine who lived 1600 years ago, with a certain kind of culture, tradition and faith community. She says that an experience that can be defined as "religious" in Augustine's time could be that which involves a search for or attainment of the truth, goodness, or beauty – since these were the defining aspects of the divine. The term can also refer to the philosopher, the art of living a virtuous life, encountering ordered beauty and harmony, or being an adherent to a religious sect (p. 99).

selfishness people dominate others with abusive power and denial of rights. Human beings no longer work “intelligently” in conversation with nature, but exploit it with “concupiscence and blind lust” for their own profit.⁵⁰ The effects of human exploitation can be seen in the treatment and view toward animals. Extinction of a species is one of the signs of exploitation and serious imbalance in creation’s design. “Sometimes we do not know the place of animals in this world; sometimes, however, we know their place very well, but set more value on our own prosperity.”⁵¹ Creation has a price tag.

The violation of harmony in the self, due to greed, envy and self-regard, generates violent repercussions in the cosmic order.⁵² Selfishness violates and moves against the natural tendency and attraction of rightly ordered love (*pondus*) established in the laws of existence between creature and Creator. A self de-centered from God engenders further chaos and disorder.⁵³ The solution requires a new turn: a self re-centered in God. We gain insight into this re-centering when we turn to Augustine’s last days in Hippo.

During the late summer of 430, Augustine fell ill and knew he was dying. His biographer Possidius tells us that four penitential psalms hung on the wall and on these he

⁵⁰“The use of natural things is justified only if the human being remains faithful to the divine law and administers the other beings under him without concupiscence and blind lust, that is, according to God’s law.” (“*Usus autem rerum est legitimus, ut anima in lege Dei maneat, et uni Deo plenissima dilectione subjecta sit, et caetera sibi subjecta sine cupiditate aut libidine ministret, id est secundum praeceptum Dei*” (*De Gen imp.* 1, 3; *PL* 34, 221)).

⁵¹“Et in illo ardore, qui eis displicet, nonnulla animalia per convenientiam salubriter vivere” (*Civ Dei* 12, 4; *CCL* 48, 359).

⁵²Spitzer makes a similar observation when he says, “Only in a world estranged from God is there a gulf between the animal and human kingdoms.” See SPITZER, “Classical and Christian Ideas,” 2, p. 459.

⁵³VAN BAVEL, “The Creator and the Integrity of Creation,” p. 33.

reflected, “crying constantly and deeply.”⁵⁴ Age and death help us to refocus our priorities and what we deem to be essential. Peter Brown writes that Augustine wanted to die alone and he cites *Sermo* 348, 2:

Whoever does not want to fear, let him probe his inmost self. Do not just touch the surface; go down into yourself; reach into the farthest corner of your heart. Examine it then with care: see there, whether a poisoned vein of the wasting love of the world still does not pulse, whether you are not moved by some physical desires, and are not caught in some law of the senses; whether you are never elated with empty boasting, never depressed by some vain anxiety: then only can you dare to announce that you are pure and crystal clear, when you have sifted everything in the deepest recesses of your inner being.⁵⁵

A first step toward re-centering in God is to examine one’s inward self and hidden sources of “wasting love.” It is important to probe oneself with honesty and in view of self-knowledge as how one really is. What are the motives, impulses, delights and desires that move one to make decisions and recourse to actions? To turn and enter one’s heart and to examine the repercussions of a disordered love are the pathway to the heart of God.

Transformation involves a conscious turn. It is an awareness of de-centering from the self and re-centering in the Spirit of God. The human person has the “capacity” and an “interior sense” to re-center and encounter the *imago Dei*, or the Trinity, within oneself, as Augustine says, when the image is “reformed and purified” (*reformatione perficiendam*).⁵⁶

⁵⁴Cf. *Vita* 31, 1-3.

⁵⁵ BROWN, *Augustine of Hippo*, p. 436. Brown states that Augustine wanted “to die alone” (p. 436), which contradicts Possidius’ statement in the *Vita* 31, 5: “as we stood by watching and praying, he fell asleep with his fathers.” However, for “about ten days” before his death, Augustine wanted to spend “his entire time in prayer” (31, 3). It seems that the community was present at the moment of his death.

⁵⁶ See *Civ Dei* 11, 26-27; *CCL* 48, 345-347. It is important to note that where Augustine cites *Wis.* 11:21, nowhere does he make the analogy of the triad to God nor assign a term of the triad to the trinitarian persons. “However, those triads that Augustine sees as parallel to *Wisdom* 11:21 are sometimes

“Contemplating His image in ourselves, therefore, let us, like that younger son of the Gospel, come to ourselves, and arise and return to Him Whom we had forsaken by our sin.”⁵⁷ That image of the Trinity within the self must first be “known” before it is “loved:” “we love the love itself with which we love our existence and our knowledge of it.”⁵⁸ When we return, like the prodigal son, to the source of this “knowledge,” we become “light,”⁵⁹ as if “dawn has broken in the minds who contemplate them.”⁶⁰ An affective dimension accompanies this sense of “light.”

That is why it has been arranged in God’s loving plan of salvation that the inner self who is being renewed from day to day should no longer be set under the law, but already under grace (i.e., faith, hope, love) . . . and whatever vexations . . . may inflict from outside on the outer self become for the inner self light with an inner joy.⁶¹

The inner self is moved by a “restlessness” for delight and sense of beauty. Augustine concludes his *Confessiones* on the idea of stimulating desire and delight by “asking, seeking, knocking.”⁶²

used as trinitarian analogies (e.g., *ep.* 11; 14). See AYRES. “Measure, Number, and Weight” in *AA*, pp. 551-552.

⁵⁷“In nobis autem ipsis ejus imaginem contuentes, tanquam minor ille evangelicus filius ad nosmetipsos reversi surgamus” (*Civ Dei* 11, 28; *CCL* 48, 348; *Lk.* 15:11ff).

⁵⁸“De amore autem quo amantur, utrum et ipse amor ametur” (*Civ Dei* 11, 28; *CCL* 48, 347).

⁵⁹“Et eorum aequalitatem adhuc sperantes, utique nondum tenentes, jam lux dicti ab Apostolo sumus: *Fuistis enim, inquit, aliquando tenebrae, nunc autem lux in Domino*” (*Civ Dei* 11, 33; *CCL* 48, 334; *Eph.* 5:8).

⁶⁰“Tanquam mane lucescit in mentibus contemplantium” (*Civ Dei* 11, 29; *CCL* 48, 349).

⁶¹“Propter quod ita divinae pietatis dispensatione actum est, ut interior homo, qui renovatur de die in diem (2 *Cor.* 4:16), non adhuc sub Lege positus, sed jam sub gratia . . . (simplicis fidei, et bonae spei, et sanctae charitatis). . . quidquid molestiarum exteriori homini forinsecus intulisset ille princeps qui missus est foras, interiori gaudio leve fieret” (s. 70, 3; *PL* 38, 444).

⁶²“A te petatur, in te quaeratur, ad te pulsetur: sic, sic accipietur, sic invenietur, sic aprietur (*Mt.* 7:8). Amen” (*Conf.* 13, 38, 53; *CCL* 27, 273).

The pastoral movement that Augustine emphasizes is the process of conversion and invitation to reach one's highest potential as described in *Romans* 12:1-2.⁶³ In Book 13 of the *Confessiones*, he draws attention to this citation four times giving emphasis to the need for transformation of the self by restraining “the monstrous savagery of pride” (*ab immani feritate superbiae*) and the “luxurious inertia of self-indulgence” (*ab inerti voluptate luxuriae*).⁶⁴ We do this when we are persistent in our “asking, seeking, and knocking” which stimulates desire, a thought with which Augustine ends this classic.⁶⁵ Change, reform and transformation are important expressions of the dynamic in confronting egocentrism and the self turning toward God.

To follow the Spirit is to be attentive to desire, a subject we will treat in the next chapter. Thus we are commanded to serve and to worship the Creator because “our spirit feeds on what gives it joy.”⁶⁶

Only they understand who test the voice heard outwardly against the truth within. Truth tells me, “neither earth nor sky nor any bodily thing is your God.” Their own nature avers it. Do you not see, my soul? Nature is an extended mass, smaller in any one part than in the whole. Even you, my soul, are better than that, for you impart energy to the mass of your body and endow it with life, and no corporeal thing can do that for any other corporeal thing. But your God is to you the life of your life

⁶³*Romans* 12:1-2: “I urge you therefore, brothers, by the mercies of God, to offer your bodies as a living sacrifice, holy and pleasing to God, your spiritual worship. Do not conform yourself to this age but be transformed by the renewal of your mind, that you may discern what is the will of God, what is good and pleasing and perfect.”

⁶⁴*Conf.* 13, 21, 30; *CCL* 27, 259; also *Conf.* 13, 14; 21, 31; 22, 32.

⁶⁵*Conf.* 13, 38, 53; *CCL* 27, 273. See note 62 above of this study for Latin.

⁶⁶“Invoco te in animam meam, quam preparas ad capiendum te ex desiderio quod inspiras ei: nunc invocantem te ne deseras . . .” (*Conf.* 13, 1, 1; *CCL* 27, 242).

itself.⁶⁷

God Creator is the life of the human person and to recognize this relationship is what it means to be in harmony with God. The human person falls out of harmony with God when the self centers its love on some other source and promise of fulfillment that is not God. One moves toward a state of alienation and fragmentation, an experience of “nothingness” and disharmony. At the same time, transformation and conversion, the act of de-centering from excessive self-assuredness and re-centering in the heart of the Creator, is possible when one enters and scrutinizes the pulsing “loves” in his or her own heart. Harmony with the Creator, that is, “to love God above all things,” does not end with the divine as the center point of human existence. The second part of the great commandment has a social dimension: “to love one’s neighbor.”

C. Harmony with others: *pax et concordia*

We have seen thus far that all created reality, according to Augustine, has a built-in design of harmony and the human self discovers its fundamental relationship with God. A consequence of harmony with God is an outward expression toward others of which peace (*pax*) can be called a fruit of right relationships. Augustine develops the feature of peace in the famous Book 19 of *De civitate Dei*:

For this alone can be truly called and esteemed the peace of reasonable creatures, consisting as it does in the perfectly ordered and harmonious (*concordissima*)

⁶⁷“Sed illi intelligunt qui ejus vocem acceptam foris intus cum veritate conferunt. Veritas enim dicit mihi: Non est Deus tuus coelum, et terra; neque omne corpus. Hoc dicit eorum natura videnti: Moles est; moles minor est in parte quam in toto. Jam tu melior es; tibi dico, anima; quoniam tu vegetas molem corporis tui, praebens ei vitam, quod nullum corpus praestat corpori. Deus autem tuus etiam tibi vitae vita est” (*Conf.* 10, 6, 10; *CCL* 27, 160).

enjoyment of God and of one another in God.⁶⁸

The peace of the body, therefore, lies in the balanced ordering of its parts; the peace of the irrational soul lies in the rightly ordered disposition of the appetites; the peace of the rational soul lies in the rightly ordered relationship of cognition and action; the peace of body and soul lies in the rightly ordered life and health of a living creature; peace between mortal man and God is an ordered obedience, in faith, under an eternal law; and peace between men is an ordered agreement of mind with mind. The peace of a household is an ordered concord, with respect to command and obedience, of those who dwell together; the peace of a city is an ordered concord, with respect to command and obedience, of its citizens; and the peace of the Heavenly City is a perfectly ordered and perfectly harmonious fellowship in the enjoyment of God, and of one another in God. The peace of all things lies in the tranquillity of order, and order is the disposition of equal and unequal things in such a way as to give to each its proper place.⁶⁹

The notion of peace is important in Augustine's writings where the word appears under various forms at least 2500 times.⁷⁰ This is so because the bishop underlines the fact that what drives human action forward is the desire for happiness of which peace is its basis and foundation. The word "peace" itself has a tone of sweetness and we are happy and grateful to hear of it. Nothing is desired more than peace.⁷¹

Peace is more a "gift of God" rather than a product of human effort. Where human

⁶⁸“Ut rationalis duntaxat creaturae sola pax habenda atque dicenda sit, ordinatissima scilicet et concordissima societas fruendi Deo, et invicem in Deo” (*Civ Dei* 19, 17; *CCL* 48, 685).

⁶⁹“Pax itaque corporis, est ordinata temperatura partium. Pax animae irrationalis, ordinata requies appetitionum. Pax animae rationalis, ordinata cognitionis actionisque consensio. Pax corporis et animae, ordinata vita et salus animantis. Pax hominis mortalis et Dei, ordinata in fide sub aeterna lege obedientia. Pax hominum, ordinata concordia. Pax domus, ordinata imperandi atque obediendi concordia cohabitantium. Pax civitatis, ordinata imperandi atque obediendi concordia civium. Pax coelestis civitatis, ordinatissima et concordissima societas fruendi Deo et invicem in Deo. Pax omnium rerum, tranquillitas ordinis. Ordo est parium dispariumque rerum sua cuique loca tribuens dispositio” (*Civ Dei* 19, 13; *CCL* 48, 678-679).

⁷⁰D. BURT, *Friendship & Society. An Introduction to Augustine's Practical Philosophy*. Grand Rapids, Mi.: Wm B. Eerdmans Publishing, 1999, p. 169.

⁷¹“Tantum est enim pacis bonum, ut etiam in rebus terrenis atque mortalibus nihil gratius soleat audiri, nihil desiderabilius concupisci, nihil postremo possit melius inveniri” (*Civ Dei* 19,11; *CCL* 48, 675).

effort is involved, the desire for the higher goods of eternal and enjoyment of eternal peace in the future life will secure some sort of earthly peace. If not, then misery will be one's lot and the current situation can only grow worse.⁷² To love peace is to overcome the disordered loves from which pride and greed emerge. Where there is a correct order of love, there will be internal and external harmony, as we have seen, and many hearts are made into a unity.

. . . the children of grace, the citizens of the redeemed city, the companions in eternal peace, among whom there is no love of a will that is personal and, so to speak, private, but a love that rejoices in a common and immutable good: a love, that is, that makes one heart out of many because it is the perfectly concordant obedience of charity.⁷³

The concord of charity brings together a diversity into a unity. As a manifestation of harmony, *concordia* is another important notion in Augustine's writings. The bishop uses the term *concordia* 652 times and *discordia* with its cognates 179 times.⁷⁴ The term is used in a variety of ways, such as describing God as *summa concordia*⁷⁵ and the Holy Spirit as

⁷²“Sed si, neglectis melioribus, quae ad supernam pertinent civitatem, ubi erit victoria in aeterna et summa pace segura, bona ista sic concupiscuntur, ut vel sola esse credantur, vel his quae meliora creduntur, amplius diligantur; necesse est miseria consequantur, et quae inerat augeatur” (*Civ Dei* 15, 4; *CCL* 48, 457).

⁷³“Filio gratiae, cives civitatis liberae, socios pacis aeternae, ubi sit non amor propriae ac privatae quodammodo voluntatis, sed communi eodemque immutabili bono gaudens, atque ex multis unum cor faciens, id est perfecte concors obedientia caritatis” (*Civ Dei* 15, 3; *CCL* 48, 456).

⁷⁴M.-F. BERROUARD, “Concordia-discordia” in *AL*, pp. 1107-1111, especially 1107. The root of these two words is *cor* which denotes an “affective sense”: “ille concors dicendus est, que corda iungit” (*Io. eu. tr.* 77, 5).

⁷⁵“Ubi summa concordia, summa evidentia, summa constantia, summa plenitudo, summa vita” (*Solil.* I, 1, 4; *CSEL* 89).

uniting the Father and Son; ⁷⁶ all creation is designed and composed on *concordia*.⁷⁷ God created one single person to indicate the “unity of society and the bond of concord.”⁷⁸ The Fall represented the division and discord within the self and the experience of the first parents: *secum sibi non concordans*.⁷⁹ We have already seen how the peace of families and societies is the fruit of a life of concord. The Church is a privileged space where the Christian community gathers as brothers and sisters who live with one concord and charity (*concordiam caritatemque fidelium*).⁸⁰ The assembly is nourished with the eucharist (*panem concordia*).⁸¹

Like the assembly, a religious community struggles for peace and concord when people from different places and socio-economic levels strive to live together in the spirit of *Psalm 133* – “How good it is, how pleasant, where the people dwell as one!” This is a favorite psalm of Augustine whose community was composed of the “rich, nobles and poor.” A certain beauty is born when differences are not extinguished, nor are they merely

⁷⁶“Quam toto corde, tota anima, tota mente Deum diligere” (*Mor.* 1,25; *CSEL* 90; cf. *De doctr.* *Christ.* 1, 5).

⁷⁷“Quod conditiorem animalis insinuat Deum: quem certe decet credere auctorem omnis convenientiae atque concordiae” (*De mus.* 6, 8, 20; *PL* 32, 1174; cf. *Vera rel.* 21).

⁷⁸“Quarum ex aquis et terris plurium pullulavit exordium, quam homines, quorum genus ex uno est ad commendandam concordiam propagatum” (*Civ Dei* 12, 22; *CCL* 48, 380).

⁷⁹“Cognovit se in miseria, in gemitu, in rixa et contentione; ipse secum sibi non concordans, a se dissonans, a se resiliens: et quid ait, optans pacem, pacem veram, pacem supernam?” (*En ps.* 102, 15; *CCL* 38-40).

⁸⁰“Quid miraris? Tantum valet pax, non qualiscumque, ut solet intelligi, nec talis qualis laudatur in hac vita per concordiam charitatemque fidelium; sed illa pax Dei, quae, sicut dicit Apostolus, *supergreditur omnem intellectum* (*Phil.* 4:7)” (*Ep.* 238, 16; *PL* 33, 1044; cf. *C. Faust.* 33, 6; *Cat. Rud.* 42).

⁸¹“Litigabant utique ad inuicem, quoniam panem concordiae non intellegebant, nec sumere uolebant; nam qui manducant talem panem, non litigant ad inuicem; quoniam *unus panis, unum corpus multi sumus*. Et per hunc *facit Deus unius modi habitare in domo*” (*Io. Eu. Tr.* 26, 14; *CCL* 36, 16).

tolerated, but complement and enhance each other. This is accomplished through the risk of open dialogue, trust, and mutual respect. Aspects of the self, such as defensive barriers around the heart, must come down and die before differences are genuinely accepted. The wonderful characteristic of peace in a setting of concord, for example, is that it can be shared freely with others without lessening one's portion.⁸² The proof of concord can be seen in how things are shared.

The act of sharing, both material and spiritual goods, is a condition for living in concord and peace. Creation itself reminds us of this condition and our responsibility to maintain the delicate balance and equilibrium with the created order.

God the Creator made the world so that everything in its richness may be shared. "We ourselves brought nothing into the world⁸³ at the moment of our birth. You have come into the world and you have found there a well-filled table. But the earth is the Lord's and its fullness also . . . God gave the world to the poor as well as to the rich."⁸⁴

Augustine's *Rule* is very much aware of this need to share and hold things in common in the monastic setting. After he states the purpose why people come together to live in harmony, to be one mind and heart toward God, he proceeds to lay out a plan about sharing everything in common.⁸⁵ The sharing of these material gifts is a consequence of and

⁸²Cf. *S.* 357, 1.

⁸³1 *Tim.* 6:7.

⁸⁴"Audi apostolum: Nihil intulimus in hunc mundum. Ad mundum venisti, plenam mensam invenisti. Sed domini est terra et plenitudo eius . . . Mundum praestat deus pauperi, praestat diviti" (*S.* 39, 2-4; *CCL* 41, 489-491). See VAN BAVEL, "The Creator and the integrity of Creation," p. 9.

⁸⁵*Rule* 1, 3: "Among you there can be no question of personal property. Rather, take care that you share everything in common . . . He does not have to give exactly the same to everyone, for you are not all equally strong, but each person should be given what he personally needs. For this is what you read in the *Acts of the Apostles: Everything they owned was held in common, and each one received whatever he had need of (Acts 4:32; 4:35).*"

commitment to harmonious relationships, of concord and of peace with others, regardless of ethnicity or social and economic standing.

If we want to sum up what we have said so far, we may say that the harmony of relationships finds expression in a built-in design or plan found in creation. God created with a sense of design, form and beauty which evokes wonder and meditation on the plenitude of God's goodness and love. The triad of measure, number and weight points us in a direction on how to be in harmony with God, as human beings, by collaborating with grace, for of ourselves we are unable to find the way. What aspects of the self can we glean from this discussion?

Selfhood, for Augustine, is defined in terms of the self's relationship of love with God. Living the life of virtue (*artem vivendi*) and rightly ordered love implies a life in harmony with the self and with God. But human experience attests to the fact that the person tends to drift toward self-centeredness, pride, ambition and greed which give birth to alienation and fragmentation. The person is "poised" between the nothingness of excessive self-love and true fulfillment and plenitude of meaning found in self-giving love directed toward God and neighbor. Being at odds with oneself and suffering from the consequences of the brute force of habit and desiring to be free from the disruptions of inner conflict, the faithful person can only take responsibility for his or her actions and call out to the humble Christ through "asking, seeking and knocking."

The first step along the path of recovering harmony is one of self-examination, of going inward and doing an honest assessment of our deepest loves and their effect on our lives. Are these pulsating loves self-centered or self-giving, centered in the Spirit of love?

Are there repercussions of any sort? These questions assist us in the path of self-awareness.

Selfhood is not only interior, but also has an exterior aspect. Harmony with God is not strictly an individual endeavor, but is social. The fruit of the bond with the divine is shared with other human beings and all of creation. Peace and concord are “gifts of God” when we attempt to live in harmony and unity with others, sharing our material and spiritual goods. Living in unity demands an act of sharing in love in a concrete sense. These are only a few of the many expressions, conditions for harmony and aspects of the self found in some of Augustine’s writings, but already we may ask: To what extent have these notions been carried into the Order’s tradition?

II. Creation and harmony in the Order’s Tradition

It is interesting to recall that a gap of eight hundred years exists between Augustine’s death and the birth of the Order of Saint Augustine and yet the theme of harmony is clearly present in the latter from its beginning. Nevertheless it’s important to ask to what point the Order’s spiritual tradition has received those components of the theme of harmony, namely, the built-in design of harmony in creation, the relationship between the self and God, and of the self with others. These three components help us to shape our answer to the previous question before we conclude by comparing those aspects of the self treated in some of Augustine’s writings with those in the Order’s tradition.

A. Harmony with Creation: pastoral challenge and appropriation of design

The Augustinian spiritual tradition has long espoused the notion of harmony with creation and this from two perspectives. First, nature is the source of reflection for the self and its relationship with God and others. As we see from the *1998 Intermediate General*

Chapter document, Augustinians view the natural world as a pastoral challenge that is to be respected and worked with in a responsible manner. Second, the Order's tradition has implicitly appropriated the design of Augustine's triad (measure, number, weight) under the form of love (weight) as a component of harmony between God and the soul. St. Thomas of Villanova's insights from his preaching are privileged here because of his impact on shaping the Order's spirituality.

1. "*Communion with creation*": *pastoral challenge and context for theology*

Augustine describes creation and its beauty in terms of connecting relationships of diversity and unity. The Augustinians of today as well as those of the past continue to turn to nature as the source of reflection on how the self discovers its relationship with God and with others. Giles of Rome (d. 1316), the Order's first theologian said in a sermon at the Paris house of studies: "God is known in two ways: through the creatures which he has created, and through the scripture which he has inspired."⁸⁶ We can see that Giles has embraced Augustine's perspective on creation as a source for meditation and seeking God. Donald Burt writes: "if humans want to discover traces of the divine, all they need to do is open their eyes and turn to the book of creation. There, on every page, they will find a

⁸⁶ J. ROTELLE (ed.), *Commentary on the Song of Songs and Other Writings: Giles of Rome, O.S.A.* Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1998, p. 265. Giles also describes in his treatise, *The Divine Influence in the Blessed*, the order and harmony in the universe and among angels: "And there is such order and harmony (*armonia*) in the heavenly realm that the illuminations concerning the governance of the universe come to intermediate angels through their superiors, and these illuminations reach to the lower angels through the intermediate. And the higher order not only illumines the lower order with such illuminations, but also a higher angel within one and the same order illumines a lower angel, for it is held that the seraphim cry out one to another, which cry is nothing else than one angel seeking to be taught and illumined by another" (p. 194). Giles of Rome makes reference to the nature of proportion and rhythm as part of the inner structure of the universe in his Prologue, pp. 53-54. AEGIDIUS ROMANUS, *Opera exegetica. Opuscula 1*, Frankfurt: Minerva, 1968, p. 23b in "Tractatus de Divina Influentia in Beatos," ch. 3: Et ibi est tantus ordo, & tanta armonia

nature flooded with the presence of God.”⁸⁷

Nevertheless, though this role of creation still holds true today, a shift has taken place in contemporary awareness of how we as a people live in balance, or in harmony, with creation. The question is one of planetary survival, both for creation and for the human species. Augustinians are sensitive to the pastoral task of raising awareness of our connectedness with creation as we see in their chapter documents.

The *1998 Intermediate General Chapter* document entitled, “Augustinians in the Church for the World of Today,” focuses on the present reality of creation as a “pastoral challenge.” Its section 31 entitled “Communion with creation” clearly resonates with Augustine’s thinking on such important issues as the ongoing dialogue between God and the human being, and nature as the great book that speaks to us of God the Creator, but not everyone is able to understand this book.⁸⁸ The document emphasizes in the same section the importance of turning to nature as a context for even doing theology.

Love of nature and the return to nature have deep dimensions. To look at nature as God’s work is to do theology; to call for respect of it and its enjoyment by all is to practice justice and solidarity.

Creation is not only the “book,” but also the auditorium or a temple from which we reflect with delight and joy, do theology and practice social justice. The natural environment must be respected and protected because it is God’s creation and we are its stewards,⁸⁹ for “to assault nature is to destroy unity,” since the word “universe” is derived from the word

⁸⁷D. BURT, *The River: reflections on the times of our lives*. Collegeville, Mn.: The Liturgical Press, 1998, p. 73. Cf. *Civ Dei* 11, 2; s. 68, 6.

⁸⁸“Et uix paucis intellegibili modo” (*En ps.* 81, 2; *CCL* 39, 1136).

⁸⁹Cf. *1998 Intermediate General Chapter*, no. 30.

“unity”.⁹⁰

Although there is a call for an “Augustinian response” “to respect the environment,”⁹¹ nothing is mentioned in the formation manual, *Ratio*, about Augustine’s perspective on creation. The link between the “mystery of the human being” in dialogue with the created order⁹² is unaccounted-for, especially at a time when there is much concern about the preservation of and harmony with life on the planet. The theme of harmony and the notion of a self-in-relation can help recover this link.

Some important documents of the Order’s tradition have received Augustine’s ideas of relationship with creation and our stance within the environment, while in others, such as the formation manual, they appear totally absent. Can we make a similar claim regarding Augustine’s understanding of the design of the natural order, namely, his notion of the triad (measure, number, weight) from the book of *Wisdom*? Contrary to the claim of some scholars, this insight from *Wisdom* has had a certain existence in the literary life of the Augustinian spiritual tradition.

2. “Love without measure”: “Hymn of harmony” in Thomas of Villanova

Augustine describes the harmony of the inner order of the cosmos and the evolutionary processes in his *rationes seminales*. In terms of the triad found in scripture,

⁹⁰1998 *Intermediate General Chapter*, no. 31. *De Gen.* 1, 21, 32.

⁹¹1998 *Intermediate General Chapter*, no. 30: “A sketch of an Augustinian response to this great challenge requires us to return to the subject of study as a means of grounding the faith, to critical reflection, interdisciplinary approaches, constant search, and esteem for thought. ‘Have a great love of understanding’ (*Ep.* 120, 13). A common meeting ground will be provided by a shared commitment to peace, justice, social involvement, human rights, and new values of tolerance, pluralism, democracy, and respect for the environment.”

⁹²Cf. *Conf.* 4, 4, 9 and s. 241, 1-3.

the bishop uses the text *Wisdom* 11:21 to describe creation as a coherent living system with the design of measure, number and weight.⁹³ According to Lewis Ayres, Augustine's interpretation of this scripture text is not found anywhere else in the tradition of exegesis: there are no earlier parallels of his treatment of this text, and it was not appropriated in any significant manner in the writings of his "Augustinian" successors.⁹⁴ Ayres' statement has to be questioned in light of Thomas of Villanova's contribution. First, a word about this important figure who impacted the social and cultural life of his era, influenced Church reform, and "who deeply influenced the spirituality" of the first part of the history of the Order.⁹⁵

Thomas Garcia was born in the small village of Fuenllana (Spain), a few miles from Villanova, in 1486. Returning to Villanova to live, the Garcia family prospered in that city. Prosperity did not keep the family from reaching out to the poor.⁹⁶ After teaching philosophy in Alcalá, Thomas entered the Augustinian community in Salamanca in 1516 where he applied himself zealously to the study of the *Rule* and *Constitutions* of the Order. He soon became prior, then provincial and archbishop of Valencia, where he died on the feast of the Birth of Mary (September 8) in 1555. Thomas, in his relation to God, is not to

⁹³*Wisdom* 11:21: "You have disposed all things by measure and number and weight." This citation demonstrates that the universe is designed according to the triadic principles of "measure, number, and weight." See discussion on pages 81, 121-124.

⁹⁴AYRES, "Measure, Number, and Weight," p. 551.

⁹⁵D. GUTTIERREZ, *The Augustinians from the Protestant Reformation to the Peace of Westphalia 1518-1648*. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Historical Institute, 1979, vol. II, p. 162. Other important ascetical writers from this period are Dionisio Vásquez and Jerome Seripando. See also A. LLIN CHAFER, "Algunos aspectos de la teología de Santo Tomás de Villanueva." *Religión y Cultura* 49 (2003): pp. 43-92.

⁹⁶S. BACK, *The Pelican. A life of Saint Thomas of Villanova*. M. J. O'Connell (trans.); J. Rotelle (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1987, p. 15.

be accounted as one of the great mystics of Spain, but he can be described as an “active, open-minded, vibrant, down-to-earth saint with a mystical bent.”⁹⁷

Even though he did not leave behind any spiritual diary or autobiography, Thomas’ thoughts are reflected in his compassion toward the poor, his writings on the interior life, and his sermons which contain the essence of his thought. Fortunately, the corpus of his sermons have recently been translated into English;⁹⁸ there is no critical edition of their Latin version.⁹⁹ Thomas’ wisdom is yet to be explored. As one erudite person once said:

We have a saint in the Order who would be very appropriate for our day and age. His emphasis on poverty, his personal example of living a dedicated life, and his concern for the downtrodden would speak to all men and women, especially the young. And yet we have little written in any language on this major saint of ours.¹⁰⁰

In what manner, then, can this Augustinian reformer and bishop shed light on the current discussion about Ayres’ statement? We do know that Thomas of Villanova used this text from *Wisdom* rather extensively in his preaching to highlight the soul’s dependence on God. His Advent sermons reflect the design of creation and our participation in that design. Thomas says in one sermon: “In the natural creation supreme order reigns, and the succession of events and seasons is regulated by the wonderful artistry of God.” This

⁹⁷BACK, *The Pelican*, p. 93.

⁹⁸*The Works of Saint Thomas of Villanova*. The Augustinian Series, vol. 20, parts 1-8. J. Rotelle (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1994 - 2001. Translated from the Manila edition (1881). An introduction by A. Turrado is provided in the first volume (Part 1, pp. 11-46). Hereafter *WSTV*.

⁹⁹The Latin edition was published in six volumes in Manila, The Philippines, from 1881 to 1897. Volumes I to V comprise sermons for the liturgical season, preached in Spanish, and then translated into Latin at a later date. Very few sermons exist in Spanish. Other works (Volume VI) by the bishop are in Spanish and Latin. Thomas’ marian sermons and other works can be found in *Biblioteca de Autores Christianos* (B.A.C.). See J. ROTELLE (ed.), “Foreword” in *WSTV*, Part 1, pp. 9-10.

¹⁰⁰BACK, *The Pelican*, p. 7.

pattern of order governs our actions and desires: “The foundation of this moral goodness consists in their (people’s) freedom to choose either compliance with this law or divergence from it.”¹⁰¹ Personal freedom is a question of loves. A rightly ordered love is patterned after the design of nature where the human being turns toward God in the act of self-giving and supportive love. Or, in freedom, one can choose to focus on a love that is excessively self-serving, confusing the creature with the Creator. Thomas is bringing to our attention that every person possesses the freedom to make a choice.

God’s very nature is described almost in the same fashion that Augustine did: “You have loved me, Lord, above measure and without measure; and in this love for me you who made all things according to number, weight and measure have passed beyond the boundaries of weight and measure.”¹⁰² In the famous sermons on the love of God, also considered as a “hymn of harmony” between God and the soul, Thomas says, referring to the triad, that we ought to

love God without measure and without limit . . . he who made everything in weight, number, and measure had no limit or measure in loving. In this alone God went to excess; he went beyond measure and Jesus’ death on the cross is “grand excessiveness” and “very excessive love, which exceeds the limits and ends of all

¹⁰¹“Cum enim in naturalibus tantus sit ordo in universo, miraque Dei arte rerum successus, & temporum ordinentur, si ut quidam delatrat, *hominum solos respuit actus* merito rector cohiberet, & ut alius inquit, *Super cardines caeeli ambulat, neque nostra considerat*” (*OpTV*, p. 3a; THOMAS OF VILLANOVA, *First Sunday Advent, Sermon 1, 6 and 4*, in *WSTV*, Part 1, pp. 50-51. ALONSO DE OROZCO, *Expositio*, p. 57: “All things were ordained by God according to the right order of obedience.” . . . “The one who is disobedient, therefore, inverts this order and confuses all things.”

On the feast of St. Mary Magdalene, Thomas begins the sermon: “Cum solus creator rerum conditarum perfectam habet notitiam in pondere, & mensura quae sunt, eas undique penetrando, & comprehendendo . . .” (*OpTV*, p. 943a; *WSTV*, Part 6A, p. 243).

¹⁰²“Dilexisti me Domine supra modum, dilexisti me sine modo, & qui omnia in numero, pondere, & mensura fecisti, in diligendo me modum, pondus, atque mensuram excessisti” (*OpTV*, p. 46a; THOMAS OF VILLANOVA, *Second Sunday Advent, Sermon 1, 11* in *WSTV*, Part 1, p. 119.)

love!¹⁰³

Defining God's love as "without measure and limit" speaks of the self as a recipient of a shower of graces and blessing. The individual person is first loved by God, a love that is immense and "excessive." The human response is to love "without measure and without limit." It is obvious and interesting that the archbishop of Valencia takes hold of the idea of the triad and applies it to describe a relationship of love between the human person and the Creator. The mystery of Christ is also understood from this same trilogy. In a Good Friday sermon, Thomas preaches:

It is necessary for us to consider not only what Christ suffered, but also who it is that suffered, and for what he suffered . . . Christ is saying: O children of Adam, see if your sorrow is like my sorrow. O Lord, and you ask this of us who have passed through this miserable way of the world? I know, Lord, that you made all things in **number, weight, and measure**; so too you make and dispose our sufferings, for you do not allow us to suffer more than we can bear. **But your sufferings were without number, without weight, without measure.**¹⁰⁴

Was Thomas, the "Father of the Poor," the only sixteenth-century spiritual writer to appropriate this concept of the triad in his writings and preaching? Is it possible that, because of his influence on spirituality, this concept was picked up by others? Without a doubt he was not an obscure personality in the Church, for his writings and thought became

¹⁰³"Diligamos ergo eum sine modo, & sine mensura, quia sic ab eo dilecti sumus. Qui enim omnia in pondere, numero fecit, & mensura, in diligendo modum non habuit neque mensuram. Excessit in hoc solo Deus, excessit supra modum, excessit supra omnem rationem, & intellectum, & qui in omnibus modum semper ab initio tenuit, in hoc modum tenere non voluit, & supra modum nimius fuit." (*OpTV*, p. 459a; THOMAS OF VILLANOVA, *Seventeenth Sunday after Pentecost*, Sermon 3, 8, in *WSTV*, Part 5, p. 267.

These four sermons are called the "hymn of divine harmony" in the "Introduction" by A. TURRADO in *WSTV*, Part 1, p. 33 and in A. TURRADO, "Thomas de Villeneuve," *DS* 15, col. 888.

Other sermons on the love of God are the *Twelfth Sunday after Pentecost* (*WSTV*, Part 5, pp. 211-221) and the *Feast of St. Mary Magdalene* (*WSTV*, Part 6A, pp. 243-264). Cf. J. M. BUJANDA, "Tratado del amor de Dios de Santo Tomás de Villanueva." *Ciudad de Dios* 183 (1970): p. 40.

¹⁰⁴ THOMAS OF VILLANOVA, Good Friday, *Sermon* 1,7-8, *WSTV*, Part 4, p. 30. Emphasis is mine.

foundational for prominent Augustinian theologians like Luis de Montoya, Luis de León and St. Alonso de Orozco.¹⁰⁵ Further exploration is warranted. Yet, in France a century after Thomas of Villanova's death and around the year of his canonization, the scarcely known Ange Le Proust cites the same triad in his commentary on the *Rule*:

. . . [T]hese creatures have being, essence, quality, inclination only to the extent that they must have them to be useful to the "form" that is man. *God has made all things by this weight, by this measure and this number (Wis. 11:20)*. Man, accordingly, is the soul of the world, and God's love for man made and sustains the universe. The bond that links the whole world to God is the influence which God exerts on it, and its dependence is first and principally that which exists between God and man. This bond should therefore be found in the most perfect degree in the being of man, which is free and rational. Consequently, it should be a bond of gratitude and love, such as binds the whole universe to God but through the heart and mind of man.¹⁰⁶

What is most interesting in this text is how the triad is not only mentioned, but that Le Proust introduces the notion of the "bond" between human beings with God, others, and the universe which corresponds neatly to our understanding of harmony as a "rhythm of relationships." The concept of the "bond" and expressions of harmony and concord permeate nearly every page of his *Traité*. There is no doubt that this literary work, still quite unknown, can serve as an entry point for further exploration into the study of the theme of

¹⁰⁵TURRADO, "Thomas de Villeneuve," col. 889.

¹⁰⁶ROTELLE (ed.), *Treatise*, p. 20. A. LE PROUST, *Traité de la Règle de Saint Augustin*. [hors commerce] Paris: Jean Munier, 1980, p. 37: "toutes n'ont d'être, d'essence, de qualité, d'inclination, qu'autant qu'il leur en faut pour être utile à cette 'forme' qui est l'homme. 'Dieu a tout fait à ce poids, à cette mesure et à ce nombre' (Sag. 11,20). L'homme est donc l'âme du monde et c'est l'amour que Dieu a pour l'homme qui fait et soutient l'univers. Ce lien qui lie tout le monde à Dieu est l'influence que Dieu exerce sur lui, et sa dépendance est premièrement et principalement celle qu'il y a entre Dieu et l'homme. Ce lien doit donc se trouver, au degré le plus parfait, dans l'être de l'homme qui est libre et raisonnable. En conséquence, il doit être un lien de reconnaissance et d'amour qui lie à Dieu l'univers entier par le cœur de l'homme."

harmony in Augustinian spirituality.¹⁰⁷

Nevertheless, human perception of the universe was altered through a different prism. The God-centered notion of the triad waned over time, possibly due to the rise of scientific thought and the Enlightenment. Yet by the 1960's some Augustinian scripture writers like Ansfried Hulsbosch recovered the triad from *Wisdom* and incorporated it into their reflections on evolutionary science.¹⁰⁸ In describing divine wisdom with the characteristics of *multiplicity*, the author writes,

This property has a connection with the multiplicity of creatures in their endless variety and in their precisely established measures and weights. *Wisdom* 11,20 [21] unites these in one sentence: ‘You have arranged all things by measure and number and weight.’ such a work of creation can be carried through only by means of a truly divine wisdom, in which everything is included as in its source.¹⁰⁹

Hulsbosch also makes a link between the universe’s built-in design or lawfulness with harmony and the human being’s participation in that drama that clearly echoes Augustine’s thought on the triad.¹¹⁰

It appears that Ayres’s opinion has to be pondered. We cannot say that the triad from *Wisdom* has been ignored in the scholarly or pastoral writings by later Augustinian thinkers.

¹⁰⁷As mentioned already, only 200 copies of the French edition were printed in 1980. The text was translated into English only in 1996.

¹⁰⁸A. HULSBOSCH, *God’s Creation: Creation, Sin and Redemption in an Evolving World*. M. Versfeld (trans.). London: Sheed and Ward, 1965, pp. 85-87.

¹⁰⁹HULSBOSCH, *God’s Creation*, p. 85.

¹¹⁰HULSBOSCH, *God’s Creation*, p. 64: “Just as everything exists in harmony, and moves and lives in obedience to God’s sovereign creative will, so, too, man lives in his peculiar position in the visible universe, thanks to his obedience to God’s commands . . . The human person has freedom to turn away from God” (p. 64) or collaborate with divine grace as a “created becoming” (p. 76). Human beings have a natural tendency toward God as Creator (pp. 75, 158). “The whole of creation is saturated with built-in lawfulness. Thus the whole universe in all its facets displays a harmony which is to be explained only by the immeasurable wisdom the Creator which displays its workings here” (p. 63).

We can agree, nevertheless, that the idea of the triad is not a dominant characteristic of the theme of harmony as a whole and has not been strictly adopted from this particular angle in the Order's tradition. Neither do the Chapter documents and formation manuals make reference to Augustine's expressions of the triad, for example, "my weight is my love." The literal expression is not common; however, the notion of love of God and neighbor is present. Evidence of the triad as such, its components, and reference to *Wisdom* 11:21 are not found anywhere in these same documents. We may regret this because each term in the triad is very significant for a better understanding of harmony.

The Augustinian tradition has appropriated Augustine's view that we live in an inter-connected relationship with creation, through which we can discover God and our duty as responsible stewards with the gifts of creation. The natural world is not meant to be exploited nor destroyed and this is our pastoral challenge. The global situation has placed new demands on how we receive the created reality and utilize its natural resources. It is an imperative to share these resources in a responsible manner because the human person has discovered that it is the recipient of an "excessively loving" God, the one whose measure of love is "without measure." Does not love have to be the center point for harmony with God?

B. Harmony with God: "un centro de amor"

This essential component of harmony with God is studied in three different treatments. First of all, centrality in God and gratitude according to Giles of Rome; secondly, the Prior General Martin Nolan's comments on the notion of ego-centric love as an expression of disharmony; finally, Thomas of Villanova's views on the restoration of

harmony as “going within” to one’s “center” for self-knowledge and scrutiny of self-loves.

1. Centrality in God and gratitude: aspects of harmony in Giles of Rome

In the context of the doctrine of creation (*creatio ex nihilo*), Augustine speaks of the self in relation with God as a condition for harmony. All natural processes in the universe converge into God, or as Augustine says, “creation is referred to its Creator.”¹¹¹ Do any Augustinians retrieve this understanding of the relationship between the self and God? At least, one name can be brought forward: Giles of Rome.

In his treatise on the seven gifts of the Holy Spirit, *Praises of Divine Wisdom*, Giles of Rome, the “‘pupil but not a disciple’ of Aquinas,”¹¹² is clearly rooted in Augustine’s thought on two points. First, the centrality of the human person’s connectedness and turning toward God. Without this connection everything would simply cease to exist and fall into a state of nothingness. Thus, for Giles and the Augustinian School, the object of theology is not just learning, but wisdom and love-oriented; theology is affective.¹¹³ Second, a consequence of this connection with God is the attitude of gratefulness. On the first point Giles teaches that as a “manner of living” one ought to be “turned toward [God] through all things.”

For God is not the cause of things as a builder is the cause of a house, but if at any moment God should desert his creation, it would immediately cease to exist. Hence Augustine, in book four of his *The Literal Meaning of Genesis*, chapter 12, says: “The world is not like a structure of rooms, which remains standing even when its

¹¹¹“Quae tamen opera cum ad ipsius Creatoris laudem uenerationemque referuntur, tamquam mane lucescit in mentibus contemplantium” (*Civ Dei* 11, 29; *CCL* 48, 349).

¹¹²A. ZUMKELLER, *Theology and History of the Augustinian School in the Middle Ages*. J. Rotelle, (ed.) Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1996, p. 19.

¹¹³ZUMKELLER, *Theology and History of the Augustinian School*, p. 20. See Giles’s elaboration on the object of theology on page 60, note 153, of this thesis.

builder departs and is gone; but the world would vanish in the blink of an eye if God removed his governance from it.” And because God is above all things, conserving them, and because they are nothing without him, therefore we should be turned toward him through all things, and, with all our strength, we should direct all our powers to him through love. Speaking to God in book six of his *Confessions*, Augustine says: “Leaving all things behind let us turn to you, who are above all and without whom all would fall into nothingness.”¹¹⁴

Then, a condition for harmony is to maintain a connection with God who is the source of abundant life, and to whom our response for the goodness and blessings of creation is an expression of gratitude, as we read in Paul: *we have nothing that we have not received*.¹¹⁵ Giles introduces the attitude of gratitude for our very existence as an expression of harmony, because from God

[W]e have mind, heart, and soul; memory, understanding, and will, and all the powers of the soul; from him we also have every impulse for good that can exist through our powers; from him, therefore, we have everything extensively and intensively, as far as the powers possessed and the manner of possession, as far as their natures and as far as their impulses. And since it is terrible ingratitude not to order all things that we have to him from whom we have them, that we might not be ungrateful to God, we ought to order all our powers according to every impulse to God himself.¹¹⁶

It is very interesting to take into consideration that from the beginning of the Order’s history

¹¹⁴ ROTELLE (ed.), *Giles of Rome: Commentary on the Song of Songs*, p. 234. The theological work is called *De laudibus divinae sapientiae*. (Due to circumstances, I have been unable to cite this text in the original Latin.)

¹¹⁵1 *Cor.* 4:7.

¹¹⁶ ROTELLE, *Giles of Rome: Commentary on the Song of Songs*, p. 234. Like Thomas of Villanova, Giles made reference to Augustine’s triad by saying that our expression of gratitude is to “love God without measure” (pp. 234-235). AEGIDIUS ROMANUS, *Opera exegetica. Opuscula 1*, “Tractatus de laudibus divinae sapientiae,” p. 30a: “Ab ipso enim habemus mentem, cor, & animam: sive memoriam, & intelligentiam, & voluntatem, & omnes potentias animae: ab ipso etiam, habemus omnes vires, & omnem conatum in bonum, qui potest esse per huiusmodi potentias: ab eo ergo habemus omnia extensive, & intensive, quantum ad res habitas & quantum ad modum habendi, quantum ad id quod sunt, & quantum ad eorum conatur. Et quia magna ingratitude est, non ordinare omnia quae habemus ad illum a quo habemus: ideo ne ingrati simus Deo, omnia nra secundu omne conatum debemus ordinare in ipsum Deum.”

and theology, the centrality of the goodness of creation and the human being's place in the natural order -- as one turned toward God as Creator -- are already present. Moreover, one characteristic of the self as an expression of harmony is articulated in terms of gratitude for blessings received. And, consequently, ingratitude, understood as excessive self-regard, becomes an expression of disharmony.

2. Ego-centric love as an expression of disharmony

Augustine refers to his disharmonious relationship with the Creator as an experience of brokenness and unrest. The bishop uses an existential type language to portray his own sinfulness and frailty as nothingness and non-being. In order to exist, for Augustine, the self must be rooted in God who is the fulness of life and being. How does the Augustinian tradition receive these notions?

On the occasion of the XVIth Centenary of the Conversion and Baptism of Augustine, the then Prior General Martin Nolan wrote a pastoral letter addressing the "restlessness that seethes in the heart of every person."¹¹⁷ Similar to Augustine's experience of being broken and alienated with himself and with life, contemporary forms of restlessness and feeling of nothingness are expressed in a variety of ways as "quest for meaning and [the] need for God." The Prior General highlights eight of these features of brokenness that we sum up with his own terms.

- 1) struggle with loneliness and rootlessness;
- 2) desire for a community to belong to;
- 3) search for satisfying answers to the deeper questions of life;

¹¹⁷M. NOLAN, *A cry from the heart. Conversion and Prayer Today*. A letter from the Prior General of the Augustinians. Rome: Tip. De Magistris & Ceccacci, 1987, p. 3.

- 4) coping with alienation with self, others, native culture and environment;
- 5) emergence from anonymity and achievement of identity;
- 6) lack of a competent spiritual guide to lead one spiritually and strengthen and confirm one in the search;
- 7) experience of the world as a shaky balance between hostility, conflict, violence and fear of total destruction;
- 8) facing an uncertain future; longing for a sign of hope and a vision of a future to which people can commit.¹¹⁸

These contemporary expressions of restlessness have an echo in what Augustine says regarding his experience of nothingness and alienation, which he links with a drift of the self in the direction of excessive self-love and pride. Perhaps it is more accurate to say with other authors that our contemporary restlessness resembles more a sense of being “poised” between the two tendencies of selfish love and self-giving love that is found in God.¹¹⁹ The more one loves the self to the extreme through pride, greed and ambition, the greater the sense of alienation and drift toward a state of meaninglessness and disharmony. One’s choice to be a life-giver and whose whole self is focused and oriented toward God, will find wholeness and a movement toward “repose.” The Order’s *Constitutions* -- one of the primary documents on Augustinian spirituality -- captures the importance of recognizing

¹¹⁸NOLAN, *A cry from the heart*, p. 5.

¹¹⁹HARRISON, “Augustine and Religious Experience,” pp. 117-118. Harrison identifies some characteristics from Augustine’s doctrine of creation from nothing: “language of restlessness and unease, of longing for the truth, of being poised between being and non-being, of inevitable self-interest and pride, of alienation and fragmentation, of temporality and mutability, of moral blindness and impotence, of the motivating and transforming power of love and beauty – all of which are relevant and resonate with contemporary experience in a way that the Fall of Adam and Eve, and original sin, do not.”

the tendency toward disordered self-love:

Although this “holy sharing of life” among the brothers is the gift of God, still each of us must strive with all his strength to perfect it to the point that “deep in his heart he will hate every self-centered affection that undoubtedly pertains only to this passing world” and cherish only that common and social love which will endure in the heavenly city that consists of many souls.¹²⁰

Thus, we find a resonance with Augustine on the effects of ego-centric love as an expression of disharmony. The experience of brokenness and unrest is a common human experience which must be addressed by every generation in terms of the relationship with self and with God. A question we can ask is: Does the Order’s tradition pick up anything from Augustine regarding the restoration of harmony between the self and God when it is broken?

3. Restoration of harmony: turning to the “center” in Thomas of Villanova

One of the dominant characteristics in Augustine’s writings and in the Order’s spirituality is the notion of returning to the inner self as a condition for harmony and transformation. Augustine describes this innerness in relation to God: “You were more intimately present to me than my innermost being, and higher than the highest peak of my spirit.”¹²¹ The Order’s tradition calls this “interiority.”¹²² The return to the self and the restoration of the broken relationship with God is possible because of our natural tendency, indicated by the “restless heart,” to find ultimate rest in God. As we recalled earlier,

¹²⁰*Const.* 28.

¹²¹“Tu autem eras interior intimo meo et superior summo meo” (*Conf.* 3, 6, 11; *CCL* 27, 33).

¹²²*Const.* 34: “This image (that is, the image of God within us) will be more easily refashioned in us if we proceed by way of the interior life (interiority). Led by the voice of creation itself, we must continually turn back into ourselves and, entering into the depths of our being, diligently work toward perfecting our hearts, so that praying with the continuous desire of our hearts we may come to God.”

Thomas of Villanova calls this tendency “vital ontology” (ontologie vitaliste).¹²³ This natural inclination, rooted in desire that resonates with Augustine’s notion “our weight is our love,” is due to our inevitable restlessness toward God who is the center around which our life revolves.

Thomas elaborates on this tendency of “weight” toward the divine “center” in the self in the sermon already mentioned for the Seventeenth Sunday after Pentecost, described by Turrado as “a hymn to the harmony of the soul with God.”¹²⁴ At least fifteen times in his *Sermón Segundo del Amor de Dios*, the bishop describes the act of going down to one’s center to find God. God is described as the center of love;¹²⁵ God is your center;¹²⁶ the infinite and most attractive center.¹²⁷ The preacher continues:

Love is a weight of the soul, as our saintly father Augustine testifies: ‘My love, my weight, I am carried by it wherever I am carried.’ As weight carries a stone down to the center, so too love carries the soul down to its center, which is God, who is the proper place of the soul, just as the center is the stone’s place. Therefore imitate nature, O soul, at least imitate the insensible stone.¹²⁸

¹²³TURRADO, “Thomas de Villeneuve,” col. 889. Some distinguishing characteristics in Thomas which have roots in Augustine are 1) the innate desire for God, 2) grace as virtue, force and attraction, 3) the human being as the image of God, and 4) the theology of charity (col. 878-879). Also, *Constitutions* 32: “Whether we are aware of it or not, we are continually and insatiably drawn toward God, toward the possession of the infinite good, by reason of that natural longing that God himself, as a skilled artisan, has placed in our hearts. . . .” Cf. *Solil.* 1, 1, 2.

¹²⁴TURRADO, “Thomas de Villeneuve,” col. 888: “un chant à l’harmonie de l’âme avec Dieu.” Cf. Introduction in *WSTV*, Part 1, p. 33.

¹²⁵ “Porque es Dios un centro de amor;” S. SANTAMARTA (ed.), *Obras de santo Tomas de Villanueva: sermones de la Virgen y obras castellanas*. Madrid: Editorial Católica, 1952, p. 603.

¹²⁶ “Dios sea tu centro;” SANTAMARTA, *Obras de santo Tomas de Villanueva*, p. 604.

¹²⁷ “centro infinito, infinitamente bueno y, por consiguiente, infinitamente atractivo;” SANTAMARTA, *Obras de santo Tomas de Villanueva*, p. 605.

¹²⁸ “El amor peso del ánima: testigo es el gran Agustino, que dice “Mi amor es mi peso. Con él soy llevado adquiera que soy llevado.” Y así como el peso lleva a la piedra al centro, así el amor lleva el ánima a su centro, que es Dios, el cual es propio lugar de él, como el centro es propio lugar de la piedra”

This centering, or natural tendency of “weight” and desire for full happiness, the feeling of unrest God has created in all of us,¹²⁹ is an important concept in understanding Augustine’s view of creation and harmony between the human being and God. Thomas also describes the need to go to the “center” in time of conflict and anguish:

Through anguish and much labor, through hunger and thirst, through all that causes fear and terror, with incredible velocity, one ought to go and arrive at one’s center, whose will in some manner has returned to its nature.¹³⁰

This idea of returning to one’s center in a time of conflict demonstrates how Thomas has received a similar viewpoint from Augustine’s *Sermo* 348, 2: “Whoever does not want to fear, let him probe his inmost self. Do not just touch the surface; go down into yourself; reach into the farthest corner of your heart.” In the context of discord, one returns to the self as a step towards inner transformation.

Augustine’s direction for transformation -- that every person has the “capacity” to enter the self and able to “reform and purify” the *imago Dei* that is within the self – has been received by the Order’s spirituality. We find in the *Constitutions*:

(SANTAMARTA, *Obras de santo Tomas de Villanueva*: p. 603.) THOMAS OF VILLANOVA, *Seventeenth Sunday after Pentecost, Sermon* 2,3, in *WSTV*, Part 5, p. 253. “This Spanish sermon is an original sermon found in the Augustinian College at Valladolid, Spain. It was published for the first time in *Revista Agustiniiana* (1881).” See *WSTV*, Part 5, p. 382.

¹²⁹“Nature does not cease from striving for its final end and ultimate completion. This natural appetite and inclination exists in human beings, ordering them to their happiness; it is created in them and directed by God, even though persons may not explicitly understand what the completion is to which their nature inclines them.’ Thomas sees this inclination to love of God at work throughout nature, since God is the supreme Good on which all things depend and in which they participate (12th Sunday after Pentecost, 1). God is the center of all things, and everything tends to him in its own way; the rock necessarily moves toward its center, which the human person does so by the free movement of the will.” See Introduction in *WSTV*, Part 1, p. 19.

¹³⁰“Por angustias y trabajos muchos, por hambre y por sed, por fríos y calores, por cuchillos, por todas las cosas espantosas y terribles, con increíble velocidad se daba prisa por ir y llegar a su centro, cuya voluntad en alguna manera se había ya vuelto en naturaleza;” SANTAMARTA, *Obras de santo Tomas de Villanueva*, p. 604.

We cannot enjoy the satisfaction of true happiness except in God, because we are made in his image and likeness. We are his image for the very reason that we are capable of possessing him and able to share his being. “Through sin” the image of God is obscured in us, but not destroyed, and “through grace it is renewed.” Each of us must dedicate himself intensely to this work of renewal, for as Saint Augustine says: “He who made you without your help will not justify you without your cooperation.”¹³¹

The process of inner transformation, of renewal and of re-centering the self is a life-long task of coming to know ourselves and God who is love. Transformation is a confrontation with our tendencies toward egocentrism and pride. Only love can break down the barriers created by pride and re-establish a relationship of harmony with God. This is another point of contact between Augustine and the Order’s tradition regarding the process of transformation.

Turning again to Augustine’s *Sermo* 348, 2, the bishop reminds us to enter the self and evaluate the sources of our loves. If one finds a “poisonous vein” of egotism, then love and humility are sources from which one can overcome the damaging effects and know the self at a more intimate level. The formation document *Ratio* echoes these thoughts found in Augustine:

Love always includes one’s ability to transcend egotism and go out to others. But this cannot be done without humility, which breaks down the walls imprisoning the ego in itself. Humility does not consist in slavish subservience, but in a sense of reality: “You are not told: be something less than you are, but: know what you are. Know that you are weak, that you are a human being, that you are a sinner.”¹³²

Humility looks at the self in terms of truth, and not a lie. A step in the direction of conversion and transformation begins with a truthful acceptance and knowledge of the self

¹³¹*Const.* 33.

¹³²*Ratio* 22. Augustine is quoted from *Sermo* 137, 4, 4.

and of who one really is as a person. Self-knowledge is essential in the process of de-centering from the drift of excessive self-assuredness and re-centering in the Spirit of God.

In this section we find how the Augustinian tradition has received Augustine's teaching with more or less emphasis. Three points can be underlined: the transformation requires going to the "center" of oneself; the capacity within each person makes possible this renewal; and, finally, self-giving love breaks the barriers of egocentrism and enables us to know ourselves as we are, with our limitations and potential for the turn toward God and recognizing God's presence in the other.

C. Harmony with others: peace, concord and sharing of goods

To be in harmony with God implies a harmonious relationship with others, for the great commandment calls us to love God and our neighbor. The Order's spirituality, as developed in the *Constitutions* and the *Ratio*, deals with these notions under three aspects: 1) peace is the manifestation of harmony, 2) learning to live together in concord is an element of harmony, and 3) the sharing of material and spiritual goods is the essential condition for harmony.

1. Ideal of peace: anima una et cor unum.

Augustine describes peace as the fruit of right relations and ordered loves. Absolute peace is found in the future life with the Infinite. Relative peace exists in earthly life of multiplicity and diversity, described as the tranquillity of order (*tranquillitas ordinis*) whereby every part finds its proper place within the whole.¹³³ We struggle on our journey to cultivate relationships, to bring together the diverse parts, that are interpersonal and life-

¹³³*Civ. Dei.* 13, 1. Cf. D. BURT, "Peace" in *AA*, pp. 629-632.

giving. The bishop of Hippo reminds us that this peace is the result of a love “that makes one heart out of many.”¹³⁴

The idea of “one heart” finds resonance in Augustine’s *Rule* when he writes that the purpose for forming a community is “to be of one mind and one heart on the way to God” (*anima una et cor unum in Deum*).¹³⁵ The Order, with the *Rule* as its most important document, embraces this aspect of the “one heart” as one of the dominant characteristics of its spirituality. The peace that is the fruit of being “one heart,” then, is found in community life, the basic norm for following Christ and living Augustinian spirituality. What does the community of “one heart” look like?

Augustinian community implies a life of relationships which takes seriously the practice of loving God and neighbor. These relationships are interpersonal and encompass all the dimensions of human experience. The *Ratio*, in its section on “Sharing Life in Community,” portrays these dimensions of life’s experiences as “sharing in one another’s faith, hope, affections, ideals, feelings, thoughts, activities, responsibilities, shortcomings, failures, sins, etc.”¹³⁶ This sharing presupposes as a foundation an “openness to others, a sense of belonging, acceptance, trust, support, encouragement, as well as sensitivity and

¹³⁴“Sed communi eodemque immutabili bono gaudens atque ex multis unum cor faciens, id est perfecte concors oboedientia caritatis” (*Civ Dei* 15, 3; *CCL* 48, 456).

¹³⁵*Rule* 1, 2.

¹³⁶*Ratio* 16: “Within our tradition community life is normative. It is here that Augustine placed a very special emphasis on the following of Christ. Building a good community implies nothing more than putting into practice the command of love of God and love of neighbor. Community life consists in the cultivation of interpersonal relationships. This life encompasses the whole of concrete human existence: sharing in one another’s faith”

presence to these others.”¹³⁷

The *Constitutions* speak of an “exchange of charity,” borrowing the phrase from Augustine, to describe the dynamic of relationships in the community.

Moreover, according to Augustine, among these Christians, “each in his own degree observing the evangelical precepts and hoping in the evangelical promises,” there must necessarily be “a kind of ‘exchange’ of charity.”¹³⁸

So, community life becomes a context in which people commit themselves through charity to working out peace and right relationships with one another. To be “one heart” is the goal and peace that individuals and a community strive for and maintain as the hope-driven force. We are all too well aware that to obtain some earthly peace with others, limited as it is, is not easy. Often the “*anima*” is not one, but divided. Although we do our part, peace is the manifestation of harmony. In the end, it is a gift.

2. Living in concord with others: God’s gift and challenge

Augustine says that peace and living in concord are more “gifts of God” than a consequence of human effort. This does not mean that human beings stand around and wait for peace to bloom automatically in their communities, families or nations. We must do our part of collaborating with grace and of focusing our desires on the values of the future life with Christ, but we realize that growth toward greater unity, communion and peace with one another, is ultimately a gift of God.

The *Constitutions* makes the point that community life is God’s gift and a sign of

¹³⁷*Ratio* 17: “Living together means in a very special way speaking together, for speech is our strongest means of communication. Without dialogue community life simply disappears, always and everywhere, just as happens in all human relationships when dialogue fails.”

¹³⁸*Const.* 23.

“spiritual beauty” as recorded in chapter 8 of the *Rule*.

They should understand this: “It is a grace of God that the friars live together; it is not the result of their own doing or their own merits; rather it is his gift.” This is what the *Rule* means where it says that we should observe all our obligations in a spirit of charity “as lovers of spiritual beauty . . . not as slaves living under the law but as men living in freedom under grace.” We who have been freely created and redeemed, freely called and justified, should render thanks to God and carry out our mission in peace and humility. . . .¹³⁹

This gift of God, where people live together and strive to be “lovers of spiritual beauty,” becomes a manifestation of harmony. A condition for this manifestation is that there be charity and a life in cooperation with grace and movements of the Spirit. Gratitude, humility and peace are also aspects of harmony, for which we continue to “ask, seek and knock.”

Often, we experience selfishness, arrogance and the lack of peace in our communities. Perhaps for this reason peace is a challenge for us at the same time. The *Ratio* is aware of the human limitations of living in community when communities are called “schools of reality.”¹⁴⁰ As noted in the previous chapter, under the subheading of “Harmony,” the writers of the *Ratio* seem to give a message that the peace of living in community will be a constant struggle and the challenge is embedded in real experiences. In the past, formation in religious life gave greater emphasis to disciplines than learning

¹³⁹*Const.* 42. The first part of the *Rule* emphasizes “Before all else, live together in harmony, being of one mind and one heart on the way to God” (1, 2) and “Among you there can be no question of personal property. Rather, take care that you share everything in common” (1, 3). But the climax of the *Rule* is found in the last chapter: be “filled with longing for spiritual beauty” (8, 1). In this context, God is Beauty toward which everything points. VERHEIJEN, *Nouvelle Approche*, p. 47: “le sommet de la Règle de saint Augustin ne se trouve pas au début du texte, mais à la fin, dans la prière qui constitue sa seconde partie. . . la clef de voûte de la Règle se trouve en réalité dans la prière finale. Si l'*anima una* et le *cor unum* sont orientés *in deum*, cela veut dire qu'ils sont tendus *in spiritalem pulchritudinem*, vers la Beauté divine que se reflète dans la beauté de l'*anima* et du *cor* pacifiés *ad intra* et *ad extra*.”

¹⁴⁰*Ratio* 29: “The foregoing considerations do not mean that community life is to be considered as a form of splendid isolation, a place of refuge for the individual, fostering carefree existence. Community life is not a romantic dream, but a school of realism.” See page 85 for the discussion. Cf. Appendix 2.

“how to live in community.” This is a very important statement, as we said.

The writers make a link between the theme “Harmony” and the necessity of learning how to live together. Some aspects of a life of relationships will include, as indicated in this document, teaching on understanding a rightly ordered life of love, the fundamental disposition of humility, friendship with God and with one another, and communication of ideas and experiences and a deep level of relationships where the members begin to think as “we.”¹⁴¹

Community life is a gift of God and, at the same time, it consists of human collaboration with grace at a given moment. Communities are not problem-free. The challenge posed within this “school of reality” filled with tension and conflict is learning how to love, to be humble, to be friends, to dialogue and to communicate with each other, not superficially, but profoundly, as elements of harmony. Learning how to live together, according to the writers of the *Ratio*, is an essential element in understanding how Augustine presented harmony. The opening paragraphs of the *Rule* give us a clue to one of the means for living together by examining our “acts of sharing.”

3. Material and spiritual sharing: an essential condition for harmony

The Order’s tradition has received as a dominant characteristic of its spirituality Augustine’s notion that common life must be rooted in an intentionally shared life in all its dimensions. The bishop, as we recall, opens his *Rule* in the spirit of the first apostolic community stating the purpose for coming together: *to live together in harmony, being of one mind and one heart on the way to God*. The following paragraph is a strong statement

¹⁴¹*Ratio* 19-28.

on common ownership of goods as a condition *sine qua non* for living, and ought to be, not separated, but linked as one block of thought.¹⁴² *Among you there can be no question of personal property. Rather, take care that you share everything in common.* For Augustine, an essential ingredient of the theme of harmony is what we do with our possessions, both materially and spiritually. To begin with, what do we mean by material and spiritual possessions?

Again, we turn to the *Ratio* for clarification because this document illustrates the application of the spirit of the *Rule* and *Constitutions* for the modern era. So, in the section called “The vow of poverty or sharing goods in common,” the nature of material and spiritual goods are explained in detail. Poverty in the strict sense of the term means deprivation of basic necessities for life, such as food, water and shelter. Augustine never had this sense in mind, an evil that must be overcome, but the idea expressed in the *Acts of the Apostles: Everything they owned was held in common, and each one received whatever he had need of.*¹⁴³ The lifestyle he proposed was based on this “community of goods” or “sharing of goods,” both material and spiritual.¹⁴⁴

¹⁴²In the classical sense, friendship and the sharing of goods are two conditions that must be present for an authentic relationship. Having said this, we must take another look at the *Rule*’s goal to include “that things are shared in common,” as proposed in T. VIÑAS, *La amistad en la vida religiosa*. Madrid: Instituto Teológica de Vida Religiosa, 1982, pp. 130, 255, 257f. More specifically, the “secondary” goal can be: “live together in harmony, being of one mind and one heart on the way to God. For is it not precisely for this reason that you have come to live together. Among you there can be no question of personal property. Rather, take care that you share everything in common” (*Rule* 1, 2-3). The “primary” goal is to be “lovers of spiritual beauty” (*Rule* 8, 1). Arranging these characteristics in this manner can amplify the meaning of the *anima una* in the context of the theme of harmony from a variety of perspectives.

¹⁴³*Acts* 4: 32, 35.

¹⁴⁴*Ratio* 34: “Community of goods applies not only to the sharing of material goods, but also to the sharing of spiritual goods. Such sharing, through a frugal and ascetical lifestyle, opens us to a deep inner freedom.”

The shared use of material goods in the community has the intention of creating a new set of relationships based on equality, unity, and life in harmony and overcoming divisive attitudes like “this is mine” and “that is yours.” It also includes our attitude toward the goods themselves: our creative sense, healthy management and responsible care, and just distribution according to need.

The intention behind sharing material goods is, first, to create new relationships of equality and unity among those living in the monastery. The distance between rich and poor, between powerful and powerless, must be abolished, for material goods are by their nature sources of division: “this is mine and that is yours.” In these material goods lies the source of individualism, egoism, jealousy, competition, covetousness, conflict, and struggle. This vow means more than receiving goods from the community. It includes also a creative attitude towards material goods and their management: care for the goods of the community, their just distribution, personal stewardship, and responsibility for goods entrusted to the individual.¹⁴⁵

How material goods are shared gives a glimpse into the quality (or absolute condition?) of the “*anima una*” among its members. (Is it possible to speak of “community” without the sharing of material things?) In some societies, every member may need an automobile for the diverse ministries. But is a television in every friar’s room a necessity and expression of “healthy management”? We can take the same questioning beyond religious life to life in the world demarcated by “haves” and “have-nots.” The quality of how natural resources are managed and diverse cultures and rights of peoples are respected will indicate to what extent the world is striving to become “*anima una*.”

The sharing of material goods is considered as the “first condition” for forming authentic common life and living together in harmony. The individual member cultivates

¹⁴⁵*Ratio* 35. For “source of individualism, egoism” see *En ps.*131, 5.

the attitude found in the *Rule: It is better to need less than to have more.*¹⁴⁶ Furthermore, this sharing is not restricted only to the limited monastic setting, but it is meant to be extended to the building up of a better society and world based on justice.¹⁴⁷

Following the idea of building a better world, the conclusions of the recent *Ordinary General Chapter of 2001* state that the sharing of the gifts of creation is important because this sensitivity has “diminished in the world today.”¹⁴⁸ The Chapter document draws further attention to the African continent where the “gifts of creation” are scarce and starvation widespread.¹⁴⁹ Since the Chapter, Africa has become a focal point for consciousness-raising in the Order for sharing materially, and also learning its “spiritual goods.”

Regarding the second component of “goods,” namely the spiritual, the *Ratio* gives us some indications as to its meaning:

faith and inspiration, ideals and expectations, insights and ideas, talents and

¹⁴⁶*Rule* 3, 5: “Those who have the strength to lead simple lives should consider themselves the richest of people. For it is better to be able to make do with a little than to have plenty.”

¹⁴⁷*Ratio* 36: “The sharing of material goods is for Augustine the first condition for forming an authentic community of brothers or sisters, living together in harmony in the same house. The sharing of material goods, however, is not meant to remain limited to the building up of community among ourselves alone. It should be extended to the realization of a better and more just society in the world . . . Moreover, does it make sense to support the pursuit of justice and peace in the world, if justice and peace are not prevalent in our houses?”

¹⁴⁸*Ordinary General Chapter 2001: Documents and Decisions*. Doc. 10. Rome: Pubblicazioni Agostiniane, 2001, B-11 on p. 18: “By our direct and indirect involvement (at the United Nations with NGO status) we can evangelize precisely from our Augustinian charism. Our basic principles of unity in diversity, respect for the dignity of each and every individual, the promotion of the common good and the sharing of all of God’s good gifts among all people, are particularly significant precisely because they are so diminished in the world today.” Hereafter *OGC 2001*.

¹⁴⁹*OGC 2001*, B-14: “The General Chapter of the Order calls the attention of all to the African continent, aside from our actual commitment in other regions, because Africa, particularly south of the Sahara, finds itself in an extremely critical and urgent situation, worsened by the crisis of AIDS, scarcity of basic nutrition, political and social instability.”

feelings. It is evident that these ought to be made available to one another, for this is an essential condition for community living. However, the sharing of spiritual goods may not be limited to this alone. A union of hearts and minds will enable us to communicate inner values to the world through our ministry. People need to see groups of persons, motivated by the Gospel and by their love of God and of one another, who live in such a way that loneliness and alienation are dispelled. In this way community life also takes on an apostolic meaning.¹⁵⁰

The sharing of spiritual goods refer to the non-tangibles or the life of the inner person (or group) that are realized. Hopes, fears, desires, struggles with faith, and finding God are all part and parcel of the “common property” of the community. Like concentric rings formed by throwing a stone into a pond, the sharing of spiritual goods has a wider ministerial dimension in assisting others out of their “loneliness and alienation.” A community that tries to live its spirituality with “one mind and heart” and motivated by the Gospel will present another path for those seeking some form of harmony in their lives.

Sharing of spiritual goods also finds expression in attitudes toward cultural diversity, such as in a religious community, composed of members from different cultures and economic levels. Sharing of spiritual goods requires listening to each other’s stories, struggles, fears and hopes, as well as sharing soda bread, gyros, tacos, and refried beans. Everyone can learn from others.¹⁵¹

We have addressed the topic of sharing material and spiritual goods and how the

¹⁵⁰*Ratio 37.*

¹⁵¹Discussions are taking place in Chicago to create an “intentional” community with Augustinians from Nigeria, Mexico, and the U.S. The present community is situated in an already existing multiethnic setting with African-Americans, Hispanics, and Palestinians. It is this writer’s conviction that Augustinian communities ought to be comprised of members from different parts of the world as a “school of reality” and sign of the struggle on how to live in harmony.

Order's tradition has received these notions from Augustine, particularly, from his *Rule*. The sharing of goods, as expressed in the Augustinian framework of the vow of poverty, is an essential condition for living together in harmony. Augustine says this in the *Rule* and it is delineated further in the contemporary context through the *Ratio*. How do we understand the perception of the self in this context?

We see that material possessions, first of all, can be a tremendous source for division among people in society as well as within a religious community. Individualism, selfishness, jealousy are the fruit of a wrongly ordered love of the things of the earth. As Jordan of Saxony says, there are problems when we consider things as “this is yours” and “this is mine,” a fundamental violation of the “laws of creation” upon which Augustine’s *Rule* is formulated.¹⁵² The “lovers of spiritual beauty” take seriously the sharing of goods and attempt to mirror the “laws of creation” by establishing new relationships based on equality and unity because the goods of creation are meant to be shared. A formula may be: “spiritual beauty” = “anima una” (sharing of goods) + “in Deum.” This is a radical vision of a future that says no one will be without the basic necessities of life when there is a proper sharing and distribution of the fruits of creation. For the individual seeking a deeper inner freedom, this means appropriating the deeper insights of that phrase from the *Rule*: “it is better to need less than to have more.”

This chapter gives the opportunity to review Augustine’s understanding of harmony and beauty according to three dimensions, as grounded in the design of creation, harmony with God, and harmony with others. Then we look at how each facet is received by the

¹⁵²Cf. *LB* (III,1) 301; *LV* 320.

Order's spiritual tradition. Creation's built-in design of measure, number and weight is carried over by Augustinian theologians as a "pattern" to describe harmonious relationships with the self, God, and others by evaluating the quality of love as a "weight." The Augustinian tradition recognizes interiority and its value in today's environment of loneliness, hostility and the search for meaning in one's life. Through interiority and the return to God as the center of existence one experiences the harmony between the human and divine; disharmony is a manifestation of the turn toward the self as "center." Community life, peace and concord, as "gifts of God," continue to be the expressions of the "gift" of harmony in the corporate consciousness of the Order. A linguistic change in this consciousness is occurring with the subtle move from speaking of "community" to "communion." We also add that this movement recognizes community not only as a "school of reality," but a "school of the human heart."

From this study on harmony we can deduce the following conclusions regarding further awareness of the self.

1. Harmony with creation illustrates a built-in design, a coherent living system of relationships in nature of which the self is a part. The self created-for-relation has the capacity to look meditatively to nature and discover its multifaceted and wide spectrum of inter-connectedness, sense of order and form, and resultant beauty. Nature's design of relatedness sets the paradigm according to which the self discovers a profound inner freedom to comply with or diverge away from these relationships.

2. To comply with the order of creation means, first and foremost, that the self directs its loves in a correct manner and turns always toward God as Creator. Thus, the self lives responsibly in balanced harmony with creation; its task is to protect nature and to be its steward. The rightly ordered life of love, or the “art of living,” becomes a life of beauty.
3. The self who does not comply with the order of nature moves away from a natural tendency for the love of God toward a wrongly ordered self-love and an imbalanced relationship with creation. Through pride, the ego-centric self exploits the gifts of creation for its own private interests and profit. The consequences of selfishness are felt even in the cosmic order (or: at the cosmic level).
4. The self is in harmony with God when it is focused toward God as its Creator and is grateful for blessings. However, the experience of the contemporary self finds a sort of tension between a state of nothingness, brokenness, and alienation, on the one hand, and the aching desire for wholeness, integration, and quest for God on the other.
5. Restoration of broken harmony with God, caused by selfishness, is possible because the self has the capacity for transformation. A “connection” can be established with God once again through humility, self-knowledge, and an examination of self-love. During times of discord and conflict, the self is encouraged to “probe” and “go inward to one’s center” as the first step for transformation and a renewed relationship with God.
6. Harmony with others demands a self that demonstrates a sort of transparency with

one's "neighbor." This transparency precludes a self that values openness, acceptance, and trust. This openness becomes the basis for the sharing of faith, hopes, affections, ideals. In a community setting, the self works out the dynamics of these relationships as it strives, together with others, "to be one heart."

7. The self becomes acutely aware of its own shortcomings and limitations in community and needs to collaborate with grace, since harmony with others is not due exclusively to human efforts but is a gift of God. The basic disposition of the self is one of continuous "hunger and thirst" for peace and concord with others.
8. In the midst of tension that is often apparent in a community or group context, the self struggles with others to discover the emergence of a new identity of the "we." This becomes possible when the self values the necessary building-blocks for harmony with others: friendship, humility, dialogue and communication. What the self experiences as inner values must be expressed in a concrete manner through the sharing of goods, an essential condition for harmony.

We have explored the theme of harmony from its various dimensions, especially the new element from the perspective of creation and the design it sets forth regarding the self-in-relation with God and others. We now want to look at how the theme of harmony manifests itself in other components that are constitutive to Augustinian spirituality, namely, prayer and communion.

CHAPTER 4: PRAYER FROM THE HEART AND COMMUNION OF SYMPHONY

The spirituality of the Order of Saint Augustine consists of two fundamental characteristics: interiority and common life. By the term interiority we refer to a generic quality of depth in the Order's spirit.¹ One aspect of interiority is prayer, the act of opening oneself to the divine mystery through Christ. By the phrase "common life," or "life in community," we identify the specific characteristic of breadth in Augustinian life.² An aspect of this characteristic is the nature of communion, a gifted-reality of oneness and purpose. These two characteristics of interiority (depth) and the common life (breadth) cannot oppose each other, but comprise two movements within one dimension of the Order's spirituality identified in the *Rule*: a life of harmony "toward God" and "one mind and heart."³

In this chapter we want to look at how the theme of harmony appears in the context of prayer and communion. If harmony deals with a "rhythm of relationships," then it is fitting to see how these relationships manifest themselves with these two fundamental movements in the Order's spirituality.

¹See P. CARY, "Interiority" in *AA*, pp. 454-456;

²J. OLDFIELD, "The Augustinian charism of the Victorines," *Recollectio* 3 (1980), p. 32: "the generic characteristic of Augustinianism in all of its amplitude is interiority, the specific characteristic of Augustinian monasticism, concludes Manrique, is 'the common life.'" The source cited in Manrique is his *Teología Agustiniiana de la Vida Religiosa*, Biblioteca "La Ciudad de Dios." Real Monasterio de El Escorial, 1964, p. 15.

³*Rule* 1, 2. See G. LAWLESS, "Regula" in *AA*, pp. 707-709, and K. MADIGAN, "Regula, Use after Augustine" in *AA*, pp. 709-710.

The *specific question* we want to ask is: does the Order's tradition receive Augustine's notion of harmony in these two important areas of prayer and communion? This question allows us to scrutinize the tradition and to contribute to the enrichment of this spirituality by retrieving and setting a new direction with those aspects of harmony found in Augustine and in the spiritual writers of the Order. The conclusion summarizes new points related to understanding the self and others in light of these two characteristics.

In this view, primary texts used throughout the chapter are the *Rule*, for its content as a "carrier" of spirituality and as "bridge" between Augustine and the Order's tradition,⁴ and the *Constitutions*, for its interpretation and application of the *Rule* in the context of an apostolic fraternity. Additionally, in treating Augustine's perspective on the theme of harmony, we refer to *De civitate Dei* for the relationship between the self and God, and Chapter Two of the *Rule* where Augustine speaks of prayer as a link between the thoughts and emotions. Other texts are *Epistula* 130, written in 412 to a noble Roman woman, Anicia Faltonia Proba, for its elaboration on the nature of prayer and its method,⁵ and *sermo* 112A

⁴*Const.* 21 identifies the *Rule* as the fundamental document of Augustinian spirituality, complemented by the special characteristics of an apostolic fraternity (service and closeness to the people). G. LAWLESS, "The Enduring Values of the Rule of Saint Augustine," *Angelicum* 59 (1982): pp. 59-78. Lawless identifies nine enduring values: God-centeredness, inwardness, single-mindedness, grace and freedom, prayer, common life, harmony in the house, fraternal correction, love of spiritual beauty. He says these are "characteristic of Augustinian thought generally." See also T. MARTIN, "The Glue of Love: A 'Rule' for Community" in *Our Restless Heart: The Augustinian Tradition*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 2003, pp. 53-72.

⁵P. F. BEATRICE, "Lord's Prayer" in *AA*, pp. 506-509. Regarding the divisions of *Ep* 130: "In the first (1.2-3.8) Augustine develops the interior dispositions for prayer, while the second (4.9-13.24) is devoted to an explanation of the object of prayer" (p. 508). On the art of letter writing in antiquity, see G. KENNEDY, *Greek rhetoric under Christian emperors*. Princeton, N. J. : Princeton University Press, 1983, pp. 71-73. *Epistle* 51 of Gregory of Nazianzus says that "letters should be concise, clear, and charming." The "idea of a letter should be "more Attic than conversation, but more colloquial than the literary language" (p. 72). Atticism is the "principle that the only acceptable model for diction and composition in literary prose is to be found in Athenian writers of the fifth and fourth centuries" (pp. 45-46). Augustine respected the conventional norms of letter writing, respecting the rank of the recipient. See

for its pastoral description of the community of faithful at prayer. *Sermo* 156 on communion is treated for insights on the relationship between the self with God and others.

The final half of the chapter looks at how the Order's tradition received the theme of harmony in Augustine. On the subject of prayer and development of spirituality, we explore the early writings from the German Augustinians, like Herman of Schildesche and Jordan of Saxony's text, *The Life of the Brethren*. From a later period we look at selected writings from Thomas of Villanova's "forgotten" Spanish sermons because the archbishop of Valencia, living in the mid-sixteenth century, is a bridge to the early Augustinian period. Second, Thomas had tremendous influence on the development of the Order's spirituality and on the lives of future Augustinians. We want to look at one of his texts on prayer: "*Plática y aviso al religioso que toma el hábito.*"⁶

On the subject of communion in the Order's tradition, we examine aspects from the oldest commentary on the *Rule*, the *Expositio in Regulam beati Augustini*, from the Victorine tradition⁷ for its impact on the formation of Augustinian spirituality. The recently discovered seventeenth-century commentary on the *Rule* by Ange Le Proust is chosen for its insights on harmony and for the high esteem Luc Verheijen has for the author's

D. DOYLE, *The Bishop as Disciplinarian in the Letters of St. Augustine*. Patristic Studies, vol. 4; G. Bray (ed.). New York: Peter Lang, 2002, p. 5.

⁶"Teaching and advice to a religious who takes the habit." In light of modern psychology and approaches to feelings in prayer, we will keep in mind the important text by A. and B. ULANOV, *Primary Speech. A psychology of prayer*. London: Westminster John Knox Press, 1982, as we examine sixteenth-century attitudes toward prayer.

⁷See MARTIN, *Our Restless Heart*, p. 82f.

understanding of Augustinian communion.⁸ Finally, from the “Plan of Augustinian Formation,” *Ratio* sections 19-30, are chosen for two reasons: their application of Augustinian spirituality in modern times, and the use of “Harmony” as a subtitle in the text, a subject we have already touched upon and significant for this study.

The *objective* for this chapter is to demonstrate that the theme of harmony can enrich Augustinian spirituality by examining how the theme appears in the Order’s defining characteristics of prayer and communion. In Chapter Three we see how Augustine’s notion of harmony involves right relations of ordered love with the self, others, and God. Thus, prayer represents that Christian act of unfolding the self toward God. Communion implies the unfolding of the self toward the other as “other.” The theme of harmony can enrich our perception of these two movements of prayer and communion, as a delicate balanced tension between interior and exterior, as well as a more profound understanding of the self. We now explore these two movements in the bishop’s thought.

I. Augustine: Prayer from the heart and Communion of symphony

Augustine’s notion of harmony is reflected in his understanding of prayer of the heart and communion of symphony. More specifically, within the context of prayer of the heart, we see the harmony of relationships unfold as the self before God, the self’s desires and words, prayer-methods, and the self-with-others as a praying Church.

A. Prayer from the heart: “Words spoken by your lips should also be alive in your hearts”

Before we speak about prayer itself, we need to situate it in the wider context of “interiority.” As a well-known feature in Augustine, interiority refers basically “to

⁸L. VERHEIJEN, *Nouvelle Approche de la Règle de Saint Augustin*. Abbaye de Bellefontaine: Bégrolles en Mauges, 1980, pp. 7-8.

ruminating within myself” (*ruminantem apud me*)⁹ the “search within one’s own heart, one’s own interior life, one’s own conscience.”¹⁰ No less than seven times does the *Rule* identify a movement from the “exterior” to the “interior.”¹¹ This deliberate action of inwardness¹² involves an exploration of inner space, of coming to understand who I am as a person living in the world with others.

This inner space can be called an “auditorium” of the self because it is a place of “listening.” The term “auditorium” comes from *audire*, to “hear.”¹³ We have certain tools, such as journal-keeping or active imagination,¹⁴ to help us “listen” to the resonances (and discord) of feelings and thoughts. Augustine did much of his “inner work” in the late hours of the night.¹⁵ He also saw the creative process of writing linked with prayer: “Meditating

⁹“Quae me seduxit, quia inuenit foris habitantem in oculo carnis meae et talia ruminantem apud me, qualia per illum uorassem” (*Conf.* 3, 6, 11; *CCL* 27, 33). God is present deep within our interior self. “You were more intimately present to me than my innermost being, and higher than the highest peak of my spirit:” (“Tu autem eras interior intimo meo et superior summo meo”) (*Conf.* 3, 6, 11; *CCL* 27, 33).

¹⁰Cf. *Ratio* 52.

¹¹*Ratio* 53 identifies these movements as: “from verbal prayer to prayer of the heart, from physical hunger to hunger for the word of God, from not pleasing by clothes to pleasing by our inner way of life, from seeing to desiring, from a physical wound to a wound in the heart, from appearances to the inner clothing of the heart, from asking forgiveness with words to true forgiveness from the heart.”

¹²For an historical development of “inwardness,” see C. TAYLOR, *Sources of the Self: The Making of the Modern Identity*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1989, especially Part II. For a treatment of interiority in Augustine, see Chapter 7, “In Interiore Homine,” pp. 127-142. See also H. CHADWICK, “Philosophical Tradition and the Self,” in *Late Antiquity: A Guide to the Postclassical World*. Cambridge, Mass.: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1999, pp. 60-81.

¹³See E. PARTRIDGE, *Origins. A Short Etymological Dictionary of Modern English*. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1959, p. 31b: The word “obedience” also shares the same root *ob* + *audire* to form “oboedire.”

¹⁴An excellent work from a Jungian perspective is R. JOHNSON, *Inner Work: Using dreams & active imagination for personal growth*. New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 1986.

¹⁵VERHEIJEN, *Nouvelle Approche*, pp. 258-262 and M. NOLAN, Letter of the Prior General to the Augustinians, *A Cry from the heart. Conversion and Prayer Today*. Rome, 13 November 1987. p. 25.

... I pin down my thoughts with my pen, lest, through forgetfulness, they vanish forever.”¹⁶

“Progress” in this creative process is determined more through “reflection and prayer” than through an over-emphasis on intellectual formation.¹⁷ The danger here is that one can slip into a superficial introspection, a narcissistic dwelling on the ego as the object of reflection.

Interiority involves a constant inquiry of one’s moral life and of unmasking the false self with its subtle deceptions. This inner journey is an elusive adventure in the search for the true self,¹⁸ through the regions of consciousness and the mysterious unconscious, opening the possibility to participate in God’s grace in the unfolding of one’s character and vision of life.¹⁹ From an Augustinian perspective, “let me know myself, let me know you”

¹⁶*Trin.* 1.3.38-41: “Ego tamen ‘in lege domini meditabor,’ si non ‘die ac nocte’ [*Ps.* 1:2], saltem quibus temporum particulis possum, et meditationes meas ne obliuione fugiant stilo alligo.” *Trin.* 3, prol. 19-20: “Egoque ipse multa quae nesciebam scribendo me didicisse confitear;” cf. 1.5.36-38. These texts are quoted in B. STOCK, *Augustine the Reader: Meditation, Self-knowledge, and the Ethics of Interpretation*. Cambridge, Mass.: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1996, pp. 246 and 409, nos. 25-26.

¹⁷Cf. *Ep.* 147,1. Also STOCK, *Augustine the Reader*, pp. 129-130. *Const.* 33-34 calls this process a “work of renewal,” “a lifelong task,” and “diligently working” through interiority, that is, “entering into the depths of our being.”

¹⁸J. SMITH, “Confessions of an Existentialist: Reading Augustine after Heidegger.” *New Blackfriars* 82/096 (2001): pp. 273-282. The “inauthentic” self is misdirected love, absorbed in the world. It is the prodigal self who looks for meaning in the world without transcendence. The “authentic” self “directs its love and finds its meaning in its Creator and is thus defined as *imago Dei*” (p. 278). See T. MERTON, *The Inner Experience. Notes on Contemplation*. Wm. H. Shannon (ed.). New York, NY: HarperSanFrancisco, 2003: The false, exterior self is a “pure fiction, a mere shadow of passionate attachment and of self-deception” (p. 10). The true, or inmost self, consists of the absence of “any aggressive self-assertion: there is only the plain presence of love and of truth.” Like the prodigal, it is “a return to the inmost springs of life and joy. It is a rediscovery of paradise within our own spirit by self-forgetfulness . . . It is the recognition of ourselves as other Christs” (pp. 36-37).

¹⁹Cf. MERTON, *The Inner Experience*, p. 91: “We must become detached from the unreality that is in us in order to be united to the reality that lies deeper within and is our true self – our *inmost* self-in-God.” (Author’s emphasis). From the Greek shrine at Delphi the expression “Know thyself” points in this direction. For an interesting study on this shrine, see the chapter “The Delphic Oracle as Therapist” in R. MAY, *The Courage to Create*. New York: W. W. Norton & Co., 1975, (reprint 1994), pp. 95-111.

-- (*noverim me, noverim te*)²⁰ -- describes not only the tone of interiority, but, like musical sound, its dynamic rises from and ends in the silence of God that is not absence but presence. Through intensive listening, like listening to a symphony, we discover not only ourselves, but God's self-disclosure and presence reverberating in the "other."

When we speak of interiority, then, we refer to the inner space as a "stepping stone"²¹ to where an encounter of silence and dialogue between God and the self become possible and the fruit of this encounter is shared with others.²² Interiority is the environment for the action of prayer.

1. *Self before God: a "faithful will"*

Augustine's shortest definition of prayer may be the following: "Your prayer is a speaking to God. When you read [the scriptures], God speaks to you; when you pray, you speak to God."²³ The basic law of prayer finds expression in his *Rule*: "When you pray to God in psalms and songs, the words spoken by your lips should be alive in your hearts."²⁴

²⁰CLARKE, "St. Augustine and Cosmic Redemption," p. 163. See H. MARROU, *Saint Augustine and His Influence through the Ages*. P. Hepburne-Scott (trans.), translation of *Saint Augustin et l'augustinisme*. Paris: Éditions du Seuil, 1957. New York and London: Harper Torchbooks, 1957, pp. 72-73.

²¹MERTON, *The Inner Experience*, p. 11: "In Christianity the inner self is simply a stepping stone to an awareness of God." See A. CARR, *A Search for Wisdom and Spirit. Thomas Merton's Theology of the Self*. Notre Dame, Ind.: Notre Dame University Press, 1988.

²²*Const.* 35: "common prayer should flow from the abundance of the intimate sharing of the friars."

²³"Oratio tua locutio est ad Deum; quando legis, Deus tibi loquitur; quando oras, Deo loqueris" (*En ps.* 85, 7; *CCL* 39, 1182). A.-M. BESNARD, *Saint Augustin: Prier Dieu. Les Psaumes*. Paris: Les Éditions du Cerf, 1994, p. 22, n. 1: "Cette idée est un bien commun de la tradition patristique. On la retrouve en de multiples endroits, chez saint Jérôme, saint Grégoire; le Moyen Age lui fera une fortune. La lecture dont il s'agit est, avant tout, la lecture de la Bible. La *lectio divina* se vit selon le rythme primordial *lectio-oratio*."

²⁴"Psalmis et hymnis cum oratis Deum, hoc versetur in corde quod profertur in voce" (*Regula* II, 12; *Rule* 2,3).

Prayer demands an inner/outer harmony of the desires of the heart with the mind. There is no room for dualism; prayer involves the harmonious relationship of the whole self (body-psyche-spirit) directed to God alone.

The pastor of souls speaks of *harmonia* in reference to David's admiration for music, which is not found in the sound of notes and chords but a single-mindedness toward God alone. "He loved the harmony of music (*harmoniam musicam*) not for the sake of vulgar pleasure, but with a faithful will (*sed fideli uoluntate*)."²⁵ Harmony deals with "rightly-ordered relationships," as we have already seen in the previous chapter. David has rightly ordered love of the "faithful will" directed to God alone.²⁶ The self stands before God, as creature to the Creator. Similarly, Augustine tells Lady Proba to "pray as a widow belonging to Christ,"²⁷ for the human heart "ascends" (*ascendere*) to God in proportion to one's desire, faith and life of virtue.²⁸ What is this human heart that ascends?

2. *Self's desires and words: harmony of heart and mind*

Prayer, for Augustine, is more than an intellectual pursuit of words; rather, the praying-self is more like a dance of the mind and heart, and indeed, the whole self toward the love of God. When we speak of the "heart" ascending, or the "prayer from the heart,"

²⁵"Erat autem Dauid uir in canticis eruditus, qui harmoniam musicam non uulgari uoluptate, sed fideli uoluntate dilexerit ea que deo suo, qui uerus est deus, mystica rei magnae figuratione seruierit. Diuersorum enim sonorum rationabilis moderatusque concentus concordii uarietate compactam bene ordinatae ciuitatis insinuat unitatem" (*civ Dei* 17, 14; *CCL* 48, 578). Cf. CICERO, *De rep.* 2, 42, 69.

²⁶ P. DE LUIS, "Comentario de la Regla de San Agustín." *Estudio Agustiniiano* 36 (2001): p. 527, note 139: Verheijen is cited as saying that the interior truth of prayer is most important and that our whole life is to be like a song. Music in this sense is very relative. The notion of the "faithful will" can be compared to the instrument called a "monochord" and its directness of a single note, as we will see later in the section on "Communion."

²⁷"Ora sicut uidua Christi" (*Ep.* 130, 29; *CSEL* 44, 73-74).

²⁸"Quia cor hominis illus debet ascendere" (*Ep.* 130, 17; *CSEL* 44, 59-60).

we refer to the whole self, of which *desire* is a component.²⁹ Before we explore Augustine's view of prayer as a harmony of heart and mind, we need to explore more deeply his notion of desire.

Desire (*libido*) is neither a good nor an evil; it simply is. From this perspective Augustine leaves behind the Greek understanding and "views the cardinal passions, desire and delight, fear and grief, not as eruptions into the mind from the irrational part of the soul or from the body but as affective modalities of will."³⁰ What factors influence the will and subsequent choices? Human will is attracted by the object of "delight" (*delectationes*) that it knows and the force of desire necessarily moves the will (choice) into the direction of greater pleasure, sweetness, or attraction of joy. The will that constantly gives consent to similar desires begins to follow a pattern of choices that inevitably lead to "habit" (*consuetudo*),³¹ and when habit is not resisted by the will, it acquires a new force of necessity.³² Fluctuations of the human will, desire, delight, and habit are components of a psychological process on how we make choices. This process demonstrates how the will can give rise to tensions within the human person and in society. Augustine's conversion

²⁹T. HAND, *Augustine on Prayer*. New York: Catholic Book Publishing Co., 1963 (new edition 1986), p. 78: "Augustine uses the term 'heart' in a scriptural sense. For him it signifies . . . our whole interior and spiritual life, and it includes mind and will, knowledge and love."

³⁰S. DUFFY, "Anthropology" in *AA*, p. 29.

³¹A. FITZGERALD, "Habit (*consuetudo*)" in *AA*, pp. 409-411. The term *consuetudo* is used more than 950 times and it refers to the manner in which one chooses to use created things. "Augustine speaks of four stages: first, pleasure in the heart, followed by consent, then action, then habit" (cf. *s.* 98, 6) (p. 409). Habit deals with personal choices.

³²"The truth is that disordered lust springs from a perverted will; when lust is pandered to, a habit is formed; when habit is not checked, it hardens into compulsion:" "Quippe ex uoluntate peruersa facta est libido, et dum seruitur libidini, facta est consuetudo, et dum consuetudini non resistitur, facta est necessitas" (*Conf.* 8, 5, 10; *CCL* 27, 119).

is a case in point.

Book eight of the *Confessiones*, the story of Augustine's conversion, illustrates how desire is operative and affects the powers of volition. Different desires clash and cause inner turmoil. The point of Book eight can be deceptive, however. Augustine reads St. Paul³³ and finds a resolution to his conflicting desires and torturous will, between the disordered desires toward "flesh" and the lust for power (*libido carnalis* and *libido dominandi*) and the ordered desire towards the love (*caritas*) and longing for God. Interior struggles have not been eliminated, rather, there is a shift in the balance of power, caused by the gift of grace, toward divine delight. Desires for things of the Spirit have greater influence over the flesh and things temporal.³⁴ The tension remains.

From another perspective, when Augustine speaks of creation-from-nothing, he uses existential language to describe this "tension" where the human person is "poised between two movements," between existence and nothingness.³⁵ To turn the will toward God

³³Romans 13:13: "Not in dissipation and drunkenness, nor in debauchery and lewdness, nor in arguing and jealousy; but put on the Lord Jesus Christ, and make no provisions for the flesh or the gratification of your desires" (cf. *Conf.* 8, 12, 29).

³⁴On the interpretation of *Conf.* 8 and the ongoing struggle between desires, see W. BABCOCK, "Augustine and the Spirituality of Desire." *Augustinian Studies* 25 (1994): pp. 188-189. This division between flesh and spirit is not a metaphysical distinction but a moral one rooted in the biblical notion of "flesh." "Flesh" does not necessarily mean sensual indulgence, but the moving away from a superior good. Pride and self-centeredness are examples of tendencies of the flesh and they undermine the harmony of the common good. The relationship between will and desire is treated more extensively in Chapter 5 in the discussion on the Self.

³⁵C. HARRISON, "Augustine and Religious Experience." *Louvain Studies* 27 (2002): p. 104. Augustine's "existential" language seems to say that experience has sufficient authority in itself, and does not need any Scriptural or doctrinal endorsement. Harrison says, "This is something Pelagius was later to object to, especially in relation to the idea of original sin. Against Pelagius' insistence on the authority of Scripture, Augustine reflects, 'it is not wrong to add something which we do not read. After all, we can, as reliable witnesses, add something that we have experienced, even if we may not read it' (*De natura et gratia*, 248 of Teske in New City Press)."

(*conversio*), eternal realities, the good and the beautiful consists of fuller existence; to turn away towards temporality and mutability (*aversio*), taking creation as the Creator, is self-destruction.³⁶ The movement towards “nothing” is “whatever is flowing, dissolving, melting and so to speak, perpetually perishing.”³⁷

Such strife caused by the will suspended between “nothingness and existence” is perceived by Augustine as a wound or a sickness. The person of faith has the capacity to move beyond the wound and find healing that comes through Christ, the divine Physician.³⁸ Spiritual health for the one who aspires to being, wisdom and integration involves the collaboration with grace (*gratia cooperans*)³⁹ which does not destroy personal freedom.⁴⁰ The dominant influence on desire, which affects and pulls the will like gravity, is the delight found in the eternal joy of God. Desire moves in the direction of greater delight (that is either delight in selfish or self-giving love). Unlike pride and subsequent fragmentation of the self, desire that has properly ordered love as its source finds integration and harmony between human choices and the heart’s hunger and thirst for God.

In summary, opposing tendencies of pride or excessive self-love and love of charity

³⁶HARRISON, “Augustine and Religious Experience,” pp. 105-106. Prior to the *Confessiones*, Augustine uses an existential type language to describe the fragile situation the human being finds itself, that is, a language of “nothingness and existence” or the tendency to turn away from God or the will turned towards God as Creator. Later, after the writing of *Confessiones*, Augustine couches the same idea (*conversio* vs. *aversio*) in scriptural/doctrinal language of the Fall of Adam and Eve (*aversio*) in *Genesis*.

³⁷“Nihil est enim omne, quod fluit, quod soluitur, quod liquescit et quasi semper perit” (*De beata vita* I, 8; *CCL* 29, 70).

³⁸*Const.* 33: “We are his image for the very reason that we are capable of possessing him and able to share his being.”

³⁹See M. SCANLON, “The Augustinian Tradition: A Retrieval.” *Augustinian Studies* 20 (1989): p. 72.

⁴⁰*Const.* 30: “In the Augustinian community personality does not lose its identity.”

are not eliminated, but a balanced tension is maintained where life in the Spirit becomes an awareness of delight and choice, in grace. “You stir us so that praising you may bring us joy, because you have made us and drawn us to yourself, and our heart is unquiet until it rests in you.”⁴¹ Since the beginning of creation, we are poised between tendencies toward nothingness and existence. Yet we naturally “vibrate” for God, the fulness of Being. To move toward God, or away, is a matter of choice, a movement of the will, a moral act, of which we cannot escape from making.⁴² The manner in which we learn how to make the right choices and follow our rightly ordered desires, or “vibration,” is a function of prayer and yearning desire is the music of the heart.⁴³ Prayer is a matter of being in *tune* with what *stirs* us from within our inner auditorium.⁴⁴

Since we have explored the notion of desire, we continue with Augustine’s reflection on prayer from the heart as an action of the whole self, heart and mind.⁴⁵ Like Paul, at times we cannot find words to express what is stirring within us, but the Spirit prays in us with “groans.”⁴⁶ Augustine says in a sermon given around 410: “Desire (*desiderium*) is praying always, even if the tongue is silent. If you desire always, you are praying always.

⁴¹“Tu excitas, ut laudare te delectet, quia fecisti nos ad te et inquietum est cor nostrum, donec requiescat in te” (*Conf.* 1, 1, 1; *CCL* 27, 1).

⁴²See *S.* 140, 3. Also, HARRISON, “Augustine and Religious Experience,” p. 106.

⁴³J.-L. VESCO, “Psaumes en Prière.” *Revue Thomiste* 108 (1999), p. 332: “Dans la Bible, le cœur est l’équivalent de toute la personnalité humaine dont le psaume est la musique” (cf. *Ps* 77, 7).

⁴⁴Emphasis is mine.

⁴⁵“Sed laudate de totis uobis; id est, ut non sola lingua et uox uestra laudet Deum, sed et conscientia uestra, uita uestra, facta uestra . . . Nam si a uita bona numquam declines, lingua tua tacet, uita tua clamat; et aures Dei ad cor tuum” (*En ps.* 148, 2; *CCL* 40, 2166; cf. *Ratio* 49).

⁴⁶*Rom.* 8: 26 NIV: “the Spirit helps us in our weakness. We do not know how we ought to pray, but the Spirit himself intercedes for us with groans that words cannot express.”

When does prayer nod off to sleep? When desire grows cold.”⁴⁷ To say that “longing” is our prayer, then, means that desire – or the cry of our affections – emerges from the human heart.⁴⁸ It is the stirring from the heart’s depths that hungers, thirsts, vibrates and praises God, and at the same time, it is God who listens to the movements of desire in the heart. Prayer is authentic when our words are in tune with the heart and give voice to these deepest yearnings. Often, these yearnings are muted. Augustine highlights this equilibrium between the heart’s desires and the words used in prayer in a sermon on *Psalms* 119.

It is to the heart that God’s ear is bent . . . Many who pray with closed lips are heard, while many who are very vocal are not heard. It is with the heart that we must pray.⁴⁹

Like the arrangement of two musical tones producing a feeling of rest, harmony, then, deals with how our prayer articulates the emotions and thoughts in the soul’s core where the “ear of God is directed to the human heart.” To do otherwise is to offer God a fragmented “muted” heart of noisy dissonance rather than the whole self.

The prayer of the whole self, sparked by movements of love, has an inward/outward dimension toward God and others. In a homily after 400, Augustine tells his congregation in Hippo:

⁴⁷“Desiderium semper orat, etsi lingua taceat. Si semper desideras, semper oras. Quando dormitat oratio? Quando frigerit desiderium” (*S.* 80, 7: *PL* 38, 498).

⁴⁸See *En ps.* 141, 2. In our own time, this idea of “longing” is reiterated by Lonergan’s assertion that men and women are “unrestricted eros.” See B. LONERGAN, *Method in Theology*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, c. 1971 (reprinted 1996), pp. 13 and 103. R. MALONEY, “The Person as Subject of Spirituality in the Writings of Bernard Lonergan.” *Milltown Studies* 45 (2000): p. 68: To live authentically implies “being in love with God.”

⁴⁹“Quia ad cor hominis aures Dei . . . Multi clauso ore exaudiuntur, et multi in magnis clamoribus non exaudiuntur. Affectibus orare debemus” (*En ps.* 119, 9; *CCL* 37, 1785; cf. *Conf.* 1, 1, 1). BESNARD, *Saint Augustin: Prier Dieu*, p. 12. Augustine gave the greater part of *En ps.* in Carthage, not in Hippo. Cf. G. MADEC, “Cor” in *AL*, vol. 2, fasc. 1-2, Basel, 1996, col. 1-6.

So if my sermon has found in your hearts just a *spark (scintillam)* of such *spontaneous love of God (gratuiti amoris Dei)*, nurse it carefully. Tell yourselves urgently to increase it by prayer, . . . a praiseworthy way of life, loyal friendship . . . When it grows, and bursts into flame . . . then it burns up the straw of all the greedy desires of the flesh.⁵⁰

The “spark” is often that unique human experience of love associated with spirituality and the notion of the “art of living” and virtue.⁵¹ If one does not have attentive listening to the subtlety of the invitation to conversion, the sparks of love vanish into nothingness. Another danger is that one can become too involved with the method of prayer and blind to the difference between the spark that comes from the ego and one from the inspiration of the Spirit. Does Augustine say anything about prayer-methods and how to recognize the spark that is the love of God?

3. *Prayer-methods: fostering “fervor of desire”*

Augustine did not leave us a manual on how to pray.⁵² However, he sketches the contours of a prayer life without putting a stranglehold on creativity and freedom. In the letter to Proba he encourages reflection on the “Lord’s prayer” (*dominica oratione*) -- “that gospel prayer” (*istam euangelicam precem*) -- as a practical guide on how to pray, for this is the “method” given to us by Jesus.⁵³ Since prayer is not just words, but an encounter in

⁵⁰“Si ergo sermo meus invenit in cordibus vestris aliquam scintillam gratuiti amoris Dei, ipsam nutrite: ad hanc augendam vos advocate prece . . . conversatione laudabili, amicitia fideli . . . ipsa cum creverit, et flammam . . . fecerit, omnium cupiditatum carnalium fena consumit” (*S.* 178, 11; *PL* 38, 966). Emphasis is mine.

⁵¹See *Civ Dei* 19, 1.

⁵²R. WEAVER, “Prayer” in *AA*, p. 670.

⁵³“Nam quaelibet alia uerba dicamus, quae affectus orantis uel praededendo format, ut clareat, uel consequendo attendit, ut crescat, nihil aliud dicimus, quam quod in ista dominica oratione positum est, si recte et congruenter oramus. Quisquis autem id dicit, quod ad istam euangelicam precem pertinere non possit, etiamsi non inlicite orat, carnaliter orat, quod nescio quem ad modum non dicatur inlicite, quando quidem spiritu renatos non nisi spiritualiter deceat orare” (*Ep* 130, 22; *CSEL* 44, 64-65; Cf. *Lk.* 11: 1-4).

faith of the whole person, the pastor recommends the discipline of interior preparation for prayer: “the effect following upon prayer will be excellent in proportion to the fervor of the desire which precedes its utterance.”⁵⁴ This preparatory step implies: What feelings (love, fear, hope, joy) do I bring to prayer?

Augustine gives minimal structure and emphasizes to the value of praying. Directions for prayer in the *Rule* (Chapter Two) consist of only four sentences: pray at the appointed times, use the oratory only for prayer, listen to your heart and mind, and have order to your singing. Engagement with the language of the scriptures gives shape and direction to our desires. The words of the psalms, for example, mold the conscience of the person who uses them.⁵⁵ The rest is open to the freedom and creativity of each person who lives in accordance with the scriptures. In addition, one characteristic in Augustine is that the monastic path to prayer is certainly not one of contemplative tranquillity and “prayer of silence,” for the heart is never quiet because love is never silent.⁵⁶ Restless desire is the heartbeat of prayer and fervor of the praying-self in company with others.

4. *Self-with-others: the sound of “symphonia”*

“Each day, with one heart, they regularly went to the Temple but met in their houses

BESNARD, *Saint Augustin, Prier Dieu*, p. 11: “Le Pater: Règle de la Prière.” “La prière ne s’est nullement présentée à saint Augustin comme un pur exercice ascétique ou une peineuse obligation de piété, elle fut dès le commencement la respiration de sa foi. C’est la foi qui prie” (p. 9). WEAVER, “Prayer,” p. 672: “For the Christian the Lord’s Prayer is, of course, the paradigm for prayer.” See also BEATRICE, “Lord’s Prayer,” pp. 506-509.

⁵⁴“Dignior enim sequitur effectus, quem feruentior praecedat affectus” (*Ep.* 130, 18; *CSEL* 44, 60).

⁵⁵WEAVER, “Prayer,” p. 672.

⁵⁶B. HACKETT, “Augustine and Prayer: Theory and Practice.” *Second Annual Course on Augustinian Spirituality, Rome, July 1-17, 1976*. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1976, p. 180.

for the breaking of the bread.”⁵⁷ Through the inspiration of the Jerusalem Church, Augustine gave special importance to prayer in common, that is, prayer with others, united by a shared spiritual goal. Praying the psalms is a “school of prayer.”⁵⁸ “Human beings are able to join together into a religious community only if they are bound to one another by a common sharing in visible signs or saving mysteries.”⁵⁹ In a sermon the pastor compares the diversity of the community to musical instruments: “You are the trumpets, harps, zithers, kettledrums, strings, flutes, and cymbolas of a song of praise in which all produce a glorious sound because they are in harmony (*consonantia*).”⁶⁰

What constitutes this harmony of the praying Church? Both communal and individual prayer bring people together when they “lift up their hearts” to God, like David’s “faithful will.”

To Him, we owe the service which in Greek is called *latreia*, whether this be expressed through certain sacraments or performed within our selves. For we are His temple, each of us and every one of us together, since He deigns to dwell both in the whole harmonious body (*concordiam*) and in each of us singly . . . Our heart is His altar when we lift it up to Him.⁶¹

⁵⁷*Acts* 2:46 JB.

⁵⁸BESNARD, *Saint Augustin: Prier Dieu*, p. 16: “une école de prière.”

⁵⁹“In nullum autem nomen religionis, seu uerum, seu falsum, coagulari homines possunt, nisi aliquo signaculorum uel sacramentorum uisibilium consortio conligentur” (*C. Faust.* 19, 11; *CSEL* 25-1, 510).

⁶⁰“Vos estis tuba, psalterium, cithara, tympanum, chorus, chordae, et organum, et cymbala iubilationis bene sonantia, quia consonantia” (*En ps.* 150, 8; *CCL* 40, 2196). Cf. ZUMKELLER, *Augustine’s Rule. A Commentary*. M. J. O’Connell (trans.) and J. E. Rotelle (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1987, p. 55.

⁶¹“Huic nos seruitutem, quae *λατρεία* Graece dicitur, siue in quibusque sacramentis siue in nobis ipsis debemus. Huius enim templum simul omnes et singuli templa sumus, quia et omnium concordiam et singulos inhabitare dignatur . . . Cum ad illum sursum est, eius est altare cor nostrum” (*Civ Dei* 10, 3; *CCL* 47, 275).

Divine presence resides in both the concord of the community and the individual person. What constitutes the praying Church is the refinement of the heart's desires toward God while we, as a community, continue our faith journey through this life. This refinement occurs when "we lift" our heart to God on Christ's altar of sacrifice, for the sacrifice of love commands us to change our habits, behavior, and attitudes that tend to be egocentric. The harmony of the praying Church invites inner transformation.

The effects of common prayer encourage *metanoia*. In *Sermo* 112A, delivered between 411 and 420 at the rebuilt basilica in Carthage, Augustine preaches about the prodigal son's return to his father's house, a symbol of the praying Church, his heart is moved by the "sound of symphony" (*symphonia sonans*).

What does "symphony" mean? A concord of voices. Those who engage in discord are out of tune; those who enjoy concord are in tune with each other. The apostle was teaching the **art of symphony** when he said, . . . *and not to have schisms among you* (1 Cor 1:10).⁶²

The Church at prayer demonstrates the "art of symphony," or a certain "rhythm of relationships," especially when it takes into consideration the wandering experience of the "prodigal self."⁶³ Desire is stimulated away from loss and nothingness toward a greater delight -- the pleasant music of a "choir" singing together -- a motif inviting interior change and transcendence.⁶⁴

⁶²“Quid est symphonia? Concordia vocum: qui discordant, dissonant; qui concordant, consonant. Ipsam symphoniam docebat apostolus, dicens . . . *et non sint in vobis schismata*” (S. 112A,9; PLS 2, 431). Translator's note: “Augustine is explaining the Greek word *symphonia*, which was transliterated in his Latin text; so I keep its English derivative here” (*Sermons*, WSA III/4, p. 163, note 19). Emphasis is mine.

⁶³SMITH, “*Confessions of an Existentialist*,” p. 278.

⁶⁴See GUZELIMIAN, *Parallels and Paradoxes*, pp. 46-47: A similar “lost and found” motif can be heard in the language of Classical music, as one sees in Barenboim's analysis of harmonics. A similar theme of being attracted to the Easter chants of a Church choir can be found in Berlioz's “La Damnation

An aspect of this art is the prayer of petition for those “out of tune.” Augustine’s letter to Proba, a war refugee, illustrates the duty of Christians to pray for their friends, strangers, and even enemies.⁶⁵ In situations of adversity, we may not know what to pray for nor how to be free from the trials we are in. Paul’s plea to remove the thorn in his flesh is a model for responding to trials which exist “to heal the swelling of pride, or to prove and exercise patience.”⁶⁶ If God does not answer us, we should not feel neglected. Rather, we live “in patient endurance of evil, hope to be made partakers of greater good, for so His strength is perfected in our weakness.”⁶⁷ It is the Spirit who “inspires us with longings”⁶⁸ for that which is unknown and which we wait for with patience. The art of symphony involves *metanoia* for all those who hear the music of many singers.

The same letter indicates certain conditions and attitudes of the self for the “symphony” of common prayer. Augustine hints at the importance of peace and order in the house and how it affects prayer: “even though she . . . conducts her household piously, entreating all dear to her to put their hope in God: and in the midst of all this, she says in

de Faust.” The “Légende dramatique” (not an opera) is available at World Wide Web @ <http://ourworld.compuserve.com/homepage/har/faust.htm>

⁶⁵“Haec et pro nobis et pro nostris et pro alienis atque ipsis inimicis sine fluctu dubitationis oranda sunt” (*Ep.* 130, 23; *CSEL* 44, 66). Tertullian says: “All people love their friends, but only Christians love their enemies” (*Ad Scapulam* 1:3). Christians are “different” in the sense that they focus on love of one’s enemies. See E. BIANCHI, *Words for the Inner Life*, Ottawa, Ont.: Novalis, 2002, p. 175.

⁶⁶“Uel ad sanandum tumorem superbiae uel ad probandam exercendamue patientiam” (*Ep.* 130, 25; *CSEL* 44, 68; cf. 2 *Cor.* 12:7-9).

⁶⁷“Sed potius pia patientia malorum bona speremus ampliora. Sic enim uirtus in infirmitate perficitur” (*Ep.* 130, 26; *CSEL* 44, 70).

⁶⁸“Inspirans eis desiderium” (*Ep.* 130, 28; *CSEL* 44, 73).

her prayer, ‘my soul thirsts for You’.⁶⁹ Prayer must not conflict with the work schedule of the house.⁷⁰ Each person, as a self-in-relation, contributes to this order when she relates with love to the other as “other.”

Emulate each other in prayer with a holy rivalry, . . . Let each one do what she can; what one cannot herself do, she does by another who can do it, if she loves in another that which personal inability alone hinders her from doing . . . For your conscience is responsible to God; to each other owe nothing but mutual love.⁷¹

Taking the other into account results in invisible bonds and a unity of persons. Even in solitude or apart from the community, one does not work alone. The person who lacks a talent is complemented by the companion who does. Common prayer lifts the community beyond its material and pragmatic dimensions to a higher plane of friendship. The spirit of a praying community is the “mutual love” found in friendship. “Whatever, therefore, be our circumstances in this world, there is nothing truly enjoyable without a friend.”⁷² The fruit of common prayer is the potential to create the harmony of deep friendships as an Easter people.

⁶⁹“Etiam quae filios et nepotes habet et domum suam pie tractat, agens cum omnibus suis, ut ponant in deo spem suam, dicit tamen in oratione: Sitiuit tibi anima mea” (*Ep.* 130, 5; *CSEL* 44, 46).

⁷⁰“Quae cum ita sint, etiam diu orare, cum uacat, id est cum alia bonarum et necessariarum actionum non impediuntur officia, quamuis et in eis, ut dixi, desiderio illo semper orandum sit, non est improbum nec inutile” (*Ep.* 130, 19; *CSEL* 44, 61-62).

⁷¹“Orate certatim concordi sanctoque certamine; . . . faciat quaeque uestrum, quod poterit; quod altera minus potest, ea, quae potest, faciat, si in altera diligit, quod ideo, quia non potest ipsa, non facit. . . conscientiam quippe uestrum deo debetis; nemini autem uestrum aliquid debeatis, nisi ut inuicem diligatis” (*Ep.* 130, 31; *CSEL* 44, 76-77).

⁷²The lines that follow indicate how difficult it is to know the self: “But how rarely is one found in this life about whose spirit and behaviour as a true friend there may be perfect confidence! For no one is known to another so intimately as he is known to himself, and yet no one is so well known even to himself that he can be sure as to his own conduct on the morrow.” “Ita in quibuslibet rebus humanis nihil est homini amicum sine homine amico. Sed quousque talis inuenitur, de cuius anima et moribus sit in hac uita certa securitas? Nam sicut sibi quisque nemo alter alteri notus est et tamen nec sibi quisque ita notus est, ut sit de sua crastina conuersatione securus” (*Ep.* 130, 4; *CSEL* 44, 44).

Chanting the *Alleluia*, comprising the outward social dimension toward people in need, is another expression of the fruit of common prayer. So important is this coherence between communal prayer and social action Augustine makes this commentary on *Psalms* 149:

Why . . . take in hand the tympanum and the psalter? The reason is that, not only may the tongue give praise, but also our works . . . When you sing Alleluia, you must give bread to the hungry . . . By doing this, not only does your voice sing, but also your hands will be in harmony with your voice, insofar as your deeds are in accord with your words.⁷³

In a homily preached during the Easter season the pastor of souls says:

That, surely, is how God wants *alleluia* to be sung to him, so that there is no discord in the singer. So first of all let there be harmony in ourselves between tongues and lives, between mouths and consciences. Let our voices, I repeat, be in harmony with our behavior, or else it may happen that good voices are witnesses against bad behavior. O blissful *alleluia* in heaven, where the angels are God's temple! There, I mean, supreme harmony reigns among those who are praising, because there is no anxiety about their exultant singing.⁷⁴

How do we sing with our life? We sing with acts of charity as the dominant melody in our prayer. To make one's life a song within a "symphony," rather than a cacophony, requires the discipline and skill of an *art*. Singing our "alleluia" as an Easter people invites the transformation of discordant voices, anticipates the fulfillment of our prayer of praise at the journey's end, and becomes the goal of the "art" of communion and Christian living.

B. Communion with one another, on the way

⁷³"Quare assumit tympanum et psalterium? Vt non sola uox laudet, sed et opera . . . si quando Alleluia cantas, porrigas et panem esurienti . . . non sola uox sonat, sed et manus consonat, quia uerbis facta concordant" (*En ps.* 149, 8; *CCL* 40, 2183).

⁷⁴"Sic enim sibi dici vult Deus Alleluia, ut non sit in laudante discordia. Concordent ergo prius in nobis ipsis lingua cum vita, os cum conscientia. Concordent, inquam, voces cum moribus, ne forte bonae voces testimonium dicant contra malos mores. O felix Alleluia in coelo, ubi templum Dei Angeli sunt! Ibi enim concordia summa laudantium, ubi est exultatio secura cantantium: ubi nulla lex in membris repugnat legi mentis" (*S.* 256, 1; *PL* 38, 1190).

Augustine encouraged fellow Christians to lead lives of communion (*concordia*). We can illustrate this approach of communion from the present-communion with one another, on the way toward the “perpetual Sabbath,” the dynamism of communion as convergence, and broken communion as discord. Pastoral texts, such as *sermons* 156, 355 and 356, relate to the application of the theme of harmony in concrete instances of the Church’s life.

1. *Present-communion: toward the “perpetual Sabbath”*

The future guides our living in the present. The goal or endpoint of the Christian journey,⁷⁵ for Augustine, is to “dwell in the house of God,” who is “highest good” (*summum bonum*), “highest wisdom” (*summa sapientia*), and “highest concord” (*summa concordia*).⁷⁶ In God there is “no discord, no confusion, shifting, no indigence, no death, where there is supreme concord, supreme evidence, supreme steadfastness, supreme fullness, and life supreme.”⁷⁷ The Trinitarian God is a communion of relations and people of faith are reminded to reflect this communion in their lives with one another.⁷⁸

Communion of relations on the earthly journey anticipates the eternal felicity in the

⁷⁵MARTIN, *Our Restless Heart*, p. 25: “I propose that it is with the notion of ‘the journey’ (*peregrinatio*) that one finds a key to understanding and living Augustinian spirituality.”

⁷⁶ “Sed hunc amorem non cuiuslibet sed dei esse diximus, id est summi boni summae sapientiae summae que concordiae” (*mor.* 15, 25; *CSEL* 90, 30). See *Civ Dei* 22, 30.

⁷⁷“Ubi nulla discrepantia, nulla confusio, nulla transitio, nulla indigentia, nulla mors, ubi summa concordia, summa evidentia, summa constantia, summa plenitudo, summa vita” (*Solil.* I, 4; *CSEL* 89, 7).

⁷⁸We recall on pages 24, 27-28, that the “meaning of life” is constituted by an understanding of how we live our lives in view of our ultimate destiny and what constitutes a commitment to that particular goal.

P. HENRY, *Saint Augustine on Personality*. The Saint Augustine Lecture 1959. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1960, p. 23: “Augustine teaches us that the person, while being an absolute, *absolute in se persona dicitur*, is also and essentially a being *ad alium*, related to others, open to others, and defined as person by this very relativity.”

City of God, or what Augustine describes in the last book of *De Civitate Dei* as the “perpetual Sabbath” (*maximum sabbatum*). “For what other end do we set for ourselves than to reach that kingdom of which there is no end?”⁷⁹ Once we reach the end of our journey “we will be free to give ourselves up to the praise of God.” What will this praise look like? The communion of relationships between human beings in the future life will resemble the union of diverse parts of the body that is now glorified. This communion Augustine calls “harmony.”

When the body is made incorruptible, all the members and inward parts which we now see assigned to their various necessary offices will join together in praising God; for there will then be no necessity, but only full, certain, secure and everlasting felicity. For all those elements of the body’s harmony of which I have spoken, those harmonies (*harmoniae*) which are now hidden, will then be hidden no longer.⁸⁰

Eternal life will be common to all in the way that the different members of the body are organically connected together. There will be distinctions but each one will be satisfied according to his or her position in the eternal City. Peace, the “tranquillity of order,” and concord will be the mark of the citizen of the heavenly realm where there is the “enjoyment of God, and of one another in God”⁸¹ and “no one will suffer enmity either within himself or from anyone else.”⁸²

⁷⁹“Nam quis alius noster est finis nisi peruenire ad regnum, cuius nullus est finis?” (*Civ Dei* 22, 30; *CCL* 48, 866).

⁸⁰“Omnia membra et uiscera incorruptibilis corporis, quae nunc uidemus per usus necessitatis uarios distributa, quoniam tunc non erit ipsa necessitas, sed plena certa, secura sempiterna felicitas, proficient laudibus Dei. Omnes quippe illi, de quibus iam sum locutus, qui nunc latent, harmoniae corporalis numeri non latebunt” (*Civ Dei* 22, 30; *CCL* 48, 862).

⁸¹“Pax caelestis ciuitatis ordinatissima et concordissima societas fruendi Deo et inuicem in Deo, pax omnium rerum tranquillitas ordinis” (*Civ Dei* 19, 13; *CCL* 48, 679). Chapter 13 is the celebrated chapter on peace.

⁸²“Uera pax, ubi nihil aduersi nec a se ipso nec ab aliquo quisque patietur” (*Civ Dei* 22, 30; *CCL* 48, 862-863).

Augustine the pastor was so convinced of the value of communion directed toward life's end that he made this daring statement in one of his sermons:

What do I want? What do I wish? . . . Only with this intention, that together we may live with Christ . . . But I don't want to be saved without you.⁸³

The struggle to live in communion with others and in peace in the present reflects the hope that perfect communion and peace will be possessed in the future. Augustine's *Rule* renders us a kind of compass that steers the community toward that end.⁸⁴

The notion of communion is so vital in Augustine's vision of life that he inserts it in the beginning of his *Rule*: "Before all else, *live together in harmony (Ps. 68:7), being of one mind and one heart (Acts 4:32).*"⁸⁵ What follows, as we recall, is more than just an afterthought, but an integral component of the *anima una* that necessitates common ownership of material goods.⁸⁶ Oneness of mind and heart engenders the harmony of the outward expression of oneness with possessions.⁸⁷

Therefore, monks were not to own private property because to do so would be a

⁸³"Quid autem uolo? Quid desidero? . . . Nisi hac intentione, ut cum Christo simul uiuamus? . . . Sed nolo saluus esse sine uobis" (*S.* 17, 2; *CCL* 41, 238).

⁸⁴LAWLESS, "The Enduring Values," p. 77: Augustine refers to his *Rule* as a "mirror" that is to be read once a week. Lawless says: "If we forget the *Rule*, we have lost one eye; if we ignore the *Rule*, we have lost both eyes." The term *Rule* comes from the Latin *regula*, meaning "a straight piece of wood," itself derived from *regere* = "to direct" (*rex*). A *Rule* provides the necessary support and daily structure for a community to orientate itself toward goals and ideals. On the historical development of a "rule," see D. STEINDL-RAST and S. LEBELL, *Music of Silence: A sacred journey through the hours of the day*. Berkeley, Ca.: Seastone, 1998, 2002, p. 6.

⁸⁵*Rule* 1, 2.

⁸⁶*Rule* 1, 3-4: "Among you there can be no question of personal property. Rather, take care that you share everything in common . . . Those who owned possessions in the world should readily agree that, from the moment they enter the religious life, these things become the property of the community."

⁸⁷Cf. T. VIÑAS, *La amistad en la vida religiosa*. Madrid: Instituto Teológica de Vida Religiosa, 1982.

contradiction and a violation of the harmony of the *anima una*.⁸⁸ A communion of love cannot be self-seeking.⁸⁹ Possidius of Calama, Augustine's friend, biographer and commentator on the communal life in Hippo, tells us that "the most important provision was that no one in that community was to have any property of his own, but rather they were to have all things in common, with each being given what he needed."⁹⁰ This point is intensely emphasized in his *Sermones* 355 and 356 -- which resemble a theory of economics -- where the bishop explains the ideals of the religious communities to his congregations. The two sermons focus primarily on the disruptive tendencies of hidden, private ownership among some clerics, causing discord within the community setting.⁹¹

Mary Clark says that the *Rule* has all its admonitions given in view of promoting harmony and communion.⁹² Religious communities point to a future life. For Augustine, the community must live out in a concrete manner an outer/inner harmony in the sharing

⁸⁸This unity is demonstrated in Augustine's sermon on *Psalms* 132, 12: "Sic sunt multi fratres; non habitant in unum nisi corpore. Sed qui sunt qui habitant in unum? Illi de quibus dictum est, *Et erat illis anima una et cor unum in Deum; et nemo dicebat aliquid suum esse, sed erant illis omnia communia (Acts 4,32)*" (*En ps.* 132,12; *CCL* 40, 1934). Just as unity is contingent upon the proper use and sharing of material goods, so too is the importance of one's interior disposition in the dealing of these goods. The bishop continues with his reflection on the same psalm: "*Quoniam ibi mandavit Dominus benedictionem. Ubi mandavit? In fratribus qui habitant in unum. Ibi praecepit benedictionem, ibi benedicunt Dominum que habitant concorditer. Nam in discordia non benedicis Dominum. Sine causa dicis quia lingua tua sonat benedictionem Domini, si corde non sonet: ore benedicis, et corde maldicis*" (*En ps.* 132, 13; *CCL* 40, 1934-1935).

⁸⁹*Rule* 5, 2: "love is not self-seeking (1 *Cor.* 13:5); that is to say, love puts the interests of the community before personal advantage, and not the other way around."

⁹⁰"Maxime ut nemo quicquam proprium in illa societate haberet, sed eis essent omnia communia, et distribuerentur unicuique sicut opus erat" (*Vita.* 5,1; *Pellegrino* 52). ROTELLE, *The Life of Saint Augustine*, p. 47.

⁹¹See F. VAN DER MEER, *Augustine the Bishop*. B. Battershaw and G. R. Lamb (trans.). New York: Harper Torchbooks, 1955, pp. 199-206.

⁹²M. CLARK, "Augustinian Spirituality" in *NDCS*, p. 71. Clark is clear when she says the *Rule of Augustine* epitomizes the spirituality of the Order of St. Augustine.

of goods as an expression of sharing of heart and mind so as to mirror for themselves and others the hope and faith in the promises of Christ. What is this communion concretely?

2. *Dynamism of communion: convergence*

Communion does not mean a group of people standing around together any more than community is a crowd of consumers at the intersection of a business district. Augustine repeats in the *Rule* his vision of common life with a new aspect: “You are all to live together, therefore, *one in mind and one in heart* (Acts 4:32), and honor God in one another because *each of you has become his temple* (2 Cor. 6:16).”⁹³ Communion has an internal dimension (interiority) which recognizes the interiority of the other as sacred, as “temple.” A bond of oneness is formed to the extent that each member sees God in the interiority of the other because God is seen in oneself.

The design of a musical instrument can help us with this point. Leo Spitzer says the bishop of Hippo draws on the example of the *cithara*, an instrument with one string called a monochord, to demonstrate that “everything tends toward mono-theism.”⁹⁴ This means that when Augustine uses the *cum*-prefix he sees more than just “togetherness” of a group.⁹⁵ Rather, the bishop sees dynamic “convergence” with one objective or goal. *Cum*- is

⁹³*Rule* 1, 9: “Omnes ergo **unanimitet et concorditer** vivite, et honorate in vobis invicem Deum cuius templa facti estis.” Emphasis is mine.

⁹⁴L. SPITZER, “Classical and Christian Ideas of World Harmony.” *Traditio* 2 (1944): p. 435. Cf. *Trin.* 4, 2: “For by this it is that treble and bass voices are in harmony, so that any one who in his note departs from it, offends extremely, not only trained skill, of which the most part of men are devoid, but the very sense of hearing. To demonstrate this, needs no doubt a long discourse; but any one who knows it, may make it plain to the very ear in a rightly ordered monochord.”

⁹⁵Ambrose identifies more with the notion of “togetherness” or in modern terms, the “concert hall and full orchestra.” See Spitzer, “Classical and Christian Ideas,” p. 435.

perfective where *consonare, concordia, concinere* mean “to arrive at harmony, unity.”⁹⁶ This is an intriguing point, for the same idea is found in the *in Deum* of the *anima una*. Together, members come “toward God.”⁹⁷ Communion is not static, but a movement. Communion occurs when there is a convergence of interiority, that is to say, an awareness of the other as “temple” in whom God resides.⁹⁸

The notion of convergence as a dynamic process finds an interesting expression in the African bishop’s sermons. Augustine preaches to his congregation that just as the walls of the Church “converge” into the corner, who is Christ, so do the Jewish and Gentile communities, with all their differences, move toward harmony, toward the corner, called “the kiss of peace” (*in osculum recipit*). He describes this process in *Sermo* 156, given in 419, on the feast of the Bolitan martyrs:

as distant from each other and between each other as they are from the corner; the nearer they are to the corner, the less of course the gap between them; and right in

⁹⁶A computer search verifies that Augustine uses the term *concordia* 652 times and *discordia* with its cognates 179 times (M.-F. BERROUARD, “Concordia-discordia” in *AL*, pp. 1107-1111). The root of these two words is *cor* which denotes an “affective sense”: “ille concors dicendus est, que corda iungit” (*Io. eu. tr.* 77,5. BERROUARD, “Concordia-discordia,” p. 1107.) Recalling Spitzer’s observation of the *cum*- prefix meaning “convergence” we can say that *con-cordia* refers to a “convergence of hearts.” Is this what Augustine the theologian had in mind when he described harmony of charity and of being “one mind and one heart” of the faithful and his monastic communities as the privileged place of *concordia*: “concordiam caritatemque fidelium”? (*Ep.* 238, 16. Cf. BERROUARD, “Concordia-discordia,” p. 1110.)

⁹⁷The grammatical structure of “*in Deum*” is developed further in MARTIN, *Our Restless Heart*, p. 163, n. 7: “Although ‘*in Deum*’ could be literally translated ‘in God’, its Latin grammatical structure (‘*in*’ with the accusative designates motion, ‘into God’) conveys dynamism and movement. It could be rendered ‘towards God’, ‘seeking God’, ‘into God’, ‘on the way to God’, denoting in the final analysis a vital and vibrant God-directed life.”

⁹⁸MERTON, *The Inner Experience*, p. 23: “[C]harity, which is the life and the awakening of the inner self, is in fact to a great extent awakened by the presence and the spiritual influence of other selves that are ‘in Christ.’ St. Augustine speaks of recognizing the inner self of other Christians through the virtuous actions which give evidence of the ‘Spirit’ dwelling in them. It can be said that Christian ‘edification’ is this mutual recognition of the inner spirit in one another, a recognition which is a manifestation of the Mystery of Christ.”

the corner actually joined together. *For he is our peace, who has made the two one (Eph. 2-22)*. So from one direction the circumcised, from the other the uncircumcised, the **walls harmonized** (*parietum concordia*), the corner glorified.⁹⁹

The walls converge at the corner. Communion involves movement, dynamism and convergence. Diversity becomes harmonized into the “kiss of peace.” What happens when the walls of diversity engender, not the embrace of friendship, but barriers of division and discord?

3. *Broken communion: discord*

One type of division occurs over a perception of an idea or understanding of truth. Individuals or groups can pit their ideas against each other, building barriers rather than channels for dialogue. Seeking the truth must incorporate mutuality and openness to learning the truth from each other. The pastor of souls links the search for truth with the notion of concord, an expression of communion, in the *Confessiones*:

Amid this profusion of true opinions let Truth itself engender concord (*concordiam*) . . . and pure charity . . . But let all of us . . . love one another and likewise love you, our God, the fount of truth, if truth is really what we thirst for, and not illusions.¹⁰⁰

In order for the common search for truth to even be possible, each person must plumb his or her own inner depths (interiority) in faith and with others reach out toward

⁹⁹“ . . . tantum a se et inter se longe, quantum ab angulo longe: quantum autem ad angulum prope, et inter se utique prope; in angulo autem inter se juncti. *Ipse est enim pax nostra, qui fecit ultraque unum*. Ergo inde circumcisio, inde praeputium, parietum concordia, anguli gloria” (*S.* 156, 15; *PL* 38, 858). Emphasis is mine.

¹⁰⁰“In hac diuersitate sententiarum uerarum concordiam pariat ipsa ueritas, et deus noster misereatur nostri, ut legitime lege utamur, praecepti fine, pura caritate . . . sed omnes, quos in eis uerbis uera cernere ac dicere fateor, diligamus nos inuicem pariterque diligamus te, deum nostrum, fontem ueritatis, si non uana, sed ipsam sitimus” (*Conf.* 12, 30-31, 42; *CCL* 27, 240).

A helpful resource on Augustine’s impact on contemporary concerns is R. DODARO and G. LAWLESS (eds.), *Augustine and His Critics: Essays in Honour of Gerald Bonner*. London: Routledge, 2002.

God who is “mutual relationships” (*modis simpliciter et multipliciter infinito*).¹⁰¹ This search is a long process, and it takes time to bring together (*nodo*) a unity of mind and hearts.¹⁰²

However, relationships of unity can easily be broken because of pride and self-centeredness. Augustine reflected and wrote much about unity and beauty because he lived in a world that was torn apart by so much hatred and violence. To preach communion and happiness in the future was not a form of psychological escape, but an antidote, or as “a governor of turmoil.”¹⁰³ The controversy with the schismatic Donatist Church is one example of how Christians were divided.¹⁰⁴

Augustine hated violence. For this reason the process of reconciliation and search for truth together was so important after the Conference in Carthage between Catholics and Donatists in 411. A few months after the great Conference, the bishop preached *Sermo* 359 at Bizerta, hoping to end the barriers of division and greed that destroyed the unity of brotherly and sisterly concord.

There you have the advice on how to achieve concord, which the Lord gave brothers

¹⁰¹“An utrumque miris modis simpliciter et multipliciter infinito in se sibi fine” (*Conf.* 13, 11, 12; *CCL* 27, 248).

¹⁰²Augustine reflects on the friendship of his youth: “The friendship which draws human beings together in a tender bond is sweet to us because out of many minds it forges a unity” (“Amicitia quoque hominum caro nodo dulcis est propter unitatem de multis animis”) (*Conf.* 2, 5, 10; *CCL* 27, 22).

¹⁰³W. MALLARD, *Language and Love: Introducing Augustine’s religious thought through the Confessions story*. University Park, Pa.: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1994, p. 83.

¹⁰⁴P. BRIGHT, “Donatist Bishops” in *AA*, pp. 281-284. R. MARKUS, “Donatus, Donatism” in *AA*, pp. 284-287. See C. STRAW, “Augustine as Pastoral Theologian: the exegesis of the parables of the field and threshing floor.” *Augustinian Studies* 14 (1983): pp. 129-151, for an analysis of the use of parables against the Donatists in the sermons and letters. For a list of anti-Donatist writings, see p. 129, note 2. Cf. CHADWICK, *Augustine: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1986. pp. 79-90 on the Donatist controversy.

who were at loggerheads; they should lay aside greed, and would straightaway have their fill of truth. So let us acquire an inheritance like that . . . Their inheritance is God himself.¹⁰⁵

Catholics and Donatists were members of the same family and prayed to the same God the Father who demanded of them to live in concord,¹⁰⁶ at the same time they sang the same songs and psalms, but their hearts were in dissonance.¹⁰⁷ Augustine wanted to establish a mood where Donatists were received with openness and charity into the family of the Church. He rebuked Catholics who were uncharitable to the Donatists¹⁰⁸ and viewed as theologically valid all Donatist sacraments and ordinations. Ministerially they would share in the pastorate of each diocese.¹⁰⁹ As in Luke's story of the prodigal son, the bishop of Hippo emphasized "sharing," rather than "dividing" the inheritance.¹¹⁰ The spirit of charity, as the dominant tone, creates harmony.

The opposite of harmony -- discord and the lack of charity -- even penetrated community life. According to Possidius, when gossip entered conversation at meals, Augustine would check the slander with severity and recall the inscription he made on the

¹⁰⁵“Ecce quale consilium Dominus fratribus dedit dissidentibus, quo concordessent, ut careret cupiditate, et continuo implerentur veritate. Inveniamus ergo talem haereditatem . . . Haereditas eorum Deus ipse est” (S. 359, 4; *PL* 39, 1593). See also S. 162A, 5; 357, 4; *Ep.* 33, 5.

¹⁰⁶ Cf. S. 357, 4.

¹⁰⁷“Profero quod surdus cantas; aperi aures, tu cantas ista; cantas mecum, et non concordas mecum; lingua tua sonat quod sonat mea, et cor tuum dissonat a corde meo” (*En ps* 95, 11; *CCL* 39, 1350).

¹⁰⁸See *Ep* 61, 1; 65, 5.

¹⁰⁹W. H. C. FRIEND, *The Donatist Church. A movement of protest in Roman North Africa*. Oxford, Eng.: Clarendon Press, 1952, p. 242: “the unity which Augustine restored [in the struggle with the Donatists] was deceptive and short-lived.”

¹¹⁰“Et non dicimus, Domine, dic fratri meo, ut dividat mecum haereditatem; sed, Dic fratri meo, ut teneat mecum haereditatem” (S. 359, 4; *PL* 39, 1594). See *Lk* 12: 13.

dining table: “Let those who like to slander the lives of the absent know that their own are not worthy of this table.”¹¹¹ He even rebuked his friends and fellow bishops for not heeding the inscription and would say: “the verses must be erased from the table or he would get up from table in the middle of the meal and retire to his room.”¹¹² Gossip engenders disharmony.

We now sum up some major threads on the theme of harmony in Augustine. In the category of prayer, we see the following relationships: the self unfolds before the silence of God as one is “in tune” with the “sparks” of divine love; one prays from the heart (whole self), where words express deepest desires and where one reaches out to the needs of the poor, including enemies;¹¹³ no method of prayer is aimed at anything but fostering desire and love for God and the other; the self unfolds to others through interiority and in “symphonia”, and through complementary bonds of mutuality and friendship.

The category of communion demonstrates the theme of harmony as governed by the view of the future life in present communion, that there will be joy in God and one another in God where the self will no longer be divided against itself. Augustine’s ideal religious community requires the interior oneness of mind and heart with the exterior expression of

¹¹¹“Quisquis amat dictis absentum rodere vitam, hac mensa indignam noverit esse suam” (*Vita*. 22,6; *Pellegrino* 122). ROTELLE (ed.), *The Life of Saint Augustine*, p. 92.

¹¹²“Ut diceret aut delendos esse illos de mensa versus, aut se de media refectione ad suum cubiculum surrecturum” (*Vita*. 22, 7; *Pellegrino* 122). ROTELLE, *The Life of Saint Augustine*, p. 92.

¹¹³*Sermo* 56, 14, preached around 410-412 on the Lord’s Prayer: “You, too, pray against your enemy’s ill-nature; may that die, and he live. You see, if your enemy dies, you are going without an enemy, I suppose, but you haven’t found a friend, but if it’s his ill-nature that dies, then you have both lost an enemy and found a friend” (“Ora et tu contra malitiam inimici tui: illa moriatur, et ille vivat. Si enim mortuus fuerit inimicus tuus, quasi inimico caruisti, sed nec amicum invenisti. Si autem mortua fuerit malitia ejus: et inimicum amisisti, et amicum invenisti” (*PL* 38, 384).

sharing material and spiritual goods. Communion is born through convergence of interiority whereas “depth” is recognized in and through the other as “other.” The lack of charity and transcendence foments discord and break up of relationships. The question we want to look at now is: has the Order’s tradition received these expressions of harmony in prayer and communion?

II. The Order’s Tradition: Prayer of the undivided heart and Communion of *concordia*

The spirituality of the Order of Saint Augustine incorporates the insights of the bishop of Hippo and the evangelical thrust of an apostolic fraternity. To what extent do the bishop’s insights on the two fundamental components of the Order’s tradition, namely, prayer and communion, appear? This is what we want to explore in this section. We begin with the “depth” of individual and common prayer. We rely mainly on the *Rule* and writings of important figures like Herman of Schildesche and Thomas of Villanova, for the subject of prayer. Then, for the topic of communion we look at the different commentaries on the *Rule* by Ange Le Proust and by our contemporary, Tarsicius van Bavel.

A. Prayer of the undivided heart: “every thought, affection, desire of soul”

Augustine’s thoughts on prayer find a place in many writings and teachings of Augustinians throughout the Order’s history. The feature of interiority as well as the notion of the “undivided heart” point to the prayerful stance of being “alone toward God” in Blessed Simon of Cascia and “loving totally” in Thomas of Villanova’s sermon, a

“forgotten jewel.”¹¹⁴ “Common prayer as a retrieval of *symphonia*,” is present in some Augustinian works, especially those from Thomas of Villanova.

1. Harmony -- Alone toward God: Herman of Schildesche and Bl. Simon of Cascia

Interiority, the “generic” aspect of the Order’s spirituality, provides the environment for nurturing two dimensions of prayer: aloneness with God and unfolding of the self. The goal of prayer in the Augustinian tradition is to contemplate God who inflames the soul through desire in a focused, rather than scattered, manner. Adolar Zumkeller describes prayer for the great theologian Herman of Schildesche (d. 1357) with the wonderful expression of the *dormitorium animae* where intellect and feeling are anchored in God alone. Prayer is:

the quiet of contemplation in the image of the *dormitorium animae*, the quiet room of the soul, the foundation supporting which is a deep peace in God and an intimate union with God, the protecting walls of which are the complete detachment from earthly desires and the purification of earthly images, and which receives its completion, its roof, in a feeling of incomparable love.¹¹⁵

“The Search for God” occupies a primary place in the *Constitutions* as a component of the Order’s spirituality.¹¹⁶ Christ, the Incarnate Word, is the way and our hearts are guided by a “natural longing for peace, happiness and contemplation of God.” The spiritual writer and “mediator for peace and reconciliation” Blessed Simon of Cascia (d. 1348) refers

¹¹⁴The sermons that pertain to the Seventeenth Sunday after Pentecost, also called the “hymn of harmony,” are unknown to most scholars and are called “esta joya olvidada.” J. M. BUJANDA, “Tratado del amor de Dios de Santo Tomás de Villanueva. Estudio histórico-doctrinal y edición del texto.” *Ciudad de Dios* 183 (1970), p. 52, note 2. The texts of the first three sermons are in this article.

¹¹⁵A. ZUMKELLER, *Theology and History of the Augustinian School in the Middle Ages*. J. Rotelle, (ed.) Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1996, p. 117. See A. ZUMKELLER, “Hermann de Schildesche” in *DS* 7, pp. 302-308; and B. RANO, *Augustinian Origins, Charism, and Spirituality*. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1994, pp. 246-279.

¹¹⁶*Const.* 32-35.

to the advancement of the “prayer of the heart” as: “Our whole life is a prayer, if it is directed to God alone, and not to anything else.”¹¹⁷ The notions of the inner/outer dimensions of one’s whole life toward the divine from Herman of Schildesche, Simon of Cascia, and *Constitutions* indicate strong parallels with Augustine’s attitude on prayer and the centrality of the self in God.

2. Harmony of the “undivided heart:” Jordan of Saxony and Thomas of Villanova

The theme of harmony and the yearning heart (desire and love) in Augustine continues to find strong resonance in the writers and preachers of the Order. It is not an oversight that the Order adopted the flaming heart pierced by the arrow of love within its logo.¹¹⁸ Writing in *The Life of the Brethren* about chanting the divine office, Jordan of Saxony¹¹⁹ quotes an anonymous author who captures Augustine’s spirit of prayer as inner/outer harmony between heart and words:

Not voice but vow, not harp-strings but the heart,
Not loudness but love, make music in God’s ears.¹²⁰

A similar thought on the desires and total love of the heart as a “circle of the soul” (*un cerco del ánima*) is found in the Old Spanish of the third sermon for the *Seventeenth*

¹¹⁷Blessed Simon of Cascia is cited in *Const.* 35. He is identified as one of the “mediators for peace and reconciliation in RANO, *Augustinian Origins*, p. 82.

¹¹⁸*Const.* 19: “A clear expression of this life of ours is to be found in the public insignia of the Order: a heart placed over a book and pierced by the arrow of love.” The inspiration for this logo comes from *Confessiones*: “With the arrows of your charity you had pierced our hearts, and we bore your words within us like a sword penetrating us to the core:” “Sagittaueras tu cor nostrum caritate tua, et gestabamus uerba tua transfixa uisceribus” (*Conf.* 9, 2, 3; *CCL* 27, 134).

¹¹⁹See A. ZUMKELLER, “Jourdain de Saxe ou de Quedlinburg” in *DS* 8, col. 1423-1430.

¹²⁰“Non vox, sed votum, non musica cordula, sed cor, Non clamor, sed amor cantat in aure Dei” (JORDAN OF SAXONY, *The Life of the Brethren*, p. 196 (*LV* 2,15)).

Sunday after Pentecost from Thomas of Villanova, archbishop of Valencia: “I love because I love; I love that I may love, seeking no other reason, aiming for no other end. Love is the beginning and end of love, for love is reflected back to itself.”¹²¹ One who loves totally does so by loving God alone with the whole self: “that every thought, every affection, every desire, and every power of the soul is completely absorbed into God, and that we love God with the whole effort of mind.”¹²² By contemplating God, the self comes to know the self in a different manner.¹²³ Not to love with the whole self means fragmentation of the soul: “Division of heart means certain destruction of the soul, since just as the body divided asunder cannot live, so the divided soul cannot live either.”¹²⁴ We find a similar resonance in the *Constitutions* also repeating this perspective: “praying with the continuous desire of our hearts we may come to God.”¹²⁵ As we see, the prayer of the whole person, including the affective dimension, has a place in the Order’s spirituality.

Tensions can exist in some communities regarding the relationship between prayer

¹²¹“Amo porque es amor: amo por amar: no buscando otra causa, ni otro fin. El premio y fin del amor el mismo amor es” (BUJANDA, “Tratado del amor de Dios,” p. 74). THOMAS OF VILLANOVA, *Sermon 3, 1* in *WSTV*, Part 5, p. 261.

¹²²“Que todo nuestro pensamiento, toda nuestra afición, todo nuestro apetito, y toda la virtud de la ánima se transforme y consuma del todo en Dios, y sea de nosotros amado con toda la fuerza de nuestra ánima” (BUJANDA, “Tratado del amor de Dios,” pp. 83-84). THOMAS OF VILLANOVA, *Sermon 3, 9* in *WSTV*, Part 5, p. 269.

¹²³Husserl refers to the direction of intentionality in prayer that is directed by the subject to the Other as object. What constitutes the object is conscious awareness of the subject. See ULANOV, *Primary Speech. A psychology of prayer*, p. 8.

¹²⁴“Ca la tal división del corazón, una muerte de la ánima es; porque así como el cuerpo partido no vive, así ni la ánima” BUJANDA, “Tratado del amor de Dios,” p. 83). THOMAS OF VILLANOVA, *Sermon 3, 9* in *WSTV*, Part 5, p. 268. Thomas also has two treatises on the on the “art of meditation” in four stages in his *De la Lección, Meditación, Oración, Contemplación* as well as in his *Modo Breve de Servir a Nuestro Señor* (*WSTV* 8, pp. 170-185).

¹²⁵*Const.* 34.

and desires of the heart. For so long in religious life emotions were suspect due to negative and dualistic interpretations of the “flesh” and “spirit” and preference for the mind, rationality and logic. Prayer has often been a practice of “words,” rumination of the intellect, and emphasis on doing, rather than taking the risk to listen to God speaking through the affective level. Interestingly, the section on prayer in the *Ratio*¹²⁶ clearly emphasizes activity over *desiderium*. Though the document claims that Augustine’s teaching on prayer is too vast to treat everything, it does say the following:

the basic law of all prayer is expressed in the *Rule* (2, 3): “When you pray to God in psalms and songs, the words spoken by your lips should be alive in your hearts.” The first meaning of this text is that our words must be in harmony with our deeds, or perhaps better: it makes no sense to pray with the lips, if we do not put into practice words pronounced in our prayer.¹²⁷

What happens to desires of the heart? No doubt the fruit of prayer must have an expression of charity, but the interpretation of the *Ratio* can be misleading. As mentioned earlier, Augustine describes the harmony of hearts and lips in terms of desire and feelings finding voice in our prayer: “Your very desire is your prayer.”¹²⁸ As we have seen, he describes acts of charity as “taking in hand the tympanum and the psalter.”¹²⁹ In this sense the heart, lips and hands are in relation to each other. Prayer must involve the whole self (heart, mind and action) and our desires must be molded to the scriptures. The praying-self

¹²⁶*Ratio* 48-51.

¹²⁷*Ratio* 48. A danger always arises concerning the proper balance between the contemplative with active dimensions in Augustinian living. The tone of *Ratio* 48-51 on prayer stresses deeds, and little on *desiderium*. It is important to recall *Const.* 40 describing the active ministry as “an exterior activity springing from a deep interior life.”

¹²⁸“*Ipsium enim desiderium tuum, oratio tua est*” (*En ps.* 37, 14; *CCL* 38, 392).

¹²⁹ See page 189. Cf. *En ps.* 149, 8; *CCL* 40, 2183.

can follow any method, as long as one is “caught up in Christ.”¹³⁰ If not, then felt-needs will be scattered in every direction, paralyzing the ability to make a choice, and over-activity will inhibit the “turn inward” to encounter our hopes and fears.

Individual prayer takes seriously the challenge to link one’s desires with prayer (in order to know what to desire) and overcome the split in the self which denies any sense of feelings that are to be directed to God alone. The notions of desire, will¹³¹ and deeds together need to be retrieved and cultivated more fully in the Order’s tradition. However, in the Augustinian environment, prayer encompasses more than just the personal, but the communal dimension, as well. What kind of parallels exist between Augustine and the Order with respect to common prayer?

3. *Common Prayer: retrieving “symphonia” – Thomas of Villanova*

Although the richness of Augustine’s word “symphonia” does not appear as a specific description of the praying community in the Order’s documents, the importance of common prayer is nevertheless heard as a strong melody in the writings of Thomas of Villanova and official documents. The praying community builds and contributes to the formation of common life, especially when each individual member cultivates the prayer of the heart.

¹³⁰NOLAN, *A cry from the heart*, p. 27: “For Augustine what counted was anything that helped a person to an awareness of what was within, so that in a truly Christian prayer, welling up from the Spirit of God, a person would allow himself to be caught up in Christ.”

¹³¹See SCANLON, “The Augustinian Tradition,” p. 68: “To understand the Augustinian will as synonymous with what we name as person is of fundamental importance if we are to appreciate his relevance to our contemporary self-understanding. Personhood emerges as the historical self-enactment of will, and it is personhood in this sense that Augustine explores with his focus on the ‘soul.’ The Augustinian ‘soul’ is not Aristotelian ‘substance’ – it is what is often referred to today as the ‘subject.’” Scanlon identifies various categories from Augustine for retrieval: will, person, grace, love, and history (cf. p. 67). See ULANOV, “Prayer and Desire” in *Primary Speech. A psychology of prayer*, pp. 13-25.

Thomas of Villanova has a unique perspective on how common prayer strengthens the bonds of community. In one of the six minor works in Spanish, he writes “Advice to the religious who receives the habit.”¹³² for a person entering the monastery. The entire treatise portrays how the religious, a “servant of God” (*el siervo de Dios*), is to focus primarily on the life of contemplation and prayer; paradoxically, the treatise says very little about common prayer and community life, until the end of the text. The friar lives in such a way as to receive spiritual nourishment from God through prayer.¹³³ A consequence of a life focused on prayer is healthy, harmonious relationships with others in the community, because they will not only help themselves, but “show them the path . . . and in this life they will gain much.”¹³⁴ The harmony of relationships in a community, then, depends upon the spiritual life and prayer of its individual members, especially in the liturgical context. Personal prayer strengthens the bonds of common life and prayer.

The liturgy of common prayer, like the performance of an orchestra, creates an environment in which “symphony” can occur. The section “Life with God” in the *Constitutions* reinforces the idea that common prayer strengthens “unity and harmony”¹³⁵

¹³²See “Plática y aviso al religioso que toma el hábito” in SANTAMARTA, *Obras de santo Tomás de Villanueva*, pp. 562-575. Cf. *WSTV*, Part 8, pp. 217-228.

¹³³*Deut.* 8, 3: “not by bread alone does [one] live, but by every word that comes forth from the mouth of the Lord.” Thomas also gives importance to *2 Tim.* 1: 14 JB: “With the help of the Holy Spirit who dwells in us, look after that precious thing given in trust.”

¹³⁴“Mostrándoles el camino . . . y por esta vida han ganado mucho y aprovechado..” SANTAMARTA, *Obras de santo Tomás de Villanueva*, p. 575.

¹³⁵*Const.* 96: “ the liturgy of the hours is not only a source of piety and nourishment for personal prayer, but also offers no small aid to strengthening and demonstrating *unity and harmony*, it is to be considered the common prayer of all the friars . . . Moreover, the faithful should be invited to join us in this prayer.” Emphasis is mine. Cf. *En ps.*30, sermon 3, 1; JORDAN OF SAXONY, *The Life of the Brethren*, pp. 72-74 (*LV I*, 5).

and stimulates the “unity of love” among the friars and the faithful who celebrate with them.¹³⁶

Common prayer stimulates desire and creates unity among those gathered together. The dynamism of “symphony” in common prayer ought to find a place within contemporary Augustinian spirituality that will avoid making the subject of “community” a static reality and a cliché. That is to say, Augustinian “community” implies the “unity of love” of its members in the act of common prayer, the *anima una* is *in Deum*, and not mere cohabitation within the same place. To love another person requires tremendous risk and vulnerability. To the extent we risk opening ourselves to the mystery of God who speaks to us through our desires (hopes and fears), we risk ourselves with others. What is said here is true not just for friars, but for all Christians to demonstrate through their prayer, especially in the liturgy, the love of God *and* the evangelizing love of neighbor.

Augustine emphasizes that prayer must produce fruit and have an external dimension, one that reaches the poor because the “love of neighbor” is the “love of God.”¹³⁷ Tars van Bavel calls the bishop’s inversion “daring”¹³⁸ and more sensitive to modern ears.

¹³⁶*Const.* 35: “There is nothing better than prayer for preserving and augmenting unity among the friars, and therefore it should never be absent. Indeed, when it consists of prayers poured out in common, it both *expresses* and *stimulates* the unity of love.” See *En ps.* 132, 13. Emphasis is mine.

¹³⁷“Those who say, with their lives rather than their lips, *The world has been crucified to me and I to the world*, they are the ones who cry out to Christ. Those who distribute and give to the poor, so that their justice endures for ever and ever, they are the ones who cry out to Christ.” “Qui dicit non lingua, sed vita, *Mihi mundus crucifixus est, et ego mundo* (*Gal.* 6:14); clamat ad Christum. Quid dispergit, et dat pauperibus, ut justitia ejus maneat in saeculum saeculi (*Ps.* 111:9); clamat ad Christum” (*S.*88, 12; *PL* 38, 546).

¹³⁸T. VAN BAVEL, “The Double Face of Love in Augustine.” *Louvain Studies* 12 (1987): p. 121. “Let no one say: ‘I do not know what to love.’ Let him love his sister and brother, and let him love love itself. . . . Therefore, the more we are healed from pride, the more we are full of love. And of what but God is he full who is full of love?” (“Nemo dicat: ‘Non noui quod diligam.’ diligat fratrem et diligat eandem dilectionem; . . . Quanto igitur saniores sumus a tumore superbiae tanto sumus dilectione

Michele Pellegrino says

the extension would not be justified were it not that in Augustine's spirituality¹³⁹ prayer cannot be simply cut off from the rest of life. One constant duty of the Christian is this prolongation of prayer, for it is the guarantee that our prayer is in harmony with the spirit of Christ.¹⁴⁰

The coherence between inner and outer self, prayer and the "rest of life," is a constant idea in Augustine the preacher as well as in the lives of Augustinians. The pastoral dynamism of Thomas of Villanova, "the holy almsgiver" (*le saint aumônier*) and "the father of the poor" (*le père des pauvres*)¹⁴¹ harmonized contemplation and action on behalf of the poor and fed five hundred people every day.¹⁴² Thomas' life was not out of tune with his

pleniores. Et quo nisi deo plenus est qui plenus est dilectione?" (*Trin.* 8, 8, 12; *CCL* 50, 286-287). Regarding the love of self (since the love of God, others, and self are related), self-love is "genuine only if the self is loving God" (p. 117).

¹³⁹MARTIN, *Our Restless Heart*, p. 161, note 7: "The word 'spirituality' was never used by Augustine. It was just beginning to enter into the Latin vocabulary in Late Antiquity and only centuries later does it take on its contemporary meaning. Seeking to be true to Augustine, the notion of the 'spiritual journey' captures what in Augustinian terms could be considered the equivalent of a holistic Christian spirituality, one with rich doctrinal content and an explicit commitment to 'living', i.e., making the journey."

¹⁴⁰M. PELLEGRINO, *Spiritual Journey: Augustine's Reflections on the Christian Life*. J. Rotelle (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1996, p. 207. Translation of *Itinerario spirituale*.

¹⁴¹TURRADO, "Thomas de Villeneuve," *DS* 15, col. 888.

¹⁴²Cf. S. BACK, *The Pelican: A Life of Saint Thomas of Villanova*. J. Rotelle (ed.), M. J. O'Connell (trans.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1987, p. 30: The writings of Thomas of Villanova might have been overlooked in literature, but not in the art of Bartolomé Murillo, artist par excellence of the seventeenth-century. In one painting, Murillo portrays the friar praying before the crucified Christ; the other paintings show Thomas the almsgiver and one as healer of the handicapped. His love for the poor and for the disenfranchised is the fruit of his personal prayer and community life. His life towards others in need was coherent with his beliefs and convictions. That is why Thomas, who was convinced that the vow of poverty had the power to liberate, was a strong critic of the wealth and comfortable conditions in monasteries and in the Church. He saw that riches and wealth constituted a major evil. "For my part I regard as dangerous the wealth of the Church and the monasteries, as well as the ever-growing power of the pope and the Church's interventions in secular affairs . . . I believe the Church's glory must come from within, not from outside. We exert a greater influence through prayer and sacrifice than through the sword," he told students. Riches have an impact on a person's life because they scatter desires in every direction. For that reason, effective prayer is linked to a community's critical attitude toward material possessions, honors, and any other form of "wealth" or distinction that Jordan of Saxony makes: "this is 'yours' and this is 'mine'" (JORDAN OF SAXONY, *The Life of the Brethren*, pp. 301, 303 (*LV* III, 1)).

contemplation and his preaching, of which charity was the dominant note.

Prayer becomes empty of its meaning if it does not engender charity. Encounters with others are affected, often ending in discord and conflict. One of the effects of common prayer oriented in love is its capacity for healing broken relationships. The *Rule*, in a chapter entitled “Love and Conflict,” addresses the tendency toward quarrels, anger and the need for reconciliation among community members. If there is no reconciliation, then our prayer “forgive each other’s trespasses” and “praying the Our Father becomes a lie.”¹⁴³

This remarkable statement on the healing aspect of prayer follows an insight on the imperfect self: “Indeed, the more you pray, the more honest your prayer ought to become.” As one plunges into prayer a certain honesty about the self and its relationship to others emerges.¹⁴⁴ A step towards mending the social fracture and removing the mask of self-illusion is to have the courage to drop down into the self with humility and honesty, and refine our desires in a way a musician listens and fine tunes an instrument. In some way we are changed by the encounter with the divine in the self.¹⁴⁵

Prayer and reconciliation affect not only self-knowledge, but also our outward attitude towards others in community. If prayer is supposed to enhance the love for God, then it necessarily implies love of God in one’s neighbor. An equilibrium and harmony between the inner and outer self become possible and healing takes place in social

¹⁴³*Rule* 6, 1-2; *Mt.* 6: 12.

¹⁴⁴The notion of honesty is treated quite well in ULANOV, *Primary Speech. A psychology of prayer*, pp. 10-12. Cf. JORDAN OF SAXONY, *The Life of the Brethren*, p 189 (*LV* II, 14).

¹⁴⁵STEINDL-RAST and LEBELL, *Music of Silence*, p. 75: “Prayer is attuning yourself to the life of the world, to love, the force that moves the sun and the moon and the stars. We can close our hearts to that Tao of the universe, and because we so often do, alienation and lack of peace tear the world apart . . . it’s not what our prayers do to God, but how we ourselves are changed by encountering God in prayer.”

relationships.¹⁴⁶

The idea of “symphony,” along with expressions like communion and concord, and the effect of transformation can give greater depth to the understanding of common life and prayer in Augustinian spirituality. “Symphony” offers a new understanding of our role in dealing with “collective guilt” and scandals which cause confusion in many religious communities and the Church today. It may be timely to recover this aspect of “solidarity with the offense,” rather than adopting an attitude that “it is not my problem.” We are connected to each other. Prayer unites us to the totality of our existence, with others, even with another’s guilt.

In summary, through some of its major authors the Order has received from Augustine notions of prayer that bear on the theme of harmony. Parallels do exist, such as the focus on interiority and the transformation of the praying-self, alone toward God, through an encounter with Christ. Prayer is a creative act of the human heart (whole person), where desires and words are in harmony and reflect the same intent. Prayer is not only inward, but outward through concrete expressions of charity. When people pray in common, the community is strengthened by the love and fervor of each member at prayer. Others are attracted, and transformed in the process, by the “delight” and “symphonia” of the community at prayer. A relationship exists between the interior/exterior self with others

¹⁴⁶See BACK, *The Pelican*, pp. 35-36: There is a splendid story of the healing aspect of prayer where Thomas of Villanova takes the art of “symphony” to new levels of understanding *metanoia*. A priest who had committed a serious sin and gave a bad name to the Order had to answer for himself before Thomas, then provincial. Thomas opened his heart by telling the priest that *both of them together* had to do penance. The friar was shocked. After his reprimand the friar observed more closely the *Rule* of the Order, so much so that the provincial chose him as a companion on his visitation to the monasteries. Never again did Thomas make reference to the brother’s offense. This story demonstrates something about the type of person Thomas was, and to what extent he was in “symphony” – through prayer, fasting and sacrifice – and at one with the collective guilt, discord and sins of others. Emphasis is mine.

and all are bonded together, as long as the self risks and “searches” for God behind one’s desires (loves, hopes and fears) in its deeper inner core.

Aspects of the theme of harmony that need to be retrieved are 1) the role that desires have in our articulation of prayer and deeds of charity, and 2) in situations of conflict, the manner in which prayer enables us to uncover the masks of illusion and extreme self-love that inhibit concord with others. If prayer, in both its personal and communal dimensions, involves the unfolding of the self in love with others and toward God, then we can continue to explore the deeper meanings of Augustine’s “daring” inversion that the “love of neighbor” is the “love of God” through the lens of “communion,” an aspect of the theme of harmony and “specific” characteristic of the Order’s spirituality.

B. Communion of *concordia*: future life and the “kiss of peace”

The notion of communion, which means to be in relation with one another, a sharing of life,¹⁴⁷ cannot be separated from the life of prayer, as already mentioned. Communion is a consequence of prayer and one’s openness to the Spirit’s movements and inspirations. Like prayer, it is a gift of God. Prior General Nolan concludes his letter *A cry from the heart* by linking the fruits of prayer to harmony and communion. He says

Without that free unfolding of ourselves to God we can never enjoy His free gifts

¹⁴⁷*Const.* 26.

of abundant life¹⁴⁸ full joy,¹⁴⁹ profound harmony and peace,¹⁵⁰ authentic freedom¹⁵¹ and complete intimacy and communion¹⁵² in which the human person comes to fulfilment in Christ. God is always offering Himself gratuitously. He waits for us to welcome his self-gift.¹⁵³

Nolan echoes the convictions of other Augustinian figures, like harmony of living in *concordia* as a gift of God in the Order's first commentary on the *Rule* and abundant life as a life shared in Le Proust. The Prior General's letter serves as a springboard from the search and dialogue with God in the inner "auditorium" to the sharing of the fruits of that dialogue in communion with others. It is the flip side of the same coin: from "love of God" to "love of neighbor," an expression of the theme of harmony.

Augustine's view of "present-communion and future life" is received by the Order's tradition. How this communion is received will involve the following principal texts: the *Expositio*, originally attributed to Hugh of St. Victor, for its contribution to the initial formation of the Order's spirituality, and the *Traité*, by Ange Le Proust. We will examine the dynamism of communion as "retrieving convergence" in the tradition, using Thomas of Villanova's Advent sermons and Jordan's *The Life of the Brethren*. At the end we will

¹⁴⁸Jn. 10:10 NIV - "I have come that they may have life, and have it to the full."

¹⁴⁹Jn. 15,11; 16, 24 - "I have told you this so that my joy may be in you and the your joy may be complete. Ask and you will receive, and your joy will be complete."

¹⁵⁰Jn. 14:27 - "Peace I leave with you; my peace I give you. I do not give to you as the world gives. Do not let your hearts be troubled and do not be afraid."

¹⁵¹Jn. 8:33, 36 - "They answered him, 'We are Abraham's descendants and have never been slaves of anyone. How can you say that we shall be set free?' . . . So if the Son sets you free, you will be free indeed."

¹⁵²Jn. 17:22 - "I have given them the glory you have given me, that they may be one as we are one."

¹⁵³NOLAN, *A cry from the heart*, pp. 28-29.

look again at the *Ratio* 19-30 because it is here that we can see a contribution the theme of harmony can make to understanding community.

1. Communion of “*concordia*,” the “*Expositio*,” *Le Proust, van Bavel*

Since the time of the Order’s foundation in the thirteenth century, Augustine’s ideas of companionship in the present and evangelical perfection in the future life find parallels throughout the writings of Augustinians. One document in particular, *Expositio in Regulam beati Augustini*,¹⁵⁴ erroneously attributed to Hugh of St. Victor (d. 1141), was the congregation’s first official commentary on the *Rule* prescribed in the first complete text of the *Constitutions*. The *Expositio* was a highly valued document for the “interpretation of the *Rule* and consequently for the formation of spirituality as well.”¹⁵⁵ We turn to see how this anonymous author captures the vision of the bishop of Hippo and incorporates it into the Order’s self-definition.

From the outset of the commentary, the author elaborates on the first part of the *Rule* which describes the “main purpose for you having come together” (*primum propter quod in unum estis congregati*) as to live in “oneness of mind and heart” (*unitate et concordia*):

... the sort of harmony (*concordia*) that comes about for the sake of God. Harmony (*concordia*) for the sake of sinning is evil; harmony (*concordia*) is good if it is for the sake of doing good, pursuing justice, and serving God . . . For it is only fitting, if we are gathered bodily into one place, that at the same time we should also live

¹⁵⁴Regarding the anonymous authorship and content of the *Expositio*, see MARTIN, *Our Restless Heart*, pp. 77-93 and RANO, *Augustinian Origins*, p. 441.

¹⁵⁵RANO, *Augustinian Origins*, p. 441: The general chapter of Genoa in 1308 attached a penalty of privation from office and active voice for any superior of a house who did not possess a copy of the *Rule* and the said commentary. The English translation of the *Expositio* is on pp. 443-496, and the Latin is in *PL* 176, 881-924. T. X. MARTIN, “The Great Union of 1256. Defenders of the Papacy: the Observant Reform.” *Second Annual Course on Augustinian Spirituality, Rome, July 1-17, 1976*. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1976, p128: The *Expositio* is considered to be “a mystical exhortation on Augustinian spirituality.”

together spiritually (*simul habitemus et spiritualiter*). For what good is it if one house brings us together while difference of will (*separat diversa voluntas*) separates us. . . For what most leads to harmony (*concordiam*) is if each one strives to do not his own but the will of another for good . . . For this reason we now live together in this house, so that hereafter we may continue together in the heavenly kingdom.¹⁵⁶

Concord, as an expression of harmony, is evident. We notice immediately that the commentator of the *Expositio* uses the term *concordia* several times and other expressions as the “virtue of harmony” (*virtus concordiae*), “harmony of humility” (*ad humilitatis concordiam*), “unity of harmony” (*in unitate concordiae*) throughout this text. Humility and attention to the other’s needs in community are conditions for harmony: “And this is the sign of great humility.”¹⁵⁷

The rationale for living in harmony with others coincides with Augustine’s thinking of the end-time:¹⁵⁸ “we may continue together in the heavenly kingdom” (*postmodum in coelesti regno maneamus*).¹⁵⁹ What constitutes harmony in the Augustinian community for this author? The commentary on *Rule* 1, 8 – “Therefore all should live united in mind and

¹⁵⁶ . . . et tali concordia quae in Deo fit. Nam concordia ad faciendum peccatum mala est; concordia vero ad faciendum bonum, et sectandam justitiam, et serviendum Deo bona est . . . Oportet enim si iam unum congregati sumus corporaliter, ut simul habitemus et spiritualiter. Non enim prodest si nos continet una domus, et separat diversa voluntas . . . Hoc est enim quod maxime adducit concordiam, si quisque non suam, sed alterius voluntatem facere studeat in bono . . . Ad hoc enim simul modo in ista domo vivimus, ut postmodum in caelesti regno maneamus” (*PL* 176, 881-884).

¹⁵⁷ “*Et hoc est magnae humilitatis iudicium*” (*PL* 176, col. 882-883).

¹⁵⁸ We speak about the future life because of its link to the “meaning of life” (and ultimate destiny and commitment to that goal) and “spirituality” discussed in Chapter One, pp. 22-27.

¹⁵⁹ *PL* 176, 884. The author also cites two scriptural texts: “We are God’s children now; what we shall later be has not yet come to light. We know that when it comes to light, we shall be like him, for we shall see him as he is” (1 *Jn.* 3:2) and “We have not here a lasting city but we seek one that is to come” (*Heb.* 13:14).

heart and should in one another honor God whose temples you have become” – elaborates the concrete manner of living a life of harmony, a coherence between the inner and outer life:

“In unity” refers to the will; “in harmony” pertains to good practices and habits. This is the proper order for our life: first, to have the same will or intention, and then outwardly a harmonious way of life. The brother who intends to live in harmony must first set aside all bad practices and habits; and he must not be self-willed, disorderly, or undisciplined. He must not be a cause of trouble to others. He must so balance his actions and his whole life (*debet librare actus suos et totam vitam suam*) that he may maintain harmony in God with those with whom he lives.¹⁶⁰

The opposite of harmony is discord. At the same time, lived-experience of harmony in community is a response to the reality of discord. This early writer is much aware of this response where the Church is like a military troop well-organized in “unity of harmony” (*in unitate concordiae*) and “armed with weapons of virtue” (*virtutum armis accinctos*). The devil trembles

. . . and grieves deeply when he fails to break through their ranks and separate them by discord . . . We see then that harmony (*concordia*) shatters all the weapons of the evil one.¹⁶¹

Here is an echo of Augustine’s “symphonia” described in the sermon of the prodigal son who was influenced toward change after hearing the singing of the “choir.” The *Expositio* is clearly marked with the theme of harmony as a way of living a coherent and balanced life with one’s self, with others, and toward God. Harmony of the community also embodies a

¹⁶⁰“Quod ait unanimiter, pertinet ad voluntatem. Quod vero subdit concorditer, pertinet ad bonos mores. Hic est rectus ordo vivendi, primum ut sit voluntas una, deinde concors vita. Frater qui vult concorditer vivere, prius debet pravos mores deponere, ne sit perversus, inordinatus, indisciplinatus, ne anxietate sua caeteros premat, deinde ita debet librare actus suos et totam vitam suam, ut concordare possit secundum Deum cum quibus vivit” (*PL* 176, 889).

¹⁶¹“Victusque vehementer dolet, cum eos per discordiam dividere, et penetrare non valet . . . quod omnia diabolica arma frangit concordia” (*PL* 176, 883).

type of contemplative strategy for dealing with realities of discord. We find this same spirit in a “lost” commentary on the *Rule* written five centuries later.

The recently discovered manuscript, *Traicté de la Règle de Saint Augustin*,¹⁶² written in Old French by the already-mentioned Ange Le Proust (d. 1697), makes a significant contribution to the link between the spirit of the Order and Augustine’s notion of present-communion and future life.¹⁶³ Verheijen says the *Traicté* is without doubt *un classique de la littérature religieuse de la France du XVII e siècle*.¹⁶⁴ In the *Préparatif* of Chapter II, Le Proust identifies the kernel of the Order’s spirit as charity where minds and hearts are bound together for the future life to which the road of evangelical perfection points. Le Proust writes:

Saint Augustine directs all virtues toward the charitable intention of making the way to evangelical perfection easy for one’s neighbor. This is achieved by a union of hearts in the bonds of mutual charity, and in a community whose only aim is to unite and bind individuals together under the same yoke, to bear each other’s burdens, making this yoke sweet for one another, and its burden light.¹⁶⁵

In this text the theologian describes “la fin de sa Règle” and *l’esprit et le caractère* of the

¹⁶²ROTELLE, *Treatise*. For background to this document refer to pages 37-39, footnotes 57-61.

¹⁶³A brief biographical sketch of Le Proust is given on page 37, footnote 57. See L. VERHEIJEN, “Le Père Ange Le Proust et la nature propre de la vie monastique augustinienne.” *Augustinus* 12 (1967): pp. 485-487; E.YPMA, “Les auteurs augustins français.” *Augustiniana* 20 (1970): pp. 386-387.

¹⁶⁴VERHEIJEN, *Nouvelle Approche*, p. 16.

¹⁶⁵ROTELLE, *Treatise*, p. 10. LE PROUST, *Traité de la Règle de Saint Augustin*, p. 22: “[S]aint Augustin oriente toutes les vertus vers la charité, dans l’intention de rendre le chemin de la perfection évangélique facile au prochain, par l’enchaînement des cœurs dans les liens d’une charité réciproque et d’une communauté qui ne vise qu’à unir sous un même joug les individus. Portant les fardeaux les uns des autres (cf. *Gal.* 6:2), ils se rendent ce joug suave et sa charge légère (*Mt.* 11:30).” VERHEIJEN, *Nouvelle Approche*, p. 16. “Ainsi toute la fin de sa Règle est la facilité perfection évangélique. Son esprit c’est de prendre tellement le joug de Jésus-Christ sur nous, que nous nous le rendions mutuellement suave et nous fassions sa charge légère.”

Order in terms of charity, the love of God and neighbor. When joined together in companionship, charity, and bearing with one another's weaknesses, the weight of "le joug de Jésus-Christ" becomes bearable and light. As we have seen earlier (Chapter One), Le Proust calls this inspiration and mutual support *cet admirable secret* on the Augustinian way.¹⁶⁶ This "secret" of relationships – carrying the "yoke" together – resounds in the *Rule* on how the religious communities were to live: *unanimiter et concorditer*.¹⁶⁷

One may ask today whether or not the idea of "carrying the yoke of Christ's command together" is truly a "secret" for Augustinians. Le Proust's description of the Order's spirit presents a strong challenge for those who follow the *anima una* of the *Rule* in a culture where the values of self-sufficiency, profit-making and consumption are strong, to the point of overshadowing the purpose why people come together to live in community. The Augustinian "secret" -- carrying the yoke of the Gospel together -- reflects the strength in communion in living together Christ's command to love.

One must be aware that communion can become "pragmatic" and "methodological" – a reality without soul. That is to say, communion can degenerate into a state of conformism, choking out any attempt at freedom, creativity, and "necessary autonomy."¹⁶⁸ What the theme of harmony harkens us back to is the primary role of *caritas* and, in communion of relationships, carrying the "yoke" of the Gospel – *together*. Here we find

¹⁶⁶VERHEIJEN, *Nouvelle Approche*, p. 17.

¹⁶⁷*Rule* 1, 9.

¹⁶⁸*Const.* 31: "Friendship in Christ not only strengthens personality; it also enhances freedom in the community itself, in which a healthy attitude of tolerance promotes open dialogue and everyone enjoys a necessary autonomy"

Augustine's previously mentioned *Sermo* 17 on his profound desire to be together with his congregation in eternal life.¹⁶⁹ Returning to Le Proust's insight of carrying the "yoke" together, does this "secret" find any expression in the Order's documents today?

The writings from the General Chapters do not use the term "secret" in the way Le Proust did, but the category of communion points to the same reality, as we see in the Intermediate General Chapter of 1998. This document states that the "spirituality [Augustinian] that we offer to the world is both personal and communal" (26).¹⁷⁰ The encounter with God happens through interiority and in the community through which human experiences have a vital role for interpreting and encountering the divine. The notion of communion as "relationships" – an aspect of the theme of harmony, unfolds beginning with the self (2-4), the religious community (5-12), the Church and world community (5, 8, 12-15, 23-30), and finally, all of creation (31). "Augustinian ecclesiology emphasizes communion and complementarity."¹⁷¹ A Church that is a communion demands co-responsibility" (12).

By way of concluding this reflection, we can consider in a concrete manner how to continue to retrieve Augustine's notion of communion and anticipation of future life. Van Bavel offers two approaches: first, the need to reflect on the Gospel together, to dialogue

¹⁶⁹*Ratio* 61.

¹⁷⁰Numbers indicate sections in the "Augustinians in the Church for the World of Today" (*IGC* 1998).

¹⁷¹ Cf. *S.* 101, 4; 71, 18; *En ps.* 56, 1.

together, listen together, think together, and respond together;¹⁷² second, the need to recover the spirit of the “eschatological reserve,” that is, to live the values of the kingdom of God (charity, peace, justice, unity and harmony).¹⁷³ Augustinians today can be a “leaven” in the Church by doing a critical self-examination on what it means to be a “communion” in society where the values of radical individualism and self-sufficiency, among others, produce the evils of institutionalized violence, racism, sexism, war and global poverty. The language of eschatology needs to be couched in the historical present, a transformation of the here and now, which is more in tune with modern sensitivities.¹⁷⁴ With this in mind, we can readily see how the Order of Saint Augustine recognized, from its earliest foundations, the importance of communion in light of future life in its spirituality. Is there continuity in the Order with the dynamism of Augustine’s notion of communion?

2. Retrieving “Convergence:” Thomas of Villanova and Jordan of Saxony

Communion is far from being a static reality. Rather, it is dynamic and ever-evolving. We have already seen that Augustine likens the dynamism of communion to the convergence of opposites, or of two walls meeting in a corner, the “kiss of peace.” This same metaphor of the walls appears periodically throughout the Order’s history. In an Advent sermon Thomas of Villanova speaks of the harmonization of the two walls as a consequence of the

¹⁷²See MARTIN, *Our Restless Heart*, pp. 156-157: “The very volume of attention being paid to Augustine today offers a unique challenge to hold together and keep in conversation all the differing and often conflicting concerns, methods and approaches Augustine is subjected to today. What is most essential in facing the abundant new readings of Augustine is to keep these readings in conversation with one another as well as with Augustine’s own rich complexity.”

¹⁷³VAN BAVEL, *The Basic Inspiration of Religious Life*, Chapter 6 and p. 220.

¹⁷⁴See SCANLON, “The Augustinian Tradition,” pp. 83-84.

Incarnation.

By his coming, however, the Lord has made peace between them (that is, the Gentiles and Jews), as a cornerstone joins one wall to another, making one Church out of the two peoples and breaking down the dividing wall built up by idolatry and the Law.¹⁷⁵

Jesus' life and teachings show how we can shape our lives, like a work of art, relate to diversity, and move toward "the corner" of rightly-ordered love.¹⁷⁶ Walls as barriers between people are broken down and the harmonization of differences has a quality of convergence toward a common goal or unifying principle, such as Christ.

Jordan of Saxony also uses the same architectural image of walls from another perspective. This time Jordan has the individual friar in the corner, receiving the converging walls of the contemplative and active dimensions of religious life. Our early historian and spiritual master is convinced that the friar can be in this position only if prayer and meditation are the cornerstone of his life. Jordan makes this observation because it is found in Augustine's own *Confessiones*, and he is "the exemplar and guide." He writes in *The Life of the Brethren* how the Church called hermit brothers out of the solitude of their cells to form the Order and to move to the new urban centers for ministry. The contemplative and the active lifestyles are not in opposition, but are compatible. Through prayer, reading, and

¹⁷⁵THOMAS OF VILLANOVA, *Second Sunday Advent, Sermon 2, 2*, in *WSTV*, part 1, p. 122. (Due to circumstances, I have been unable to cite this text in the original Spanish.)

¹⁷⁶ROTELLE (ed.), *The Augustine Catechism*, p. 133 or *Ench 32, 121*: "So all the divine commandments concern charity, of which the apostle says *the end of the commandment is charity that comes from a pure heart, a good conscience, and sincere faith*" (1 Tim 1:5) . . . This love is of God and neighbor (Mt 22:40). And it is the Holy Spirit who is charity. Augustine enjoys emphasizing the role of the Spirit with titles like *caritas, communitas, societas* or *unitas*. K.COYLE. "Concordia: The Holy Spirit as Bond of the Two Testaments in Augustine." *Augustinianum* 22 (1982): p. 448, see note 112.

meditation

he will be like a cornerstone, holding together the two sides: even if he is rejected by the world he remains secure at the head of the joint. This is what our most blessed father Augustine did . . . There he evangelized the world, not however becoming entangled in it, . . . as we see clearly from the *Confessions*.¹⁷⁷

In this discussion on the image of the walls converging into the cornerstone, Jordan links Augustine's *Sermo* 156 with *Confessiones* 11, 2, 2-4¹⁷⁸ in his struggle to maintain a balanced tension between two opposites, possible only when the direction of the tension is convergent toward Christ and the practice of prayer. Under the heading of the "Apostolate," the *Constitutions* gives importance to harmonizing contemplation and ministerial action:

For Augustine the duties of contemplation and action are respectively: to spend time on the word of God, taste the joys of learning, and be engaged in the science of salvation; and to preach the gospel, administer the sacraments, and carry out other duties and works. It is necessary, however, to blend and foster these things so harmoniously that neither the joyous taste for truth is lost, nor are the demands of love made burdensome, but rather that both prove to be of help, the one to the other.¹⁷⁹

¹⁷⁷JORDAN OF SAXONY, *The Life of the Brethren*, p. 85 (LV I, 11): "Ut sic sit sicut lapis angularis utrumque complectens, qui etsi reprobetur in mundo, in capite anguli conservetur. Sic enim fecit beatissimus Pater noster Augustinus, . . . et mundo evangelizavit nec tamen mundo se implicavit . . . ut patet XI libro Confessionum, capitulo 2o." The passage referred to in Augustine's *Confessiones*: "I am chary of frittering away on anything else the hours I find free from such needful activities as bodily refreshment, mental concentration, the duties I owe to the people and others which I do not owe but render nonetheless;" ("Et nolo in aliud horae diffluant, quas inuenio liberas a necessitatibus reficiendi corporis et intentionis animi et seruitutis, quam debemus hominibus et quam non debemus et tamen reddimus") (*Conf.* 11, 2, 2 CCL 27, 194).

¹⁷⁸Augustine speaks of a communal "we" who knock at the door of the Scriptures in order "to ponder the hidden wonders of your law" and to discover "the inner meaning of your words." And Christ, the Mediator, stands in the corner sustaining the two walls, the God-wall and the wall of humanity, for "through him you sought us when we were not seeking you." It is Christ who intercedes for us and "in him are hidden treasures of wisdom and knowledge" and "that is what I seek in your books." The "hidden harmonies" that exist within a people of faith on the journey seeking communion is tied to the relationship with Christ and the scriptures. The communion of a community happens when the hearts of the members converge into Christ and his law revealed as *caritas*.

¹⁷⁹*Const.* 40. Cf. *Civ Dei* 19, 19. See N. J. TORCHIA, "Contemplation and Action" in *AA*, pp. 233-235.

The idea of harmonizing walls may provide another way to strike a balance between contemplation and the heavy demands of ministry within an Augustinian spirituality. Busyness and over-activity will always be present, and will continue to threaten the quality of ministry, for ministry and community ought to “spring from a deep interior life.”¹⁸⁰ Earlier we said one will feel the pull in many directions until there is a convergence of desires, feelings, hopes toward “fullness of life,” through Christ, in prayer.¹⁸¹ Jordan of Saxony and Thomas of Villanova used this metaphor of the converging walls in the temple.

Can we recover the expression of convergence to describe the tension between contemplation and action, community life, inner and outer life, as well as other forms of polarity? Is it possible to speak of the spirit of the Order, not in terms of the static notion of “community,”¹⁸² but as convergent dynamism of “communion” as we find further elaborated in Jordan’s “Fourfold Communion” (*communio quadriformis*)?¹⁸³

¹⁸⁰*Const.* 40.

¹⁸¹Cf. *Jn.* 10:10.

¹⁸²Citing Jordan of Saxony, a distinction is made between “community” and “communion” in *Const.* 26: “If we carefully examine Saint Augustine’s ideal . . . we find that he based his entire religious foundation on community, or better on communion”

¹⁸³Jordan’s “Fourfold Communion” was identified in Chapter Two as living in the same place, spiritual oneness, possession of goods, and proportional distribution.

ZUMKELLER, *Theology and History of the Augustinian School*, pp. 97-104. James of Viterbo (d. 1307) wrote in the work *Christian Government (De regimine christiano)* of three kinds of unity in the Church: unity of totality, unity of similarity, and unity of assignment. The first unity refers to the “parts to the whole” in the mystical body (where there is discord); the second unity describes a oneness with the “gifts of grace,” that is, the unity of the virtues (faith, hope, love) and the works arising from them -- love is its social principle; the third unity concerns the destiny of all Christians in the Church, whose end is eternal happiness (pp. 100-101). H. X. Arquillière calls this text “the earliest treatise on the Church” (p. 97). In connection with the treatise *De Ecclesia*, see D. GUTIERREZ, “Ermites de Saint-Augustin” in *DS* 4, col. 986 and A. BOLAND, “Royaume de Dieu et Royauté du Christ” in *DS* 13, col. 1077. See also A. d’ALÈS, “Jacques de Biterbe Théologien de l’Église.” *Gregorianum* 7 (1926), pp. 330-353 and J. MADOZ, “Una nueva redacción de los textos pseudo-patristicos sobre el Primado en Jacobo de Viterbo?” *Gregorianum* 17 (1936), pp. 562-583.

The *Ratio* is a fitting document through which we can address these questions and summarize the chapter on prayer and communion. It is fitting because here the theme of harmony can make a contribution. We remember that this document,¹⁸⁴ which suggests how to apply the spirituality of the Order to concrete circumstances, contains a significant part called “Formation to a Life of Love, Humility, Friendship, Communication and Harmony.”¹⁸⁵ Two statements can be made about this title. It can be reworded as “Formation to a Life of Harmony,” for love, humility, friendship and communication are components of harmony. And what is important to notice is the term “Harmony,” is linked as a subtitle with community life, but left undeveloped in paragraphs 29-30, a point treated in Chapter Two. A critical statement is made in paragraph 30:

In the past, formation in religious life taught people how to pray, how to live the vows, and how to be a good apostle, but not necessarily how to live in community. True formation for Augustinian religious life must first of all prepare for living in a community.

This statement is correct to say that formation in Augustinian spirituality must begin with learning “how to live in community,” a dimension not taken seriously in the past. Unfortunately, the *Ratio* still perpetuates this dilemma,¹⁸⁶ even though a section on love,

¹⁸⁴*Ratio* 2: “This present *Plan* intends to integrate and specify what is already contained in the *Constitutions* (especially 206-221), spell out more clearly the essential elements of Augustinian formation.”

¹⁸⁵*Ratio* 1.2,19-30. Here the term “Harmony” (29-30) appears explicitly in the official texts. See Appendix 2.

¹⁸⁶I say “dilemma” because the *Ratio* intends to focus on *Const.* 206-221 (cf. *Const.* 2) which reinforces the “split” with learning how to live in community. *Const.* 206-221 deals with three aspects of formation: human-Christian, religious-Augustinian, and apostolic-pastoral aspects. Little is said about the spirituality of the Order (*Const.* 20-42).

humility, friendship and communication has been added within the scope of formation. The theme of harmony discussed in this chapter presents new avenues on “how to live in community” and better understand the self. Let us review some of those points.

1) Since harmony is a gift of God, the primary human/divine relationship must be the love of self directed towards the divine Other. The work of interiority involves prayer through the auditorium of the self where one “listens” and is “heard;” it is the locus for unmasking the false self, the self of illusions and make-believe.

2) Essential to the task of interiority and integral to the act of prayer is giving voice to one’s deepest desires (love, fear, hope, joy) and allowing those desires to converge and to be shaped by the words of Scripture and the life of Christ. This harmony of relations between the inner/outer self involves the whole self (heart, mind, body, actions) and the deliberate risk to be open to transformation and the unsuspected movements of grace. To the extent that the self can be open to divine mystery, one can be open to the inner mystery of the other person.

3) The communion of a community manifests itself in the act of common prayer for it is “*in Deum*.” The fire of God ignited in the spirit of each member, a self-in-relation, becomes an attractive force, of mutual love and invisible bonds of charity, like “burning coals” through which others are drawn to by its delight. One is invited to interior change through the pleasure of participating in the converging dynamic, of being “caught up in Christ” together.

4) Communion, the concord of community of living, points to a value of the future life toward which Christians strive. Community is far from an ideal nor is it an escape; it is

a “school of realism” in which the best and the worst of human beings are found.¹⁸⁷ The term “communion,” rather than “community,” creates in language the adequate shift of intent toward a deeper dynamic on why people come together, to converge into God and through one another in God.

5) Attempts at building community will inevitably encounter conflict and tension. Because of personalities, social backgrounds, the inner forces of pride and egoism in the human condition become apparent and their influence is felt. Such experiences are not abnormal, but present challenges for personal and group growth and maturity.¹⁸⁸ The depth of prayer, if it is honest, creates the opportunity to explore one’s own shortsightedness and sources of self-love and conceit that calls for *metanoia* and forgiveness. In times of conflict, how have we contributed to the source of tension? If we recognize the divine presence struggling within my interior self, do we recognize the same presence in the invisible depths

¹⁸⁷*Ratio 29*: “Community life is not a romantic dream, but a school of realism” (cf. *En ps.* 99, 11; *PL* 37, 1277) . . . “Augustine tells us that he never met better people than those who made progress in the monastery but, on the other hand, that he never met worse than those who had lost their ideal” (cf. *Ep.* 78, 8-9; *PL* 33, 272).

¹⁸⁸*Ratio 30*: “Wherever people try to build up a community, be this in youth movements, peer groups, support groups, in families or in religious life, they will be confronted with tension and conflict . . . The tension between the self and the other (or the group) can express itself in egoism, pride, exploitation, or destructive criticism.”

See GUZELIMIAN, *Parallels and Paradoxes*, pp. 6-12: A concrete example of using music to establish “harmony” in the midst of “discord” is Barenboim’s and Said’s joint effort and daring experiment to establish the Weimar workshop in 1999. In Weimar, Germany, Arab, Israeli, and German musicians were brought together to play as one orchestra – “as an alternative way of making peace.” An “unstoppable transformation” took place once the students discovered how much ignorance they had of the “other.” By playing the same music “they tried to do something together” and “shared a common experience.” The challenge is to “put one’s own identity to the side in order to explore the ‘other’.” For their work with the young musicians of the West-Eastern Divan Workshop, Barenboim and Said received the Concord Prize. See Arjan El Fassed, “Daniel Barenboim and Edward Said awarded the annual Prince of Asturias Concord Prize in Spain,” in *The Electronic Intifada*, 4 September 2002 [cited 2 October 2003]; available from World Wide Web @ <http://electronicintifada.net/v2/article639.shtml>

of the other, who is also God's temple? Forgiveness, mutuality, complementarity, and friendship strengthen the invisible bonds between members striving for the gifts of communion and harmony, together and in Christ.

If we acknowledge that the Order is faithful to Augustine in its approach of harmony, we may consider that an important aspect is forgotten by the tradition, the bishop's description of the "whole Christ."

CHAPTER 5: THE “WHOLE CHRIST:” A FORGOTTEN EXPRESSION OF HARMONY

In the previous chapter on prayer and communion, the theme of harmony deals with internal/external relationships of self-giving love with the self, others, and God. We pray together as friends *in Deum* in order to be “caught up in Christ;” we strive to live in communion as *anima una* to share in common because we are summoned to “love God and one another in God.” In this chapter we find something very original in Augustine and forgotten in the Order’s tradition. The *anima una*, an expression of the theme of harmony, is co-extensive with humanity throughout the world as a boundary-breaker of extraordinary proportions where no one needs to feel excluded. This “expansion” Augustine calls the “whole Christ.”

When the bishop uses the term “whole Christ” (*totus Christus*) he is referring to *Christ and the church*, with Christ not only as Head but as the whole body, including its members.¹ This notion is intimately related to Augustinian spirituality; Luc Verheijen claims “that the *anima una* of *Acts* 4:32 is, in the eyes of Augustine, the *anima unica Christi* or,

¹W. MALLARD, “Jesus Christ” in *AA*, p. 468; cf. *Jo. Ev. Tr.* 28, 1. L. VERHEIJEN, *Saint Augustine: monk, priest, bishop*. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Historical Institute, 1978, pp. 63-65; for the “one soul of Christ” (p.64).

Augustine himself describes the “whole Christ” in one of the “Newly discovered sermons,” *sermo* 341, 1, 1, given in Carthage in 417: “[I]n a certain manner the whole Christ, in the fullness of the Church, that is, head and body according to the fullness of a perfect man in whom each of us is a member.”

which comes to the same thing, the ‘one soul of the Church,’ her *koinônia*.”²

The link between Christ and the Church requires a shift in thinking on what happened after Christ’s death.³ Jesus becomes “embodied” in the active gathering of the believers. Faith becomes tangible not in something ethereal, but it needs a body for expression; it needs hands, feet, and hearts. Augustine cannot think of the historical Jesus, the incarnate Word, without thinking at the same time about the Church. Conversely, he cannot speak about the Church without speaking about the “one soul of Christ.”⁴ The union between Christ and the Church is one “cemented” by love, the same love that unites the *anima una* of a religious community which, in turn, is supposed to mirror the “whole Christ.” By means of the “glue” of love, the rhythm of relationships between the self, others, and God, takes on new identification (not identity)⁵ without forsaking freedom. It is this dimension of identification through love with the *totus Christus* that Tarsicius van Bavel calls the already-mentioned “forgotten aspect” in Augustine’s thinking and religious experience.⁶

²VERHEIJEN, *Saint Augustine*, pp. 7-8; cf. Chapter II: “The one soul of Christ,” pp. 63-65. See S. 45, 157, 341, 361.

³See T. VAN BAVEL, “Church” in *AA*, pp. 170-171.

⁴VERHEIJEN, *Saint Augustine*, p. 63. T. VAN BAVEL, *Christians in the World: In introduction to the Spirituality of Augustine*. J. Rotelle (ed.). New York: Catholic Book Publishing Co., 1980, p. 89: The unity of the Head and Body is an image frequently used by Augustine and is the “cornerstone of his whole theology.”

⁵Where the term “identity” signifies a static reality, the term “identification” implies a dynamic process.

⁶See T. VAN BAVEL, “The ‘Christus Totus’ Idea: A Forgotten Aspect of Augustine’s Spirituality” in *Augustinian Spirituality and the Charism of the Augustinians*. J. Rotelle (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1995, pp. 59-70. IDEM, *Christians in the World*, pp. 80-95. See S. GRABOWSKI, “St. Augustine and the Doctrine of the Mystical Body of Christ.” *Theological Studies* 7 (1946): pp. 72-125. Also R. HESLINGA, *One Mind, One Heart. Augustinian spirituality of the Religious life*. A translation of A. MANRIQUE, *La vida monástica en s. Agustín. Enchiridion histórico -doctrinal y Regla*, Salamanca: El Escorial, 1959. Olympia Fields, Il.: Tolentine Center Press, 1973.

The *specific question* we want to ask is: how can the theme of harmony help the Order today reclaim the expanded dimension of the *anima una* contained in the notion of the “whole Christ?” If the theme of harmony deals with the “rhythm of relationships” with the self, God, and others, then the notion of the “whole Christ” can extend our understanding of these relationships, especially in the experience of disharmony.

With this question in mind, we will examine the “whole Christ” from two perspectives. The first looks at Augustine’s understanding of the *totus Christus*, beginning with Cicero’s concept of the parts to the whole in *De civitate Dei* and including pastoral texts, such as Augustine’s letters. *Epistula* 48 describes how the “we” of faith communities are joined and present to each other in Christ. *Epistula* 228 suggests how the “I” and the “we” ought to live in the face of the disharmony caused by the barbarian siege of Hippo. Possidius, Augustine’s biographer and friend, incorporated this important letter – an “incident that must by all means be recorded” – into his *Vita Augustini* for the sake of posterity, and therefore bears importance.⁷

The second perspective looks at texts from the Order’s tradition and history, such as *Ratio*, the Chapter documents and the *Constitutions*, for references made to “rediscover” the “whole Christ.” Connections with texts from the “forgotten spiritual masters and reformers

1973, pp. 96-101. G. TEJERINA ARIAS, “La Eclesiología agustiniana del *Christus totus*.” *Revista Agustiniana* 42/129 (2001): pp. 1139-1179.

⁷“Interea reticendum minime est, cum memorati impenderent hostes” (*Vita*, 30, 1; *Pellegrino*, 158). D. DE BRUYNE, “Le texte et les citations bibliques de la ‘Vita S. Augustini’ de Possidius.” *Revue Bénédictine* 42 (1930): p. 300: The author thinks Possidius published this letter, which was probably Augustine’s last correspondence.

of the Order,”⁸ like the *Lectures on the Book of Revelation* of Augustine Favaroni (d. 1443) and sermons of Girolamo Seripando (d. 1563), will be linked with the discussion for what they say about the notion of the “Body of Christ” and union as an integral component of the Order’s spirituality. The chapter concludes with those points for understanding the “whole Christ” and the theme of harmony.

The *objective* for this chapter is to show how the theme of harmony can help us retrieve the notion of the “whole Christ” in Augustinian spirituality, and at the same time, provide a pastoral direction for living in situations of disharmony. But first, we need to ponder what Augustine meant by the expression the “whole Christ.”

Part I: The “whole Christ” and Augustine

It is common to find among the works of modern Christology the description of Christ in terms of his divinity and humanity, as the divine, pre-existent Word of God, and as the one born of Mary, God and human, Mediator and Head of the Church. But Augustine introduces the “third way” (“whole Christ,”)⁹ of perceiving Christ as a “presence” in the world. No one has developed this idea further than did the bishop of Hippo.¹⁰

According to some theologians, modern Christology does not know what to do with

⁸D. GUTIERREZ, *The Augustinians in the Middle Ages: 1357-1517*. Vol. I, part II. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Historical Institute, 1983, p. 120.

⁹For Augustine, one encounters the whole Christ in the totality of the Scriptures that incorporates the head and body, Christ and Church. See TEJERINA ARIAS, “La Eclesiología agustiniana del *Christus totus*,” pp. 1146, 1148.

¹⁰VAN BAVEL, *Christians in the World*, p. 81.

Augustine's *totus Christus*.¹¹ Perhaps some reasons can be found in a certain institutional fear of the "symbolical or mystical."¹² Nor is this a common insight among the community of the faithful.

According to some theologians, modern Christology does not know what to do with Augustine's *totus Christus*.¹³ Perhaps some reasons can be found in a certain institutional fear of the "symbolical or mystical."¹⁴ Nor is this a common insight among the community of the faithful. What the bishop of Hippo has in mind with the "third way" is the reality (not a comparison) of an intimate, interchangeable, relationship of love and presence between Christ-Head and Church-Body. In other words, the *anima una* of communion is co-extensive with humankind. To expand on this idea of the "whole Christ," we will look at how Christ is present in the believing community, in the poor, and in situations of discord.

A. Christ present in the faithful: "though many -- so it is with Christ"

Movements and ideas are often grounded in the experience of an encounter. When Alypius, Augustine's friend, decided to remain with him as a companion after the conversion

¹¹ Cf. *Jo. ev. tr.* 21,8. VAN BAVEL, "The 'Christus Totus' Idea," p. 61. Augustine's doctrine of the whole Christ is based on the writings of Paul which "have shaped Augustinian christology as never happened before in Christian tradition" (p. 60). For Grabowski, the "center" of Augustine's theological thought – "center" meaning toward which all other doctrines converge, radiate, or cluster as a single object – is the person Christ. See also GRABOWSKI, "St. Augustine and the Doctrine of the Mystical Body of Christ," pp. 100-101.

¹²VAN BAVEL, *Christians in the World*, p. 81.

¹³ Cf. *Jo. ev. tr.* 21,8. VAN BAVEL, "The 'Christus Totus' Idea," p. 61. Augustine's doctrine of the whole Christ is based on the writings of Paul which "have shaped Augustinian christology as never happened before in Christian tradition" (p. 60). For Grabowski, the "center" of Augustine's theological thought – "center" meaning toward which all other doctrines converge, radiate, or cluster as a single object – is the person Christ. See also GRABOWSKI, "St. Augustine and the Doctrine of the Mystical Body of Christ," pp. 100-101.

¹⁴VAN BAVEL, *Christians in the World*, p. 81.

episode in the garden at Milan, it was not because everything made perfect sense. In Book Nine of the *Confessions* Augustine is pierced to the heart – like a sword – by “Your words” and moved by the “examples of your servants,” the communion of saints.¹⁵ This incident, where Augustine finds Christ deep in his interior self and surrounded by the example of holy people, “might be taken as the religious experience encouraging the notion of the *Christus totus*.”¹⁶

Augustine builds his concept of the “whole Christ” on the thinking of Paul, specifically *Romans* 12:4-6.¹⁷ Among the body’s members, the “I” and “we” are related together as parts to the whole. Together the members of the body make up the “one body of Christ.” Similarly, in *De civitate Dei* 2, 21, Augustine cites Cicero’s comparison of parts to the whole to the blending of discord into musical harmony and the concord in a city that is the fruit of justice.

[A] certain harmony (*concentus*) must be maintained which the cultivated ear cannot bear to hear disrupted or discordant; and such harmony, concordant and consistent, may be brought about by the balancing of even the most dissimilar voices . . . What musicians call harmony (*harmonia*) in singing is concord in the city, which is the most artful and best bond of security in the commonwealth, and which, without

¹⁵The text reads -- “With the arrows of your charity you had pierced our hearts, and we bore your words within us like a sword penetrating us to the core. The example of your servants, whom you had changed from murky to luminous beings, from dead to living men, were crowding in upon our thoughts . . .” (“Sagittaueras tu cor nostrum caritate tua, et gestabamus uerba tua transfixa uisceribus et exempla seruorum tuorum, quos de nigris lucidos et de mortuis uiuos feceras, congesta in sinum cogitationis nostrae urebant”) (*Conf.* 9, 2, 3; *CCL* 27, 134).

¹⁶I am grateful to J. KNIES for sharing with me his “Reflections: *Totus Christus*,” [unpublished manuscript], Tolentine Center, Olympia Fields, Illinois, 2001.

¹⁷*Rom.* 12:4-6: “Just as each of us has various parts in one body, and the parts do not all have the same function: in the same way, all of us, though there are so many of us, make up one body in Christ, and as different parts we are all joined to one another.”

justice, cannot be secured at all.¹⁸

A certain “rhythm of discernment,” based on delight, is required for the blending of different sounds.¹⁹ And the balanced harmony found in the city is a two-dimensional relationship between the higher and lower states as well as between each state or level of order. A parallel of this balance can be found in the relationship between the Church-Body to the Christ-Head, and among the members themselves in the Church-Body.

However, “in expressing the need for harmony and collaboration in society,”²⁰ the Pauline text from 1 *Corinthians* 12:12-27 makes the strongest impression on Augustine and his development of the doctrine of the “whole Christ.”²¹ The apostle to the Gentiles is not just making a comparison of Christ to the body of believers, in the way Cicero uses the diversity of musical sounds as a comparison to the concord in a city. Rather, Paul is describing a certain kind of web of relations that has a reality, and not a mere comparison of one thing to another: “For as with the human body which is a unity although it has many parts—all the parts of the body, though many, still making up one single body— *so it is with*

¹⁸“Ac uocibus concertus est quidam tenendus ex distinctis sonis, quem inmutatum aut discrepantem aures eruditae ferre non possunt, isque concertus ex dissimillarum uocum moderatione concors tamen efficitur et congruens . . . et quae harmonia a musicis dicitur in cantu, eam esse in ciuitate concordiam, artissimum atque optimum omni in re publica uinculum incolumitatis, eamque sine iustitia nullo pacto esse posse” (*Civ Dei* 2, 21; *CCL* 47, 53).

¹⁹A. SQUIRE, “The Cosmic Dance: Reflections on the *De musica* of St. Augustine.” *The New Blackfriars* 35 (1954): pp. 477-484, especially p. 483. Cf. *De mus.* 6, 9, 23.

²⁰VAN BAVEL, “The ‘Christus Totus’ Idea,” p. 61.

²¹ VAN BAVEL, “The ‘Christus Totus’ Idea,” p. 59. 1 *Cor.* 12:12-27(NIV): “The body is a unity, though it is made up of many parts . . . So it is with Christ . . . If the foot should say, ‘Because I am not a hand, I do not belong to the body,’ . . . But God has combined the members of the body and has given greater honor to the parts that lacked it, so that there should be no division in the body, but that its parts should have equal concern for each other. If one part suffers, every part suffers with it; if one part is honored, every part rejoices with it. Now you are the body of Christ”

Christ.” The expression – “so it is with Christ” – implies a presence and a unity between the “I” and the “we,” between Christ and the faithful.

When speaking about the presence of the “whole Christ,” we have in mind the sense of “collective” (or “corporate”)²² identification of love, and a presumption of the claim of faith, in Christ between the parts and the whole. In a certain manner this is a kind of “presence.”²³ As an example, “X” is present (affects) in “Y”; and the reversal is true: “Y” is present in “X”. Where “X” is, there is “Y,” and conversely, where “Y” is, there is “X.” The manner in which “X” and “Y” (or the “I” and “we”) are present (or represent) to each other depends on each other’s claim and the extent to which one’s self opens up to the other. In the case of the claim of friendship, one is present to the other according to the conditions and limits set by each friend. Or we might consider the classroom situation where the professor’s wife is traveling to a distant city. For that professor, his wife has a greater claim on his life because, through love, she has greater influence on him. The wife, although physically absent, is more present to the professor than his students are. Presence, then, deals

²² VAN BAVEL, *Christians in the World*, p. 82. Other authors will speak of the “whole Christ” in “corporate” terms. GRABOWSKI, “St. Augustine and the Doctrine of the Mystical Body of Christ,” p. 77: the Church is considered as a corporate unity. There are a variety of phrases which Augustine used to describe this unity: “totus Christus,” “unus ille,” “unus vir,” “vir integer,” “perfectus vir,” “una persona,” “sponsus et sponsa, duo in carne una,” all of which replace the word “Church” and express its intimate relationship with Christ (p. 78).

There are some who captured the thought pattern of the Augustinian whole Christ. People like Dorothy Sölle, Catherine de Hueck, and Oscar Romero have understood this meaning. Some recent theological studies have picked up on this theme, like J. A. SULLIVAN, *Explorations in Christology. The Impact of Process-Relational Thought*. New York: P. Lang, 1987, p. 63. Cited in VAN BAVEL, “The ‘Christus Totus’ Idea,” p. 69. See D. SÖLLE, *Christ the Representative: An Essay in Theology after the ‘Death of God.’* D. Lewis (trans.). London: SCM Press, Ltd., 1967.

²³See SULLIVAN, *Explorations in Christology*, pp. 56, 69-70 and VAN BAVEL, *Christians in the World*, pp. 86-90 for a development of the notion of “presence.” Van Bavel speaks of Christ’s “presence in the poor and destitute” and “presence in the believers.”

with a claim on our life that has influence, force, and power.

When we look at Jesus of Nazareth we find that God's presence has an absolute claim and influence. When Jesus referred to his "I," his sense of "self" went beyond the boundaries of his skin and was more than just psychic energy that animated the matter of his body. Due to his cognizance of God's presence and his absolute response in love and in freedom (something we do more or less), the "size" of his "self" is huge and co-extensive with humankind.²⁴ This is why Jesus can say "In truth I tell you, in so far as you neglected to do this to one of the least of these, you neglected to do it to me" – a value important for Augustine and to which we will return later.²⁵ We, too, participate in the same dynamic when the Christ-Event (birth, death, resurrection) has a claim on our lives and we choose to respond in a free association of love. When we choose to follow Jesus in discipleship in faith, hope, and love, communion with Christ's presence comes into existence.²⁶

An example of this communion with Christ is found in *Epistula* 48 which Verheijen calls "a very interesting and valuable" letter of Augustine.²⁷ Written in 398, Augustine's letter is a response to Abbot Eudoxius from the island of Capraria, who asked about whether or not a monk should quit monastic life to take on pastoral leadership of a local church. The

²⁴SULLIVAN, *Explorations in Christology*, pp. 62-63: The terms "size" and "self" are Sullivan's terms.

²⁵*Mt. 25:45* JB.

²⁶See VAN BAVEL, "Church," pp. 170-172. To follow Jesus means to pray as he did, to be of service to the poor and to the marginalized, and to love one's friends and enemies.

²⁷VERHEIJEN, *Saint Augustine*, pp. 63-65.

first lines of this letter point to the meaning of the *anima una* or the “one soul of Christ.”²⁸

When we think of the peace that you enjoy in Christ, we too find rest in your love, even though we are caught up in the midst of various difficult labors. For we are one body under one head in such a way that you are also busy in us and we are at leisure in you. Because *if one member suffers*, . . . [cites 1 Cor. 12:26].²⁹

“Being one body” in Christ makes possible a relationship between life in the monastery and in the local church; that one is present in and represented by the other. With this reality in mind, Augustine tells the abbot to steer a middle path between the life of prayer and the life of ministry, caring for the needy, and supporting one another in difficult times. Echoing the *Rule*, he writes

[Whether] *singing and chanting in your hearts to the Lord (Eph. 5:19)*, or with words in harmony with your hearts, *do all for the glory of God who does all things in all (1 Cor. 10:31, 12,6)*.³⁰

In Christ, there is a collective identification and an interchangeability of love among the members of the body, even in times of suffering and need. The middle road is marked out by being centered in Christ, through whom a bond with one another and with the “God of peace” become “unbreakable.” He concludes,

Such action is not broken because of work, and it is not cold because of leisure. It is neither turbulent nor flagging, neither too bold nor cowardly, neither too hasty nor idle. Do all this, and the God of peace will be with you.³¹

²⁸Verheijen, *Saint Augustine: Monk, priest, bishop*, p. 64.

²⁹“Quando quietem uestram cogitamus, quam habetis in Christo, etiam nos, quamuis in laboribus uariis asperisque uersemur, in uestra caritate requiescimus, unum enim corpus sub uno capite sumus, ut et uos in nobis negotiosi et nos in uobis otiosi simus, quia, si patitur unum membrum, . . .” (*Ep.* 48, 1; *CSEL* 34, 137; *WSA* II/1, 192.)

³⁰“Siue cantantes et psallentes in cordibus uestris domino uel uocibus a corde non dissonis: omnia in gloriam dei facite” (*Ep.* 48, 3; *CSEL* 34, 139).

³¹“Talis actio nec frigitur negotio nec frigida est otio nec turbulenta nec marcida est nec audax nec fugax nec praeceps nec iacens. Haec agite et deus pacis erit uobiscum” (*Ep.* 48, 3; *CSEL* 34, 139).

The notion of the “whole Christ”-- that is, the *anima una* -- breaks the boundaries of identity and relationships. It is no longer either the contemplative or the active life, but a “both/and” in Christ, because the “I” and the “community” are interchangeable realities as well as mutually contained in one another. Augustine elaborates on the *anima una* when he writes: “your soul is not your own, but is shared by all the brethren whose souls are also yours, or, rather, whose souls form with yours not souls, but one soul, the single soul of Christ.”³² The faith community in Hippo is present in Capraria and the monastic community of Capraria is represented in the pastoral ministry in Hippo.

One final observation is to be made regarding Christ’s presence in the believing community. The link between the Head and Body relationship of the “whole Christ” becomes more apparent in the context of prayer and liturgy for the believing community. Scripture texts portray the praying person or community as speaking, sighing, longing, desiring, exulting and confessing. But who is speaking? Augustine prefers to say that both Christ and the faithful pray in and through each other. It is Christ who prays through the psalms.³³ When we (Church) pray with harmony of heart and words it is Christ who prays through us and we (Church) do not separate ourselves from the prayers of Christ. In this

³²“Sic enim anima tua non est propria, sed omnium fratrum; quorum etiam animae tuae sunt, vel potius quorum animae cum tua non animae, sed anima una est, Christi unica” (*Ep.* 243, 4; *CSEL* 57). See L. MARÍN, *Augustinos: Novedad y Permanencia - Historia y espiritualidad de los orígenes*. Madrid: Religión y Cultura, 1990, p. 25: *Ep.* 243, 4 identifies the core of Augustinian spirituality.

³³See *En ps* 30, I, 3-5 and 56, 1. See A.-M. BESNARD, “Prière du chrétien: prière de Jésus-Christ” in *Prier Dieu Les Psaumes*. Translation of Augustine’s texts by J. Perret. Paris: Les Éditions du Cerf, 1994, pp. 33-38.

sense prayer is intensely communal and transformative.³⁴ When we speak, sigh, desire or confess we recognize the two voices in one.³⁵

The “whole Christ” is not just the believers,³⁶ but also the whole human race, for it is Christ who wants to be joined together with us, not out of necessity, but out of love.³⁷ Augustine extends this notion of identification with the poor and those who suffer by turning to the Gospel of *Matthew* and the *Acts of the Apostles*.

B. Christ present with the poor: “if one suffers, all suffer”

References to the “whole Christ” in Augustine, as well as in the New Testament, are few, but it does not mean they are less important. Van Bavel says they form an important group which deal chiefly with the “call to service in this world.”³⁸ Commenting on *Matthew*’s account of the Final Judgement: “I was hungry . . . thirsty . . . a stranger . . . naked . . . sick . . . in prison and you came to see me,” Augustine claims that the poor are Christ’s presence in the world.³⁹ It is Christ who lacks the material and relational needs for a dignified human existence. The Christian must take care of Christ who lies by the roadside;

³⁴ VAN BAVEL, “The ‘Christus Totus’ Idea,” pp. 65-66. At one level, prayer becomes transformative when our desires are in harmony with our words and when we pray with the words of Christ our desires are transformed to become the desires of Christ. In this way, Scripture challenges and redirects our desires.

³⁵Cf. *En ps* 30.1, 3-5.

³⁶Cf. *En ps* 30.1, 4; *Eph* 4:13.

³⁷Cf. *S.* 341, 9, 11.

³⁸VAN BAVEL, *Christians in the World*, p. 87. See note 56 for biblical citations for the “whole Christ.” Sermons that deal with the “whole Christ:” *S.* 71, 28; 133, 8; 149, 10; 243, 4; 341, 1.

³⁹*Mt.* 25:31-46. G. Gutierrez makes a similar point when we do “good works” for the poor we meet Christ, and this meeting is grace. “The ethic of being a disciple rests on this meeting with Christ in the poor.” See G. GUTIERREZ, “The Violence of a System.” *Concilium* 140 (1980): pp. 97-98.

take care of Christ who hungers, freezes, is destitute and a stranger.⁴⁰

The second reference comes from *Acts*' depiction of Saul's actions: "Why are you persecuting me? . . . I am Jesus, whom you are persecuting."⁴¹ The faithful, oppressed by war and terror, are Christ. Both passages from *Matthew* and *Acts* portray a new identification of relationships and intimate union of Christ with suffering humanity. Augustine joins the categories of the poor and persecuted in *Sermo* 345, 4, given in 411 or 416 in Carthage, on the feast of the women martyrs of Thuburbo:

"Saul . . . persecuting me?" It's the same one who says to you, "Feed me on earth." Saul was raging, and yet it was Christ that he was persecuting. The same applies to you also; pay out on earth, and it is Christ you are feeding . . . "I was hungry and you gave me to eat."⁴²

The unity of relationship and the *anima una* between the self, others, and Christ are found in the Christ of Saul and when we assist (or ignore) the Christ of the poor. As we have seen in *Epistula* 48, the suffering Church has an echo in Paul when this body is wounded: "if one part suffers, all the parts suffer with it," an expression of the *anima una*.⁴³ No one lives in complete isolation. No one can completely ignore those who suffer, for we are all

⁴⁰"Attendite illum iacentem sub porticu, attendite esurientem, attendite frigus patientem, attendite egenum, attendite peregrinum" (*S. de vetere testamento*, 25, 8, 8; *CCL* 41, 339; *Cf. Ep.* 157, 4, 36).

⁴¹*Acts* 9:4; 22:8; 26:14. *Cf. En ps* 142, 3. See also TEJERINA ARIAS, "La Eclesiología agustiniana del *Christus totus*," p. 1145, regarding Saul on the way to Damascus. GRABOWSKI, "St. Augustine and the Doctrine of the Mystical Body of Christ," p. 79: "'Saule, Saule, cur me persequeris?'" In this intimate and unique unity of Christ and His Church is rooted the identification of Christ with His Church, taken not only abstractly as a corporate entity but also concretely with His members. For it is not the actions, attributes, and perfections of Christ alone that are ascribed to that entity which is the Body of Christ, but also the state, actions, and qualities of the members are predicated of it. As a result we have a variety of attributes, often widely disparate, referring to the same Body of Christ."

⁴²"'Saulus . . . me persequeris?' ipse tibi dicit, Pasce me. In terra Saulus saeviebat, et Christum in coelo tangebatur: sic et tu in terra eroga, et Christum in coelo pascis . . . 'Esurivi, et dedistis mihi manducare'" (*S.* 345, 4; *PL* 39, 1520; *cf. S.* 239, 7).

⁴³1*Cor.* 12:26.

interconnected by a web of relations. Even the “turn away” sends its ripple-effect of non-love that weakens the body of humankind, and thus, the “whole Christ.” Christ present in the poor is a summons to service in the here and now. In another sermon given in Hippo Regius in the last years of his life, Augustine is more dramatic with this collective identification between the suffering Church and Christ:

Look, here I am in heaven, and you are there on earth, and you are persecuting me. Why me? Because my members; the members through whom I am there. After all, if the foot is trodden on, the tongue doesn't fail to cry out.⁴⁴

Thus far, we see two basic orientations of presence with the “whole Christ,” with the *anima una* between Head and Body. The first is the presence of Christ in the community of believers. And then, Christ is present in a special way in the poor and suffering Church which summons others, who have the claim of the Christ-Event in their lives, to respond in love and service. Does Augustine apply his notion of the “whole Christ” to concrete situations of conflict and disharmony?

C. Christ present in discord: “we are not to break the bonds”

Human suffering continued throughout the North African Church in which the dying bishop of Hippo had dedicated so many years to build up into a communion of faith.⁴⁵ Buried

⁴⁴“Ecce ego hic sum in coelo, tu in terra, et in persecutoribus. Quare me? Quia membra mea: per quae membra mea ibi sum. Non enim si calcetur planta, non clamat lingua” (S. 395, 2; PL 39, 1716).

⁴⁵P. BROWN, *Augustine of Hippo: A Biography*. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1967 (new edition 2000), p. 428: “Roman rule in Africa simply collapsed. In the summer of 429 and the spring of 430, the Vandals suddenly and swiftly overran Mauretania and Numidia. There is no record of resistance by the population: no Catholic communities rallied behind their bishops, as had been the case in Spain, to resist and harry the barbarians. The Catholic bishops were divided and demoralized, their flock passive. Faced with ‘overthrowers of the Roman world’, they lost their taste for martyrdom.”

in the final chapters of Possidius' biography,⁴⁶ *Epistula 228*, Augustine's last correspondence written in the summer of 429, provides us with a glimpse of his firmness regarding the ties of human relationships when violence is directed against the Church and its people. The letter of Augustine responds to a question posed by Honoratus, bishop of Thiabe, asking whether or not the bishops and clergy should leave their Churches when the barbarians arrive. Avoiding the trap of trying to "read the mind" of the bishop, the kernel of this letter expresses the thoughts closest to his heart – "not to abandon the Churches" – at a time when people needed their ministers, when all dreams and pastoral labors were lost, and when disharmony reigns. *Epistula 228* portrays the *anima una* of the "whole Christ" and the art of living in the context of discord.⁴⁷

Augustine does not use the term *totus Christus* in *Epistula 228*, but expressions of the *anima una*, like "Christ's sheep," "living stones," and "members of Christ's body," are indeed present. Faith in the Christ-Head demands internal/external bonds of relatedness and a concrete expression of solidarity (not abandonment) by the clergy, and that one be present with the suffering Church-Body, the "whole Christ." "Let them all alike survive or let them all alike suffer what the Father of the family wills them to suffer."⁴⁸ It is the *anima una* that survives or suffers together.

⁴⁶*Ep. 228* (CSEL 57, 484-496) can be found in POSSIDIUS, *Vita Augustini*, 30, 1-51. This is the only letter of Augustine's incorporated into the biography.

⁴⁷H. -I. MARROU, *St. Augustin et l'augustinisme*. Paris: Éditions du Seuil, 1955, p. 7: Augustine's entire life has been a development of "un art de vivre par temps de catastrophe."

⁴⁸"Et aut pariter uiuant aut pariter sufferant, quod eos pater familias uolet perpeti" (*Ep. 228*, 2; CSEL 57, 486; *Vita* 30, 11).

The pastor of souls confronts the reality of war and reclaims self-giving love, a component of the theme of harmony, saying: “we are not to break the bonds by which love of Christ binds us to our ministry and not to abandon the churches we are obliged to serve.”⁴⁹ One must “struggle against one’s own fear”⁵⁰ and tendencies toward self-love and self-preservation. And “as Christ laid down his life for us, so we ought to lay down our lives for the brethren (1 *Jn.* 3:16).”⁵¹ The “ministers of Christ” (*serui Christi*) must nourish the faith communities with sacrament and the Word: “how greatly Christian peoples benefit if in the present calamities they have Christ’s ministers present among them.”⁵² The idea that runs through the letter is that the bishops and clergy, as supreme proof of their love, “must not abandon the churches.” Their presence is vital.

Epistula 228 gives us a kind of praxis for dealing with conflict that consists of coming together and of looking into the deeper meaning of events, of profound prayer, of inner desire and courage, and of maintenance of bonds with one another. We find this praxis in the last sentence of this letter: “our best course in the present dangers is to pray and . . . by his gift . . . find the desire and strength not to abandon their churches, and have persevered in their firm resolve in the face of detractors.”⁵³ Where disharmony breaks bonds,

⁴⁹“Et ministerii nostri uinula, quibus nos Christi caritas alligauit, ne deseramus ecclesias, quibus seruire debemus, non esse rumpenda” (*Ep.* 228, 1; *CSEL* 57, 484; *Vita* 30, 4).

⁵⁰“Quare non potius contra suum timorem” (*Ep.* 228, 7; *CSEL* 57, 489; *Vita* 30, 24).

⁵¹*Cf.* (*Ep.* 228, 3; *CSEL* 57, 486; *Vita* 30, 12).

⁵²“Quantum boni consequantur populi Christiani, si in praesentibus malis non eis desit praesentia ministrorum Christi” (*Ep.* 228, 9; *CSEL* 57, 491; *Vita* 30, 32).

⁵³“Melius tamen, quod in his periculis faciamus, inuenire non possumus quam orationes . . . ut scilicet ecclesias non desererent, dei dono . . . et uelle et facere meruerunt et inter dentes obtrectantium a sui propositi intentione minime defecerunt” (*Ep.* 228, 14; *CSEL* 57, 496; *Vita* 30, 51).

the praxis of harmony holds everything together.

In the winter of 429, the barbarians surrounded the fortified town of Hippo and seized control of the port and surrounding sea. Panic spread throughout the region whose bishops with their people fled to the city for safety from the impending invasion. Peter Brown writes: “Augustine lived to see violence destroy his life’s work in Africa.”⁵⁴ Prayers and hymns to God were no longer sung in the churches. Church-buildings were desecrated and burnt to the ground. In the midst of these disasters, Possidius of Calama tells us that the bishop was consoled with the words of Plotinus: “No one is great who is amazed that wood and stone collapse and mortals die.”⁵⁵ Augustine died on August 28th, 430.⁵⁶

Thus far we have seen how the “whole Christ” is an extension of the *anima una* of the first Christian communities in Jerusalem. The “one soul of Christ” is the presence of Christ in the world, especially among the poor and the faith communities, and not a mere comparison of the parts of the body. In situations of conflict, Christ is present in those who suffer and the Church’s ministers, through the identification of love. Even accepting the “ultimate consequences,” we are not to break the bonds of Christ’s love with the people. The praxis for these situations necessitates an intensification of the web of relationships between the self, others, and Christ, through deep prayer and mutual support. The response to discord is “not to break the bonds of the love of Christ.” The question we want to ask next is: does

⁵⁴BROWN, *Augustine of Hippo*, p. 429. For a study on North Africa after the invasions (435 - 711), see MARÍN, *Augustinos: Novedad y Permanencia*, pp. 30 - 48.

⁵⁵“Non erit magnus magnum putans quod cadunt ligna et lapides, et moriuntur mortales” (*Vita* 28, 11; *Pellegrino*, 154).

⁵⁶See POSSIDIUS, *Vita* 31.

the Order expand on the notion of the “whole Christ” present in the faith community, in the poor, and in those who suffer?

Part II: The “whole Christ” and the Order’s Tradition

Augustine’s notion of the “whole Christ” as presence and collective identification in love between the parts and the whole, between the “I” and the “we,” and between the Christ-Head and the Church-Body, is an extension of the *anima una* of the first Jerusalem communities. We already know that the concept of the “whole Christ” is a “forgotten aspect” among Augustinians, even though there is a renewed effort to retrieve this unique notion of Christ’s presence in the world.

Sources considered for the topic of the “whole Christ” in the Order’s tradition will include the “forgotten spiritual writers”⁵⁷ and reformers of the Order, like Augustine Favaroni, for his development of the “Christo integro” and contribution to the “mystical Body of Christ,” and Girolamo Seripando, for his spirituality of union that influenced the reform of the Order and the pastoral dynamic between bishops and their churches. Finally, we will look at the *Constitutions*, chapter documents and *Ratio* for their insights toward the rediscovery of the “whole Christ” as the ultimate horizon of Oneness.

⁵⁷GUTIERREZ, *The Augustinians in the Middle Ages*, p. 120. Other “forgotten spiritual writers” are Clement of Osimo (d. 1291), Augustine of Tarano (d. 1309), and Alexander of Oliva (d. 1463). “These five men (who were theologians and priors general) were masters of spirituality who reached holiness through their government of the Order and their service to the Church.” One may inquire as to why these authors are forgotten. As reformers, did their theological ideas affect the status quo to such an extent that they had to be marginalized? See P. SHELDRAKE, *Spirituality & History: Questions of Interpretation and Method*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 1991 (revised 1995), pp. 183-184 on the critical interpretation of spiritual texts.

A. Augustine Favaroni: “Christo integro”

One of the prime contributing thinkers who brought greater definition to the Church as the Mystical Body of Christ is Augustine Favaroni (sometimes called Augustine of Rome). Before discussing him, we need to review briefly the development of the expression “Mystical Body of Christ.”

1. “*Mystical Body of Christ*”: origin and development

The phrase “Body of Christ” has roots in the Pauline and patristic texts. The adjectival modifier “mystical” has its roots in neither.⁵⁸ Theologians are not in agreement as to the origin of the phrase “Body of Christ,” but some indicate possible Stoic and Gnostic influences as well as the influence of Judaic thought in general.⁵⁹

The Pauline notion of the “Body of Christ” is found in 1 *Corinthians* and in *Romans*, which generated new categories such as “Head” and “fullness” in the later (possibly deutero-Pauline) letters (*Colossians* and *Ephesians*).⁶⁰ Christ’s Body is a visible Body, sacramentally and hierarchically structured. For Paul, the baptized faithful are members of the Body.⁶¹ Christians must share in Christ’s way and mission, thus, his Body-Person takes on relevance.

⁵⁸F. X. LAWLORD and M. DOYLE, “Mystical Body of Christ” in *New Catholic Encyclopedia*. 2nd ed. Detroit: Thomason/Gale; Washington D.C.: Catholic University of America, 2003, pp. 99-105, especially p. 99. Much of the reflection here on the notion “Mystical Body of Christ” is taken from this article and G. TEJERINA ARIAS, “La Eclesiología agustiniana del *Christus totus*.” *Revista Agustiniana* 42/129 (2001): pp. 1139-1179.

⁵⁹LAWLORD and DOYLE, “Mystical Body of Christ,” p. 100. “Stoic origins deal with a linking of the cosmos or state to an organism (1*Cor.* 12:12-30; *Rom.* 12:4-5), and others link the phrase to Gnostic myth beliefs of the Primal Heavenly Man. The most distinctively important elements are found in Christian revelation and life, and within the framework of Judaic expression and thought.”

⁶⁰1 *Cor.* 6:12-20; 10:17; 12:12-30 and *Rom.* 12:4-5. *Col.* 2:11-13; 1:22; 3:9-11 and *Eph.* 2:14-16; 4:4-6.

⁶¹The Spirit is given at baptism (1*Cor.* 6:11; *Tit.* 3:5.)

As mentioned earlier, Christians participate in that Body that passes from death to life as members in a new order that is hidden and mystery. The Spirit who quickens the Body of the risen Christ is the life principle for Christians.⁶² There is charismatic diversity in unity and the faithful are “fellow members of the same body.”⁶³ The various gifts are meant to work together under one Spirit,⁶⁴ and serve and adorn the whole Body.⁶⁵ This unity in diversity is a permanent characteristic of the organic structure and life of Christ’s Body.⁶⁶

In the patristic era the mystery of the Church as the Body of Christ is found in Origen, Hilary, Athanasius, Chrysostom, Cyril of Alexandria, and Augustine.⁶⁷ Some orientations on this theme are (1) the Church is a sacramental principle of a visible sign and hidden reality. The Church-Body is Christ’s Spirit-quickened Body. (2) The Church represents the Spirit of God. Augustine summarizes this notion in his *Sermo* 267, 4: “What the soul is to the body of a human being, that the Holy Spirit is to Christ’s Body which is the Church.”⁶⁸(3) There is a clear link between Christ’s Eucharistic Body and the Church-Body

⁶²1 Cor. 15:44-49; 1 Cor.6:17.

⁶³1 Cor. 12; Rom.12:3-8; Eph. 3:6.

⁶⁴1 Cor. 12:7-11; Eph. 4:7.

⁶⁵Rom. 12:3-8; 1 Cor. 12:7; 14:12, 26.

⁶⁶1 Cor. 12; Rom. 12:3-8.

⁶⁷Augustine expands on Paul’s use of “body and members,” and to a lesser extent, the Johannine image of the vine and branches. The bishop also stresses the interior dimension of the Body of Christ: the life of Christ within the person, the unity of people, and their unity with the Church. See TEJERINA ARIAS, “La Eclesiología agustiniana del *Christus totus*,” pp. 1139-1140, 1150.

⁶⁸“Quod autem est anima corpori hominis, hoc est Spiritus sanctus corpori Christi, quod est Ecclesia” (S. 267, 4; PL 38, 1231; cf. 1 Cor. 12: 12-31). This notion carried with itself some problems, for instance, how does one deal with the sinner and how does the Spirit and grace work beyond the confines of Church structures, such as with the sacraments of a heretic or schismatic? See J. DJODI, *Le Saint-Esprit, Don de Dieu*, especially the “Partie Annexe.”

when there is a commitment to forming the “bond of peace” (*vinculum pacis*).⁶⁹ (4) The Body of Christ takes on wider meaning and extension, that is different from Paul, when the Church-Body is understood to embrace all the saints in both covenants. Some of these ideas were rejected and others were modified further in the medieval period.

We find the expression “*Mystical Body*” (*corpus mysticum*) used for the first time in the twelfth-century Latin theological writings on the Church of which the first official document is Boniface VIII’s bull *Unam Sanctam*.⁷⁰ From the ninth-century to about 1150, the *corpus mysticum* occurs frequently in writings and always means Christ’s Eucharistic Body with an awareness of a link to the Church-Body. The relationship is one of sacramental mystery. The emphasis changes after 1150 with an identity of Christ’s “physical” Body associated with Christ’s Eucharistic Body. A further change, although gradual, occurs and Christ’s Church-Body began to be called his Mystical Body to distinguish it from his true physical Body present in the Eucharist. At first the qualifier “mystical” as applied to the Church-Body kept its Eucharistic resonances as sacramentally signified and realized Body. The central focus is turned on the visible Catholic Church.⁷¹

By the time of the Protestant Reformation the Eucharistic link of sacrament and realized Body is no longer present in this interpretation, and there is a dissociation of the

⁶⁹“So if you want to understand the body of Christ, listen to the apostle telling the faithful, ‘You, though, are the body of Christ and its members (1 Cor. 12:27)’. . . Any who receive the sacrament of unity, and do not hold the bond of peace, do not receive the sacrament for their benefit, but a testimony against themselves” (“Corpus ergo Christi si vis intelligere, Apostolum audi dicentem fidelibus, ‘Vos autem estis corpus Christi, et membra’. . . Qui accipit mysterium unitatis, et non tenet vinculum pacis, non mysterium accipit pro se, sed testimonium contra se” (S. 272; PL 38, 1247-1248).

⁷⁰LAWLORD and DOYLE, “Mystical Body of Christ,” p. 99.

⁷¹TEJERINA ARIAS, “La Eclesiología agustiniana del *Christus totus*,” p. 1166.

empirical Church from the true Church of the saints. In the nineteenth-century, German theologian J. A. Möhler (d. 1838) contributed to recentering the theology of the Church as “the concentration of love.”⁷² With Pius XII’s encyclical *Mystici Corporis* (1943) the notion of “Mystical Body of Christ” brings together the institutional dimension of the Church with the Church of grace and love from the Holy Spirit. In this document the Pope explicitly identifies the Mystical Body of Christ with the Roman Catholic Church, a vast difference from Augustine’s “whole Christ.”

2. Favaroni: Unity of Christians with Christ

The notion of the “whole Christ,” as an extension of the *anima una* and Christ’s presence in the poor and faith community, is quite different from the “Mystical Body of Christ” identified with the institutional Church. Favaroni, an original thinker of the Augustinian School, is important in this context for his particular perception of the presence of Christ with the unity of Christians, even though his thinking got him into trouble.⁷³

Favaroni, theologian and Prior General (1419-1431), encouraged much reform within the Order. He was also archbishop of Cesena until 1435. Because of his excellent grasp of the thought of Augustine, says Adolar Zumkeller, Favaroni has been called the “most important medieval theologian of the Augustinian school of thought in the Augustinian

⁷²LAWLORD and DOYLE, “Mystical Body of Christ,” p. 104. TEJERINA ARIAS, “La Eclesiología agustiniana del *Christus totus*,” pp. 1165-1170.

⁷³L. GAGO FERNANDEZ, *Trayectoria histórica de la escuela agustiniana*. [Thesis]. Bogotá: Pontificia Universidad Católica Javeriana, 1963, p. 177: Favaroni has suffered from two injustices: of being forgotten and of being judged too quickly.

Order.”⁷⁴ He was an independent thinker, a lone wolf in his own camp, and sought original answers to theological questions. In terms of understanding theology, Favaroni goes against the grain when he writes: “*sciencia theologica non est practica . . . sciencia theologica esta speculativa.*” He also refuted the school’s opinion regarding the affective character of theology.⁷⁵ With this statement he clearly rejects the Augustinian school’s vision of theology. Favaroni showed little esteem for the scholastic doctors as well as for many theologians of the Order. He did not follow the common current of the theologians in his day, and this explains why some of his conclusions contradicted the traditional teachings of the Church.

On the other hand, Favaroni favored the writings from the Patristic and pre-scholastic era over the “vain theories of the scholastics.”⁷⁶ Augustine of Hippo had the last word and Favaroni’s references to him were innumerable. Favaroni was also familiar with the works of Bernard, Anselm and the Victorine tradition as well as with the non-Christian sources, such as Cicero, Virgil, Pliny, Horace and especially Seneca.⁷⁷ His personality was complex and multifaceted, since he was at the same time theologian, philosopher, moralist, mystic, and exegete.

⁷⁴A. ZUMKELLER, *Theology & History of the Augustinian School in the Middle Ages*. J. Rotelle (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1996, p. 107, note 47. For a bibliography on Favaroni, see the World Wide Web @ <http://www.augustiniana.org>

⁷⁵GAGO FERNANDEZ, *Trayectoria histórica*, p. 180.

⁷⁶GAGO FERNANDEZ, *Trayectoria histórica*, p. 180.

⁷⁷GAGO FERNANDEZ, *Trayectoria histórica*, pp. 180-181.

Even though Ambrosio de Cora called Favaroni “alter Augustinus,” applicable perhaps in a general sense, we cannot say that this rings true for his Christology.⁷⁸ As a young master he wrote his *Lectures on the Book of Revelation*, the first part of which was entitled “On the Sacrament of the Unity of Christ and the Church, of the Whole Christ (*Christo integro*).”⁷⁹ It contained some passages of his extreme, sometimes unbalanced theological formulations of the Body of Christ that were later considered flawed. He exaggerated the bishop of Hippo’s unity of Christians with Christ by saying “Christ sins every day” and a select few will be saved.⁸⁰ After many years of study and debate, the Councils of Constance and later of Basle, in 1435, condemned several of his propositions and his written defense as well. Favaroni was not condemned for heresy “because he submitted his teaching to the decision of the Church.”⁸¹ Favaroni’s doctrine did not influence subsequent theology; it was a dead letter. In the decree against Favaroni, it was prohibited

⁷⁸GAGO FERNANDEZ, *Trayectoria histórica*, pp. 179, 181.

⁷⁹ZUMKELLER, *Theology & History*, p. 107, note 47: The treatise is entitled *De sacramento unitatis Christi et ecclesiae, sive de Christo integro* which can be found in the manuscript Ms. Lat. Fol. 852 in the Preussische Staatsbibliothek, Berlin (fol. 212ff) and also in the manuscripts Clm. 498 and Basel Ms. A.IV.17 (fol. 306ff).

⁸⁰ZUMKELLER, *Theology & History*, pp. 52, 183. The primary issues of concern were: 1) Monophysitic tendencies – Favaroni wanted to emphasize the excellence of human nature in Christ by saying: “Humana natura in Christo vere est Christus.” This obscured the real difference between the human nature of Christ and his divine person. 2) He exaggerated the unity of Christians with Christ in the mystical body with the formula: “Christ sins every day, since he was Christ, he sinned every day.” 3) Favaroni’s assertion that only the elect and predestined were members of Christ and his mystical body had overtones of the condemned thesis of Hus: “Duae naturae, divinitas et humanitas, sunt unus Christus.” See GAGO FERNANDEZ, *Trayectoria histórica*, p. 179. For a study on Jan Hus, see ZUMKELLER, *Theology & History*, pp. 155-163. The execution of Hus (6 July 1415) led to bloody conflict and the terrible Hussite Wars (1420-1434). “By the year 1424 all the Augustinian monasteries in Bohemia had been destroyed and their inhabitants, if not murdered, scattered to the four winds” (p. 161).

⁸¹ZUMKELLER, *Theology & History*, p. 183. The Council debated these propositions over the next four years. The participants were divided on these issues and it is noteworthy that the papal legate, Cardinal Julianus Cesarini, is named as the foremost defender of Favaroni.

to teach or preach this doctrine.⁸² On the other hand, he made a positive contribution through the debate and discussions in linking the nature of the Church to the Body of Christ.

It was, by the way, Favaroni's extreme formulations that started the council's preoccupation with the inmost essence of the Church in very thorough and long discussions and for the first time in the Church's history expounding the doctrine of the mystical body in an official ecclesiastical report. John of Segovia, [a contemporary historian of the council,] ranked these council debates among the most significant of the whole Church synod.⁸³

Favaroni also initiated the idea that "the only Priest is Christ and that the *whole* Priest is the Mystical Christ."⁸⁴ It is difficult to determine if his thinking on the Body of Christ influenced his perception of the *anima una* within his reform of the Order.⁸⁵ Nor can it be documented that Favaroni left his episcopal office because of the doctrinal errors in his Christology. Nevertheless, he retired to the Augustinian monastery in Prato, lived as a simple friar for the next eight years, and died with a reputation of sanctity.⁸⁶

It is important to take another look at the writings of Favaroni for a couple reasons. First, there is a summons by some authors for a "more detailed and profound study" of his

⁸²GAGO FERNANDEZ, *Trayectoria histórica*, p. 179.

⁸³ZUMKELLER, *Theology & History*, pp. 184 and 53. James of Viterbo (d. 1308) describes the "mystical body" as a metaphor. Speaking about the nature of ecclesial unity, "the mystical body, as James calls the Church at this point, differs from the natural body in that all the members of the natural body co-exist together whereas in the Church the members are not all in existence at the same time. In general our Master stresses that the comparison of the Church with a human being or a human body is only a metaphor which cannot be interpreted in every respect. Above all the Church lacks unity of person such as the individual human being possesses" (p. 100).

⁸⁴G. DIAZ, "Un tratado inédito sobre el sacerdocio, de Agustín Favaroni (d. 1443)." *Ciudad de Dios* 173 (1960): p. 588: "el único Sacerdote es Cristo; pero también lo es que el Sacerdote *total* es el Cristo Místico."

⁸⁵A thesis on Favaroni's thinking of the Body of Christ and the reform of the Order would be interesting.

⁸⁶GUTIERREZ, *The Augustinians in the Middle Ages*, p. 32. After his death, miracles were associated with Favaroni, and his cult continued for 50 years (p. 118).

thought, for he has not been treated fairly and has been a source to Martin Luther's thinking.⁸⁷ Another reason for taking a look at Favaroni's doctrine is the change in the Church's attitude toward Hus and the place he occupies among those who sought reform.⁸⁸ Since both people were dealt with at the Council of Basle, it would be worthwhile to examine the influences of their Christological doctrines on the reform of the Order and of the Church.

Even though Favaroni's Christology was not taken up by later thinkers in the Order,⁸⁹ he was, nevertheless, a prime contributor to initiating a more serious examination of the nature of the bonds and presence between Christ and the people of faith, the *Christo integro*, a thought taken up by another Augustinian reformer in the next century.

B. Girolamo Seripando: Saying the "Pater Noster" makes us brothers and sisters

The sermons of the "forgotten"⁹⁰ spiritual master and reformer Girolamo Seripando, whose episcopacy (Salerno) we have treated in the previous chapters, continue to shed light on the collective development of the "whole Christ" in the consciousness of the Order. For Seripando, like the bishop of Hippo, spirituality is an ecclesial experience of the believing community and the highest form of this spirituality is essentially one of union as brothers

⁸⁷GAGO FERNANDEZ, *Trayectoria histórica*, pp. 177-178.

⁸⁸See John Paul II's address to the International Symposium on John Hus, 17 December 1999, [cited 6 December 2003]; available from the World Wide Web @ <http://www.vatican.va>

⁸⁹GAGO FERNANDEZ, *Trayectoria histórica*, p. 179.

⁹⁰GUTIERREZ, *The Augustinians in the Middle Ages*, p. 120. F. C. CESAREO, *A Shepherd in their Midst: The Episcopacy of Girolamo Seripando (1554-1563)*. The Augustinian Series, vol. 21. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1999, pp. 109-115. An important study on Seripando is H. JEDIN, *Papal Legate at the Council of Trent, Cardinal Seripando*. F. C. Eckhoff (trans.). St. Louis: B. Herder Book Co., 1947.

and sisters.⁹¹ Because of baptism, the Christian enters into a relationship with Jesus Christ and with other members with whom baptism and eucharist establishes an identification found in the corporate experience of being Church.

To be Christian is to believe in one another as the source of unity. We live with our brothers and sisters in the Body of Christ and in the human community at large.⁹² This aspect of union in Christian, and Augustinian, spirituality is expressed in Seripando's sermons in which he calls the Lord's Prayer the *Oratione Fraternalis* because:

[I]n this prayer all Christians know and confess that they are brothers and sisters, since Christians do not ask for anything in this prayer for themselves which they do not ask for all other Christians as their brothers and sisters.⁹³

The act of liturgical prayer forms a bond between the members of the community. This relational bond has a social dimension that needs to be "embodied" as we see in other sermons. Seripando reminds his listeners that they are all members of the Body of Christ because of their common baptism and relationship with each other and with Christ as Head. However, he makes it clear that Christians in his day are living in disharmony among themselves and separated from Christ the Head.

And if you say that among Christians there exists estrangement, discord, war, which indicates that unity does not exist, as you say, of this situation we must all feel sadness and weep, because it is a sign that we are not true, pure, and good Christians, since we are not one body as described by Saint Paul: we do not drink of that spirit

⁹¹CESAREO, *A Shepherd in their Midst*, p. 109.

⁹²CESAREO, *A Shepherd in their Midst*, p. 109. Also, J. ZIZIOULAS, "The Early Christian Community," in *Christian Spirituality: Origins to the Twelfth Century*. B. McGinn, J. Meyendorff, J. Leclercq (eds.). New York: Crossroad, 1985, pp. 28-31.

⁹³Cited in CESAREO, *A Shepherd in their Midst*, p. 109, from G. SERIPANDO, "Prediche Salernitane," *Girolamo Seripando tra Evangelismo e Riforma Cattolica*. Rocchina M. Abbondanza. Naples: Ferraro, 1982, p. 93. Hereafter "PRS."

which maintains, nourishes, and vivifies the virtues of this holy body: we are not the same thing in Christ, because we do not possess Christ, but rather our cupidity is our head.⁹⁴

The archbishop of Salerno makes a clear connection of the relationship between head and heart of the community when situations of discord and war should make us “sad” and “weep.” Furthermore, one cannot love Christ without loving Christ present in the poor.⁹⁵ In Salerno, once a center of the Humanist movement⁹⁶ and one of the most important cities in Italy at that time, class distinction caused a breakdown of formerly peaceful relations. Seripando denounces the devastating consequences of class mentality through his reflection on the Lord’s Prayer:

I am amazed how the princes and great magnates do not remember each day in this prayer that their vassals are their brothers; and that the nobles do not remember that the commoners are their brothers; and that the wealthy do not think in saying this prayer that the poor are their brothers; and that the healthy do not realize that the infirm are their brothers; and that the learned do not see that the ignorant are their brothers because all say to the same Father “Pater Noster.”⁹⁷

Seripando intends to challenge his diocese to become aware of the ramifications when saying together the prayer of Jesus. He speaks of a unity between heart and words, and words with action. The text is not just words, but it evokes a certain “embodied” reality and

⁹⁴CESAREO, *A Shepherd in their Midst*, pp. 109-110 (PRS, p. 113).

⁹⁵CESAREO, *A Shepherd in their Midst*, pp. 98-99 (PRS, p. 240-241): Seripando says “Christ himself says that when one who is hunger is fed, he is fed; when one who is thirsty is given to drink, he is given to drink . . . Christ views these works as if they were done to him.” This movement of charity is an invitation to the “transformation of the self” which is described further in Seripando’s ninth and tenth sermons on the Lord’s Prayer (p. 98).

⁹⁶See F. CESAREO, “Patristic and Humanist Themes in the Sermons of Girolamo Seripando,” *Ana Aug* 56 (1993): pp. 265-278.

⁹⁷CESAREO, *A Shepherd in their Midst*, p. 110. Cited from D. DENTE, *Salerno nel Seicento: Nell’Interno di una città*, vol. 2, pt. 1: Inediti per la Storia Civile e Religiosa. Salerno: Edisud, 1993, p. 294.

challenges us to change our ways of life. This renewal calls for a twinning-love: loving God, by loving one's neighbor,⁹⁸ and thereby building up the Body of Christ. The archbishop invites his listeners to examine the quality of their relationships and the extent to which liturgy and prayer challenge them to alter these relationships. We recall that it is Seripando, as Cardinal legate at the Council of Trent, who emphasizes "under the pain of mortal sin" (an opinion refuted by the Council) that bishops had to form a "spiritual bond" with the faithful and reside in their dioceses, and not in Rome.⁹⁹ They were not "to abandon the Churches," an echo from Augustine's *Epistula* 228.

Today, Augustinian communities have a profound task and an opportunity to embrace the theme of harmony and Seripando's spirituality of union with one another as brothers and sisters in Christ, especially in pastoral situations that are increasingly multi-cultural. It is not uncommon, for example, to see parishes in the United States, and elsewhere, whose ethnic makeup changes within five to ten years. Pastoral challenges of this kind are seldom embraced with open arms. Much confusion and resistance abound, to the point of anger and rebellion by the "established" Catholic communities, clergy and faithful alike, when the *status quo* is disturbed or another Catholic community¹⁰⁰ of a different ethnic, often economically poorer, origin enters "our" Church "building." In some

⁹⁸Y. MEESEN, "Jamais l'un sans l'autre: une recherche sur l'intersubjectivité chez s. Augustin." *Revue des sciences religieuses* 76/4 (2002): pp. 426-446, esp. p. 440, note 79: These two loves are called the "charité jumelle."

⁹⁹CESAREO, *A Shepherd in their Midst*, pp. 41 and 77.

¹⁰⁰In the case of U. S. Hispanic Catholics, who practiced the faith for over 500 years, it is often forgotten that these immigrant communities bring with them an older tradition of refined religious values, such as the value of family bonds, the uniqueness of the person, the role of Mary and Christ the Crucified. By 2015, they will comprise the majority of Catholics in the U.S. See A. FIGUEROA-DECK, "The Spirituality of United States Hispanics: An Introductory Essay." *US Catholic Historian* 9 (1990): p. 137.

communities, the *anima una* of the “Body of Christ” is replaced with the “mystical Building of Christ.” The notion of the “sacrament of unity” and the command to welcome Christ the stranger and immigrant are absent from the collective conscious awareness of the Christian community.

Like Favaroni and Seripando, the pastoral challenge for Augustinians is to reclaim Augustine’s view of the “whole Christ” as a presence among the poor and the believing communities, and to examine critically the quality of interpersonal relationships (that is, harmony of relations with the self, others, and God) by reflecting not only on the Lord’s Prayer, but also on what Paul (possibly deuterio-Pauline) says:

There is one body and one Spirit—just as you were called to one hope when you were called—one Lord, one faith, one baptism; one God and Father of all, who is over all and through all and in all.¹⁰¹

Through our diversity we are united together as the *anima una* because of our faith, hope, and love in the one God. The poor, the stranger, the one who feels like a “non-person” are our brothers and sisters. How have Augustinians retrieved the notion of the expansiveness of the *anima una*, of the “whole Christ?”

C. “Whole Christ” as the ultimate horizon of Oneness

Contemporary thinkers are taking another look at Augustine’s “third way,” the “whole Christ.” Two recent publications illustrate this. John Rotelle (d. 2002) writes the following in the Foreword to a text on prayers from Augustine’s *Confessiones*:

Often Augustine speaks of Christ as head and body – the whole Christ (*Christus*

¹⁰¹*Eph.* 4:4-6. Another text: “But now in Christ Jesus, you that used to be so far off have been brought close, by the blood of Christ. For he is the peace between us, and has made the two into one entity and broken down the barrier which used to keep them apart” (*Eph.* 2:13-14 JB).

totus) and not just the Christ of history or the Jesus of redemption and salvation. For Augustine Christ will always mean him as our head and us as his body, the two forming the whole Christ. These thoughts are emphatically preached in his sermons to the people, especially in his sermons on the psalms.

For Augustine the words of scripture, *Saul, Saul, why are you persecuting me?* clearly identify Christ with the Christian. The same can be said for the words, *Whatever you do to one of these, you do to me.* We must never lose sight of this christological teaching of Augustine, for it is important for a more profound understanding of his writings and sayings and, above all, of the prayer or prayers in his *Confessions*.¹⁰²

A clear link is found here with Augustine's "whole Christ" and a present-day prayer approach incorporating the collective nature of Christ's presence in the poor and in its suffering members.

In *Our Restless Heart: The Augustinian Tradition*, Thomas Martin describes the "whole Christ" as the "ultimate horizon" of Augustine's spiritual experience and vision.

"The whole Christ" (*Christus totus*) is uniquely developed by Augustine to give his spiritual vision its ultimate horizon. *Christus totus* seeks to express the utter comprehensiveness of Christ, extending from the union of Christ with his church – the Body of Christ – to a profound sense of inclusivity and responsibility that never allows one to separate love of God from love of neighbor, to a culmination in a Christ-centered articulation of humanity's destiny: one Christ loving himself . . . If the psalms are the voice of Christ, they speak not only Christ's solidarity with us and our solidarity with him but also our solidarity with one another . . . Shared oneness of life (*in una vita, en. Ps. 74.4*) is what Augustine understands by "the whole Christ."¹⁰³

The "shared oneness of life," as the *anima una* of love with Christ and with one another, is a process of becoming and solidarity that breaks boundaries and reaches out to new frontiers.

These frontiers include finding one's place within the "whole Christ," an idea the Order's

¹⁰²J. ROTELLE, *Saint Augustine: Prayers from the Confessions*. M. Boulding (trans.). Hyde Park, NY.: New City Press, 2003, p. 12-13.

¹⁰³ MARTIN, *Our Restless Heart*, pp. 34-35.

formation document (*Ratio*) has taken from Augustine: “this total Christ is primarily the Church, but it also extends to all humans because of God’s all embracing love.”¹⁰⁴ The “whole Christ” is not a static reality, for love is always dynamic and attentive to the needs of one’s neighbor.

Within the “whole Christ” we see how the all-embracing love of God requires the same type of love toward one’s neighbor and that it be co-extensive with the human race. The 1998 *Intermediate General Chapter* takes this thought of “whole Christ” as a means for rediscovering the ecclesiology of communion as a dynamic challenge of unity and legitimate diversity and a mode of evangelization. For Augustinians, this means

to acknowledge the place of participation, co-responsibility, dialogue, decentralization, and subsidiarity . . . [regarding the emphasis on sharing and peace in Augustinian spirituality] This peace is not the result of compromise but of conversion and the search for harmony.¹⁰⁵

In this contemporary document we find linked together the “whole Christ” and the “search for harmony” as a relationship of sharing and peace. Unfortunately, we do not find the sense of presence as described by Augustine: “their souls and yours are not your own, but of the one soul of Christ.”¹⁰⁶ Moreover, there is another dimension of Augustine’s “whole Christ” that is not too apparent in the Order’s documents and writings by Augustinians. That dimension is the interchangeable collective relationship between the “I” and the “we,” or the “one soul of Christ,” as we have seen in *Epistula* 48. A parallel of the

¹⁰⁴*Ratio* 8b. We also recall what Giles of Rome said earlier about God having “two ears,” one for anger and the other for affection. ROTELLE, *Commentary on the Song of Songs*, p. 54.

¹⁰⁵*Ratio* 28. The “evangelizing mode” refers to *Jn.* 13:35 where the community of love portrays the presence of the living Christ.

¹⁰⁶*S.* 243, 4; *PL* 37, 1718.

anima una in this *epistula* surfaces in the Order's *Constitutions* on the interchangeable relationship between the Augustinian contemplative sisters and those Augustinians in active ministry:

By giving themselves particularly to prayer, mortification, and study, they together with us eagerly answer to the needs of the Church and the Order, with the result that they become active through us and we through them become more contemplative.¹⁰⁷

In the footnote to this citation we find a reference to *Epistula* 48, 1, which clearly links Augustine's notion of the "whole Christ" and the *anima una* to the collective identification of those in the contemplative and active life.¹⁰⁸ Regrettably, the *Constitutions* does not use the term "whole Christ" in its description of this relationship between the sisters and those in ministry.¹⁰⁹

Outside the realm of official documents is a certain letter that has captured the spirit of the collective identification with the "whole Christ." The letter comes from an African Augustinian novice telling why he chose Augustine's ideal of common life: "I am, because we are; and because we are, I am."¹¹⁰ But there is another letter of solidarity and oneness from the African continent that is absent from the Order's official documents, and that is Augustine's *Epistula* 228 telling the bishops and clergy not to abandon the churches in times of violence. Is this letter forgotten?

We noted that this *Epistula* was specifically chosen by Possidius for posterity, a letter

¹⁰⁷*Const.* 45.

¹⁰⁸Another letter cited in the footnote with *Ep.* 48, 1 (*CSEL* 34/2) is *Ep.* 211, 2 (*CSEL* 34/2).

¹⁰⁹The insertion of the expression "whole Christ" in paragraph 45 will be proposed when the next General Chapter convenes in 2004 to discuss changes in the section on spirituality in the *Constitutions*.

¹¹⁰VAN BAVEL, "The 'Christus Totus' Idea," p. 70.

that has been ignored by Augustinian commentators. Aspects of harmony, identification with love, relationships and bonds with Christ and the faithful are all indicators on how to live in situations of discord. *Epistula 228* can be seen as a most important source and first step for rediscovering the implications of the “whole Christ” as a horizon of Oneness and the value of living in harmony with others. The importance of this letter helps one to look beyond the situation by pondering questions and the deeper meaning of relationships and of events,¹¹¹ in the same way one looks beyond the material contents of a sacrament. *Epistula 228* provides a direction for communities on how to live the *anima una* and to be the “sacrament of harmony” in situations of conflict. This letter needs to be retrieved and studied, for its wider dimensions brought to the category (or notion) of the “whole Christ.”

Already, from our study, we may draw four conclusions.

1. The Order’s teaching has demonstrated a link between the “whole Christ” and the “search for harmony” (*Ratio 28*). If harmony involves the rhythm of relationships with the self, others, and God, then one can identify the “whole Christ” in terms of an ecclesiology of communion and an expansion of the horizon of the *anima una* of the first Christian communities. Where the “whole Christ” means the breaking of boundaries and is co-extensive with humanity in love, the “search for harmony” necessarily involves a sense of inclusivity and co-responsibility, without separating the twin loves of God and neighbor. The “shared oneness of life” projects a process of becoming and a change in structures for those built on the values of dialogue, decentralization, subsidiarity, participation, and

¹¹¹ Rowan Williams comments that the tragic events of the attack in New York on September 11, 2001, should cause us to ask questions by looking into ourselves. See. R. WILLIAMS, *Writing in the Dust: After September 11*. Grand Rapids, Mi.: William B. Eerdmans Pub., 2002, pp. 21-22.

unity/diversity.

2. Thinking with the “whole Christ” challenges the secure structures of the status quo in exchange for the possibilities of risk and mystery that can be called “getting caught in the swirl of the Cosmic Dance.”¹¹² The music of the “whole Christ” sings the “poem of the universe,”¹¹³ of believing in one another as the source of union in the Spirit. Is the purpose of music to offer diversion and entertainment, or is it to disturb us into self-questioning? Like the “O Freunde, nicht diese Töne” of Beethoven’s Ninth Symphony or Charles Ives “The Unanswered Question,”¹¹⁴ the song of the “whole Christ” is meant to disturb us with questions: “Who is my neighbor?” (*Lk.* 10:29). “What is truth?” (*Jn.* 18:38). The “whole Christ” cannot be “contained” in a neat definition, for it is a hidden mystery pointing to the presence of Christ in the living community.

3. The concept of “presence” -- the linking of the interior self to historical humanity¹¹⁵ -- is integral to the notion of the “whole Christ.” The collective relationship helps to identify how the “I” is present in the “we,” and conversely, how the “we” is present

¹¹²SQUIRE, “The Cosmic Dance: Reflections on the *De musica* of St. Augustine,” p. 477. The author begins the article identifying parallels between the dance of the Hindu god, Shiva, and Augustine’s *De musica*, a “fully developed treatise on this theme.” One may find support in *De musica* for interreligious dialogue. See also the Federation of Asian Bishops’ Conference (FABC) and the document “Asian Christian Perspectives on Harmony;” [cited 3 November 2003]; available on the World Wide Web <http://www.ucanews.com/html/fabc-papers/fabc-75.htm>

¹¹³“Carmini universitatis” (*De mus.* 6, 11, 29; *PL* 32, 1179).

¹¹⁴This musical piece is a kind of dialogue among instruments. A single trumpet sounds a theme to which the instruments in the orchestra attempt to answer, always with greater frustration and in discord. After many attempts, the trumpet plays for one last time its “question.” The answer is silence.

¹¹⁵The linking of the interior person to wider humanity is characteristic of Augustine’s thought. Today’s shortcomings involve either an exaggerated preoccupation with interiority (as in some novelists, spiritual writers, and existentialists) or with the exterior person (sociologists, statisticians, cyberneticians, and dialecticians). See J. GUITTON, *The Modernity of St. Augustine*. A. V. Littledale (trans.) From *Actualité de Saint Augustin*. London: Geoffrey Chapman, 1959, p. 63.

in the “I.” The presence of the other in the “I,” and vice versa, depends on the interior openness and claims of each person or group with one another. No one lives in isolation and the “whole Christ” reinforces our sense of solidarity with one another, not as a mere comparison, but as a reality of identification found only through love. The consequences of such a perception has a prophetic dimension in the context of globalization and multiculturalism when one asks: Who is Christ in today’s poor and destitute? ¹¹⁶

4. The unfolding of the mind and heart to the “whole Christ” must be Paul’s statement on our common humanity that “if one member suffers, all the members suffer” (1 *Cor.* 12:26). Situations of suffering and discord call, not for denial, but for solidarity and bonds with the love of Christ. In moments of discord, the very bond constituted by love can dissolve with the solvent of selfish love and fear. A response to the reality that fragments the bonds of human relationships, either through violence or fear, is a profound sense of presence of the “I” and the “we.” Where discord alienates and fragments, the harmony of presence holds together the bonds with the energy of love.¹¹⁷

The bonds are never static realities, but constitute dynamic relationships, energy and power always in the process of becoming and transforming the self to deeper love. The music of the “whole Christ” is the recurring invitation to oneness as the ultimate horizon and the bonds of love are the *anima una* of the first Christians and the core of Augustinian spirituality: “one mind and one heart toward God.” The Order struggles to rediscover the

¹¹⁶ As a caveat, one must be aware that the answer to this question will be culturally-conditioned. A person from Africa will answer this question differently from someone from the United States. However different the answers, a link of common humanity exists between these two people.

¹¹⁷See page 24, note 19, on the difference between *symbolon* (together with) and *diabolos* (throwing apart).

meaning and expansion of the *anima una* that is the *totus Christus*. The “search for harmony,” as a rhythm of relationships of the self, others, and God, can facilitate the rediscovery of the mystery of presence, the “unanswered question.”

CONCLUSION

The present study began with the question: Is it possible to identify some components or features of Augustinian spirituality which will help one to face, in a particular way, how to live more fully one's own life? In the search for an answer we discovered how significant the notion of harmony was for Augustine and how it was not explored in all its richness by Augustinians. The theme of harmony is present in Augustinian spirituality but because of the use of other terms it often does not appear clearly. No one has looked at the spirituality from this perspective before, and here lies its contribution. Therefore, the goal, and originality, of this study is to find out how Augustinian spirituality has received the different components of harmony found in Augustine's writings. Answers to this question pave the way to see better how harmony, as a "rhythm of relationships," sheds light on a better understanding of the self, God, and others.

What can we claim as new from this research? One contribution of the study is the selection of the theme of "harmony" itself. Here we find a term that is sensitive to modern ears and evokes fresh ideas and new perspectives. If the idea of "community" as a term has completed its course, then the word "harmony" can provide a new impetus to an enduring value. We are aware of how a re-arrangement of elements can lead to something evocative. The study of the theme of harmony has led us into new directions of understanding the rhythm of relationships with the self, God, and others. This rhythm finds expression in the balanced tension between the inner/outer self, intellect/feelings, contemplation/action, unity/diversity, and local/global.

This rhythm also leads us to a new understanding of how the self, God, and others function and remain distinct from each other. The self journeys from fragmentation toward symmetry and “spiritual beauty,” from a possessive ego-self to a giving-self, from exterior confusion and discord to prayerful interiority and attentive listening to God who is the source of life and love. Harmony of the self and God has its beginning when the creature and Creator are in right relationships with love as the foundation. Disharmony is born when the creature dislodges the Creator as the source and end of all desires. The right bond of love, expressed in the forgotten “secret” of “carrying one another’s burdens,” especially in times of discord, creates a cohesion of interpersonal relations and forms its members into a communion, the whole Christ, in which the “I” and the “we” become interchangeable realities. This communion is more than a togetherness; like two walls moving toward a corner, it is a union created by the convergence of interiority and prayer toward God who is Love and who waits to be discovered in the stillness of one’s being. In the context of harmony as balanced tension, the recovery of the notions of the “secret,” the whole Christ, and convergence are new and contribute to our understanding of living life more fully.

The harmony of right relationships does not end at the levels of the self, God, and others. Another level of relationships is discovered when we examine the harmony of the self, God, and others together as a unit. No one relationship can exclude the other. And together they sound a melody, a spiritual “fragrance,” that is attractive and evangelizing. This outward movement of the experience of harmony is new.

What is our next step? The theme of harmony is a wake-up call for the communities in the Augustinian Order as we experience the tension and need for equilibrium between

tradition and renewal. We cannot deny the fact that the term harmony does appear more frequently in some of the Order's documents. The implementation of the word is significant because it indicates a slight shift in the congregation's consciousness on how it understands itself and how it relates with others. What remains absent, especially in *Ratio*, is the call for an Augustinian response to respect creation and to deepen our relationship, not only with self, God, and others, but also with the natural environment.

However, we discovered something very serious in this study: the lack of awareness and consequent failure to interiorize the core message of Augustinian spirituality in the membership (*Orcasitas*). The *Rule* is ignored as a "mirror" for self-critique and as a source for reform in the Order (*Hollen*). A possible explanation for this lack of awareness is the tendency to imitate and repeat old formulas. The Order must embrace its spirituality, find new expressions for the original ideas, and continue the evolution of thought and new visions that are rooted in the concrete, existential situation of human beings. Augustinians must ask: What are the needs in our culture and society? What would Augustine do if he were here today? We can see two approaches.

First, we are aware of the many issues facing the modern person today: personal fragmentation, alienation, loss of meaning in life, and the inability to communicate. In the city people feel diminished by loneliness, fear, distrust of the stranger, materialism, consumerism, and a disconnectedness with the wider community of the earth and its natural resources. Before communities, within the Order and beyond, can respond to these needs and move toward greater harmony and renewal, it is essential that the core message of their spirituality be clearly understood. To accomplish this task, a pedagogy is required.

“A” spirituality should normally generate its own pedagogical tools on how to live it and how to help someone to live it.¹ On the basis of our study, some tools can suggest how to balance the inner/outer dimensions of the self, how to make the turn inward and struggle with our competing desires, and how to integrate the scattered self toward a coherent pattern of living the love of God with others and with the natural environment. Often, the conscious turn toward the inner self is frightening. The turn inward is deflected by noisy distractions, superficial relationships, and empty entertainment. This barrier of fear must be overcome if the core message, as found in the *Rule* and *Constitutions*, can become an integral part of one vision of common and pastoral life.

Painting, music, or writing our own *Confessions* are practical steps for encouraging an encounter and dialogue with the fears and strange, mental voices that emerge into our consciousness. Before we pick up the brush or pen we must “converse” with our self. What do we want to express? How will we do it? Will the outcome be satisfactory? What if it is rejected? An initial dialogue takes place deep within our heart before the emotions and thoughts receive shape and color on canvas. This inner conversation opens us up to a familiarity with the terrain of interiority that can only come to fruition through the practice of silence and active reflection. Some of our communities can provide live-in experiences where the youth can rediscover the richness of silence.

¹ M. LAGUË, “Nommer et s’appropriier sa spiritualité: Art de vivre et pédagogie.” *Église et Théologie* 29 (1998): pp. 7-30. “Le deuxième aspect de la pédagogie concerne la manière concrète de vivre une spiritualité. En effet, la mise en pratique des éléments inhérents à la spiritualité chrétienne (prière, engagement, liturgie, sacrements, ascèse) est appelée à revêtir des modalités singulières suivant les diverses spiritualités” (p. 27). See also M. P. MARTIN DE LA MATA. *Valores Agustinos*. *Pensando en la educación*. Publ. by F.A.E., Madrid: Grafinat, S.A., 1994. B. LONERGAN. *Method in Theology*. Toronto, University of Toronto Press, c.1971, (reprinted 1996), p. 355, says the fruit of theological investigations comes when the results are communicated in some way.

Trusting in love and being-with our inner silence, our capacity to listen profoundly begins to take root. We move from the outer to the inner self by learning how to balance dialogue with silence and solitude, while always listening to the subtle intimations – the silent music – of the divine stirring in the unconscious dimensions of the self. With interiority as a kind of path, people share their experiences and mutually enrich each other. For example, where the retreat environment of the Ignatian *Exercises* gives priority to absolute silence, the Augustinian *Exercises* would incorporate a balanced tension between silence and group sharing.

Once the self is rediscovered as a “restless heart,” an Augustinian pedagogy would focus on mutual relationships with God and others, of which the fundamental texts would be the Gospels, as well as the *Rule* and *Constitutions*. The particular focus on God might include the notion of rightful love found in the creation story of Genesis. An introduction to the corporate nature of the whole Christ will introduce an appreciation for humanity’s sense on how to live in a Christian way in the city and with a positive view toward the world. The exercises, then, have the goal to lead not only members of a religious order, but of any member of the faith community, to be “lovers of spiritual beauty” and to live the *anima una* through the convergence of interiority.² To embark with courage upon the inward journey and to share with others comprise the first steps of a pedagogy toward embracing the core message of Augustinian spirituality.

²J. GARCÍA. *Expérience de Dieu et communauté. Suivre le Christ à l'école de S. Augustin. Perspectives de vie religieuse*. Paris: Les Éditions de Cerf, 1994, pp. 116-122. So important are these pages that I receive them as a confirmation of the dissertation.

A second approach in responding to the needs of the present and the lack of balanced tension, such as loneliness and the difficulty of forming interpersonal relations, and in appropriating the core message of Augustinian spirituality, is to view harmony in terms of friendship, a desire so close to the heart of Augustine. While completing the writing of the thesis, I discovered an important resource by Van Bavel who suggests new perspectives and attitudes on how to live as friends in community.³ Friendship, of which harmony, goodness, and mutual love are components in the classical sense,⁴ provides an opportunity for greater understanding on how to live in community, a concern we dealt with in *Ratio* 29-30 and on which this study offers new perspectives.⁵

Van Bavel's text is replete with references on friendship in Augustine's spiritual experience, but little is known of its role in the history of the Order.⁶ What was said about interiority is significant since friendship, for Augustine, is the mutual act of plumbing one's depths and sharing hopes, fears, desires, and faith with another person or group. The bishop's clearest definition on friendship is: "There is no true friendship unless You weld it between souls that cleave together through that charity which is shed in our hearts by the

³T. VAN BAVEL, *La communauté selon Augustin: Une grâce pour notre temps*. La part-Dieu, 5. M. J. Schuind (trans.) from *Charisma: Gemeenschap. Gemeenschap als plaats voor de Heer*. Heverlee-Leuven: Augustijns Historisch Instituut (2000). Brussels: Éditions Lessius, 2003. I am grateful to Prof. Coyle for bringing this wonderful book to my attention.

⁴VAN BAVEL, *La communauté selon Augustin*, p. 43.

⁵For a discussion see pages 87-90 of the thesis.

⁶See VAN BAVEL, *La communauté selon Augustin*, p. 87. Also, M. A. McNAMARA, *Friendship in Saint Augustine*. *Studia Friburgensia*, New Series, vol. 20. Fribourg: University Press, 1958, especially pp. 4-7, 187-228.

Holy Spirit who is given to us.”⁷ To be friendly to another is a duty; to have a friend is a gift of God. How different it is to speak of a religious community or a local parish as a community of friends!

Van Bavel’s *La communauté selon Augustin* is rightly subtitled *Une grâce pour notre temps*. The author leads us with questions toward a deeper reflection of the *anima una* and the whole Christ by looking at friendship as a “rhythm of relationship” and as “*une grâce*” for the modern experience of alienation in its many expressions.⁸

- Are we able to share our faith, our image of God, with one another?
- Are we capable of entering into deep dialogue?
- Do we have a communitarian approach to ministry?

In each question an aspect of the theme of harmony emerges with the idea of balanced tension. Oddly enough, the question which finds most difficulty for religious communities, and possibly for faith communities in general, is the first question on sharing our faith with another person. Perhaps this is due to a reluctance on the human level to expose one’s intimate thoughts and relationship with the divine. Or greater emphasis on active listening and suspension of judgement might be required. Through friendship, a trust

⁷“ . . . uera amicitia, quia non est uera, nisi cum eam tu agglutinas inter haerentes sibi caritate diffusa in cordibus nostris per spiritum sanctum, qui datus est nobis” (*Conf.* 4, 7; *CCL* 27). See DJODI, *Le Saint-Esprit, Don de Dieu*, especially Chapter III.

⁸VAN BAVEL, *La communauté selon Augustin*, Chapter VI. Other questions that can be asked are: “Is there harmony between our personal lives and life in community? Are we willing to accept being part of an imperfect community? Do we have self-control over our emotions? Do we trust the other and are we able to risk showing who we are? Have we expressed our expectations of the other? Do we believe in the value of community? Is the community open in a way that gives freedom to the individual person? Are we ready to receive from the other? Do we carry each other’s burdens and human limitations? Where is the tension between tradition and reform? Do we fear the future?” (Translation is mine.)

is built and a sharing of intimacy and enrichment become possible.⁹

For Augustine, friendship, like harmony, is a gift of God. Our responsibility is to create an environment of interpersonal relations founding on faith in love for the reception of the gift, if it is granted. Van Bavel concludes with *petits conseils* that can create such an environment, as well as to inspire and to preserve the harmony of a community.¹⁰

Such thoughts on the value of friendship offer us new perspectives on harmony as a rhythm of relationships. One views the self as a friend, and not as an enemy, with whom there is constant confrontation, but as one who is truly loved by the Creator. As in the days of paradise, God offers the hand of friendship to those who wish to take it in trusting faith. Since God dwells in the other, we are commanded to give respect and to be friendly, to honor difference when necessary, and to a certain degree move in the same direction and share in similar interests and projects. Harmony is never vanquished by discord when the enemy is perceived as a “potential friend.” The harmony of friends provides a daunting force against all that attempts to sever its unity; the bonds of friendship pave a way for living in a city that is too often, sadly, a violent environment.

⁹I am indebted to Gerard Theis, an Augustinian from the Midwest Province (USA), for having shared with me this notion of “believing in one another as a source of unity.”

¹⁰VAN BAVEL, *La communauté selon Augustin*, pp. 155-156. A list of the counsels are: “Do not avoid the small difference of opinions, but take an interest in those who have a different idea from what you have. Do not always moan about the same things. Avoid the “silent treatment” when there is a dispute. Do not make plans in your heart to take vengeance against another. Never have a dispute with someone in the presence of others who have nothing to do with the quarrel. Do not be aggressive toward anyone after a dispute; it will only prolong the problem. Never offend those who are close to you (friends, family, those who hold dearly to convictions and values). Once hurt, the healing process takes a long time. Do not tell people outside the house the problems you have with community members; the outsiders will always support your side of the argument. Always search for the means to prevent a dispute.” (Translation is mine.)

Community, or the harmony and rhythm of mutual relationships, remains to be a grace for the modern world and offers new strategies on how to live in situations of discord. We have looked at a pedagogy for understanding interiority and friendship as a manner of living in harmony with one another “on the way to God.” In a certain manner, the Augustinian is called to be a “principle of harmony” in relations with the self, God, creation and others, and to stand up to all that fragments. An expression of this principle can be found in how we reflect *together* on the Gospel and issues of the day, how we recognize the contribution of each person, how we do things together in common, and how we encourage one another. The intent to live the *anima una* is, furthermore, a response for those who hunger and thirst for friendship, love, justice, and truth, in other words, the whole Christ, who gives meaning and direction as the ultimate horizon of human existence.

We share in the missionary spirit of friendship with Augustine as we continue to explore *together* the richness of harmony in our spirituality, as expressed in the words of St. John:

“By this love you have for one another, everyone will know that you are my disciples.”¹¹

¹¹*Jn.* 13:35 JB.

Appendix 1: *The Rule of Saint Augustine*

Appendix 2: “Harmony” in the Plan of Augustinian Formation
*(Ratio Institutionalism Ordinis Sancti Augustini)*¹²

29. The foregoing considerations do not mean that community life is to be considered as a form of splendid isolation, a place of refuge for the individual, fostering a carefree existence. Community life is not a romantic dream, but a school of realism. Augustine tells us that it is like a furnace: “Many promised that they would live fully that holy life in which everything is held in common and no one calls anything his own. This is the life of those who have one mind and one heart as they journey toward God. When they were put to the fiery test, they totally fell apart.”¹³ Augustine tells us that he never met better people than those who made progress in the monastery but, on the other hand, that he never met worse than those who had lost their ideal. “Even though good order reigns in my household, I am a human being and I live among human beings. I would not dare to say that my house is better than Noah’s ark, where one of eight persons was cast out . . . nor better than the community of the Lord Christ, in which eleven faithful souls put up with the faithless thief Judas”¹⁴
30. Wherever people try to build up a community, be this in youth movements, peer groups, support groups, in families or in religious life, they will be confronted with tension and conflict. For it is a fact that we all have different personalities, feelings, perceptions, expectations, ideas, choices, needs, and values. The tension between the self and the other (or the group) can express itself in egoism, pride, exploitation, or destructive criticism. Such tensions and conflicts should not be considered abnormal; they are a natural part of human interaction, at both the individual and the group level. However, neither should they be merely frustrating experiences. They should be rewarding ones, insofar as they further personal growth and foster greater pleasure in group participation. In the past, formation in religious life taught people how to pray, how to live the vows, and how to be a good apostle, but not necessarily how to live in community. True formation for Augustinian religious life must first of all prepare for living in a community.

¹² The complete text can be accessed on the World Wide Web at <http://www.aug.org>

¹³ *En ps.* 99,11.

¹⁴ *Ep.* 78, 8-9.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Abbreviations:

Many of the sources are taken from J. Rotelle (ed.), *Works of St. Augustine: A Translation for the 21st Century* (WSA), Hyde Park, NY: New City Press. At the time of this writing only fifty of the commentaries on the psalms have been translated in the WSA series. Thus, references to the commentaries will rely on both the WSA and NPNF resources. Other texts are selected either from the same editor (J. Rotelle) or from the series *A Select Library of the Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers of the Christian Church*. Grand Rapids, Mi.: W. B. Eerdmans, 1890-1900, reprint 1956, (NPNF). The Latin texts are from *Corpus Christianorum* (CCL) or *Patrologiae Cursus Completus* (PL).

Collections

- AA *Augustine through the Ages. An encyclopedia.* A. Fitzgerald (ed.). Grand Rapids, Mi.: Eerdmans, 1999.
- ACW *Ancient Christian Writers.* New York, N. Y. / Mahwah, N. J.: Newman Press, 1946.
- AL *Augustinus-Lexikon.* Mayer (ed.), Basel: Schwabe & Co., 1986.
- AM *Augustinus Magister.* Paris: Études Augustiniennes, 1954, vol. 1-3.
- Anal. Aug. *Analecta Augustiniana.* Rome: 1905-.
- CCL *Corpus Christianorum, Series Latina,* Turnhout, Belgium: Brepols, 1953.
- CSEL *Corpus scriptorum ecclesiasticorum latinorum.* Al. Goldbacher (ed.), Vindobonae: Tempsky, 1895.
- DS *Dictionnaire de Spiritualité ascétique et mystique, doctrine et histoire.* Marcel Viller, F. Cavallera and J. de Guibert (eds.). Paris: G. Beauchesne, 1937-1995, 17 volumes.
- FA *Fichier Augustinien.* Boston: G. K. Hall, 1972.
- FC *Fathers of the Church.* Washington, D.C.: Catholic University of America, 1947-.
- LB Jordan of Saxony, *The Life of the Brethren.* Translation from *Liber Vitasfratrum* (New York: Cosmopolitan Science & Art services, 1943), Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1993.
- LV Jordanus de Saxonia, *Liber vitasfratrum.* R. Arbesmann and W. Hümpfner (eds.), New York: Cosmopolitan Science & Art services, 1943.
- NDCS *The New Dictionary of Catholic Spirituality.* M. Downey (ed.), Collegeville, Mn.: The Liturgical Press, 1993.
- NPNF *A Select Library of the Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers of the Christian Church.* Grand Rapids, Mi.: W. B. Eerdmans, reprint 1956.
- OpTV *Opera omnia quae hactenus reperiri potuerunt. Thomas de Villanova.* (Latin sermons). Ed. Novissima emendatio. Augustae Vindelicorum, Sumptibus I. Adami & F. A. Veith, 1757.
- PL *Patrologiae Cursus Completus, Series Latina,* J. P. Migne (ed.), Paris:

- 1844-1864.
- PLS* *Patrologiae Latinae Supplementum*. A. Hamann (ed.). Paris: Éditions Garnier Frères, 1958-1974.
- WSA* *Works of St. Augustine: A Translation for the 21st Century*. J. Rotelle (ed.). Hyde Park, NY: New City Press, 1990 -.
- WSTV* *The Works of Saint Thomas of Villanova*. The Augustinian Series, vol. 20, parts 1-8. J. Rotelle (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1994 - 2001.

Augustine

- conf.* *Confessions* (**WSA, I/1**) 1997.
- Civ. Dei* *City of God* (Dyson, ed., Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1998.)
- ench.* *Enchiridion* (Rotelle, ed.) (**WSA I/8**) The Augustine Series, vol.1. New York: New City Press, 1999.
- en. Ps* *Commentaries on the Psalms* (**WSA III/15-16; NPNF 8**).
- ep.* *Letters* (**NPNF 1**).
- Jo. ev. tr.* *In Johannis evangelium tractatus* (**NPNF 4**).
- mor.* *On the Catholic and the Manichean Ways of Life* (**NPNF 4**).
- mus.* *On music* (**WSA I/3**) (**FC 2** (1948)).
- regula* L. VERHEIJEN, *La règle de saint Augustin*. Paris, Études augustiniennes, 1967, 417-437 (critical edition of “Praeceptum”).
- s.* *Sermons* (**WSA III/1-11** (1990-1997)).
- solil.* *Soliloquies* (**NPNF 7**).
- Trin.* *The Trinity* (Rotelle, ed.) (**WSA I/5**) Brooklyn, NY: New City Press, 1991.)
- Vita.* *Possidius, The life of St. Augustine* (Rotelle, ed. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1988). English translation based on Latin critical text by M. Pellegrino from *Vita di S. Agostino*, Edizioni Paoline, 1955. Latin sources are taken from Pellegrino’s text.

Order of Saint Augustine

- Const.* *Rule and Constitutions of the Order of Saint Augustine*, Issued by Miguel Angel Orcasitas (Prior General). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1991. Latin version: *Regula et constitutiones. Ordinis Fratrum Sancti Augustini*. Issued by Theodore Tack. Rome: Curia generalis augustiniana, 1978.
- OGC1995* *Renewed Augustinians for the Third Millennium. Documents of the Ordinary General Chapter 1995*. Rome: Pubblicazioni Agostiniane, 1995. <http://www.aug.org>
- IGC1998* *Augustinians in the Church for the World of Today. Documents of the Intermediate General Chapter 1998*. Rome: Pubblicazioni Agostiniane, 1998. <http://www.aug.org>
- OGC2001* *Ordinary General Chapter 2001. Documents and Decisions*. Rome:

- Publicazioni Agostiniane, 2001. <http://www.aug.org>
- Ratio* *Plan of Augustinian Formation (Ratio Institutionis Ordinis Sancti Augustini)*. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1993. <http://www.aug.org>
- Rule* *Rule and Constitutions of the Order of Saint Augustine*, Issued by Miguel Angel Orcasitas (Prior General). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1991. Latin version: *Regula et constitutiones. Ordinis Fratrum Sancti Augustini*. Issued by Theodore Tack. Rome: Curia generalis augustiniana, 1978. <http://www.aug.org>

1. Works by Augustine

- Bourke, V. (ed.). *Saint Augustine: The City of God*. G. Walsh, D. Zema, G. Monahan and D. Honan (trans.). New York: Doubleday, 1958.
- Dyson, R. W. *The City of God against the Pagans*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1998.
- Oates, W. (ed.). *Basic Writings of Saint Augustine*. Two volumes. New York: Random House, 1948.
- Page, T. E. *Saint Augustine: The City of God against the pagans*. G. E. McCracken and others (trans.). Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1957-1972, vol. 6.
- Rotelle, J.(ed.). *The Trinity*. WSA I/5. Brooklyn, NY: New City Press, 1991.
- _____. *Saint Augustine, Teaching Christianity – De Doctrina Christiana*. WSA I/11. Hyde Park, NY: New City Press, 1996.
- _____. *The Augustine Catechism: The Enchiridion on Faith, Hope and Love*. The Augustine Series, v. 1. Hyde Park, NY: New City Press, 1999.
- _____. *The Confessions*. WSA I/1. M. Boulding (trans.). Hyde Park, NY: New City Press, 1997.
- _____. *Sermons of St. Augustine*. WSA III/1-11. M. Boulding (trans.). Hyde Park, NY: New City Press, 1997.
- _____. Possidius. *The Life of Saint Augustine*. Audrey Fellowes and Matthew O’Connell (trans.). The Augustinian Series, v. 1. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1988.
- _____. *Saint Augustine: Prayers from the Confessions*. M. Boulding (trans.). Hyde Park, NY: New City Press, 2003.

2. Harmony in Augustine: Creation, Music, Beauty, Community

Ayres, L. "Measure, Number, and Weight," in *AA*, 550-552.

Berrouard, M.-A. "Concordia-discordia" in *AL*, 1107-1111.

Burt, D. *The River: reflections on the times of our lives*. Collegeville, Mn.: The Liturgical Press, 1998.

Clarke, T. "St. Augustine and Cosmic Redemption." *Theological Studies* 19 (1958): 133-164.

Corsini, E. "L'harmonie du monde et l'homme microcosme dans le *De Hominis Opificio*." *Epektasis: Mélanges Patristiques offerts au Cardinal Jean Daniélou*. Paris: Beauchesne, 1972, 455-462.

Coyle, K. "Concordia: The Holy Spirit as Bond of the Two Testaments in Augustine." *Augustinianum* 22 (1982): 427-456.

_____. "Saint Augustine's Manichaean Legacy." 2002 St. Augustine Lecture. *Augustinian Studies* 34/1 (2003): 1-22.

De Margerie, B. "La doctrine de saint Augustin sur l'Esprit Saint comme communion et source de communion." *Augustinianum* 12 (1972): 109-119.

Dixon, S. *Augustine: The Scattered and Gathered Self*. St. Louis: Chalice, 1999.

Fontanier, J. M. "Le *De Pulchro et Apto* d'Augustin," *Revue des sciences philosophiques et théologiques* 73 (1989): 413-421.

Ganzarolli de Oliveira, J. V. "San Agustín: lenguaje y alegoría." Miriam Luz Jamett Díaz (trans.). *Revista Agustiniiana* 42/127 (2001): 263-275.

Garcia, J. "La beauté spirituelle dans la Règle de saint Augustin." *Connaissance des Pères de l'Église* 55 (1994): 16-20.

_____. *Expérience de Dieu et communauté. Suivre le Christ à l'école de S. Augustin. Perspectives de vie religieuse*. Paris: Les Éditions de Cerf, 1994.

Harrison, C. "Augustine and Religious Experience." *Louvain Studies* 27 (2002): 99-118.

- _____. *Beauty and Revelation in the thought of St. Augustine*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1992.
- _____. "Measure, Number and Weight in Saint Augustine's Aesthetics." *Augustinianum* 28 (1988): 591-602.
- Hulsbosch, A. *God's Creation: Creation, Sin and Redemption in an Evolving World*. M. Versfeld (trans.). London: Sheed and Ward, 1965.
- Martain, P. "Les fondements philosophiques de l'Harmonie d'après saint Augustin." *Revue Augustinienne* 1 (1902): 529-543.
- Matter, E. A. "Women" in *AA*, 887-892.
- McNamara, M. A. *Friendship in Saint Augustine*. Studia Friburgensia. New Series, vol. 20. Fribourg, Switzerland: University Press, 1958.
- Meessen, Y. "Jamais l'un sans l'autre: Une recherche sur l'intersubjectivité chez s. Augustin." *Revue des sciences religieuses* 76/4 (2002): 426-446.
- Morán, J. *El Equilibrio, ideal de la vida monástica en san Agustín*. Valladolid: Archivo Agustiniiano, 1964.
- Pizzani, U. 'De musica' di Agostino d'Ippona. *Lectio Augustini*; 5. Palermo: Edizioni "Augustinus," 1990.
- Ramsey, B. (ed.). *Saint Augustine: The Monastic Rules*. A. Mary and G. Bonner (trans.) and G. Bonner (commentary). Hyde Park, N.Y.: New City Press, 2004.
- Spitzer, L. "Classical and Christian Ideas of World Harmony." *Traditio* 2 (1944): 409-464 and 3 (1945): 307-364.
- Stramara, D. "Surveying the Heavens: Early Christian Writers on Astronomy." *St. Vladimir's Theological Quarterly* 46/2 (2002), 147-162.
- Uña Juárez, A. "San Agustín: la interioridad bella," *Pensamiento*, 53/205 (1997): 135-142.
- Van Bavel, T. "The Creator and the Integrity of Creation in the Fathers of the Church, especially in Saint Augustine." *Augustinian Studies* 21 (1990): 1-33.
- Williams, R. "'Good for nothing?' Augustine on Creation." *Augustinian Studies* 25 (1994): 9-24.

3. Augustine of Hippo: Biography, Theology, Anthropology

- Babcock, W. "Augustine and the Spirituality of Desire." *Augustinian Studies* 25 (1994): 179-199.
- Beatrice, P. F. "Lord's Prayer" in *AA*, 506-509.
- Besnard, A.-M. *Saint Augustin. Prier Dieu Les Psaumes*. J. Perret (trans.). Paris: Les Éditions du Cerf, 1994.
- Boyer, C. "Augustin (Saint)" in *DS* 1, col. 1101-1130.
- Bright, P. "Donatist Bishops" in *AA*, 281-284.
- Brown, P. *Augustine of Hippo: A Biography*. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1969 (new edition, 2000).
- Burt, D. "Peace," in *AA*, 629-632.
- _____. *Friendship & Society. An Introduction to Augustine's Practical Philosophy*. Grand Rapids, Mi.: Wm. B. Eerdmans, 1999.
- Capanaga, V. *Pensamientos de San Agustín. El hombre, Dios y el Dios-hombre*. Madrid: BAC, 1977.
- Cary, P. *Augustine's Invention of the Inner Self*. London: Oxford University Press, 2000.
- _____. "Interiority" in *AA*, 454-456.
- Chadwick, H. *Augustine: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1986.
- _____. "The New Sermons of St. Augustine." *Journal of Theological Studies* 47 (1996): 69-91.
- _____. "The New Letters of St. Augustine." *Journal of Theological Studies* 34 (1983): 425-452.
- Coyle, K. "Augustine and Apocalyptic: Thoughts on the Fall of Rome, the Book of Revelation, and the End of the World." *Florilegium* 9 (1987):1-34.
- Daly, G. "St. Augustine and Modern Theology," in *Augustinian Spirituality and the Charism of the Augustinians*. J. Rotelle, (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press,

1995, 19-31.

De Bruyne, D. "Le texte et les citations bibliques de la 'Vita S. Augustini' de Possidius." *Revue Bénédictine* 42 (1930), 297-300.

Djodi, D. *Le Saint-Esprit, Don de Dieu: Une clé de compréhension de la pneumatologie de Saint Augustin*. Doctoral dissertation from St. Paul University, Ottawa, Canada, September 19, 2002.

Dodaro, R. and Lawless, G. *Augustine and his Critics*. London: Routledge, 2000.

Dolbeau, F. "Nouveaux sermons de saint Augustin pour la conversion des païens et des donatistes (II). *Revue des Études Augustiniennes* 37 (1991): 261-306; 39 (1993): 57-108.

Dougherty, R. "Fall of Rome" in *AA*, 352-353.

Doyle, D. *The Bishop as Disciplinarian in the Letters of St. Augustine*. Patristic Studies, vol. 4; G. Bray (ed.). New York: Peter Lang, 2002.

Dreyer, E. A. "Spirituality as a Resource for Theology: The Holy Spirit in Augustine." *Christian Spirituality Bulletin* 4/2 (1996): 7-10.

Duffy, S. "Anthropology" in *AA*, 24-31.

Du Roy, O. *L'intelligence de la foi en la Trinité selon san Augustin*. Paris: Études Augustiniennes, 1966.

Evans, G. R. "Heresy, Schism" in *AA*, 424-426.

Fitzgerald, A. "El Estudio de Agustín Hoy." J. A. Cabrera (trans.) *Revista Agustiniiana* 42/129 (2001): 1181-1191.

_____. "Habit" in *AA*, 409-411.

_____. "Retractationes" in *AA*, 723-724.

Flood, J. M. "St. Augustine in his Letters." *The Furrow* 3/5 (1952): 196-202.

Fortin, E. "Civitate Dei, De" in *AA*, 197-198.

Frend, W. H. C. "Augustine's Reactions to the Barbarian Invasions of the West: Some comparisons with his western contemporaries." *Augustinus*, 39, (1994): 241-255.

- _____. *The Donatist Church. A movement of protest in Roman North Africa*. Oxford, Eng.: Clarendon Press, 1952.
- Garcia Lavarez, J. "El misterio de la Trinidad y la comunidad en san Agustín." *Revista Agustiniiana* 33 (1992): 613-637.
- Gilson, E. *The Christian philosophy of Saint Augustine*. L.E.M. Lynch (trans.) from *Introduction à l'étude de saint Augustin*. London: V. Gollancz, 1961.
- Grabowski, S. "St. Augustine and the Doctrine of the Mystical Body of Christ." *Theological Studies* 7 (1946): 72-125.
- Guitton, J. *The Modernity of St. Augustine*. A. V. Littledale (trans.) from *Actualité de Saint Augustin*. London: Geoffrey Chapman, 1959.
- Hackett, B. "The relevancy of St. Augustine's spirituality" in *Second annual course on Augustinian spirituality*, July 1-17, 1976. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1976, 157-173.
- Henry, P. *Saint Augustine On Personality*. The Saint Augustine Lecture 1959. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1960.
- Hundert, E.J. "Augustine and the Sources of the Divided Self." *Political Theory*, 20/1 (1992): 86-104. Also, John Dunn and Ian Harris, eds. *Augustine*. Cheltenham, UK: E. Elgar Publications, 1997, 435-453.
- Innes, R. "Integrating the Self through the Desire of God." *Augustinian Studies* 28/1 (1997): 67-109.
- Johnson, P. "Virtus: Classical Latin to the *De Civitate Dei*" in D. Donnelly, *The City of God: a collection of critical essays*. New York: P. Lang, 1995.
- Kennedy, G. *Greek rhetoric under Christian Emperors*. Princeton, N. J. : Princeton University Press, 1983.
- La Bonnardière, A-M. *Biblia Augustiniana. Le Livre de la Sagesse* (Paris: Études Augustiniennes, 1970.
- Lawless, G. *Augustine of Hippo and His Monastic Rule*. Oxford, (England): Clarendon Press, 1987.
- _____. "Regula" in *AA*, 707-709.

- _____. "The Enduring Values of the Rule of Saint Augustine." *Angelicum* 59 (1982): 59-78.
- Luis, P. de. "Comentario de la Regla de San Agustín." *Estudio Agustiniano* 36 (2001): 495-532.
- MacCormack, S. "Classical Influences on Augustine" in *AA*, 206-213.
- Madec, G. "Cor" in *AL*, vol. 2, fasc. 1-2, Basel, 1996, col. 1-6.
- Madigan, K. "Regula, Use After Augustine" in *AA*, 709-710.
- Madrid, T. C. "El ministerio pastoral según San Agustín." *Revista Agustiniana* 40/122 (1999): 653-713.
- Mallard, W. *Language and Love: Introducing Augustine's religious thought through the Confessions story*. University Park, Pa.: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1994.
- _____. "Jesus Christ" in *AA*, 463-470.
- Manrique, A. *La vida monástica en san Agustín*. Salamanca: El Escorial, 1959.
- _____. *Teología Agustiniana de la Vida Religiosa*. Madrid: Real Monasterio de El Escorial, 1964.
- Markus, R. "Donatus, Donatism" in *AA*, 284-287.
- Marrou, H. I. *St. Augustin et l'augustinisme*. Paris: Éditions du Seuil, 1955.
- _____. *S. Augustin et la fin de la culture antique*. Paris: E. de Boccard, 1949, (reprint 1983).
- Marrou, H. I. And A. M. La Bonnadière. *St. Augustine and his Influence through the Ages*. E. Hill (trans.) from *Saint Augustin et l'augustinisme*. New York: Harper and Brothers, 1957.
- Nagy, G. *The Best of the Achaeans: Concepts of the Hero in Archaic Greek Poetry*. Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, reprint 1999. Available on the World Wide Web @ www.press.jhu.edu/books/nagy/BofATL/chapter17.html
- O'Donnell, J. "Augustine's Classical Readings," *Recherches Augustiniennes*, 15 (1980): 144-175.

- Olivar, A. *La Predicación cristiana antigua*. Barcelona: Editorial Herder, 1991.
- Pelligrino, M. "Introduction" in *Sermons*, WSA III/1, J. Rotelle (ed.). Brooklyn, New York: New City Press, 1990, 13-137. The introduction is translated by Matthew J. O'Connell from the original Italian, "Introduzione Generale" in *Opere di Sant' Agostino – Discorsi XXIX*, Rome, Italy: Città Nuova Editrice, 1979.
- _____. *Spiritual Journey: Augustine's Reflections on the Christian Life*. J. Rotelle (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1996. Translation of *Itinerario spirituale*.
- Ramsey, B. "John Cassian: Student of Augustine." *Cistercian Studies* 28 (1993): 5-15.
- Rondet, H. "La théologie de saint Augustin predicateur." *Bulletin de littérature ecclésiastique* 72 (1971): 71-105.
- Russell, R. (trans.). *The Rule of St. Augustine*. [cited 9 Sept. 2003]; available from World Wide Web @ <http://www.augustinian.villanova.edu/writings/english.htm>
- Smith, J. "Confessions of an Existentialist: Reading Augustine after Heidegger." *New Blackfriars* 82/096 (2001): 273-282.
- Straw, C. "Augustine as Pastoral Theologian: the exegesis of the parables of the field and threshing floor." *Augustinian Studies* 14 (1983): 129-151.
- Stock, B. *Augustine the Reader: Meditation, Self-knowledge, and the Ethics of Interpretation*. Cambridge, Mass.: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1996.
- Tejerina Arias, G. "La Eclesiología agustiniana del *Christus totus*." *Revista Agustiniana* 42/129 (2001): 1139-1179.
- Thonnard, F. J. *Traité de vie spirituelle a l'école de saint Augustin*. Paris: Bonne Presse, 1959.
- Torchia, N. J. "Contemplation and Action" in *AA*, 233-235.
- Trapè, A. "Saint Augustine," in *Patrology*, ed. A. di Berardino, vol. 4. Westminster, Md.: Christian Classics, 1986, 342-462.
- Sage, A. *La vie religieuse selon Saint Augustin*. Paris: Vie Augustinienne, 1972.
- Squire, A. "The Cosmic Dance: Reflections on the *De musica* of St. Augustine." *The New Blackfriars* 35 (1954): 477-484.

- Stiickelberger, H. "La oración como reflexión sobre sí mismo ante Dios, en la 'Carta' 130 de Agustín, escrita a Proba." *Augustinus* 48 (2003): 237-242.
- Van Bavel, T. *Répertoire bibliographique de saint Augustin, 1950-1960*. Steenbrugis: In Abbatia Sancti Petri, 1963.
- _____. "The 'Christus Totus' Idea: A Forgotten Aspect of Augustine's Spirituality." *Augustinian Spirituality and the Charism of the Augustinians*. J. Rotelle (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1995, 59-70.
- _____. "Church" in *AA*, 169-176.
- _____. "The Double Face of Love in Augustine." *Louvain Studies* 12 (1987): 116-130.
- _____. "The Evangelical Inspiration of the Rule of St. Augustine." *The Downside Review* 93 (1975): 83-99.
- _____. *The Rule of Saint Augustine: With Introduction & Commentary*. R. Canning (trans.) from *Regula*. London: Darton, Longman & Todd, 1984.
- Van der Meer, F. *Augustine the Bishop. The Life and Work of a Father of the Church*. Brian Battershaw and G. R. Lamb (trans.) from *Augustinus de zielzorger*. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1961.
- Versfeld, M. *A Guide to the 'City of God.'* London and New York: Sheed and Ward, 1958.
- Verheijen, L. *Saint Augustine's monasticism in the light of Acts 4:32-35*. Villanova, Pa.: Villanova University Press, 1979.
- _____. "La Règle de S. Augustin. L'état actuel des faits." *Augustinianum* 4 (1964):109-122.
- _____. *La Règle de Saint Augustin*. Paris: Études Augustiniennes, 1967.
- _____. *Nouvelle approche de la règle de saint Augustin*. Abbaye de Bellefontaine: Bégrolles en Mauges, Maine et Loire, 1980.
- _____. *Saint Augustine: Monk, Priest, Bishop*. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Historical Institute, 1978.
- Weaver, R. "Prayer" in *AA*, 670-675.

4. Augustinian Spirituality: Anthropology, Religious life, History

Aegidius Romanus, *Opera exegetica. Opuscula 1*. Réimpression. Éd. originale: Rome: 1554/55. Frankfurt: Minerva, 1968.

Alonso, C. "Women in the Augustinian Calendar: reflections on their spirituality" in *Searching for God: the contemplative dimension of the Augustinian experience*. International course on Augustinian Spirituality, Rome, July 1-19, 1979. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1981, 209-217.

Arbesmann, R. "Henry of Friemar's 'Treatise on the origin and development of the Order of the Hermit Friars and its true and real title.'" *Augustiniana* 6 (1956): 37-145.

_____. "Andrea Biglia, Augustinian friar and humanist (d. 1435)." *Ana. Aug.* 28 (1965): 154-218.

_____. "A legendary of early Augustinian Saints." *Ana. Aug.* 29 (1966): 5-58.

d'Alès, A. "Jacques de Biterbe Théologien de l'Église." *Gregorianum* 7 (1926), 330-353.

Back, S. *The Pelican: A Life of Saint Thomas of Villanova*. J. Rotelle (ed.), M. J. O'Connell (trans.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1987.

Barry, J. and MacDougal, J. "A History of our Constitutions - Part I." *The Tagastan* 20/2 (1958): 2-15; Part II in 20/3 (1958-1959): 27-44.

Bernoville, G. *Les religieuses de Saint-Thomas de Villeneuve, 1661-1953*. Paris: Grasset, 1953, vol. 44.

Bujanda, J. M. "Tratado del amor de Dios de Santo Tomás de Villanueva." *Ciudad de Dios* 183 (1970): 38-89.

"Bullae ab Alexandro Papa IV datae mense aprili an. 1256 Ordini eremitarum S. Augustini." *Anal. Aug.* 4 (1911-1912): 441-443.

Capánaga, V. "San Agustín y la espiritualidad moderna." *Revista de Espiritualidad* 14 (1955): 156-169.

Capgrave, John. *The Chronicles of England / by John Capgrave, O.E.S.A. (1393-1464)*. F. C. Hingeston (ed.). Vol. 1. London: Longman, Brown, Green, Longmans, and Roberts, 1858.

- _____. *The life of St. Norbert*. Cyril. L. Smetana (ed.). Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 1977.
- Cayré, F. *La Contemplation Augustinienne: Principes de spiritualité et de théologie*. Bruges, Belgium: Desclée de Brouwer, 1954.
- Cesareo, F. *A Shepherd in their Midst: The Episcopacy of Girolamo Seripando (1554-1563)*. The Augustinian Series, vol. 21. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1999.
- _____. "Patristic and Humanist Themes in the Sermons of Girolamo Seripando," *Ana. Aug.* 56 (1993): 265-278.
- Cilleruelo, L. "Introducción del P. Angel Le Proust a la Regla de S. Agustín." *Revista Agustiniiana de la Espiritualidad* 6 (1965): 23-38; Part II, "Sobre el principio y fundamento," 372-385.
- _____. "El amor de Dios, dechado del amor del prójimo." *Revista Agustiniiana de Espiritualidad* 7 (1966): 56-72.
- Clark, M. "Augustinian Spirituality" in *NDCS*: 66-73.
- _____. "Augustinian Spirituality." *Augustinian Studies* 15 (1984): 83-92.
- Counihan, C. "Lay and clerical elements in early Augustinian History." *Anal. Aug.* 43 (1980): 305-333.
- Diaz, G. "Un tratado inédito sobre el sacerdocio, de Agustín Favaroni (d. 1443)." *Ciudad de Dios* 173 (1960): 584-637.
- Dodaro, R. "'Sacramentum Caritatis.' Foundation of Augustine's Spirituality" in *Augustinian Spirituality and the Charism of the Augustinians*. John Rotelle (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1995.
- Eckermann, W. "Reform as Conversion from Self to Community: Reception of the Augustinian Rule in Gottschalk Hollen, O.E.S.A. (d. 1481)." *Augustinian Heritage* 36 (1990): 59-81.
- Elm, K. "Augustinus Canonicus - Augustinus eremita: A Quattrocento Cause Célèbre." *Christianity and the Renaissance: image and religious imagination in the Quattrocento*. T. Verdon and J. Henderson (eds.). Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 1990, c1989, 83-107.
- Ennis, A. "Augustinian Spirituality." *New Catholic Encyclopedia*. W. J. McDonald (ed.).

New York: McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1967 Vol. 1, 1062-1063.

_____. "The Hermit Tradition: Its Origins and Influence in Augustinian History." *Augustinian Heritage* 39/2 (1993): 131-161.

_____. "The Spirit of the present Constitutions: An attempt to recapture the elements of our original charism" in *Second Annual Course on Augustinian spirituality*, July 1-17, 1976. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1976, 146-155.

Gago Fernandez, L. *Trayectoria histórica de la escuela agustiniana*. [Thesis]. Bogotá: Pontificia Universidad Católica Javeriana, 1963.

Gavigan, J. *The Augustinians from the French Revolution to Modern Times*. History of the Order of St. Augustine, vol. IV. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Historical Institute, 1989.

Gavotto, R. *The Prior General: The Principle of Unity in the Order of Saint Augustine*. Rome: Pont. Universitas Gregoriana, 1973.

Gutierrez, D. *The Augustinians in the Middle Ages 1256 - 1356*. History of the Order of St. Augustine, Vol. I, Part I. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Historical Institute, 1984.

_____. *The Augustinians in the Middle Ages, 1357 - 1517*. History of the Order of St. Augustine, Vol I, Part II. Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Historical Institute, 1983.

_____. *The Augustinians from the Protestant Reformation to the Peace of Westphalia 1518-1648*. History of the Order of St. Augustine, Vol. II. Villanova, Pa.: 1979.

_____. "Ermite de Saint Augustin" in *DS* 4, col. 998-1003.

Hackett, M. B. "The Seventh Centenary of the Great Union of Augustinians," in *The Irish Ecclesiastical Record* 87 (1957): 13-24.

_____. "The Spiritual life of the English Austin friars of the fourteenth century" in *Sanctus Augustinus, vitae spiritualis magister*. Rome: Analecta Augustiniana. (1958-1959), 421-492.

_____. "Augustine and Prayer: Theory and Practice" in *Second annual course on Augustinian spirituality*, July 1-17, 1976. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1976, 173-189.

_____. "Lecceto: Centre for Augustinian Spirituality" in *International Course on Augustinian Spirituality: Searching for God*. Rome: Augustinian Publications,

1981, 190-208.

Hand, T. *Augustine on Prayer*. New York: Catholic Book Publishing Co., 1963 (new edition 1986).

Hartmann, A. "Sources to Martyrs of the Order of St. Augustine since the Great Union (1256). *Augustiniana* 46/1 (1996), 67-145.

Heslinga, R. *One Mind, One Heart. Augustinian spirituality of the Religious life*. A translation of A. MANRIQUE, *La vida monástica en s. Agustín. Enchiridion histórico-doctrinal y Regla*, Salamanca: El Escorial, 1959. Olympia Fields, IL.: Tolentine Center Press, 1973.

Jedin, H. *Papal Legate at the Council of Trent, Cardinal Seripando*. F. C. Eckhoff (trans.). St. Louis, Mo.: B. Herder Book Co., 1947.

Living in freedom under grace: Augustinian spirit and spirituality in the writings of the Popes and priors general (1953-1978). Rome: Curia generalizia agostiniana, 1979.

Jordan of Saxony, *The Life of the Brethren*. J. Rotelle, (ed.) and G. Deighan (trans.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1993. A translation of Jordani de Saxonia, *Liber Vitasfratrum*, edited by R. Arbesmann and W. Hümpfner. New York: Cosmopolitan Science & Art Service Co., Inc., 1943.

Kostka, S. "Le Proust (Ange)" in *DS* 9, col. 683-685.

Kuiters, R. "Licet Ecclesiae Catholicae: Commentary." *Augustiniana* 6 (1956): 14-36.

Le Proust, A. *Traité de la Règle de Saint Augustin*. [hors commerce] Paris: Jean Munier, 1980.

Llin Chafer, A. "Algunos aspectos de la teología de Santo Tomás de Villanueva." *Religión y Cultura* 49 (2003): 43-92.

López, T. A. "Alonso de Orozco, escritor y santo, manchego universal." *Folletos con Él. Historia y Carisma*. 219 (2002): I-XVI.

Madoz, J. "Una nueva redacción de los textos pseudo-patristicos sobre el Primado en Jacobo de Viterbo?" *Gregorianum* 17 (1936), 562-583.

Marantz Henig, R. *The Monk in the Garden: The Lost and Found Genius of Gregor Mendel, the Father of Genetics*. New York: Houghton Mifflin Co., 2000.

- Marín, L. *Agustinos: Novedad y Permanencia - Historia y espiritualidad de los orígenes*. Madrid: Religión y Cultura, 1990.
- Marín de San Martín, L. "La Espiritualidad Agustiniiana." *Revista Agustiniiana* 35/108 (1994): 925-959.
- Martin de la Mata, M. P. *Valores Agustiniianos. Pensando en la educación*. F.A.E. Madrid: Grafinat, S.A., 1994.
- Martin, T. *Our Restless Heart. The Augustinian Tradition*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 2003.
- _____. "On Not Getting in the Way' – St. Augustine on Spiritual Direction." *Living Prayer* 20/2 (1987): 20-23.
- Martin, T. X. "The Augustinian Order" in *Second annual course on Augustinian spirituality*, July 1-17, 1976. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1976, 85-105.
- _____. "The Great Union of 1256. Defenders of the Papacy: the Observant Reform." *Second Annual Course on Augustinian Spirituality, Rome, July 1-17, 1976*. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1976, 106-131.
- Mathes, F. A. "The Poverty Movement and the Augustinian Hermits." *Anal. Aug.* 31 (1968): 5-154.
- Meier, A. de. "*Licet Ecclesiae Catholicae*: Text." *Augustiniiana* 6 (1956): 9-13.
- _____. "John Capgrave, OESA, (1393-1464): Bibliography." *Augustiniiana* 5 (1955): 400-440; 7 (1957): 118-148, 531-575.
- Mersch, E. "Deux traités de la doctrine spirituelle de saint Augustin." *Nouvelle Revue Theologique* 57 (1930): 391-410.
- Monahan, W. "The Augustinian Order at the Grand Union." *The Tagastan* 14/2 (1951): 22-36.
- Muñoz A. "Espiritualidad agustiniiana." *Augustinus* 8 (1963): 163-170.
- Nolan, M. *A cry from the heart. Conversion and Prayer Today*. A letter from the Prior General of the Augustinians. Rome, 13 November 1987.
- _____. "Have Augustinians anything to say that the world needs to hear?" in *Second Annual Course on Augustinian spirituality*, July 1-17, 1976. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1976, 239-242.

- Oldfield, J. "The Augustinian charism of the Victorines" *Recollectio* 3 (1980): 25-45.
- Orcasitas, M. *La comunidad agustiniana entre el ideal y la realidad. Carta a todos los hermanos de la Orden como preparación del Capítulo General Intermedio de 1992*. Roma 28 de agosto de 1991: Acta OSA 40 (1992).
- Orozco, Alonso de. *The Rule of Saint Augustine: Commentary by Blessed Alphonsus Orozco, O.S.A.* T. A. Hand (trans.) from *Expositio super regulam nostram*. Dublin, M. H. Gill, 1956.
- _____. *El buen combate, y El certamen del amor santo*. P. Lozano (trans.). Madrid: G. López del Horno, 1914.
- Prevost, R. *The Office and Authority of the local Prior in the Order of Saint Augustine*. Dissertation for the Pontificia Studiorum Universitas A. S. Thoma Aq. In Urbe, Rome, 1987.
- Rano, B. *Augustinian Origins, Charism and Spirituality*. J. Rotelle (ed.). Villanova: Augustinian Press, 1994.
- _____. "The Charism of the Order of St. Augustine" in *Augustinian Origins, Charism and Spirituality*. J. Rotelle (ed.). Villanova: Augustinian Press, 1994, 441-496.
- _____. *The Order of Saint Augustine*. Articles "Augustinians" and "Augustinian Nuns" from *Dizionario degli Istituti de Perfezione*. Rome: Edizioni Paoline, 1974. A. Ennis (trans.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Historical Institute, 1975.
- _____. "S. Agustín y su Orden en algunos sermones de agustinos." *Anal. Aug.* 53 (1990), 5-93.
- Renna, T. "Augustinian autobiography: Medieval and Modern." *Augustinian Studies* 11 (1980): 197-203.
- Rotelle, J. (ed.). *Augustinian Spirituality and the Charism of the Augustinians*. Villanova: Augustinian Press, 1995.
- _____. *Commentary on the Song of Songs and Other Writings: Giles of Rome, O.S.A.* Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1998.
- _____. *The Confessions of Blessed Alonso de Orozco*. M. J. O'Connell (trans.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1991.
- _____. *Treatise on the Rule of Saint Augustine. Ange Le Proust, O.S.A. 1624-1697*. J. Otto

(trans.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1996.

Russell, R. "Augustinianism, theological school of," in *New Catholic Encyclopedia*. W. J. McDonald (ed.). New York: McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1967, vol. 1, 1069-1071.

_____. "Nature and Foundations of Augustinian Spirituality" in *Second Annual Course on Augustinian Spirituality, Rome - July 1-17, 1976*. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1976, 13-46.

Sanderlin, G. "John Capgrave speaks up for the Hermits," *Speculum* 18 (1943): 358-362.

Santamarta, S. (ed.). *Obras de santo Tomás de Villanueva: sermones de la Virgen y obras castellanas*. Madrid: Editorial Católica, 1952.

Scanlon, M. "The Augustinian Tradition: A Retrieval." *Augustinian Studies* 20 (1989): 61-92.

Searching for God: the contemplative dimension of the Augustinian experience. International course on Augustinian Spirituality, Rome, July 1-19, 1979. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1981.

Seripando, G. "Prediche Salernitane," *Girolamo Seripando tra Evangelismo e Riforma Cattolica*. Rocchina M. Abbondanza. Naples: Ferraro, 1982.

Toner, N. "Augustinian spiritual writers of the English province in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries" in *Sanctus Augustinus, vitae spiritualis magister*. Rome: Analecta Augustiniana, 1958-1959, vol. 2, 493-521.

Trapè, A. "Causes of Anxiety" in *Living in Freedom under Grace: Augustinian Spirit and Spirituality in the Writings of the Popes and Priors General (1953-1978)*, Rome: Curia Generalizia Agostiniana, 1979, 113-120.

Trapp, D. "Augustinian theology of the 14th century." *Augustiniana* 6 (1956): 146-274.

Turrado, A. "Thomas de Villeneuve (saint)" in *DS* 15, col. 874 - 890.

_____. *Espiritualidad Agustiniana y Vida de Perfección: El Ideal Monástico Agustiniano en Santo Tomás de Villanueva*. Madrid: Cosa Ediciones, 1966.

Vaca, C. *La vida religiosa en San Agustín.*, II, Avila: S. Martin, 1948.

Van Bavel, T. *Christians in the World: Introduction to the Spirituality of St. Augustine*. New York: Catholic Book Pub. Co., 1980.

- _____. *The Basic Inspiration of Religious Life*, J. Rotelle (ed.) and H. Jackson (trans.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1996.
- _____. *La communauté selon Augustin: Une grâce pour notre temps*. La part-Dieu, 5. M. J. Schuind (trans.) from *Charisma: Gemeenschap. Gemeenschap als plaats voor de Heer*. Heverlee-Leuven: Augustijns Historisch Instituut (2000). Brussels: Éditions Lessius, 2003.
- _____. "The Evangelical Inspiration of the Rule of St. Augustine." *The Downside Review* 93 (1975): 83-99.
- _____. *The Rule of Saint Augustine*. R. Canning (trans.) from *Regula*. London: Darton, Longman & Todd, 1984.
- _____. "Reflections on Spirituality and Charism," in *Augustinian Spirituality and the Charism of the Augustinians*. John Rotelle (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1995.
- _____. "La espiritualidad de la Regla de san Agustín." *Augustinus* 12 (1967): 433-438.
- Verheijen, L. "Le Père Ange Le Proust et la nature propre de la vie monastique augustiniennne." *Augustinus* 12 (1967): 485-487.
- Vermeulen, A. F. "Augustinian Spirituality, A Source of Fruitful Apostolate," in *Augustinian Spirituality and the Charism of the Augustinians*. John Rotelle (ed.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1995, 199-209.
- Villanova, Thomas of. *Oeuvres de St. Thomas de Villeneuve*. V. Ferrier (trans.). Paris: P. Lethielleux, 1866-1868.
- Viñas Román, T. "Regula ad servos Dei y teología de la liberación." *Augustinus* 38 (1993), 527-547.
- _____. *La amistad en la vida religiosa*. Madrid: Instituto Teológica de Vida Religiosa, 1982.
- Vizcaino, P. L. De. *San Agustín/Orden de San Agustín*. Zamora (Spain): Ediciones Monte Casino, 2000.
- Ypma, E. "Les auteurs augustins français." *Augustiniana* 20 (1970): 347-396.
- Zumkeller, A. *Augustine's Ideal of the Religious Life*. E. Colledge (trans.) from the 2nd revised edition of *Das Mönchtum des heiligen Augustinus*. New York: Fordham

University Press, 1986.

_____. *Augustine's Rule. A Commentary*. J. E. Rotelle (ed.) and M. J. O'Connell (trans.). Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1987.

_____. "Ecclesiological Aspects of Monastic Life according to Saint Augustine," in *Second Annual Course on Augustinian Spirituality, Rome, July 1-17, 1976*. Rome: Augustinian Publications, 1976, 67-83.

_____. "Herman de Schildesche" in *DS 7*, col. 302-308.

_____. "Jourdain de Saxe ou de Quedlinburg" in *DS 8*, col. 1423-1430.

_____. *Theology and History of the Augustinian School in the Middle Ages*. J. Rotelle, (ed.) Villanova, Pa.: Augustinian Press, 1996.

_____. "The Spirituality of the Augustinians" in *Christian Spirituality: High Middle Ages and Reformation*. J. Raitt (ed.), B. McGinn and J. Meyendorff. New York: Crossroad, 1987, 63-74.

5. Christian Spirituality (general): Tradition, religious consciousness, theology

Alexander, J. "What do recent writers mean by spirituality?" *Spirituality Today* 32 (1980): 247-256.

"Asian Christian Perspectives on Harmony," document number 75 of the Federation of Asian Bishop's Conference, [cited 15 January 2000]; available from World Wide Web @ <http://ucanews.com/html/fabc-papers/fabc-75.htm>

Bazarra, C. "Comunidad - comunión?" *Iter* 26 (2001): 159-172.

Bernard, C. "Spirituel – spiritualité." *Christus* 16/69 (1969): 468-473.

Besnard, A.-M. "Lignes de force des tendances spirituelles contemporaines." *Concilium* 9 (1965): 25-40.

Bianchi, E. "La vie spirituelle chrétienne." *Vie consacrée* 72/1 (2000): 35-52.

_____. "La vida religiosa: Signo profético creíble?" *Confer* 40/153 (2001), 43-56.

_____. *Words for the Inner Life*. Ottawa, Ont.: Novalis, 2002.

Boland, A. "Royaume de Dieu et Royauté du Christ" in *DS 13*, col. 1026-1097.

- Bouyer, L. *Introduction to Spirituality*. M. Perkins Ryan (trans.). NY: Desclee, 1961.
- Bowker, J. *The sense of God; sociological, anthropological and psychological approaches to the origin of the sense of God*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1973.
- Breton, J-C. "Le supermarché du spirituel." *Prêtre et Pasteur* 98/2 (1995): 66-71 .
- Breyfogle, T. and Levergood, T. "Conversations with David Tracy." *Cross Currents*, 44 (1994): 293-315.
- Brown, P. *The Body and Society: Men, Women, and Sexual Renunciation in Early Christianity*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1988.
- Bruggemann, W. "A text that redescribes." *Theology Today*, 58/4 (2002): 526-540.
- Burton-Christies, D. "The Cost of Interpretation: Sacred Texts and Ascetic Practice in Desert Spirituality." *Christian Spirituality Bulletin*, Spring, 1994, 21-24.
- Callahan, A. "The Relationship between Spirituality and Theology." *Horizons* 16/2 (1989): 266-274.
- Carr, A. *A Search for Wisdom and Spirit. Thomas Merton's Theology of the Self*. Notre Dame, Ind.: Notre Dame University Press, 1988.
- Cenkner, W. "Eastern (Asian) Spirituality" in *NDCS*, 310-311.
- Claverie, P. "A martyr speaks of martyrs." *Cistercian Studies* 37/2 (2002): 177-180.
- Conybeare, C. *Paulinus Noster: self and symbols in the letters of Paulinus of Nola*. Oxford (England): Oxford University Press, 2000.
- Couture, A. "Spiritualité Contemporaine." *Revue de Notre Dame* (Décembre 1999): 1-15.
- Cunningham, L. and K. J. Egan. *Christian Spirituality. Themes from the Tradition*. NY: Paulist Press, 1996.
- Cunningham, L. "On Reading Spiritual Texts." *Theology Today* 56 (1999): 98-104.
- _____. "On Contemporary Martyrs: Some recent literature." *Theological Studies* 63 (2002): 374-381.
- _____. "What is a School of Spirituality?" *Spirituality* 6/32 (2000): 291-295.
- Dardenne, M. "Contemplative Psychology: Building a Framework." *Christian Spirituality*

Bulletin, Fall, 1993, 20-23.

Davis, C. *Celtic Ornament: art of the scribe*. London: Cassell & Co., 2001.

Dieker, B. and J. Montaldo, (eds.). *Merton & Hesychasm: The Prayer of the Heart - The Eastern Church*. Louisville, Ky.: Fons Vitae, 2003.

Downey, M. *Understanding Christian Spirituality*. NY: Paulist Press, 1997.

_____. "Spiritual Writing, Contemporary" in *NDCS*, 916-922.

Dunne, T. "Experience" in *NDCS*, 365-377.

Egan, H. D. *What are they saying about mysticism?* NY: Paulist Press, 1982.

Fitzpatrick, G. "Enclosure and Solitude of the Heart." *Cistercian Studies Quarterly* 38/1 (2003): 99-104.

Freeman, L. *The Selfless Self*. New York: Continuum, 1989 (reprint 1998).

Fragomeni, R. "New Age Spirituality." *Liturgical Ministry* 10 (2001): 217-219.

Gadamer, H-G. *Truth and Method*. New York: Crossroad, 1982.

Ganss, G. (ed.). *Ignatius of Loyola: The Spiritual Exercises and selected works*. New York: Paulist Press, 1991.

Grundmann, H. *Religious movements in the Middle Ages. The Historical Links between Heresy, the Mendicant Orders, and the Women's Religious Movement in the Twelfth and Thirteenth Century, with the Historical Foundations of German Mysticism*. S. Rowan (trans.) from *Religiöse Bewegungen im Mittelalter*. Notre Dame, Ind.: Notre Dame University Press, 1995.

Hames, S. "Renewal, Programs of Renewal" in *NDCS*, 823-824.

Hanson, B. "Christian Spirituality and Spiritual Theology." *Dialog* 21 (1982): 207-212.

Hart, P. (ed.). *Survival or Prophecy? The letters of Thomas Merton and Jean Leclercq*. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2002.

Healey, C. *Christian Spirituality. An Introduction to the Heritage*. New York: Alba House, 1999.

- Hennessy, P. (ed.). *A Concert of Charisms: Ordained Ministry in Religious Life*. New York: Paulist Press, 1997.
- Hunter, D. "Dualism" in *NDCS*, 298-299.
- Illich, I. *In the Vineyard of the Text. A commentary to Hugh's 'Didascalicon.'* Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1993.
- Iribarren, I. "The Search for an early Thomistic School." *Vivarum* 39/2 (2001): 255-296.
- Jeanron, W. *Theological Hermeneutics: Development and significance*. New York: Crossroad, 1991.
- John Paul II. *The New Millennium*. No. 8. Sherbrooke, Quebec: Médiaspaul, 2001.
- Johnston, W. *The Still Point*. New York: Fordham University Press, 1970.
- _____. "Arise, My Love . . ." *Mysticism for a new era*. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 2000.
- Kappen, S. *Jesus and Freedom*. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1977.
- _____. "Spirituality in the New Age of Recolonization." *Concilium* 4 (1994): 27-35.
- Kelly, J. *The World of the Early Christians*. Message of the Fathers of the Church series, vol. 1. Collegeville, MN.: The Liturgical Press, 1997.
- Kinerk, E. "Toward a Method for the Study of Spirituality." *Review for Religious* 40/1 (1981): 3-19.
- Knies, J. "Reflections: *Totus Christus*." [unpublished manuscript], Tolentine Center, Olympia Fields, Illinois, 2001.
- _____. "St. Augustine and Prayer." [unpublished manuscript], Tolentine Center. Olympia Fields, Illinois, 1994.
- Laberge, L. (ed.). "Spirituality at the University." Entire issue of *Theoforum* 33/1 (2002).
- Lafont, G. *Imaginer l'Église catholique*. Paris: Les Éditions du Cerf, 1995.
- Laguë, M. "Nommer et s'appropriier sa spiritualité: Art de vivre et pédagogie." *Église et Théologie* 29 (1998): 7-30.
- _____. "La spiritualité chrétienne: sa raison d'être dans une faculté de théologie: Sept

- thèse.” *Theoforum* 33 (2002): 61-75.
- _____. “Spiritualité et théologie: d’une même souche: Note sur l’actualité d’un débat.” *Église et Théologie* 20 (1989): 333-351.
- _____. “La non-pertinence des catégories masculine, féminine, féministe en spiritualité Chrétienne.” *Cahiers de Spiritualité Ignatienne* 106 (2003): 9-28.
- Lawlord, F. X. and Doyle, M. “Mystical Body of Christ” in *New Catholic Encyclopedia*. 2nd ed. Detroit: Thomason/Gale; Washington D.C.: Catholic University of America, 2003, 99-105.
- Leclercq, J. *The Love of Learning and the Desire for God: A Study of Monastic Culture*. C. Misrahi (trans.) from *L’Amour des lettres et le désir de Dieu: Initiation aux auteurs monastiques du moyen âge*. Paris: Les Éditions du Cerf, 1957. New York: Fordham University Press, 1961 (reprint 2001).
- _____. “‘Spiritualitas.’” *Studi medievali* 3 (1962), 279-296.
- Linnsen, R. *Spiritualité de la matière*. Paris: Éditions Planète, 1966.
- Lombardi, R. *Vatican II and Now: A Retreat to the Fathers of the Council (November 8-11, 1965)*. Washington, D. C.: Movement for a Better World, 1967.
- Lonergan, B. *Method in Theology*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, c. 1971 (reprinted 1996).
- Maloney, R. “The Person as Subject of Spirituality in the writings of Bernard Lonergan.” *Milltown Studies* 45 (2000): 66-80.
- Marmion, D. *A Spirituality of everyday faith: A theological investigation of the notion of spirituality in Karl Rahner*. Louvain: Peeters Press, 1998.
- _____. “The Notion of Spirituality in Karl Rahner.” *Louvain Studies* 21 (1996): 61-86.
- May, G. *Schöpfung aus dem Nichts: die Entstehung der Lehre von der “creatio ex nihilo.”* Berlin: W. de Gruyter, 1978.
- McGinn, B. *The Foundations of Mysticism. Origins to the Fifth Century*. New York: Crossroad, 1991 (reprint 1999).
- _____. “The Letter and the Spirit: Spirituality as an Academic Discipline.” *Christian Spirituality Bulletin*, (Fall 1993): 3.

- McGrath, A. E. *Christian Spirituality: An Introduction*. Malden, Mass.: Blackwell, 1999.
- McIntosh, M. A. *Mystical Theology. The Integrity of Spirituality and Theology*. Oxford: Blackwell Pub., 1998,
- Merton, T. *Passion for Peace: The Social Essays*. Wm. H. Shannon (ed.). New York: Crossroad, 1995.
- _____. *The Inner Experience. Notes on Contemplation*. Wm. H. Shannon (ed.). New York, NY: HarperSanFrancisco, 2003.
- _____. *New Seeds of Contemplation*. New York: New Directions, 1961 (Twenty-sixth printing).
- _____. *The New Man*. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 1961.
- Mesters, C. "How the Bible is Interpreted in some Basic Christian Communities in Brazil." *Concilium* 138 (1980): 41-46.
- Muldoon, T. "Why Young Adults need Ignatian spirituality." *America* 184/6 (2001), 8-14.
- Nelson, J. *Embodiment: An Approach to Sexuality and Christian Theology*. Minneapolis, Mn.: Augsburg, 1978.
- Nicholas, J. H. "Que faut-il entendre par 'spiritualité'?" *La Vie Spirituelle* 139 (1985): 526-536.
- Noffke, S. "Soul" in *NDCS*, 908-910.
- Nouwen, H. *Out of Solitude*. Notre Dame, Ind.: Ave Maria Press, 1974.
- Olivera, B. *How far to follow? The Martyrs of Atlas*. Petersham, Mass.: St. Bede's Publications, 1997.
- Ottmar, J. "The Tradition of the Oppressed as the Main Topic of a Theological Hermeneutics." *Concilium* 200 (1988): 143-155.
- Owens, J. *A History of Ancient Western Philosophy*. New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1959.
- Pannenberg, W. *Anthropology in Theological Perspective*. Philadelphia, Pa.: Westminster, 1985.

- Pelikan, J. *The Christian Tradition: A History of the Development of Doctrine: The Emergence of the Catholic Tradition (100-600)*. Vol. 1, Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 1971.
- Principe, W. "Toward defining spirituality." *Studies in Religion*. 12/2 (Spring 1983): 127-41.
- _____. "Theological Trends. Pluralism in Christian Spirituality." *The Way* 22 (1992): 54-61.
- Rahner, K. "Person" in *Encyclopedia of Theology: A Concise Sacramentum Mundi*. K. Rahner, (ed.). London: Burns and Oates, 1975, 1223.
- Ranley, E. "A Christian spirituality of non-violence." *America*. (September 1989): 110-123.
- Rapp, F. "France - 'Le 15e siècle'" in *DS* 5, col. 880-891.
- Reininger, G. (ed.). *The Diversity of Centering Prayer*. New York: Continuum, 1999.
- Robinson, B. A. "New Age Spirituality. Beliefs, practices, etc.," Jan. 25, 2000, [cited 13 May 2001]; available on the World Wide Web @ www.religioustolerance.org/newage.htm
- Rolheiser, R. *The Shattered Lantern: Rediscovering a Felt Presence of God*. New York: Crossroad, 2001.
- _____. *The Holy Longing. The Search for a Christian Spirituality*. Toronto: Doubleday, 1999.
- Rose, S. "Is the Term 'Spirituality' a Word that Everyone Uses, But Nobody Knows What Anyone Means by it?" *Journal of Contemporary Religion* 16/2 (2001): 193-207.
- Schneiders, S. "Theology and Spirituality: Strangers, Rivals or Partners?" *Horizons* 13 (1986): 253-274.
- _____. "Spirituality in the Academy." *Theological Studies* 50 (1989): 676-697.
- _____. "Spirituality as an Academic Discipline: Reflections from Experience." *Christian Spirituality Bulletin* 1 / 2 (Fall 1993): 10-15.
- _____. "A Hermeneutical Approach to the Study of Christian Spirituality." *Christian Spirituality Bulletin* 2/1 (Spring 1994): 9-14.

- Sertillanges, A.-D. *Prière et Musique*. Paris: Éditions Spes, 1930.
- _____. *The Intellectual life: its spirit, conditions, and methods*. M. Ryan (trans.). Cork, Ireland: Mercier, 1948.
- _____. *Spirituality*. Translated by the Dominican nuns (Menlo Park, Ca.). New York: McMullen Books, 1954.
- Sheldrake, P. *Spirituality & History: Questions of Interpretation and Method*. Maryknoll, New York: Orbis Books, 1995.
- _____. *Spirituality and Theology. Christian Living and the Doctrine of God*. Maryknoll, New York: Orbis Books, 1998, 1999.
- _____. "Interpretation" in *NDCS*, 547-550.
- Solignac, A. "Spiritualité" in *DS* 14, col. 1142-1160.
- Sölle, D. *Christ the Representative: An Essay in Theology after the "Death of God."* D. Lewis (trans.). London: SCM Press, Ltd., 1967.
- Spohn, W. "Spiritual Practices: The True Test of Spirituality." *Dialog: A Journal of Theology* 40/4 (2001): 277-283.
- Steindl-Rast, D. and Lebell, S. *Music of Silence: A sacred journey through the hours of the day*. Berkeley, Ca.: Seastone, 1998, 2002.
- Strickland, E. J. *The Life of Union with God, and the Means of Attaining It, According to the Great Masters of Spirituality*. London: Burns, Oates and Washbourne, 1927.
- Sullivan, J. A. *Explorations in Christology. The Impact of Process-Relational Thought*. New York: P. Lang, 1987.
- Teasdale, W. *A monk in the world. Cultivating a spiritual life*. Novato, Ca.: New World Library, 2002.
- Tracy, D. *The Analogical Imagination: Christian theology and the culture of pluralism*. New York: Crossroad, 1981.
- Trigo, P. "Crisis civilizatoria y espiritualidad cristiana." *ITER* 2 (1999), 55-120.
- Ulanov, A. and B. *Primary Speech. A Psychology of Prayer*. Louisville and London: Westminster John Knox Press, 1982.

Urs von Balthasar, H. "The Gospel as Norm and Test of all Spirituality in the Church." *Concilium* 9/1 (1965), 5-13.

_____. *La vérité est symphonique*. Original title: *Die Wahrheit ist symphonisch*, Freiburg: Johannes Verlag Einsiedeln, 1972. Translation: Saint-Maur: Editions Parole et Silence, 2000.

Vandenbroucke, F. "Spirituality and Spiritualities." *Concilium* 1/9 (1965): 25-33.

Vann, G. "The Writer as Creator." *New Blackfriars* 35 (1954): 358-363.

Vesco, J.-L. "Psaumes et Prière." *Revue Thomiste* 108 (1999): 331-368.

Vienne, L. de. *La spiritualité de la voix*. Paris: Cerf, 1960.

Waaïjman, K. *Spirituality: Forms, Foundations, Methods*. J. Vriend (trans.). Studies in Spirituality, Supplement 8. Leuven, Paris, Dudley, Ma.: Peeters, 2002.

Wardhaugh, J. "A Spirituality of Trauma." *Human Development* 21/3 (2000): 44-48.

Wilfred, F. "The Margins – The Site of God's Visitation – A meditation," in *Sedos* (22 May 2000); available from the World Wide Web @ www.sedos.org/english/wilfred_1.html

Williams, R. *The Wound of Knowledge. Christian Spirituality from the New Testament to St. John of the Cross*. London: Darton, Longman and Todd, 1979.

_____. *Writing in the Dust: After September 11*. Grand Rapids, Mi.: William B. Eerdmans Pub., 2002.

Woods, R. "Spirituality, Christian (Catholic), History of" in *NDCS*, 938-946.

"World Community of Christian Meditation" [cited 1 June 2003]; available from World Wide Web @ <http://www.wccm.org/>

Zizioulas, J. D. "The Early Christian Community," in *Christian Spirituality: Origins to the Twelfth Century*. B. McGinn, J. Meyendorff, J. Leclercq (eds.). New York: Crossroad, 1985, 23 - 31.

6. Selfhood, social awareness, music, meaning of life

Chadwick, H. "Philosophical Tradition and the Self" in *Late Antiquity*. Bowersock, Brown and Grabar (eds.). Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University,

1999, 60-81.

Corbett, L. "The Dark Side of the Self, September 11, and a Depth Psychology of Terrorism," (2 June 2003); [cited 15 June 2003]; available from the World Wide Web @ <http://www.cgjungpage.org/articles/Sept11Corbett.html>

Edinger, E. *Ego and Archetype*. New York: G. P. Putnam's Sons, 1972.

El Fassed, A. "Daniel Barenboim and Edward Said awarded the annual Prince of Asturias Concord Prize in Spain," in *The Electronic Intifada*, 4 September 2002 [cited 2 October 2003]; available from World Wide Web @ <http://electronicintifada.net/v2/article639.shtml>

Ferder, F. and Heagle, J. *Tender Fires: The Spiritual Promise of Sexuality*. New York: Crossroad, 2002.

Figueroa-Deck, A. "The Spirituality of United States Hispanics: An Introductory Essay." *US Catholic Historian* 9 (1990): 137-146.

Fowler, J. W. *Stages of Faith: The Psychology of Human Development and the Quest for Meaning*. San Francisco, Calif.: Harper & Row, 1981.

Frankl, V. *Man's Search for Meaning*. First published in 1946 as *Ein Psycholog erlebt das Konzentrationslager*. New York and Toronto: Washington Square Press, 1959 (reprint 1985).

Gutiérrez, G. "The Violence of a System." *Concilium* 140 (1980), 93-100.

Guzeliman, A. *Parallels and Paradoxes, Explorations in Music and Society. Daniel Barenboim and Edward W. Said*. New York: Pantheon Books, 2002.

Hepburn, R. W. "Questions about the Meaning of Life," *Religious Studies* 1(1965): 125-140.

Johnson, R. *Inner Work: Using dreams & active imagination for personal growth*. New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 1986.

Kunstatter, G. "Finding Harmony in Discord: A Physicists View of Symmetry and Beauty;" available from the World Wide Web @ <http://theory.uwinnipeg.ca/users/gabor/symmetry>

Ledoux, J. *Synaptic Self. How our brains become who we are*. New York: Viking, 2002.

- Levine, M. P. "What does death have to do with the meaning of life?" *Religious Studies* 23 (1987): 457-465.
- May, R. *The Courage to Create*. New York: W. W. Norton & Co., 1975 (reprint 1994).
- Merton, T. "Christian Action in World Crisis" in *Thomas Merton: Passion for Peace. The Social Essays*. W. Shannon (ed.). New York: Crossroad, 1995, 81-83.
- Metz, T. "The Concept of a Meaningful Life." *American Philosophical Quarterly*, 38/2 (2001), 137-153.
- Moran, F. M. *Listening. A Pastoral Style*. Melbourne, Australia: David Lovell Pub., 2001.
- Perrin, D. "Spiritual Direction, Hermeneutics, and the Textual Constitution of Selfhood." *Église et Théologie* 29 (1998): 31-62.
- Sperry, L. "Approaches to Transformation." *Human Development* 22/1 (Spring 2001), 16-21.
- Taylor, C. *Sources of the Self. The Making of Modern Identity*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1989.
- Vanier, J. *From Brokenness to Community*. New York and Mahway, N.J.: Paulist Press, 1992.
- Whitmont, E. *The Symbolic Quest*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1969 (reprint 1991).
- Wolf, S. "Life, Meaning of," in *Routledge Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, New York: Routledge, 1998, 630-633.

7. Tools: Concordances, Dictionaries, Encyclopedias

- Babcock Gove, P. *The Webster's Third New International Dictionary*, Springfield, Mass.: Merriam-Webster Inc., Pub., 1993.
- Berg Flexner, S. (ed.). *The Random House dictionary of the English language*. New York: Random House, 1987.
- De Fiores, S. (ed.). *Dictionnaire de la Vie Spirituelle*. Paris: Les Éditions du Cerf, 1983.
- Downey, M. (ed.). *The New Dictionary of Catholic Spirituality*. Collegeville, Mn.: The Liturgical Press, 1993.

- Gutierrez Garcia, J. L. *Conceptos fundamentales en la doctrina social de la Iglesia*. Vol. 4. Madrid: Centro de estudios sociales del Valle de los Caidos, 1971, 22-32..
- Léon-Dufour, X. (ed.). *Dictionary of Biblical Theology*. P. J. Cahill (trans.) et al. (2d ed.); London: Geoffrey Chapman, 1973.
- Lester, J. D. and Lester, Jr. J. D. *The Essential Guide to Writing Research Papers*. New York: Longman, Inc, 1999.
- Murray, J. A. H. (ed.). *A New English Dictionary on Historical Principles*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1919.
- New American Bible, The*. Nashville, TN.: Thomas Nelson Publishers, 1987.
- Partridge, E. *Origins. A Short Etymological Dictionary of Modern English*. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1959.
- Robert, P. *Dictionnaire alphabétique et analogique de la langue française*. Vol. 6, Paris: Société du Nouveau Littré, 1964.
- Shipley, J. (ed.). *Dictionary of Word Origins*. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1945, reprint 1969.
- Tombeur, P. *Library of Latin Texts*. Software designed by Cetedoc. Turnhout, Belgium: Brepols, 2002.